

## **COMPARATIVE ETHNIC POLITICS (G8427). Spring 2008.**

David Epstein and Macartan Humphreys

M 4:10pm-6:00pm

711 International Affairs Building

This course examines recent research on the role of ethnic groups in political analysis. The course is structured around three questions: What are ethnic (racial, national etc) groups and why might they matter for political behavior? What explains variation in the structure of ethnic demographics? And what are the consequences of variation in ethnic demographics on political outcomes? The material emphasizes recent formal and econometric approaches to address these questions and a background in formal modeling up to 4209 is assumed.

### **REQUIREMENTS**

**1. Reading:** The Syllabus lists both required reading and further reading. **You will be expected to have completed all the required readings before class to the point where you can be called on to critique or defend any reading.**

The reading loads are not especially heavy but you should aim to read them carefully and reflectively. Before approaching each reading think about what the key questions are for the week and about how the questions from this week relate to what you know from previous weeks. Then skim over the reading to get a sense of the themes it covers, and, before reading further, jot down what questions you hope the reading will be able to answer for you. Next, read the introduction and conclusion. This is normally enough to get a sense of the big picture. Ask yourself: Are the claims in the text surprising? Do you believe them? Can you think of examples of places that do not seem consistent with the logic of the argument? Is the reading answering the questions you hoped it would answer? If not, is it answering more or less interesting questions than you had thought of? Next ask yourself: What types of evidence or arguments would you need to see in order to be convinced of the results? Now read through the whole text, checking as you go through how the arguments used support the claims of the author. It is rare to find a piece of writing that you agree with entirely. So, as you come across issues that you are not convinced by, write them down and bring them along to class for discussion. Also note when you are pleasantly surprised, when the author produced a convincing argument that you had not thought of.

There is no course pack associated with this course. Almost all readings are available on-line or on courseworks. Three books are on order at **Book Culture:**

- Chandra 2004, *Why Ethnic Parties Succeed: Patronage and Ethnic Headcounts in India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Section 1: Theory
- McElreath, Richard and Robert Boyd. 2007. Mathematical Models of Social Evolution: A Guide for the Perplexed. University of Chicago Press.
- Dixit, Avinash. 2007. "Relation-based Contract Enforcement" Chapter 3 in Lawlessness and Economics: Alternative Modes of Governance (The Gorman Lectures).

**2. Arguing (10%).** You will be expected to participate in seminars each week. You should come prepared to argue and defend assigned and unassigned positions.

**3. Referee Reports (3×10%).** You will be expected to write **referee reports** on three of the readings on the syllabus, from three separate weeks of your choosing—with at least one from each part of the syllabus. These are typically around 3 pages long, they should summarize in a paragraph the core contention of the paper and then critique key aspects of the results, indicating whether the paper should or should not be published and what revisions are required to improve it. The best response papers, going beyond the call of duty, replicate results and submit them to robustness tests. These reports can easily form the basis of your seminar paper.

**4. Written Assignments (30%).** You will be expected to write a single 20-30 page research paper displaying original research and probing in depth one of the themes of the course and due on **5 May 2008**. These research papers will contain (i) a theoretical argument, engaging with one of the key themes of the course, or (ii) an empirical test of theoretically motivated argument.

**4. Run an Experiment (30%).** Your final assignment will be to identify one of the key psychological or political economy explanations for the origin or salience of groups and run an appropriate experiment to shed light on the explanation. The experiment should be run with a real sample of subjects (possibly other students, possibly from a wider pool). The experimental design and protocol should be completed by Spring break. Results should be completed in time to present on the final day of term.

