

STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



James D. Montgomery
*Merit Board Chair
Jeff Brownfield
Executive Director*

March 4, 2016

FILE COPY

Dr. David M. Glassman
President
Eastern Illinois University

Dr. Paul McCann
Interim Vice President for Business Affairs
Eastern Illinois University

Ms. Linda Holloway
Interim Director of Human Resources
Designated Employer Representative
Eastern Illinois University

Ms. Leigh Moon
Director of Internal Auditing
Eastern Illinois University

Mr. James D. Montgomery
Merit Board Chair
State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. Daniel P. Caulkins
Merit Board Member
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at Eastern Illinois University. The audit period tested was December 1, 2012 through November 30, 2014. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Eastern Illinois University and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 236.


Jeff Brownfield
Executive Director

Eastern Illinois University Final Audit Report



State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

March 4, 2016

Audit Period

December 1, 2012 to November 30, 2014

Prepared by:

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Lucinda M. Neitzel". The signature is written in a cursive style and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Lucinda M. Neitzel

Assistant Director, Classification, Examination & Compensation

Eastern Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Table of Contents

Introduction 1
Executive Summary 3
Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plans 4

Appendices

Appendix A: Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service
Classification Specifications

Eastern Illinois University *Final Audit Report*

Introduction

PURPOSE

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) (110 ILCS 70/36b(3)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250)] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” (80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140(c)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted April 6-10, 2015. A formal exit conference was conducted on November 30, 2015, which included collaborative discussions with respect to addressing the audit findings included in this report.

OVERVIEW

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material and Non-Material Findings:

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**
The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.
- **Compensation Programs**
The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer’s use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer’s

compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines**

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

Lucinda Neitzel, Assistant Director, Classification, Examination & Compensation
Danielle Routh, Human Resource Associate
Amanda Zucco, Human Resource Associate

Eastern Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Executive Summary
YEAR ENDED – FY2015

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250), State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals, applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Number of</u>	<u>This Report</u>
Findings	2
Repeated findings from previous audit®	1®

SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL AND NON-MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Description</u>
EIU FY15-01	4	FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Correspond to Civil Service Classification Specifications
EIU FY15-02	7	FINDINGS (ILLINOIS ADMINISTRATIVE CODE) Temporary Upgrades Exceeding Thirty-Day Limitation

Eastern Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

EIU FY15-01 Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Correspond to Civil Service Classification Specifications

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) *State Universities Civil Service Act (Act), Section 70/36e Coverage*
- 2) *Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.30(a) Coverage*

All employees of the Illinois Community College Board, Southern Illinois University, Chicago State University, Eastern Illinois University, Governors State University, Illinois State University, Northeastern Illinois University, Northern Illinois University, Western Illinois University, University of Illinois, State Universities Civil Service System, State Universities Retirement System, the Illinois Student Assistance Commission, and the Board of Higher Education shall be covered by the University System described in Sections 36b to 36q, inclusive, of this Act, except the following persons:

- (1) The members and officers of the Merit Board and the board of trustees, and the commissioners of the institutions and agencies covered hereunder;
- (2) The presidents and vice-presidents of each educational institution;
- (3) Other principal administrative employees of each institution and agency as determined by the Merit Board;
- (4) The teaching, research and extension faculties of each institution and agency;
- (5) Students employed under rules prescribed by the Merit Board, without examination or certification.

Exemptions are authorized in accordance with current procedures, requiring verification of exemption authorization through the comprehensive development and ongoing review of accurate position descriptions when standard titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that positions originally exempted from Civil Service designations continue to remain valid.

Periodic job description reviews, updated procedures, and ongoing classification plan changes may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have been revised or changed, and may now fall within civil service classification plan parameters, requiring a review by the department. Consequently, this may result in a

collaborative effort to allow the Human Resources Office and the department an opportunity to convert a specific position, and any employee currently occupying the position, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

The Auditor reviewed approximately one-hundred (100) exempt position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, and identified twenty (20) positions listed in **Appendix A** appeared to be performing duties comparable to those found in various Civil Service classification specifications.

Cause (i.e., why condition occurred):

According to the Employer's payroll records, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

The inappropriate designation and identification of positions can lead to inaccurate exemption authorizations and potential violations of the Act, Code, and Exemption Procedures. Appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions are essential in validating exemption authorizations consistent with regulatory guidelines.

Finding from Previous Audit:

During the FY2013 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Auditor selected a sample of one-hundred (100) Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) position descriptions and determined that twenty-eight (28) exempted positions were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. *[Finding Code EIU FY13-01, pages 4-8].*

Recommendation:

The Illinois Administrative Code, Section 250.30(a) specifically provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institution or agency. Specifically, it states that "The Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board."

