

28 March 2012

To: Helen Lamont, PhD Helen.lamont@hhs.gov

From: John Zeisel, PhD and signatories below

Re: Draft National Alzheimer's Plan

Dear Dr. Lamont:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the draft National Alzheimer's Plan.

While the Draft National Alzheimer's Plan mentions nonpharmacological treatments and initiatives for dementia, it does so in a way that enables these important initiatives to be easily sidelined through lack of funding, lack of understanding and inappropriate research.

We the undersigned believe that the unique and positive alternative paradigm of nonpharmacological interventions in Alzheimer's must be recognized. This paradigm has several key dimensions that the National Alzheimer's Plan must recognize as a legitimate treatment modality for Alzheimer's and related dementias that can significantly improve the lives of those with these conditions and can significantly reduce costs in the care and treatment of those with Alzheimer's and other dementias.

The following must be recognized and included in the plan if these significant care options are to be valued as they clearly need to be so the many millions of people with Alzheimer's and other dementias today and tomorrow receive the quality of life and human rights they deserve.

1. A DIFFERENT PARADIGM

Nonpharmacological interventions represent a global paradigm of Alzheimer's treatment; much more than just individual actions such as chocolate, dolls, and environmental design. This paradigm, based on neuroscience theory, applied research, and clinical practice, has been developed by many experts over decades. If this powerful approach to dealing with dementia and reducing symptoms is to be taken seriously, the particulars, no matter how exceptional (such as museum programs for people with Alzheimer's, providing improvisational theatre, or giving chocolate), need to be taken as examplars of a larger way of thinking about Alzheimer's and dementia—a new paradigm—not as ends in themselves.

2. EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICE

There is a huge cache of evidence-based knowledge demonstrating how non-pharmacological interventions reduce symptoms and improve daily lives of people living with dementia and their care partners. This research is often discounted and rejected because although it is meaningful and fits the needs of the evaluation being conducted, it does not fit a particular research model—the double blind randomized controlled trial. It is important to assess these data carefully to calculate the statistical effect sizes they represent and thus their impact on people's lives.

3. METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

Much existing research is discounted by policymakers, researchers, and others because they are convinced that the only evidence worth counting is generated by double-blind randomized controlled trials (RCTs). RCTs represent one important way to generate knowledge; but only one way. Other methodologies contribute substantially to our knowledge of nonpharmacological interventions and need to be taken seriously. It makes little sense to discredit a large body of knowledge that could immensely help policy and decision-making. The following summarizes two alternative ways to think about research methodology.

The RCT gold standard assumes that 1. It is the highest level of proof, no matter what the research question, 2. It is at the top of a hierarchy of methods where other methodologies are "lower" on the continuum, and 3. That statistical significance is a measure of meaningfulness of a finding.

The alternative gold standard for nonpharmacological and other research assumes that 1. The best methodology for any research question is the methodology that fits the question best--not any particular one, 2. There is no single continuum of methodology and no absolute hierarchy, and. 3. That effect measures are an important addition to statistical significance as a measure of a finding's "meaningfulness."

4. HUMAN RIGHTS

Freedom to choose, getting what you want, being part of the larger society and taking part in cultural activities are human rights everyone deserves—including those living with Alzheimer's and other dementias. We ought to be shocked at the limits to human rights being imposed daily on those with dementia (no chocolate and no visits to museums) rather than amazed that human rights are being respected in a few places—Arizona, or New York, or Massachusetts or wherever.

The World Health Organization defines the rights of all people as dignity, independence, self-fulfillment, participation and care. Respecting these for people living with Alzheimer's could well be a rallying cry for those who care about people living with this condition.

5. THE WAY OUT OF THE ETHICAL DILEMMA OF EARLY DIAGNOSIS In the name of science and further research, there is a movement taking place to diagnose Alzheimer's disease long before those being diagnosed show any cognitive or behavioral symptoms. Although these tests are presented as limited to research purposes, they are highly likely to be employed in everyday practice. For the millions who will receive this early diagnosis tomorrow and the millions living with this dementia diagnosis today, early diagnosis presents a major ethical dilemma: What to do with a diagnosis if no medications are available that stop the progress of the disease? The nonpharmacological paradigm and its associated interventions represent an ethical way to respond to the call for early Alzheimer's diagnosis since they offer a clear solution to improve the quality of life of people living with dementia.