## I General Approaches

### 1 [28 January]: Introduction

### 2 [4 February]: Biological Bases

#### Required

1. **SCAN** Anthony Appiah. *In My Father's House*. Chapter 2. Illusions of Race.
2. Douglas L. T. Rohde, Steve Olson & Joseph T. Chang. Modeling the recent common ancestry of all living humans. *Nature*. 431. 30 SEPTEMBER 2004  
<http://www.stat.yale.edu/~jtc5/papers/CommonAncestors/NatureCommonAncestors-Article.pdf>
3. Sarah A Tishkoff and Kenneth K Kidd Implications of biogeography of human populations for 'race' and medicine *Nature Genetics* 36, S21 - S27 (2004)  
<http://www.nature.com.arugula.cc.columbia.edu:2048/ng/journal/v36/n11s/pdf/ng1438.pdf>
4. The Matrilineal Ancestry of Ashkenazi Jewry: Portrait of a Recent Founder Event. Doron M. Behar et al. *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* 2006;78.  
[http://argusbio.com/docs/papers/Behar\\_2006\\_Matrilineal%20Ancestry%20of%20Ashkenazi%20Jewry.pdf](http://argusbio.com/docs/papers/Behar_2006_Matrilineal%20Ancestry%20of%20Ashkenazi%20Jewry.pdf)

#### Further Reading

- Long, Jeffrey C. and R Kittles. *Human Genetic Diversity and the Nonexistence of Biological Races* Human Biology. Volume 75, Number 4, August 2003, pp. 449-471  
[http://muse.jhu.edu.arugula.cc.columbia.edu:2048/journals/human\\_biology/v075/75.4long.pdf](http://muse.jhu.edu.arugula.cc.columbia.edu:2048/journals/human_biology/v075/75.4long.pdf)
- A.W.F. Edwards *Human Genetic Diversity: Lewontin's Fallacy* BioEssays 25(8), August 2003, 798-801. <http://www.goodrumj.com/Edwards.pdf>
- S O Y Keita, R A Kittles, C D M Royal, G E Bonney, P Furbert-Harris, G M Dunston & C N Rotimi Conceptualizing human variation. *Nature Genetics* 36, S17 - S20 (2004)  
<http://www.nature.com.arugula.cc.columbia.edu:2048/ng/journal/v36/n11s/full/ng1455.html>

### 3 [11 February]: Social Identity and Sociobiological Approaches

#### Required

1. Robert Kurzban, John Tooby, and Leda Cosmides Robert Kurzban. 2001. "Can race be erased? Coalitional computation and social categorization." <http://www.pnas.org/cgi/reprint/98/26/15387>
2. Rupert Brown. 2000. Social identity theory: past achievements, current problems and future challenges. European Journal of Social Psychology Volume 30, Issue 6 , Pages 745 – 778 <http://www3.interscience.wiley.com.arugula.cc.columbia.edu:2048/cgi-bin/fulltext/75502956/PDFSTART>
3. **BOOK** McElreath, Richard and Robert Boyd. 2007. Mathematical Models of Social Evolution: A Guide for the Perplexed. University of Chicago Press. Chapters 3, 4 and 6.

#### Further Reading

- Kurzban and Leary 2001. "Stigmatization and Exclusion" <http://instruct.uwo.ca/psychology/371g/Kurzban2001.pdf>
- Francisco J. Gil-White 2001 Are Ethnic Groups Biological "Species" to the Human Brain? Essentialism in Our Cognition of Some Social Categories <http://www.unl.edu/rhames/courses/current/gil-white.pdf>
- Edouard Machery and Luc Faucher Why do we Think Racially? Culture, Evolution, and Cognition <http://www.pitt.edu/~machery/papers/Race%202005%20Machery%20Faucher.pdf>
- Rogers Brubaker: Ethnicity without groups. European Journal of Sociology (2002), 43: 163-189

## II Endogenous Groups

### 4 [18 February]: Economic Approaches

1. GA Akerlof, RE Kranton. 2000. "Economics and Identity" *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*.
2. Alan Miller. Group Identification. <http://cowles.econ.yale.edu/conferences/aggregation/miller.pdf>
3. Roland G. Fryer, Jr. and Matthew O. Jackson 2007. "A Categorical Model of Cognition and Biased Decision-Making" *The B.E. Press Journal of Theoretical Economics (Contributions)*. <http://www.stanford.edu/~jacksonm/categ.pdf>

*Further Reading:*

- David Austen-Smith and Roland G. Fryer, Jr. 2005. An economic analysis of acting white. <http://www.kellogg.northwestern.edu/faculty/austen-smith/htm/papers/ActingWhite-FF.pdf>

