

379
N81
No. 1179

AN EVALUATION OF SELECTED INSTRUMENTAL METHODS

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the North
Texas State Teachers College in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of
MASTER OF MUSIC EDUCATION

By
Margene Clark, B. M. Ed.
Leonard, Texas
August, 1948

158394

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
Statement of the Thesis Problem	
Significance of Subject	
Method of Investigation	
Method of Presentation	
II. BOOKS ON INDIVIDUAL INSTRUMENTS . . .	3
String Methods	
Woodwind Methods	
Brass Methods	
Percussion Methods	
III. ORCHESTRAL AND BAND METHODS	21
Orchestral Methods	
Band Methods	
Combination Band and Orchestral Methods	
IV. PUBLISHERS	28
Publishers Key	
Location of Publishing Houses	
V. CONCLUSIONS	30

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of the Thesis Problem

It is the purpose of this thesis to present an evaluated list of instrumental methods in order that this material may serve as a useful and beneficial guide toward the selection of methods for the students and teachers of stringed, woodwind, brass and percussion instruments.

Significance of Subject

Selection of purposeful teaching material involves an extensive amount of time, research, and continuous effort for the teacher of instrumental music. The teacher must be able to diagnose the immediate needs of his students, possess the perception to discover opportunities for improvement in materials and methods of instruction, experiment with methods and materials, and to measure results and formulate these according to their direct usefulness in each teaching situation.

The subsequent study is an outgrowth of observations made during several years spent in the study of instruments and instrumental methods. The first part of the study is an evaluation of methods for the individual instruments belonging to

the string, woodwind, brass, and percussion family. The second part of the study is an evaluation of orchestral and band methods using these instruments in ensemble.

The methods under consideration were chosen after an extensive survey of representative instrumental teaching material, and through practical application of the methods to actual teaching situations.

Method of Investigation

The method of investigation was through evaluation. Information on each method was formulated according to format, permanent musical value, immediate musical value, and educational value.

Method of Presentation

The results of this investigation will be presented in five main sections: (1) the introduction, which includes the significance of the subject and method of procedure, (2) an evaluation of books on individual instruments, (3) an evaluation of orchestral and band methods, (4) publishers, and (5) conclusions. (There will be no bibliography since the material itself forms the bibliography.)

CHAPTER II

BOOKS ON INDIVIDUAL INSTRUMENTS

I. String Methods

A. Violin

1. Bostelmann Fundamental Scales
Louis J. Bostelmann. SGI. 75¢.
Does not compare with a good scale book; same material included in a good method book.
(Books I and II available.)
2. Bostelmann Graded Lessons
Louis J. Bostelmann. SGI. 75¢.
No illustrations; E string introduced too early; not enough drill material.
3. A Practical Violin Method.
C. H. Hohmann. CF. 50¢.
Fifty collections of exercises collected in one book; later material is much better; too much duet work; no preparation for technically difficult passages. (Books I and II available.)
4. Easy Exercises for Beginner on the Violin
Wallingford Riegger. GSC. 60¢.
May be used for supplementary material.
5. Forty Easy Variations of Bowing (Op. 3.)
O. Sevcik. Bosworth and Co. 85¢.
Excellent for use in conjunction with Wohlfhart. Available for 'cello and violin, but 'cello and violin are not to be taught together with this material.
6. Groundwork of Violin Playing
Claude Rader. JMC. \$1.25.
Elementary study for class or individual study. Too much theory; progression is illogical.

7. Keloeher Elementary Scale and Chord Studies for Violin
Robert L. Keloeber. RU. 60¢.
Supplementary material.
8. Kreutzer, Forty-Two Studies or Caprices for Violin
Rudolph Kreutzer. GSC. 75¢
An excellent study; usually used about the third year of instruction. The book cannot be used chronologically. The earlier exercises are particularly good for developing left hand and bow arm.
9. Maia Bang Violin
Maia Bang. GSI. \$1.00. Book I.
Notes extremely large, suitable only for small children; illustrations are good photographically, but psychology is not good (illustrations show both correct and incorrect methods of playing.) Material progresses very slowly; few tunes. Home practice assignments; exercises to develop hand technique.
10. Maia Bang Violin
Maia Bang. GSI. \$1.00. Book II.
Illustrated with pictures. Well graded material; many tunes; extensive drill in scales.
11. Maia Bang Violin
Maia Bang. GSI. \$1.00. Book III.
Material on positions.
12. Maia Bang Violin
Maia Bang. GSI. \$1.00 Book IV.
This supplements Books I, II, and III.
The entire set is for very young children.
13. Otto Langley, Book for Violin
Otto Langley. CF. \$1.00.
One of a complete set for all instruments. Adequate material for experienced teacher; not suitable for public school use.
14. A Practical Method of Violin
Nicolas Laoureux. GSI. \$1.25.
Four Parts. Illustrations are excellent.
Introduction of second string comes too soon.
Fingerings are marked, but it is not well-edited.
Material too extended for use as a first book for beginners.

