

COMPARING ECONOMIC SYSTEMS



| | |
|---|--|
| Module description: | Every society operates with a mixed economic system, combining the influences of market and command models in order to form a functioning economy and government. Individual countries have unique combinations of the market and command influences depending on how countries prioritize different economic goals. Students will learn the characteristics of the market and command systems and evaluate the benefits and consequences of each system |
| Template task (include number, type, level): | Task 2. SS Argumentative/Analysis L1, 2. [Insert essential question] After reading _____ (literature or informational texts), write a/an _____ (essay, report, or substitute) that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from the text(s). L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give one or more examples from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position. |
| Teaching task: | What combination of market and command systems do you believe creates an ideal mixed economy? After reading informational and opinion texts, write an essay that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from the texts. Be sure to acknowledge competing views. |
| Grade(s)/Level: | 10/11 |
| Discipline: | Social Studies |
| Course: | Economics |
| Authors: | Kathy Thiebes |
| Contact Information: | Social Studies Teacher, Centennial High School, Gresham, OR School Email: Kathy_thiebes@centennial.k12.or.us , Personal Email: kthiebes@gmail.com |

SECTION I: WHAT TASK?

TEACHING TASK

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Teaching task: | What combination of market and command systems do you believe creates an ideal mixed economy? After reading informational and opinion texts, write an essay that addresses the question and supports your position with evidence from the texts. Be sure to acknowledge competing views. |
| Reading texts: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ John Edwards and Edward Tanner, “Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System” (Article) ▪ David Kestenbaum, “Denmark Thrives Despite High Taxes” (Transcript of Broadcast) ▪ William Booth “As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder the Future” (Article) ▪ Paul Krugman and John Tierney, “Wal-Mart: Good or Evil” (Article) ▪ “The World’s Best Countries” (<i>interactive infographic</i>) |
| Background to share with students: | Every society operates with a mixed economic system, combining the influences of market and command models in order to form a functioning economy and government. Individual countries have unique combinations of the market and command influences depending on how countries prioritize different economic goals. Students will engage in activities and take notes on the content for 3 days prior to beginning the module. Students will also keep all work in a portfolio. |
| Extension (optional): | Students participate in a formal class debate about the future of America’s economic system using their essays and other research to defend their market and command preferences on different topics (healthcare, welfare, education, taxes, etc.). |

CONTENT STANDARDS FROM STATE OR DISTRICT

| Standards source: | Oregon State Standards - http://www.ode.state.or.us |
|-------------------|--|
| NUMBER | CONTENT STANDARDS |
| SS.HS.EC.02.01 | Compare and contrast the allocation of goods and services in market and command economies. |
| SS.HS.EC.04 | Evaluate different economic systems, comparing advantages and disadvantages of each. |

COMMON CORE STATE STANDARDS

| NUMBER | COLLEGE AND CAREER READINESS ANCHOR STANDARDS FOR READING |
|--------|---|
| 1 | Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text. |
| 3 | Analyze how and why individuals, events, and ideas develop and interact over the course of a text. |
| 8 | Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. |
| 9 | Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take. |
| 10 | Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently. |

| NUMBER | COLLEGE AND CAREER READINESS ANCHOR STANDARDS FOR WRITING |
|--------|---|
| 1 | Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. |
| 4 | Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. |
| 9 | Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. |
| 10 | Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a Period or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audience. |

SCORING RUBRIC (2010-11 VERSION)