For these reasons, we urge that an expert and champion of nonpharmacological approaches and treatments for dementia be appointed to generate research, direct information gathering and otherwise serve the needs of those with dementia today employing nonpharmacological approaches.

We also urge the Federal Advisory Panel and others administering research programs for dementia to include on an equal basis in all research, both nonpharmacological treatments and pharmacological ones. By nonpharmacological "treatments" we mean all health related activities that research has demonstrated have positive behavioral and health outcomes. These include, among others: engaging activity, exercise, targeted nutrition, music, visual arts, film, drama, museums, an appropriately designed and stimulating environment, memory books, high-touch end of life care, external written cueing, information technology, training family and formal caregivers, counseling, meditation, yoga, tai chi, exercise, poetry, storytelling, pets, and even chocolate.

We also urge the Federal Advisory Panel and those administering Alzheimer's-focused research programs and Alzheimer's-focused intervention strategies to develop and make explicit key performance indicators suited to nonpharmacological interventions. We also urge them to include in research protocols all evaluation methods and methodologies suited to studying the effects of real-world applications of nonpharmacological treatments. We urge that all research involving treatment of dementia, both pharmacological and nonpharmacological interventions, include reporting the clinical significance of effects produced by treatments, as well as statistical significance.

Signatories

John Zeisel PhD President, The *I'm Still Here* Foundation and Hearthstone Alzheimer Care Woburn, MA Lin Buettner, PhD, LRT, CTRS
Professor, Therapeutic Recreation and Gerontology
University of North Carolina at Greensboro
Delta Society Instructor and Team Evaluator
Editor American Journal of Recreational Therapy

Cameron Camp PhD
Director, Research and Product Development
Hearthstone Alzheimer Care
Cleveland, Ohio

Cornelia Beck, RN, PhD, FAAN
Professor, Department of Geriatrics
College of Medicine
University of Arkansas for Medical Sciences

Barry Reisberg, M.D.
Professor of Psychiatry
Director, Fisher Alzheimer's Disease Program
Clinical Director, Aging & Dementia Clinical Research Center
Director, Clinical Core, NYU, Alzheimer's Disease Center New York University Langone Medical
Center, Center of Excellence on Brain Aging

Linda Teri, Ph.D.
McAninch Professor in Nursing
Dept of Psychosocial and Community Health
Director, Northwest Research Group on Aging
School of Nursing, University of Washington

Richard Taylor PhD Person with dementia Board Member, Alzheimer's Association Houston and Southeast Texas Chapter Cypress, TX

Anne Basting, PhD
Director, Center on Age & Community
University of Wisconsin Milwaukee

Carol O. Long, PhD, RN, FPCN
Palliative and Geriatric Consultant
Co-Director, Palliative Care for Advanced Dementia Program
Beatitudes Campus
Phoenix, Arizona

John C. Cavanaugh, Ph.D., Chancellor Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education Dixon University Center, and Past President, Division 20 of APA Ladislav Volicer, MD, PhD School of Aging Studies University of South Florida

Peter Whitehouse

Professor of Neurology and former or current Professor of Psychiatry, Neuroscience, Psychology, Cognitive Science, Bioethics, Nursing, History, and Organizational Behavior Case Western Reserve University
Physician, University Hospitals Case Medical Center
Director, Adult Learning, The Intergenerational School
Shaker Heights, OH

Kathleen Buckwalter, PhD RN FAAN Professor Emerita
University of Iowa College of Nursing

Bill Thomas, MD Founder, The Eden Alternative Director of Integrated Applications Erickson School University of Maryland, Baltimore Campus

Michelle Bourgeois, Ph.D., CCC-SLP Professor, Dept of Speech & Hearing Science The Ohio State University

Nancy B. Emerson Lombardo, Ph.D.
Adjunct Research Assistant Professor of Neurology
Boston University School of Medicine, Dept. of Neurology,
National Board Member, Emeritus, Alzheimer's Association, and
Member, Medical and Scientific Advisory Committee,
Alzheimer's Association of Massachusetts and New Hampshire

Sue Levkoff

Professor, Endowed Chair in Community and Social Support South Carolina Center for Economic Excellence & SeniorSMART: SmartHOME University of South Carolina, and Lecturer, Department of Global Health and Social Medicine Harvard Medical School.