15. Preparatory Studies in Double Stopping
O. Sevcik. GSI. 75¢.
Marvelous for left hand development. To be used for purpose of building clean technique, developing rhythmic feeling and sensitivity to intonation. Meticulous, but not laborious.
16. Rubank Elementary Method
Leslie C. Potter. RU. 60¢.
No illustrations. The E string introduced much too early; not enough preparation for new keys. Good rhythmic patterns. Flat keys introduced too soon. Too many whole notes at beginning; much of material uninteresting. Book II--Material is for advanced students.
17. School of Violin Study
Harmonic Thinking as a Guide to Intonation.
Samuel Gardner. CF. 75¢. (Book I)
18. School of Violin Study
Harmonic and Rhythmic Thinking Through Melodic Phrases.
Samuel Gardner. CF. 75¢.
Used as supplementary material; excellent for second-year students.
19. School of Violin Techniques (Op. I)
O. Sevcik. GSI. \$1.00.
Book III, shifting studies. Scales through three octaves. An excellent study; may be used in conjunction with other methods for the development of facility in technique.
20. Simplicity Graded Violin Course
Louise Retter. IRMC. \$1.00.
Grades 1 to 7. Seven books; Books I to IV--first position. Book V--positions 1, 2, 3. Book VI--positions 1 to 5. Book VII--positions 1 to 7. Double stops are presented in Book I. Inadequate treatment of positions; not carefully edited. Written in keys of C and G.
21. Sixty Etudes for Violin
F. Wohlfarth. CF. 60¢. (Book II.)
Excellent book of studies for third position; used to best advantage after the student has studied a year. Teacher should know advanced technique for violin in order to use it wisely.

22. Tuneful Technics for Violin Bowing Development
 Russell Webber. HTFC. \$1.00.
 Bowing exercise is introduced preceding each tune; well written. Drills for technique are good; tunes are difficult but melodic. Available for violin and violin classes. May be used after first method book.
23. Van Hoesen Violin Class Method
 Karl D. Van Hoesen. CF. 75¢.
 Book I--Extensive technique drill on open strings; well edited; well marked; meticulous.
 Book II--A continuation of Book I, except more advanced.
 Book III--Position studies excellent; however, previous preparation for the tunes introduced in this book is inadequate. May be used either as a class method or for private instruction.
24. William Berold's Primer and Modern Graded Course for Violin
 William Berold. WMC. 75¢.
 Progresses too rapidly; written in awkward keys for beginners; too much duet work.

B. Viola

1. A Tune a Day
 Herfurth. BMC. 75¢
 Popular class method. Tuneful; interesting to children.
2. Beginning Strings
 Whistler and North. CF. \$1.00.
 Well illustrated; clean cut assignments; for older beginners. Book II is difficult reading for the eyes.
3. The Music Education Basic Method for Viola
 Henry Sopkin. CF. 75¢.
 (First position) Well graded. Introduces flat keys too soon; fingering not edited closely enough; latter part of book is too professional for children.
4. Method D'Alto
 Martinn. Baron. \$2.50.
 Advances rapidly; 2nd viola accompaniments; recommended for those who play both violin and viola.

5. Practical Viola Method
Hans Sitt. CF. \$1.25.
An old method, therefore is not available for class instruction. Second Book--Progresses rapidly; not edited carefully enough, but may be used successfully by a careful teacher.
6. Rhythm Master Viola Method
Adam Lesinsky. GMMC. Vol. I, II, and III for \$1.25. Well graded at first; carefully graded tunes scattered throughout the method. Fingerings are poorly edited. First book makes use of quarter, half and whole notes. Most exercises largely diatonic; pages appear uninteresting. Book Two more difficult with poor preparation. Book Three starts the staccato; rhythms are introduced in order of difficulty.
7. Rubank Method
Rubank. RU. 75¢.
Books I, II, and III.
The intermediate Book is preferable of the three.
8. Scale and Arpeggio Studies for Viola
Samuel Lifschey. GSC. \$1.25. Books I and II. Supplementary material; very fine for scale and arpeggio studies to develop technical facility. For Viola class alone. Book I to be used for first position. Book II may be used as supplement for Hans Sitt.
9. Viola Method
Isaac. Cole. 75¢.
Books I and II.
Popular mixed class method; teacher's manual; well illustrated, melodious; ensembles.
10. Viola Method
Lewis. Cole. \$1.00.
Book I.
Simple left hand requirements; clear print.
11. Viola Method
Sitt-Ambrosio. CF. \$1.25.
Traditional; starts in C, advances rapidly. Excellent for those who play both violin and viola.

12. Waller String Class Method
 Gilbert R. Waller. KMC. 75¢.
 Books I and II.
 An excellent method; adequate treatment of position, rhythms, technique and bowings. Material is thorough, well-edited, and progresses rapidly.

C. Violoncello

1. Dotzauer Etudes
 J.J.F. Dotzauer. CF. \$1.00.
 Book I, Vol. I, II, III, and IV.
 Melodic exercises for 'Cello only.
 Excellent for building technique and playing facility; fine bowings and studies.
2. Dotzauer Violoncello Method
 J.J.F. Dotzauer. CF. \$1.25.
 Vol. I and II.
 Excellently arranged. Vol. I and II cover the schooling of the instrumental material; concentrated and requires careful study. One of the most thorough studies to build 'cello technique rapidly.
3. Eclipse Self Instructor
 CF. 75¢.
 Logically arranged material.
4. Forty Variations on a Theme (OP. 2)
 O. Sevcik. Bosworth and Co. 85¢.
 Used only for advanced students as bowing studies. 'Cellos must be able to play fourth and fifth positions.
5. Kummer Cello Method
 Kummer. G. Schirmer. \$2.50.
 Most excellent book for teaching a musician to play 'cello. Material not graded; one of the finest 'cello methods but suitable for private study chiefly. Do not use in consecutive pages; choose material.
6. Progressive and Practical Method
Forty Melodic and Progressive Studies.
 S. Lee. CF. \$2.50.
 A very fine Etude study; a thorough method.