| | ADVANCED | MEETS EXPECTATIONS | NOT YET |
|------------------|--|--|---|
| Focus | Addresses all aspects of the prompt with a highly focused and convincing response. | Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response. | Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task. |
| Reading/Research | Demonstrates accurate and effective use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal and a solid understanding of content as presented in the prompt. | Demonstrates generally effective use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal and an understanding of the content as presented in the prompt. | Demonstrates weak use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal. |
| Controlling Idea | Establishes a substantive and credible claim or proposal. L2 Acknowledges relevant competing arguments, defending or qualifying the claim or proposal as appropriate. | Establishes a credible claim or proposal L2 Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim or proposal. | Establishes a claim or proposal but is weak or off task L2 Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments. |
| Development | Develops a detailed and convincing argument or proposal; provides relevant evidence in the form of examples or explanations with statements from reading material. | Develops a satisfactory argument or proposal using reasoning with adequate detail to support claim or proposal; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument or proposal. | Lacks details to support reasoning; examples or explanations are weak or not relevant. |
| Organization | Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasoning; applies a logic model, such as deductive reasoning. | Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasoning; applies a logic model. | Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing. |
| Conventions | Demonstrates a well-developed command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose. | Demonstrates a satisfactory command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose. | Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose. |

SECTION 2: WHAT SKILLS?

| SKILL | DEFINITION |
|---|---|
| SKILLS CLUSTER 1: PREPARING FOR THE TASK | |
| Bridging conversation | Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns. |
| Task and rubric analysis | Ability to understand and explain the task’s prompt and rubric. |
| SKILLS CLUSTER 2: READING PROCESS | |
| Active reading | Ability to understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task and develop an understanding of a text by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information. |
| Note-taking | Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase. |
| Organizing notes | Ability to prioritize and narrow notes and other information. |
| SKILLS CLUSTER 3: TRANSITION TO WRITING | |
| Bridging conversation | Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase. |
| SKILLS CLUSTER 4: WRITING PROCESS | |
| Initiation of task | Ability to establish a claim and consolidate information relevant to task. |
| Planning | Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an argumentation task. |
| Development | Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure. |
| Revision & editing | Ability to apply revision strategies to refine development of argument, including line of thought, language, tone, and presentation. |

SECTION 3: WHAT INSTRUCTION?

| PACING | SKILL AND DEFINITION | PRODUCT AND PROMPT | SCORING | INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES |
|---|--|--|---------|--|
| SKILLS CLUSTER 1: PREPARING FOR THE TASK | | | | |
| 1 class period | <p><u>1. Task engagement</u></p> <p>Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns.</p> | <p><u>Short Response</u></p> <p>In a quick write response, what is your first reaction to the task prompt? What strategies did you use to interpret this prompt?</p> | None | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Opener</u> - students will complete an opening journal entry and discussion in order to review the content on economic systems. Example: “What would be the positive and negative effects if America chose to eliminate public schools in favor of an all-private system?” • Students complete the quick-write in their Writer’s Notebook. • <u>Socratic Seminar</u> – After the quick-write, students will engage in a short Socratic Seminar to help shape their individual views and understanding of the task using dialogue instead of debate. • Extra Support – Provide struggling students with sentence starters and frameworks for their quick-writes. Example: I believe a _____ system would be the best type of system because _____. |
| 1 class period | <p><u>Task and Rubric Analysis</u></p> <p>Ability to understand and explain the task’s prompt and rubric.</p> | <p><u>Prompt:</u></p> <p>In your own words, write a brief explanation of what the task is asking you to do (students respond below the quick-write).</p> <p><u>Rubric:</u></p> <p>Students will translate the rubric in their own words.</p> | None | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have students share responses so that students can hear how each other are interpreting the task and encourage them to help each other when appropriate. • <u>Rubric Translation Activity</u> – Introduce rubric to class. In small groups, students will translate their assigned piece of the rubric in their own words. Students will then participate in a jigsaw and gallery walk to share /take notes on rubric translations. • Extra Support – Specifically plan groups to provide ideal peer-support for students who need it. • Teacher work - Review each student’s responses (task analysis and quick-write) to ensure she/he understands the task. |