**5 [25 February]: Group Formation 1: With contract enforcement**

**Required**

1. Debraj Ray and K. Hyndman "Coalition Formation with Binding Agreements", *Review of Economic Studies* 74 (2007), 1125–1147.  
<http://www.econ.nyu.edu/user/debraj/Papers/HyndmanRay.pdf>
2. Gomes, Armando and Philippe Jehiel 2005. "Processes of Social and Economic Interactions: On the Persistence of Inefficiencies" *Journal of Political Economy*, Vol 113, pp 626–667
3. Caplin A. and Nalebuff B. Competition among Institutions. *Journal of Economic Theory*, Volume 72, Number 2, February 1997 , pp. 306-342(37)
4. Maggie Penn. 2007. Citizenship versus ethnicity: The role of institutions in shaping identity choice <http://www.people.fas.harvard.edu/~epenn/IdApp.pdf>

*Further Reading:*

- Andrei Gomberg. 2003. "How Many Sorting Equilibria Are There (generically)?"
- Gomes, Armando. 2005. "Multilateral Contracting with Externalities." *Econometrica*, Vol. 73, No. 4, 1329–1350.
- Macartan Humphreys. "Coalitions." Forthcoming *Annual Review of Political Science*.

**6 [3 March]: Group Formation 2: Networks**

1. **BOOK** Dixit, Avinash. 2007. "Relation-based Contract Enforcement" Chapter 3 in [Lawlessness and Economics: Alternative Modes of Governance \(The Gorman Lectures\)](#)
2. Matthew O. Jackson and Alison Watts On the formation of interaction networks in social coordination games. [Games and Economic Behavior](#) 41 (2002) 265–291
3. Samuel Bowles a, Herbert Gintis. Persistent parochialism: trust and exclusion in ethnic networks. *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization*. Vol. 55 (2004) 1–23
4. Matthew O. Jackson [``A Survey of Models of Network Formation: Stability and Efficiency,](#) Chapter 1 in *Group Formation in Economics; Networks, Clubs and Coalitions* , edited by Gabrielle Demange and Myrna Wooders, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge U.K., 2004. <http://www.stanford.edu/~jacksonm/netsurv.pdf>

*Further Reading*

- Rauch, James. 2001. "Business and Social Networks in International Trade" JEL
- Alessandra Casella and James E. Rauch. 2003. "Overcoming Informational Barriers in International Resource Allocations: Prices and Ties"  
The Economic Journal, 113, 21-42. <http://www.columbia.edu/~ac186/p&t3.pdf>

## 7 [10 March]: Group Salience and Priming

1. ISMAIL K. WHITE When Race Matters and When It Doesn't: Racial Group Differences in Response to Racial Cues American Political Science Review Vol. 101, No. 2 May 2007
2. Eric Dickson and Kenneth Scheve. Social Identity, Political Speech, and Electoral Competition. *Journal of Theoretical Politics* 18(1):5-39 (2006)
3. DeFigueiredo, Rui and Barry R. Weingast. 1999. The Rationality of Fear: Political Opportunism and Ethnic Conflict. In *Civil War, Insecurity, and Intervention*, ed. Jack L. Snyder and Barbara F. Walter. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

**Note: 17 March is Spring Recess**

## III Applications

### 8 [24 March]: Measuring Diversity

1. J-Y. Duclos, J. Esteban and D Ray "Polarization: Concepts, Measurement, Estimation", *Econometrica* 72, 1737--1772 (2004)
2. JD Fearon 2003. Ethnic and Cultural Diversity by Country\* - - Journal of Economic Growth-
3. Laitin and Posner, 2001. "The Implications of Constructivism for Constructing Ethnic Fractionalization Indices (*APSA-CP Winter*).  
[http://www.sscnet.ucla.edu/polisci/faculty/posner/pdfs/imp\\_of\\_const.pdf](http://www.sscnet.ucla.edu/polisci/faculty/posner/pdfs/imp_of_const.pdf)
4. Habyarimana, Humphreys, Posner and Weinstein. 2007. "Placing and Passing: Evidence from Uganda on Ethnic Identification and Ethnic Deception" 2007.  
<http://www.columbia.edu/~mh2245/papers1/passing.pdf>