7. Malkin's Fundamental Method for Violoncello
Joseph Malkin. CF. \$1.50.
Interesting, well-edited method.
8. Modern Method for the Violoncello
Stephen De'ak. Elkan and Vogel. \$1.50.
Vol. I and II.
9. Practical Method for Violoncello
Schroeder. CF. 75¢.
Vol. I, II, and III.
Good for finger technique development.
10. Practical Method for the Violoncello
Joseph Werner. CF. \$1.25.
Parts I and II.
Emphasizes bowing techniques.
11. The Music Educator's Basic Method
Nino Marcelli. CF. 75¢.
Vol. I and II.
Illustrations are good; educationally sound.
12. Tutor for the Cello
Otto Langey. CF. \$1.00.
13. Twenty-One Etudes for Violoncello
J. L. Duport. G. Schirmer. \$1.00.
Vol. I and II.
An extremely difficult but excellent book.
Especially good for instruction in double-stops.
For the advanced 'cellist.
14. Scale and Technical Studies for Cello
Fritz Giese. Walter Jacobs Publishing Co. \$2.00.
Excellent for advanced students. Drill material
throughout; arpeggios in three octaves; well-
edited; double stops, fine for building technique;
concentrated; pupil gets feeling for upper register
of the instrument. One of the best 'cello methods
available.
15. Waller String Class Method
Gilbert R. Waller. K.M.C. 75¢
A thorough method; most of the material is for
development of technique.

D. Bass

1. Elementary Bass
Sylvan D. Ward. RU. 75¢.
Interesting; does not progress rapidly; poor illustrations.
2. Elementary Double Bass
O. G. Zimmerman. G. Schirmer Inc. 75¢.
Well written; good photographic illustrations.
Not enough drill material; increases in difficulty too rapidly. For string bass only, not full string class.
3. The Music Educators Basic Method
Nino Marcelli. CF. 75¢
Vol. I and II.
Good illustrations; well written.
Book II presupposes a thorough knowledge of bass; too much drill material; not enough tunes; not well-edited.
4. New Method for Double Bass
F. Simandl. CF. \$4.00.
An extraordinarily fine bass method.
Excellent for the musician who is studying bass seriously. Should not be used in the public schools.
5. New Progressive Method
H. J. Butler. CF. \$1.50.
Would be a good book for a musician who wants to learn string bass, but should not be used in the public schools.
6. Newest System of Scale Studies
Dmitry Shimuklovsky. CF. \$3.00.
English, German, and French Text.
Excellent for advanced pupils who wish to prepare a thorough technique.
7. Practical Method for the String Bass
Arthur Goetz. Witmark. \$1.50.
Vol. I and II.
Not intended for public school.
8. Rubank Elementary Method for String Bass
Sylvan D. Ward. RU. 75¢
A good method. Part of complete class method; contains numerous melodies, covers a variety of

keys; not very carefully edited. Technical points are not thoroughly explained. No table of contents; does not have a piano accompaniment. The work advances far beyond the scope of an elementary method.

9. Waller String Class Method

Gilbert R. Waller. KMC. 75¢.

Books I and II.

Photographically illustrated; adequately arranged; piano accompaniment.

Book I teaches sharp keys; last page deals with flats, a transition to the material of Book II.

Book II prepares a bass player for more difficult music with drill on position, scales, and technique.

II. Woodwind Methods

A. Flute

1. Flutist's Formulae

Georges Barrere. G. Schirmer. 75¢.

Excellent technique studies and scales.

Good for practice studies of the flutist, and for daily work.

2. Popp-Soussman Complete Method for Flute

Popp and Soussman. CF. \$2.50.

A marvelous flute method for thorough development of the player.

3. Preparatory Instructor for Flute

E. C. Moore, A. O. Seig. Appleton Music Publications, Inc. 35¢.

Book I--Illustrations are good, particularly on the embouchure. Method works toward building low register first; does not introduce the grupetto and trill in this book. If using this book, use a book that provides this drill material as a follow-up.

4. Rubank Elementary Method

A. C. Petersen. RU. 75¢.

Flute and Piccolo.

No photographs; slurs inadequately treated; very little use of high register. Good use of tunes and duets.

5. Rubank Intermediate Method

A. C. Petersen, Joseph Skornicka. RU. 75¢.

Adequate treatment of keys and upper register.

Rhythm patterns excellent.

6. Supplementary Studies for Flute

R. M. Endersen. RU. 75¢.

These studies are unnecessary if a good method is selected.

B. Oboe

1. The Music Educator's Basic Method for Oboe

Milburn E. Carey. CF. 75¢.

Material on care of the instrument; fingering chart. Well graded material; slurs introduced early; solos.

2. Oboe Method

Bruno Labate and Theodore Niemann. CF. \$2.50.

Revised by Bruno Labate.

An excellent method.

3. Rubank Elementary Method of Oboe

M. W. Hovey. RU. 75¢.

No illustrations. Progression of keys is sufficiently graded; solos; duets.

4. Technical Exercises and Complete Course of Scale Studies for Oboe

G. Pares. CF. 50¢.

Excellent scale studies. May be used for supplementary material. Available for all instruments.

C. Clarinet

1. An Elementary Method for the Boehm Clarinet

Leyland Whipple. Cundy-Boetteney Co. 50¢.

Contains a number of good tunes. Print is too small; not illustrated; small.

2. Baermann Method

Carl Baermann. CF. \$1.50; \$2.00; \$3.00.

Books I, II, III, IV, V, and VI.

Book I is not recommended.

Book II is excellent for preparatory scales and can be used successfully with Langenus fingered scales. Studies should be taken in consecutive order with continued repetition on all exercises of solo character.

Book III--Daily exercises, covers clarinet thoroughly; contains scales and slurs.

Book IV--Excellent studies in solo form. Excerpts and compositions for building style; not practical for school use.