Paula E. Hartman-Stein, Ph.D.
Adjunct Associate Professor of Psychology
Kent State University.
Clinical Psychologist
Center for Healthy Aging
Kent, Ohio

Margaret Calkins, PhD, CAPS, EDAC President, IDEAS Consulting Inc. Board Chair, IDEAS Institute Kirtland OH

Mary Guerriero Austrom, PhD Wesley P. Martin Professor of Alzheimer Disease Education Department of Psychiatry and Director, Education Core Indiana Alzheimer Disease Center

Steven H. Zarit Professor and Head Department of Human Development and Family Studies Penn State University

Susan Krauss Whitbourne, Ph.D Professor of Psychology University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Clare Cooper Marcus, MA, MCP Professor Emerita Departments of Architecture and Landscape Architecture University of California, Berkeley

Norman Abeles, PhD **Professor Emeritus** Department of Psychology Michigan State University Past President American Psychological Association

Michael Friedman Adjunct Associate Professor

Columbia University Schools of Social Work and Public Health Uriel Cohen, D.Arch.

Emeritus Professor of Architecture Emeritus Co-Director, Institute on Aging and Environment University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Elizabeth Brawley, AAHID, IIDA, CID **Design Concepts Unlimited** San Francisco, CA Board Member, American Academy of Healthcare Interior Designers

Rebecca G. Logsdon, PhD Research Professor, Licensed Clinical Psychologist Northwest Research Group on Aging University of Washington School of Nursing Seattle, WA

Maribeth Gallagher, Psych NP, MS Dementia Program Director Hospice of the Valley Phoenix, AZ

Judah L. Ronch, Ph.D.
Dean and Professor
Erickson School
University of Maryland, Baltimore Campus

Daniel R. George, Ph.D, M.Sc Assistant Professor Department of Humanities Penn State College of Medicine Milton S. Hershey Medical Center Hershey, PA

Kimberly Williams, LMSW
Director
Geriatric Mental Health Alliance of New York

State Senator Pat Jehlen Co-Chair, Joint Committee on Elder Affairs Massachusetts Legislature

John P. Eberhard, FAIA Founding President Academy of Neuroscience for Architecture

Meredith Beit Patterson, MSW, LICSW, CMC Professional Geriatric Care Manager Meredith Patterson Associates, LLC Concord, MA

Sean Caulfield Co-Founder, Creative Director ARTZ: Artists for Alzheimer's I'm Still Here Foundation

Yeou-Cheng Ma, M.D.
Developmental Pediatrician
Assistant Clinical Professor of Pediatrics Albert Einstein College of Medicine, and Executive Director, Children's Orchestra

Victor Regnier FAIA ACSA Distinguished Professor Professor of Architecture and Gerontology University of Southern California Karen Fingerman, PhD Berner Hanley Professor in Gerontology Child Development & Family Studies Purdue University

James G. Stockard, Jr., MCP Curator, The Loeb Fellowship Lecturer in Housing Studies Harvard University Graduate School of Design

Valerie Fletcher Executive Director Institute for Human Centered Design Boston, MA

Joyce Simard MSW
Geriatric Consultant
Florida, USA and
Adjunct Associate Professor
School of Nursing and Midwifery
University of Western Sydney, Australia

Victor Molinari, Ph.D., ABPP
Professor
Dept of Aging and Mental Health Disparities
College of Behavioral and Community Sciences
Louis de la Parte Florida Mental Health Inst
University of South Florida

Robin Orr President Robin Orr and Associates Former Consultant to the United States Air Force Medical Services Santa Barbara, CA

Alice Cronin-Golomb, PhD Professor of Psychology Boston University

Marlene R. DeVoe, PhD Department of Psychology St. Cloud State University Minnesota

Wingyun Mak, PhD NRSA Postdoctoral Fellow Department of Psychiatry University of Rochester Rebecca E. Ready, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Department of Psychology and the Neuroscience and Behavior Program
The University of Massachusetts, Amherst
Judith Rabig, RN, PhD
Vice President
Masonic Health System
Charlton, MA

Carolyn Aldwin, Ph.D.
Professor
Dept. of Human Development & Family Sciences
Oregon State University

Jon Rose, Ph.D., Director Spinal Cord Injury Outpatient Psychology Veterans Affairs Palo Alto Health Care System, and Past-President, Society of Clinical Geropsychology