SKILLS CLUSTER 2: READING PROCESS

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>Pre-Reading</u></p> <p>Ability to select appropriate texts and understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task</p> | <p><u>Reading Strategy Lids</u></p> <p>1) What strategies do you use to help you process your reading? 2) What information do you already know about topic of the first article: the healthcare debate and how taxes are related?</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of 5-6 of strategies for reading (can be strategies of others as well) Participates in class discussion of reading strategies and current knowledge of article topic. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As individuals, students write down 1 or 2 strategies that they use to help them understand what they read. Students share responses in pairs then must find 3 other strategy ideas from classmates to add to their lists (“give one, get one” activity) Create a class list of reading strategies and content knowledge of first article. Extra Support – Create bookmarks or laminated cards of reading strategies so students have consistent reminders of strategies. |
| <p>The following skills, Active Reading and Note-Taking, are completed in conjunction with each other for each text.</p> | | | | |
| 3 Class Periods | <p><u>2: Active reading</u></p> <p>Ability to understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task and develop an understanding of a text by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information</p> | <p><u>Annotated Articles</u></p> <p>Use annotation techniques and other reading strategies to demonstrate your reading process and your level of interaction with the text</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annotated or “actively read” article has a variety of marks (circles, underlining, stars, highlights, etc.). Annotation also includes written questions, connections, and insights in the margins. *Use annotation rubric to provide students feedback on their reading | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Frontload vocabulary synonyms for market and command economies. Students record in Vocabulary Notes section of their Writer’s Notebook. Instruction for the <u>first article</u> (“Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?”) should be very explicit and include group/partner work and teacher modeling. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher reads first 3 sentences of the article, modeling active reading and strategies. Students finish reading the rest of the article using a “think aloud” process with a partner. Teacher asks for a list of vocabulary that students struggled with and class discusses strategies for understanding words in context. Students record new vocabulary in the Vocabulary Notes section of their Writer’s Notebook. Students actively read and annotate the next 3 articles mostly independently with some teacher guidance and reflection in pairs. |

| | | | | |
|------------------------|--|---|--|--|
| (Same 3 class periods) | <p><u>Note-Taking</u></p> <p>Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.</p> | <p><u>Vocabulary list</u></p> <p>In your notebook, list words and phrases essential to the texts. Add definitions, and (if appropriate) notes on connotation in this context.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summaries contain “who, what, where, when and why” • Focus questions have an appropriate response - emerging or clear opinion is evident. • Writes in readable prose | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brief review of summary writing strategies. • Use a variety of reading/writing activities to help students improve processing skills of main idea and significance. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 25 word summary, QAR, reciprocal teaching, etc • Students get independent work time to respond to focus questions after completing the summary. Focus questions should lead students to take a stance on the market and command aspects of the article’s subject. When possible, students should discuss responses in pairs or as a group. • Extra Support – These activities are designed to provide support for all reading-levels. |
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>Organizing Notes</u></p> <p>Ability to prioritize and narrow notes and other information.</p> | <p><u>Notes and Graphic Organizer</u></p> <p>Prioritize relevant information in the “organizing notes” section of your Writer’s Notebook</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creates a prioritized set of notes that categorizes evidence. • Suggests implications drawn from information about the economic systems. • Writes in readable prose. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students place relevant information from the texts and their own background knowledge into the graphic organizer. • Students will prioritize the information in the graphic organizer by identifying which pieces of evidence they will use in their essay. • Extra Support – Provide students with specific examples of what kinds of information belongs in each section of the graphic organizer. Create a list of “leading questions” to help guide students in the process. Example: “What is one fact you learned from the healthcare article that supports a market system?” |

SKILLS CLUSTER 3: TRANSITION TO WRITING

| | | | | |
|----------------|---|---|------------|---|
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>Bridging Conversation</u></p> <p>Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase</p> | <p><u>Short response</u></p> <p>In a quick write, write brief overview of your essay. How will it be constructed and what is your central argument?</p> | No scoring | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review professional or other samples of writing type and structure. • Students will deconstruct and evaluate the article “As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder Future” using the rubric to guide critique. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Demonstrate patterns of development (e.g. from most important to least important) ○ Note the difference between an “explanation” and an “argument” ○ Evaluate effectiveness – Do you get the information and explanation you expect? Why? • Discuss the process for writing the essay. • Extra Support – Struggling readers should focus on fewer rubric components such as Reading/Research and Controlling Idea. |
|----------------|---|---|------------|---|