3. The DeCaprio Clarinet Method
Remick Music Corporation. 75¢.
Key range limited, not enough upper register material.
Good tunes.
4. Famous Clarinet Cadenzas
Walter C. Schad. Belwin. 75¢.
Not a method, but for an advanced clarinet player who wants practice in playing the famous cadenzas.
5. Gower and Voxman Clarinet Method
Gower and Voxman. JMC. 75¢.
Modern clarinet method; progresses logically, practically a self-instructor. Adequate use of tunes and rhythms. Introduces upper register by connecting it with lower. Well illustrated. May be used for clarinet class, not for use of full band.
6. Langenus Fingered Scales
Langenus. CF. 75¢.
Contains the major chromatic, and minor scales through complete register of clarinet with all fingerings.
Excellent for private teaching or classwork.
7. Klose-Prescott
Klose and Prescott. CF. \$1.00.
Klose wrote the original method; Prescott selected parts for use in new book. A superb method containing valuable material for the development of clarinet players. Has definite assignment chart for individual grading; duets; drills. Illustrations are inadequate; binding insecure.
8. Music Educators Basic Method for Clarinet
Leopold Liegl. CF. 75¢.
Introduces upper register with A to E combination; key range limited; too much theory in treatment of lower tones; contains good treatment of slurs; not enough tunes.
9. Preparatory Instructor
E. C. Moore and A. O. Sieg.
Book I--35¢. For children in grades 3, 4, and 5.
Book II--35¢. Upper register material.

Preparatory Instructor--Combination of Book I
Book II. 75¢.

Deals with low register only; excellent if interested in building low register thoroughly before taking upper register. Emphasis on slurs, building tone and smoothness in playing. Slow but thorough. Good for supplementary use.

10. Rubank Advanced Clarinet Method

Voxman and Gower. RU. \$1.00.

Intermediate, not advanced method. Does not treat the high register; contains material for lower and middle register; very little exercise or study material above C3. Not enough material on tone production; inadequate treatment of difficult keys. Contains good duets.

11. Rubank Elementary Method for Clarinet

N. W. Hovey and J. E. Skornicka. RU. 75¢.

First section of method is good. Not enough drill on high notes; poor key range. Contains adequate tunes; rhythmically sound, extends only to C3.

12. Rubank Intermediate Method for Clarinet

Joseph Skornicka and Robert Miller. RU. 75¢.

Key range too limited, not enough attention given to scales and high tones. Treatment of slurs, which is fine for tone study. Few scales are introduced, but material is musical.

13. Studies and Exercises for Clarinet and Saxophone
Cundy-Bettoney Company.

D. Bassoon

1. Weissenborn Method

Louis Pietrini. CF.

An excellent method.

2. Bassoon Method

Don Lentz. Boosey Inc.

3. Rubank Elementary Bassoon Method

Skornicka. RU.

III. Brass Methods

A. Trumpet and Cornet

1. Arban-Prescott Method
Arban and Prescott. CF. \$1.00.
Assignments made at first of method. Entirely adequate; contains scales, syncopation, use of dotted notes, lip slurs. Gruppettos in this book are incorrect. Use this method with student who has had previous beginning work.
2. Beginners Cornet Method
Luciell Young. CF. \$1.25.
Lip slurs; tunes; progresses too rapidly. May be used before Arban.
3. Edwards-Hovey Method for Cornet and Trumpet
A. R. Edwards and N. W. Hovey. Belwin Inc. \$1.00.
Carefully graded; material is good for first book. Inadequate material on lip slurs; no emphasis on high register; some solo material. Each plate contains a blank staff for students' work and exercises to be written by the teacher.
4. Foundation Method
E. F. Goldman. DF. \$1.25.
Excellent treatment of the lip slur. Similar to Arban-Prescott, but not as thorough.
5. Music Educator's Basic Method for Cornet or Trumpet
Mark M. Hindsley. CF. 75¢.
A good method; makes splendid use of slur. One tune to each page, key distribution good. Illustrations are inadequate.
6. National Self-Teacher
Chart Publishing House Inc. 25¢
Contains all U. S. Army and Navy signal calls and marches; information about drum additional material. Exercises for lip development on the cornet.
7. Preparatory Instructor for Cornet
E. C. Moore and A. O. Seig.
Appleton Music Publishing co. 35¢.
May be used as first book to precede Arban. Interesting method; first exercises are excellent for instrument. Not enough material on lip slurs; tunes are few. New notes are introduced in an interesting manner. May be used in the public school.

8. Rubank Advanced Method
W. M. Gower and H. Voxman. RU. \$1.00.
Contains good material; adequate lip slurs; good duets; a practice and grade report in the first of the book which is valuable. No procedure for building high register.
9. Rubank Elementary Method
Robinson and Skornicka. RU. 75¢.
Opening register good; proceeds with whole notes, half notes, quarter notes to page 5. Progresses slowly; tunes begin on page 14 and employ skills not developed by method. Lacking in lip slurs; too fragmentary. Duets are on last four pages.
10. Rubank Intermediate Method for Trumpet or Cornet
J. E. Skornicka. RU. 75¢.
Better than beginning method; uses tunes extensively. Exercises are tuneful, but does not contain exercises for development of lip slurs on high register. No illustrations; fragmentary.