Accordingly, through the definition contained in the Exemption Procedures Manual, a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) "is defined as an employee who is charged with high level administrative responsibilities, whose decisions are based on administrative policies and who exercises discretion and independent judgment." Additionally, these appointments "can be defined as an employee who is in a position requiring knowledge of an advanced type in a field of science or learning customarily acquired by a prolonged course of specialized intellectual instruction and study, which requires the consistent exercise of discretion and judgment."

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in these standards, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches

appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing standard titles.

If it is determined that exempted positions identified through the audit process match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible or upon vacancy. In order to ensure an efficient transition for encumbered positions, we refer the Employer to the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan – provided by Linda C. Holloway, Interim Human Resources Director:

The university remains neutral with respect to this finding. As vacancies or new positions occur in the PAA positions, they are reviewed for appropriate Civil Service classifications by the Human Resources Department. While some positions may match closely with like Civil Service classifications, we feel that many of the positions that were identified in this audit simply were not accurately reflective of the composite duties and responsibilities assigned to that position. We will evaluate those positions and ensure that comprehensive job descriptions are developed and on file for future audits.

Eastern Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

EIU FY15-02 Temporary Upgrades Exceeding Thirty-Day Limitation

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) *Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.100 Reassignments and Transfers*
- 2) *Employment and Separation Procedures Manual, Section 4.2 Temporary Downgrading and Upgrading Assignments*

According to Section 250.100(b)(3) of the Illinois Administrative Code, "...temporary upgrading and downgrading assignments must not be for more than 30 consecutive work days duration."

The Employment and Separation Procedures Manual, Section 4.2 states, "...upgrading assignments shall be limited to filling vacancies due to absence of incumbents or when it is necessary because of agreements which require a supervisory employee for a special work assignment or project." Further, "Upgrading is not required when the employee performs only certain duties and/or assumes only partial responsibility for the overall duties of the position to which assigned."

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

The Auditor reviewed approximately one hundred thirteen (113) employees provided temporary upgrade assignments within the current audit time frame. As documented in **Appendix B**, it was discovered that four (4) employees exceeded the thirty day temporary upgrade limitation. In addition, it was discovered that fifteen (15) employees, highlighted in yellow, were utilized in a temporary upgrade capacity for extended periods of time and/or appeared to be regularly upgraded on an extended and consistent basis.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

The Employer did not adequately enforce the thirty day temporary upgrade limitation by allowing several employees in the Police Department and Crafts/Trades Shops to upgrade several employees on a regular and consistent basis for several months without position audits being initiated for potential reclassification action.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

The foundation of the Merit System and the primary concept of a classification plan management system are that employees be placed in job classifications based on the prominence of actual duties and level of responsibility. The practice of creating a new job assignment through an extended upgrade is inconsistent with the intent and purpose of the classification plan management system. If a position is upgraded consistently, or is upgraded

on a continual basis for an extended period of time, the employee should in effect be reclassified into the classification or a new position posted and filled in the classification. The intent of the Code was never to allow for these extended periods of performing higher level duties without providing the opportunity of a permanent classification assignment.

Finding from Previous Audit:

No findings in this topic area were made during the last operational audit in FY2013.

Recommendation:

We recommend that the Employer confirm that monitoring standards and notification protocols have been conveyed to the campus units causing these violations, with an emphasis on compliance and proper position monitoring. Additionally, the positions noted in this finding should be reviewed and considered for upgrade either through recalls or position posting.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan – provided by Linda C. Holloway, Interim Human Resources Director:

The university remains neutral with respect to this finding. Temporary upgrades are used to ensure that civil service employees are appropriately compensated when performing duties outside their classifications. We used this application of the rules to accomplish compensating employees for the work they performed. It was our interpretation that the language did not expressly prohibit the use of temporary upgrades in this manner. However, we will review the situations and the manner in which temporary upgrades are utilized, and make adjustments in the future to comply with SUCSS interpretation of the language.

**State Universities Civil Service System
Eastern Illinois University
FY2015 Biennial Compliance Audit**

Appendix A

***Principal Administrative Appointments
Position Descriptions that Correspond to Civil Service Classification Specifications***