SKILLS CLUSTER 4: WRITING PROCESS

| | | | | |
|----------------|--|--|---|---|
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>Initiation of Task</u></p> <p>Ability to establish a controlling idea and consolidate information relevant to task</p> | <p><u>Paragraph</u></p> <p>1) Write a formal claim in your Writer’s Notebook using your quick-writes, notes, and article information to ensure a strong controlling idea.</p> <p>2) Write a draft introduction that will set the context for your claim.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Writes a claim that establishes a controlling idea and identifies key points that support development • Writes a draft introduction that sets an appropriate context for the claim. • Writes in readable prose. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Before students write their formal claim, review qualities of a strong claim as a class: must be an argument, include simple defense of the argument, and include categories to lead reader and organize essay. • In pairs, students will edit sample claim statements provided by the teacher. As a class, go over each thesis statement, asking for volunteers to identify the strong and weak characteristics of each statement. • After students have finished writing a formal claim, review the qualities of a strong opening paragraph: HOTT- Hook, Overview, Thesis, Transition. • In pairs, students share their claim statements and introduction. Student volunteers share their claim and introduction with the class for critique. • Extra Support – Provide students with sentence frames to help write the claim. For example: A _____ economic system is the ideal system because it provides a country with _____ and _____ (choose two “goals” from your notes). |
|----------------|--|--|---|---|

| | | | | |
|-----------------|---|--|---|--|
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>2. Planning</u></p> <p>Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an argumentation task.</p> | <p><u>Outline/Plan</u></p> <p>Create an outline including key elements drawn from your research and order them in some logical way (e.g. chronologically, sequentially).</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applies an outline strategy to develop reasoning for argument • Draws a credible implication from information about the differences between economic systems. • Writes in readable prose. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review text requirements: Students must use evidence from a <u>minimum</u> of 3 different texts in their essay. • Students independently write an outline using the template in their Writer’s Notebook. • In small groups, students share how they will organize their essays. • Extra Support – Students will focus on providing evidence from only one or two texts in their outline. |
| 1 Class Period | <p><u>Development</u></p> <p>Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.</p> | <p><u>Rough draft</u></p> <p>Write a rough draft of your essay consisting of 4-5 paragraphs. Includes an introduction, 2-3 body paragraphs and a conclusion.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demonstrates use of revision strategies that clarify logic and development of ideas; includes relevant details; improves word-usage and phrasing; and creates smooth transitions between sentences and paragraphs • Applies a text structure to organize reading material content and to explain key points related to the prompt. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review strategies for constructing body paragraphs: TEST – Topic sentence, Evidence, Significance, and Transition. • Create stations where students can get guidance on certain aspects of the essay: introduction, claim, evidence/analysis, and conclusion. Assign a strong student-writer at each station to help guide discussion and provide peer-review. Teacher spends time at each station assisting students. • Extra Support – Teacher leads “station” for students who need extra support in developing the essay. |
| 2 Class Periods | <p><u>Revision and Editing</u></p> <p>Ability to refine text, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.</p> | <p><u>Revised Draft</u></p> <p>Apply revision strategies for clarity, logic, language, cohesion, appearance, and conventions</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides complete draft with all parts. • Supports the opening in the later sections with evidence and citations. • Improves earlier edition. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students give each other feedback on rough drafts using the “peer review template”. • Students can email essays to teacher for efficient and basic feedback. • Discuss strategies for citing information using the Writer’s Notebook – MLA citation methods, quoting, paraphrasing. |

| | |
|--------------------|---|
| Final Draft | Submit your final draft before or on due date for scoring and feedback. |
|--------------------|---|