B. French Horn

1. Complete Method for the French Horn
Oscar Franz. CF. \$2.50.
Excellent method for private use. Contains material from operas. For students who advance rapidly.
2. French Horn Passages
Max P. Pottag. Belwin. \$1.50.
For French players in high school who are playing fairly advanced music. Difficult passages from symphonic works. In duet form.
3. Horn Symphony
G. E. Holmes. RU. 50¢.
Supplementary tunes for horns; excellent for four horns. Not a method; use as supplementary material. May be used after Music Education Book.
4. Modern Method for French Horn
Lorenzo Sansone. Cundy-Bettaney. \$2.50.
A method.
5. The Music Educator's Basic Method for French Horn
Oren A. Henning. CF. 75¢.
Graded material. Makes good use of tunes; splendid use of slur, but does not have section of lip slurs. Uses arpeggio slurs, or interval and scale slurs instead. Charts include transposition to E parts.

Excellent illustrations; adequate explanations of stopping, etc. Good treatment of lower register. Has educational helps (key signatures--page 20) and good discussion on intervals. Also discusses bass clef, which is essential for French horn.

6. Pottag-Hovey Method for French Horn

Max P. Pottag and N. W. Hovey.

Belwin. \$1.00.

Well graded material; good fingering chart; new notes introduced correctly; adequate treatment of lip slur and scales; rhythmic material. Easy tunes; good duets. Charts include transposition to E^b parts. Theory is introduced as needed. No illustrations.

7. Preparatory Instructor for French Horn

E. C. Moore and A. O. Seig. Appleton. 35¢.

Material well graded. Illustrations; fingering chart. Lacking in slurring exercises and tunes. Charts include transposition to E^b parts.

8. Rubank Elementary Method for French Horn

J. E. Skornicka. RU. 75¢.

Fingering chart; easy duets and quartets; adequate tunes. No material for lip slurs; no illustrations; not enough treatment of lower register.

9. Technical Exercises and Scale Studies for French Horn.

G. Fares. CF. 50¢.

Thorough study of scales--unequaled in development of scale technique. Use where scale studies are limited.

C. Trombone and Baritone

1. Arban-Prescott - Trombone and Baritone.

Prescott Technic System.

Arban and Prescott. CF. \$1.00.

Good illustrations; excellent chart but difficult to read. Not to be used for beginners.

2. Cimera-Hovey Method for Trombone and Baritone

Jaroslav Cimera and Nilo W. Hovey. BHB. \$1.00.

Belwin chart is detached; no illustrations; lacking in solos. Well graded; line for additional exercises; slurs used at the beginning; proper emphasis on long sustained tones; many duets. Range is not expanded enough, especially in low and high register.

3. The Music Educators Basic Method for Baritone
Mark H. Hindsley. CF. 75¢.
Material well graded. Illustrations; chart;
few tunes, not enough material on scales or slurs.
4. The Music Educators Basic Method for Trombone
John T. Roberts. CF. 75¢.
Illustrations are good. Chart adequate. Material
on position is excellent. Tunes are interesting;
scale studies are good. Few exercises for develop-
ment of lip.
5. One Hundred and Seventy Studies for Trombone
Jaroslav Cimerá. BMB. \$1.00.
Not enough variety in exercises; little attention
is given to scales and tunes. Well graded material;
alternate positions are properly marked.
6. Preparatory Instructor for Baritone
E. C. Moore and A. O. Seig. Appleton. 35¢.
Bass clef and treble clef; material well graded;
excellent illustrations; notes are introduced by
an interesting method.
7. Preparatory Instructor for Trombone
E. C. Moore and A. O. Seig. Appleton. 35¢.
Excellent illustrations. Well graded material;
not enough attention given to lip development or
slur. Would have to be used with a book of tunes.
8. Rubank Elementary Method
N. H. Long. RU. 75¢. Trombone and Baritone.
Chart in first of book is difficult for children
to understand. No illustrations. Material well
graded; good material on position; adequate tunes.
Not enough attention is given to lip slur and
long slurs.

D. Tuba

1. Arban-Prescott First and Second Year Tuba
Arban and Prescott. Prescott technique system.
E flat and BB flat tuba. CF. \$1.00.
Used in conjunction with Prescott technique system.
Confusing to a beginner, should be used as a second
book of instruction.
2. Daily Technical Exercises and Complete Course of
Scale Studies for BB flat Bass
G. Pares. CF. 50¢
Supplementary. Excellent for scales and technical
material. It is not a method, and should be used
in conjunction with other books.

3. The Music Educator's Basic Method
Mark H. Hindsley. CF. 75¢
For E flat tuba. Illustrated.
4. Preparatory Instructor for Bases, BB Flat and E flat
E. C. Moore and A. O. Seig. Appleton. 35¢.
Excellent illustrations and good fingering chart.
Well graded; good introduction of new tones; use of various keys useful. No tunes, strictly a method.
5. Rubank Elementary Method for E Flat and BB Flat Bass
N. W. Hovey. RU. 75¢.
Adequate fingering chart; no illustrations. Key distribution and tunes are excellent. Well graded material, but inadequate treatment of lip exercises.

IV. Percussion Methods

A. Drum

1. Drum Technique in the Band and Orchestra
Ludwig and Ludwig. 25¢
Contains thirteen rudiments of drumming; not a method. Does not provide enough practice material, but contains important information.
2. Drumology
Andrew V. Scott. \$1.25.
3. The Harry A. Bower System
Bower. \$1.50.
Vol. I--drums
Vol. II--bells and zylophone
Vol. III--tympani.
Complete book, \$3.50.
Excellent reference book; should be in every school library.
4. Jenkins Drum-Bugle Folio
JMC. 35¢
For an organization already developed.
5. Junior Bugle and Drum
Ed Chenette. RU. 30¢.