Title	Date of Employment	Date of Appointment	Annual Salary	Position Number	Recommended Civil Service Classification Option(s)
Assistant to the Dean for Grants and Contracts	9/7/1993	9/1/2014	\$61,221.10	A08930	Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Grants and Contracts Development Specialist
Assistant Director	3/18/2013	7/1/2014	\$36,000.00	A07830	Program Coordinator Series or Special Events Facilitator
Associate Director of Facilities	8/9/2011	7/1/2014	\$74,977.35	A01910	Facilities Manager Series
Interim Assistant Director (Benefits)	2/21/2011	8/1/2014	\$41,851.94	A0855A	Human Resource Associate or Benefits Counselor Series
Unit Director, Housing and Dining Services	7/1/2006	7/1/2014	\$48,000.00	A08440	Food Service Administrator Series or Food Service Management Series
Assistant Director for Information Security and IT Security Officer	5/1/2012	7/1/2014	\$84,840.00	A08800	Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator
Director, Administration and Finance	7/1/2000	7/1/2014	\$33,552.48	A08630	Accounting Associate, Accountant Series, Business/Administrative Associate, or Business Manager Series
Director of Digital and Multimedia Services	8/1/2003	9/1/2014	\$66,390.76	A08950	Media Technical Services Manager or Information Technology Technical Associate
Assistant Director for Health Education and Promotion	5/16/2010	7/1/2014	\$42,000.00	A03200	Health Education Coordinator
Assistant to the Dean, Lumpkin College of Business and Applied Science	6/5/2006	7/1/2014	\$62,477.97	A06370	Program/Student Advisor or Program Coordinator Series
Director of Instructional Technology Services	7/1/2007	7/1/2014	\$74,008.83	A01710	Instructional Development Specialist or Information Technology Technical Associate
Coordinator, Study Abroad	7/1/2013	7/1/2014	\$33,000.00	A02040	Study Abroad Series
Assistant to the Dean for Administrative Services	1/5/2006	7/1/2014	\$50,500.00	A02810	Administrative Assistant
Alternate Media Technology Specialist	6/15/2009	7/1/2014	\$33,551.20	A00660	Instructional Development Specialist
Special Assistant to the Vice President for Student Affairs	8/17/2005	11/1/2014	\$63,093.69	A08460	Administrative Assistant
Instructional Design Specialist for Online Learning	10/20/2014	10/20/2014	\$51,900.00	A06440	Instructional Development Specialist
Assistant Director, Planning and Institutional Research	3/6/2006	7/1/2014	\$66,000.00	A0832A	Statistician Series, Institutional Research Data Specialist, or Institutional Research Data Coordinator
Assistant Director of Panther Dining	2/10/2014	7/1/2014	\$64,000.00	A08510	Food Service Administration Series or Food Service Management Series

**State Universities Civil Service System
Eastern Illinois University
FY2015 Biennial Compliance Audit**

Appendix A

***Principal Administrative Appointments
Position Descriptions that Correspond to Civil Service Classification Specifications***

Title	Date of Employment	Date of Appointment	Annual Salary	Position Number	Recommended Civil Service Classification Option(s)
Area Director, University Housing and Dining Services	7/9/2012	7/1/2014	\$40,400.00	A01310	Food Service Administration Series or Food Service Management Series
Assistant Director, Student Standards	7/1/2008	7/1/2014	\$44,440.00	A03710	Student Conduct Programs Series

**State Universities Civil Service System
Eastern Illinois University
FY2015 Biennial Compliance Audit**

Appendix B

Temporary Upgrades Extended Beyond 30-Day Guidelines

Classification	Upgraded Classification	Beginning Timeframe	Ending Timeframe	Total Number of Days Upgraded
Carpenter	Carpenter Subforeman	7/7/2014	8/15/2014	32
Painter	Painter Subforeman	7/5/2013	8/15/2013	36
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	3/28/2014	5/14/2014	35
Tree Surgeon	Grounds Foreman	3/24/2013	5/4/2013	33
"	"	5/7/2013	7/31/2013	34
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	12/3/2012	11/30/2014	208
Painter	Painter Subforeman	12/3/2012	12/28/2014	477
Construction Laborer	Construction Laborer Subforeman	6/3/2013	8/24/2014	128
Payroll Specialist I	Payroll Specialist II	12/3/2012	9/21/2014	385
Building Service Worker	Building Service Subforeman	12/16/2013	12/28/2014	101
Building Service Worker	Building Service Subforeman	12/17/2012	12/14/2014	165
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	12/3/2012	12/28/2014	381
Groundswoker	Maintenance Equipment Operator	12/3/2012	12/28/2014	256
Building Service Worker	Building Service Subforeman	8/12/2013	12/28/2014	118
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	1/14/2013	12/28/2014	117
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	12/2/2012	12/28/2014	172
Electrician	Electrician Subforeman	12/3/2012	6/30/2013	132
Procedures and Systems Analyst	Assistant Payroll Manager	12/3/2012	12/28/2014	435
Electrician	Electrician Subforeman	3/28/2011	8/12/2012	125
Police Officer	Police Sergeant	12/3/2012	12/14/2014	345