Jane E. Fisher, Ph.D.
Professor
Department of Psychology
University of Nevada, Reno
Director, Nevada Caregiver Support Center

M.Cecelia Kimble, Ph.D.
Georgia Licensed Psychologist
(Founder, Interest Group on Aging of the
Georgia Psychological Association)
Georgia Diagnostic & Classification Prison
Jackson, GA

Paul K. Chafetz, Ph.D. Clinical Geropsychologist Dallas, TX

Benjamin T. Mast, Ph.D. Associate Professor Psychological and Brain Sciences University of Louisville

David A. Krauss, Ph.D. Clinical psychologist specializing in nursing home consultation. Cleveland, Ohio

Alexander Kraft, Psy.D. Clinical Health Psychologist US Dept of Veterans Affairs Home-based Primary Care San Antonio TX Patricia Cristine Heyn, PhD
Assistant Professor
Multisensory Activities Research for Dementia and Prevention of Dementia
Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation Department
School of Medicine
University of Colorado Denver Anschutz Medical Campus

Cheryl S Pelletier, Ph.D. Bangor Psychological Association Bangor, Maine

Michael C. Smith, Ph.D. Past President Psychologists in Long Term Care New York

William E. Haley, PhD Professor, School of Aging Studies University of South Florida

Katherine S. Luci, Psy.D. Geropsychology Fellow Salem Veterans Affairs Medical Center Salem, VA

Marianne Smith, PhD, RN Assistant Professor University of Iowa College of Nursing

Janet Anderson Yang, Ph.D. Clinical & Training Director HIPAA Officer Center for Aging Resources Pasadena, CA

Lauren S. Fox, Ph.D. Staff Psychologist / Geropsychologist Veterans Affairs, Long Beach Healthcare System Long Beach, CA

Catherine Strong, Ph.D. Clinical Psychologist Bellingham, WA

Timothy Saar,PhD Clinical Psychologist Saar Psychological Group Charleston, WV Dolores Gallagher Thompson, Ph.D., ABPP Director, Stanford Geriatric Education Center and Professor of Research, Dept. of Psychiatry & Behavioral Sciences Stanford University School of Medicine

Dalia Gottlieb-Tanaka, PhD
Post Doctorate Fellow
Department of Psychology
University of British Columbia &
Chair, Society for the Arts in Dementia Care
Vancouver, BC

Suzann Ogland-Hand, PhD Director, Center for Senior Care Pine Rest Christian Mental Health Services Grand Rapids, Michigan

Jamie Garis, Psy.D.

DMH Programs Director

Heritage Clinic / A Division of Center for Aging Resources

Pasadena, CA

Kim Curyto, PhD CLC Psychologist and Research Scientist Veterans Affairs Western NY Healthcare System Batavia, NY

Janet K. Specht, PhD, RN, FAAN
Professor
Director, John A. Hartford Center of Geriatric Nursing Excellence
The University of Iowa College of Nursing
Iowa City, IA

Professor Elizabeth Beattie (US citizen)
Director, Dementia Collaborative Research Centre (DCRC)
Carers and Consumers
School of Nursing
Queensland University of Technology
Brisbane, Australia.

Wendy Lustbader, MSW
Author of Counting on Kindness
Affiliate Associate Professor
University of Washington School of Social Work

Daniel Kuhn, MSW Community Educator Rainbow Hospice & Palliative Care Mount Prospect, IL Donna Fick, PhD, RN, FGSA, FAAN Professor of Nursing, School of Nursing Professor of Medicine, Department of Psychiatry The Pennsylvania State University

The entire Board of Directors of the American Therapeutic Recreation Association (ATRA),

- Mary Ann Aquadro, PhD, CTRS
 University of Southern Mississippi
 President, American Therapeutic Recreation Association
- Vicki Scott, MS, CTRS
 Hook Rehabilitation Center
 President-Elect
- Heather J. Sedletzeck, CTRS RT Solutions, Inc. Secretary
- Lisa Morgan, CTRS
 Siskin Hospital for Physical Rehabilitation Treasurer
- Kari Kensinger, Ph.D., CTRS Grand Valley State University
- Nancy Navar, Re.D., CTRS University of Wisconsin- La Crosse
- Ramon Zabriskie, Ph.D., TRS, CTRS Brigham Young University
- Richard Williams, PH.D, CTRS East Carolina University
- Carolee Rodrigo, CTRS, RTC Masonic Homes of CA