6. The Leedy Roll-Off
Leedy Mnf. Co. Free.
A catalogue and manual for the development of drum and bugle corp; contains all valuable information on care of drums.
7. Ludwig Drummer
Ludwig and Ludwig. Will be sent on request.
Magazine and catalogue.
8. Ludwig Drum and Bugle Manual
Ludwig and Ludwig.
A manual for drum and bugle corp; well illustrated.
9. Novel Street Beats
GHMC. Complimentary.
For the marching band.
10. Progressive Studies for the Snare Drummer
Carl E. Gardner. CF. 75¢.
An excellent method. \$5.00 for complete method, including Books I, II, III, and IV.
11. Rhythmic Foundation Through Drumming
Louis G. Wersen. CF. 75¢
Illustrations are good; well graded; progresses slowly; uses solos advantageously; goes far technically. Similar to Paul Yoder method.
12. Rubank Elementary Method for Drum
Paul Yoder. RU. 75¢.
Rudimental system; logical; continues gradually, builds slowly. Good for public school purpose.
13. The Straight System
Edward B. Straight. Chart Music Publishing House Inc. \$1.50.
A superb method. A rapid approach to drumming; very logically arranged.
Book I--Lesson File.
Book II--Triple Rhythm.
Book III--American Drummer.
14. Ten Characteristic Solos for Small Drums
Jaromir Weinberger. BHB. 40¢
An excellent book for the advanced drummer.

CHAPTER III

ORCHESTRAL AND BAND METHODS

A. Orchestral Methods

1. All Wagner Festival Program
Frederick Stock, George Dasch, Osbourne McConathy.
Silver Burdett. 75¢.
Series for orchestra and optional chorus. Part of a symphony series containing six sets of books, each with an entire planned program. Program I may be used with grade school orchestra. There are five complete miscellaneous programs and one "all-Wagner" program.
2. Classical Gems for Orchestra
Bruno Reibold. Sam Fox Co. 50¢.
Excellent. Playable with a good high school orchestra. May be used as fourth or fifty book for a beginning orchestra.
3. Classics for Everybody
Henri Weber. Belwin. 50¢.
Playable as solo or duet numbers. Simplified music; first violin playable in first position. Ten numbers included in book; arranged for school orchestra.
4. Educational Orchestra Album
Selected by George Lindsay and George Spangler.
Arranged by Charles J. Roberts. CF. 50¢.
Playable by a grade school orchestra.
5. Festival Orchestra Book
E. H. Bergh and H. V. Bergh. Arranged by Don Wilson. GEMC. 50¢.
First violin parts remain in first position; bowing difficult in places; difficulty of music warrants study of upper positions.
6. Fox Little Symphony Orchestra Folio
J. S. Zamecnik. Fox. 50¢.
Excellent literature; melodic, contains a variety of material.

7. The Follow-Through Orchestra Folio
Irvin Cheyette and Charles Roberts. CF. 50¢.
Program notes. Material arranged as a program.
Some numbers playable with intermediate and some
with advanced players.
8. Gems For Everybody
Henri Weber. Belwin. 50¢.
Tunes are simplified; written in flat keys.
9. Intermediate Orchestra Folio
DeLamater. RU. 50¢.
Simplified arrangement of well-known music.
Playable by advanced high school orchestra.
Violin parts are not edited.
10. Light Overtures for School Orchestra
Julius S. Seredy. CF. 50¢.
Overtures would be suitable for special occasions,
such as graduation exercises.
11. The Marcelli Folio
Nino Marcelli. CF. 40¢.
Tunes for grade school orchestra. Compositions by
well-known composers.
12. Modern Masters Orchestra Folios
Bruno Reibold. RU. 50¢.
Excellent for high school orchestra. Good arrange-
ments.
13. Modern Miniature Masterpieces for Orchestra
Arranged by Charles J. Roberts. CF. 50¢.
Twenty-four numbers, large per cent of music is
not by standard orchestral writers. Music diffi-
cult enough to require work; time better spent with
symphonic works.
14. Modern School Graded Orchestra Books
Arranged by Charles J. Roberts. CF. 50¢.
Published in three volumes; all violin parts include
an advanced violin part. Good composers; playable
by grade school orchestra.
15. The Philharmonic Orchestra Folio
Ditson. 50¢.
Good arrangements; tunes by standard composers.
Excellent for high school; numbers are available
separately or as a bound volume. Most string parts
are edited.

16. Pochon Album for School Orchestras
Alfred Pochon. CF. 50¢.
Twenty-five classics, country dances and folk songs for particular purpose of teaching folk music and classic dances. Fine practice for technique and rhythmic training.
17. Pomp Folio for Miniature Symphony Orchestra
Arranged by H. W. Glenn. Boosey-Hawkes. 50¢.
Several numbers are playable with two pianos, chorus, and various instruments. Advanced violin parts are written in the upper positions; violin parts edited as accompaniment and as solo.
18. Pro-Art Orchestra Folio
Arranged by Clifford Demarest. Fitzsimmons. 60¢.
19. Progressive Orchestra Folio
Arranged by Julius S. Sereby. CF. 50¢.
Four Volumes. Volume II is probably best choice of the four volumes.
20. Opera for Everybody
Henri Weber. Belwin. 50¢.
May be used to familiarize orchestra with tunes from operas. Would not be useful as program material.
21. Superior Orchestra Folio
Charles J. Roberts and Julius Sereby. CF. 50¢
Published in three volumes, each contains between fifteen and seventeen numbers. All three volumes may be played by the average high school orchestra.

B. Octavo Size Orchestra Folios

1. Ace Album for Orchestra
Arranged by George H. Sanders. Ascher. 35¢.
An old method.
2. Activity Orchestra Folio
Merle J. Isaac. CF. 35¢
Transitional material for beginning orchestra.
May follow first string class book.
3. Achievement Orchestra Folio
Arranged by Merle J. Isaac. CF. 35¢.
Extremely simplified arrangements.