MATERIALS, REFERENCES AND SUPPORTS

| FOR TEACHERS | FOR STUDENTS |
|---|---|
| <p><u>Texts</u></p> <p>John Edwards and Michael Tanner, “Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?” (Article) http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp</p> <p>David Kestenbaum, “Denmark Thrives Despite High Taxes.” National Public Radio, <i>All Things Considered</i> (transcript of broadcast) http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=123126942</p> <p>William Booth, “As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder the Future.” <i>Washington Post</i> http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2010/09/16/AR2010091607381.html</p> <p>Paul Krugman and John Tierney, “Wal-Mart: Good or Evil.” <i>New York Times Upfront Magazine</i> (article) http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp</p> <p>“The World’s Best Countries” <i>Newsweek Magazine Online</i> (interactive infographic) http://www.newsweek.com/2010/08/15/interactive-infographic-of-the-worlds-best-countries.html</p> <p><u>Optional Texts:</u></p> <p>William Neuman, “Should the Government Tax Your Coke” <i>New York Times Upfront Magazine</i> (article) http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp</p> <p>Thomas Friedman, “Start-Ups, Not Bailouts.” <i>New York Times</i> (article) http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/opinion/04friedman.html?_r=1&scp=1&sq=Start-Ups.%20Not%20Bailouts&st=cse</p> | <p><u>Included in Appendix:</u></p> <p>Writer’s Notebook</p> <p>Rubric Translation</p> <p>Meta-Cognitive Log</p> <p>Active Reading Rubric</p> <p>Peer-Review Guide</p> |

SECTION 4: WHAT RESULTS?

STUDENT WORK SAMPLES

[SPW: INSERT NAMES OF PIECES, AND SAY THEY'RE IN THE APPENDIX]

CLASSROOM ASSESSMENT TASK (OPTIONAL: MAY BE USED AS PRE-TEST OR POST-TEST)

| | |
|---|--|
| Classroom assessment task | Do you believe that the federal minimum wage in America should be raised? After reading the article “Should the federal minimum wage be raised?”, write a short essay that addresses the question and supports your position with evidence from the texts. L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. |
| Background to share with students (optional): | The government plays a significant role in the development of America’s economy. Voters elect leaders who will represent their views on the government’s role in the economy. The federal minimum wage is a government regulation created in the 1930s to ensure workers receive adequate pay from employers. However, minimum wage is a government-intervention that has both positive and negative effects on America’s economy and its value is debated amongst politicians and the public. |
| Reading texts: | Edward Kennedy and Todd Stottlemeyer, “Should the federal minimum wage be raised?” http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/debate/index.asp?article=d0918 |

LDC ARGUMENTATION CLASSROOM ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

| | MEETS EXPECTATIONS | NOT YET |
|------------------|---|---|
| Focus | Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response. | Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task. |
| Reading/Research | Demonstrates generally effective use of reading material to develop an argument. | Demonstrates weak use of reading material to develop argument. |
| Controlling Idea | Establishes a credible claim and supports an argument that is logical and generally convincing. L2 Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim. | Establishes a claim and attempts to support an argument but is not convincing. L2 Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments. |
| Development | Develops reasoning to support claim; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument. | Reasoning is not clear; examples or explanations are weak or irrelevant. |
| Organization | Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasons. | Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing. |
| Conventions | Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose. | Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose. |

TEACHER WORK SECTION

Teacher thoughts: The module was very effective in my Economics classes. A few ideas to keep in mind for revision of the module:

- Provide more supports for ELL students who have very limited English.
- Use Meta-cognitive Logs instead of the Summary/Analysis Template

Possible variations:

- Formal class debate about market vs. democratic socialist economy
- Students are “stranded on an island” in small groups and must create an economic system to survive and create their idea of an ideal structure for the island’s government and economy.

APPENDIX CONTENTS

The attached materials support teaching this module:

[SPW: PUT STUDENT WORK FIRST]

Writer’s Notebook

Rubric Translation

Meta-Cognitive Log

Active Reading Rubric

Peer-Review Guide