4. Advancement Orchestra Folio
Arranged by Merle J. Isaac. CF. 40¢.
Contains excerpts from a Haydn Symphony;
Beethoven's "Country Dance in C," Schubert's
"Serenade," and other similar numbers. May be
used by a grade school or junior high school
orchestra.
5. Album of Famous Waltzes for Orchestra
Arranged by Emil Ascher. Emil Ascher Inc. 40¢.
For high school orchestra.
6. Ascher's Advanced Orchestra Book III
Arranged by Emil Ascher. Emil Ascher Inc. 35¢.
Too difficult to study for quality of material.
7. Ascher's Beginners Book
Emil Ascher. Emil Ascher Inc. 35¢.
May be used for sight-reading by an elementary
school orchestra.
8. The Crescendo Orchestra Folio
Arranged by Maynard and Glenn. Belwin. 35¢.
Orchestra and Chorus. Excellent for grade school
orchestra. Excerpts from sonatas and symphonies
in simplified form.
9. The First Orchestra Folio
DeLanater. RU. 35¢.
Excerpts from sonatas and symphonies in a simplified
form. An excellent book for a grade school orchestra.
10. The Golden Book of Favorite Songs
Hall and McCreary. 80¢.
Use for "assembly sings."
11. Three New Orchestral Specialities
Bruno Reibold. SF. 25¢ per part; \$3.00 for
small orchestra. Includes a collection of
Christmas music.

C. Band Methods

1. Band Fundamentals
Carl Webber. Witmark and Sons. 50¢.
Also transcribed for orchestra.
Adequate treatment of rhythm. Explanations are
concise and easily understood. Based on tune
method; last one-third is devoted to easy band
numbers.

2. The Ditson School and Community Band Series
Osbourne McConnathy, Morgan and Clark. ODC. 75¢.
First half of book is material on scales; last half, band arrangements of several melodies. Supplementary material.
3. Elementary Band Course
C. W. van Duesen, J. L. Osley, J. Kustodowich, and L. Mann. RU. 60¢.
4. The Filmore Beginning Band Book
James M. Fulton. Filmore. 60¢.
Well-graded material within easy range of instruments.
5. Foundation to Band Playing
F. O. Griffin. JMC. 75¢.
For beginning band.
6. Foundation to Band Playing (Book II)
F. O. Griffin. JMC. 75¢.
7. The Lockhart Band Class Method
Lee M. Lockhart and Edmund Goehring.
Witmark and Sons. 30¢.
Contains a good drum method.
8. Modern Approach to Scale Playing
Carl Webber. White Smith Music Company. 40¢.
Excellent for teaching scales; approached from tetrachord viewpoint. A technique builder for brass and woodwind players. May be used with any grade of band method. (Supplementary material).
9. The Moore Band Course
E. C. Moore. CF. 75¢.
Do not consider for beginners.
10. Smith-Yoder-Bachman Ensemble Band Method
Smith-Yoder-Bachman. KMC. 65¢.
Well written; excellent illustrations. Adequate attention is given to rhythm, theory of music, tunes, solos, and band numbers. Good finger chart; piano accompaniment.

D. Combination Band and Orchestral Methods

1. Academic Method
John A. O'Sheer. CF. \$1.00.
Progresses too rapidly.

2. Bowing and Blowing
George Keenan and Wilfred Schlager. JMC. 50¢.
Tunes. Good for sight-reading.
3. Four and Twenty Folk Songs
Irving Cheyette. CF. 50¢.
Supplementary tunes.
4. Foundation to Band and Orchestra Playing
F. O. Griffin. JMC. 75¢.
Band method transposed for orchestra.
This is a combination method, but not suitable
for orchestra. Begins in flat keys; difficult
for beginning strings.
5. Fundamentals to Orchestra and Band Playing
Irving Cheyette and Charles J. Robert. CF. 60¢.
Material is good technique study for brass. No
indications of fingerings; few instructions.
6. Ground Work of Orchestral Training
Claude Rader. JMC. 75¢.
All instruments in one class. Progresses slowly.
More valuable for band instruments than for strings.
7. Lockhart Orchestra Class Method
Lockhart. M. Witmark and Sons. 50¢.
First choice for teaching all instruments in one
class. Progresses very slowly. No indications of
fingerings or bowings. Piano accompaniment.
8. The New Way Method for Band and Orchestra Ensemble Training
W. A. Storer. JMC. 65¢.
Impractical; for beginners and advanced students
in one class.
9. Rubank Elementary Course
C. W. van Duesen, J. Kustodowich, L. Mann, and
J. L. Osley. RU. 50¢.
No instructions for bowings or fingerings.
10. Rubank Group Method for Orchestra and Band Instruments
R. E. Moehlmann. RU. 50¢.
Good exercises; contains interesting tunes. No
accompaniments.
11. Stuber's Melody Method for Orchestra
Benjamin F. Stuber. Raymond Hoffman Company. 75¢.
Supplementary material.

12. Victor Method

Victor Publishing Company. 75¢.

Books I through VIII.

Cannot be used with all instruments at all times.
Use of flat keys first is difficult for stringed
instruments. May be used to best advantage as a
band method.

CHAPTER IV

PUBLISHERS

Location of Publishing Houses

1. Appleton Music Publications Inc., Appleton, Wisconsin.
2. Ascher, Emil, Inc., 315 Fourth Avenue, New York City, New York.
3. Barnhouse, C. L., Conservatory Bldg., Oskaloosa, Iowa.
4. Boosey-Hawkes-Belwin, New York City, New York. Originally a London publishing company.
5. Chappell and Company, Ltd., New York City, New York.
6. Chart Music Publishing House Inc., Chicago, Illinois.
7. Cole, M. M., Publishing Company, Chicago, Illinois.
8. Elkan-Vogel Company Inc., 1716 Sansom Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
9. Fillmore Music House, 528 Elm Street, Cincinnati, Ohio.
(Band)
10. Fischer, Carl, New York City, New York.
11. Fitzsimmons, F. T., Company.
12. Hoffman, Raymond A., Company.
13. Fox, Sam, Publishing Company, Cleveland, Ohio.
14. Gamble-Hinged Music Company, Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois.
15. Jenkins, J. W. Music Company, Kansas City, Missouri.
16. Kjos, Neil A., Music Company, 14 West Lake Street, Chicago, Illinois.
17. Leedy Manufacturing Company, Leedy Bldg., Elkhart, Indiana.
18. Ludwig Music Company, 709 Pine Street, St. Louis, Missouri.

19. Lyons Band Instrument Company, 14 West Lake Street, Chicago, Illinois.
20. Oliver Ditson Company, Boston, Massachusetts.
21. Peate's Music House Inc., 49 Franklin Square, Utica, New York.
22. Retter, Louis, Music Company, St. Louis, Missouri.

Publisher's Key

1. CF - Carl Fischer.
2. CLB - C. L. Barnhouse.
3. Fill. - Fillmore Publishing Company.
4. GHMC - Gamble-Hinged Music Company.
5. GSI or GSC - G. Schirmer and Company.
6. GC - Ginn and Company.
7. HTF - H. T. Fitzsimmons.
8. JMC - Jenkins Music Company.
9. KMC - Neil A. Kjos Music Company.
10. LMC - Ludwig Music Company.
11. LRMC - Louis Retter Music Company.
12. ODC - Oliver Ditson Company.
13. PAS - Paul A. Schmitt Music Company.
14. PPMC - Paull-Pioneer Music Corporation.
15. RAH - Raymond A. Hoffman Company.
16. RU - Rubank Incorporated.
17. SGI - Schroeder and Gunther Incorporated.
18. WMC - Willis Music Company.
19. Cole - Cole Publishing Company.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

The evaluation of instrumental methods as presented in the foregoing chapters has been vastly enlightening and eminently worth-while to the writer. It is the hope of the writer that this evaluation will prove useful to other students and teachers of instrumental music.

In the study of literature for instruments belonging to the string family, the writer has found that there are many merits in the Sevcik, Wohlfhart, and Kreutzer studies for the violin. This premise is based upon the sound presentation of the works and upon the practice in finger and bow dexterity as emphasized by each composer. In the class methods for violin, the Waller String Class Method has been chosen because of its thorough treatment of bowings and its emphasis on technique. For the viola, the writer favors the Method D'Alto by Martinn and the Scale and Arpeggio Studies for Viola by Lifschey. The basis for this choice lies in the fact that ample attention is given in each method toward the development of technical facility. For the class, because of its thorough system the Waller

String Class Method is advised for the viola. Of the literature for 'cello, study of the works by Lee, Dotzauer, and Duport is recommended for the development of sensitivity to intonation, dexterity in bowing, and fingering technique. The Waller String Class Method is especially suited for class instruction in 'cello because of the systematic presentation of material and the consistent emphasis on the values of repetition in practice. For the double bass, the Simandl method has been selected as superior for use in the private studio and the Waller method as outstanding for use in the class.

In the woodwind group, the Popp-Soussman Complete Method for Flute and the Flutist's Formulae by Barrere are preferred because of their skillful presentation of technique studies, and for the systematic arrangement of practice material. For the oboe, the revised Oboe Method by Labate and Niemann, and the Technical Exercises and Complete Course of Scale Studies for Oboe by Pares, are suggested as the most useful methods for a thorough study of the instrument. The Music Educator's Basic Method for Oboe by Carey has been chosen as an adequate class method on the basis of its well-graded material. In the evaluation of clarinet literature, the Klose-Prescott method has been found to be valuable for content of drill material and for the excellent illustrations. The Gower and Voxman book has been specified as a well-integrated method for use in class instruction because of the logical

progression of material. For bassoon, the Weissenborn Method has been selected on the basis of its meticulous presentation.

The Arban-Prescott method has been chosen as foremost in the list of trumpet literature in the evaluation of methods for the brass instruments. This method contains valuable material on scales, rhythm, and lip slurs. The Pottag-Hovey Method for French Horn and the Technical Exercises and Scale Studies for French Horn by Pares is suggested as excellent literature for the presentation of technique and scale studies. For the trombone, Jaroslav Cimerá's literature has been found to be valuable for the enlargement of fundamental techniques and content of comprehensive studies. For tuba, the Arban-Prescott method has been considered superior for its valuable content of material on scales, lip slurs, and rhythmic drill.

The Progressive Studies for the Snare Drummer by Carl E. Gardner has been selected as an excellent method for the rapid development of technique for the percussion player.

It is difficult to select a representative method from orchestral and band literature because of the wide scope of material; however, the Pochon Album for School Orchestras and the Delamater First Orchestra Folio merit particular mention. Of the band methods, the Smith-Yoder-Bachman Method and the Filmore Beginning Band Book are suggested for their systematic arrangement of well-organized material.

This evaluation of methods has been based primarily on the adaptability of the works to the American school system. Other considerations include the cost of the work in relation to the quality of the material, the progressive composition of the lessons, and the psychological appeal of the method to the student. Although the new methods have not been wholly disregarded, more attention has been given to those books which, in the writer's opinion, have proved their worth through constant usage and practical application.