#### Further Reading

- Federico Echenique and Roland G. Fryer, Jr. 2006. A MEASURE OF SEGREGATION BASED ON SOCIAL INTERACTIONS  
[http://www.economics.harvard.edu/faculty/fryer/files/ech\\_fryer\\_qje.pdf](http://www.economics.harvard.edu/faculty/fryer/files/ech_fryer_qje.pdf)

### 9 [31 March]: Ethnic Conflict

1. James Fearon. Ethnic Mobilization and Ethnic Violence. In Barry R. Weingast and Donald Wittman, eds., *Oxford Handbook of Political Economy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, forthcoming). <http://www.stanford.edu/~jfearon/papers/ethreview.pdf>
2. Debraj Ray and J. Esteban, September 2005. "A Model of Ethnic Conflict"  
<http://www.nyu.edu/econ/user/debraj/Papers/EthnicConflict.pdf>
3. Caselli, Francesco and Wilbur John Coleman. 2002. "On the Theory of Ethnic Conflict."  
<http://personal.lse.ac.uk/CASELLIF/papers/ethnic.pdf>

#### Further Reading:

- "On the Salience of Ethnic Conflict" Debraj Ray and J. Esteban, July 2006, revised January 2007.

## 10. [7 April]: Distribution and Coordination

1. **SCAN** Bates, Robert H. 1983. Modernization, Ethnic Competition, and the Rationality of Politics in Contemporary Africa. In *State versus Ethnic Claims: African Policy Dilemmas*, ed. Donald Rothchild and Victor A. Olunsoorola. Boulder, CO: Westview Press
2. Bart Hobijn and Carlos A. Medina-Durango Is Discrimination Due to a Coordination Failure? No 1758, Econometric Society World Congress 2000 Contributed Papers  
<http://www.econometricsociety.org/meetings/wc00/pdf/1758.pdf>
3. James Fearon. Why Ethnic politics and pork tend to go together.  
<http://www.stanford.edu/~jfearon/papers/Pork.pdf>
4. **BOOK** Chandra 2004, *Why Ethnic Parties Succeed: Patronage and Ethnic Headcounts in India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Section 1: Theory

## 11 [14 April]: Public Goods Provision.

1. James Fearon and David Laitin. 1996. Explaining Interethnic Cooperation. APSR.
2. E Miguel, MK Gugerty Ethnic Diversity, Social Sanctions, and Public Goods in Kenya Journal of Public Economics, 2005
3. Alesina, Alberto F., Baqir, Reza and Easterly, William, "Public Goods and Ethnic Divisions" (April 1997). NBER Working Paper No. W6009.  
[http://homepages.nyu.edu/~rf2/Teaching/alesinabaqireasterly\\_QJE99\\_publicgoodsethnic\\_div.pdf](http://homepages.nyu.edu/~rf2/Teaching/alesinabaqireasterly_QJE99_publicgoodsethnic_div.pdf)
4. Habyarimana, Humphreys, Posner and Weinstein. 2007. Why does ethnic diversity undermine the provision of public goods? APSR.  
<http://www.columbia.edu/~mh2245/papers1/HHPW.pdf>

## 12 [21 April] Elections

1. Marisa A. Abrajano and R. Michael Alvarez A Natural Experiment of Race-Based and Issue Voting: The 2001 City of Los Angeles Elections 2005; 58; 203 *Political Research Quarterly*
2. John Roemer and Woojin Lee. "Race and Redistribution: A Solution to the Problem of American Exceptionalism" *Journal of Public Economics*.
3. Eric Dickson and Ken Scheve. · Social Identity, Electoral Institutions, and the Number of Candidates. [http://www.nyu.edu/gsas/dept/politics/faculty/dickson/dickson\\_candidates.pdf](http://www.nyu.edu/gsas/dept/politics/faculty/dickson/dickson_candidates.pdf)

## 13 [28 April]: Institutions

1. **Districting**: David Epstein and Sharyn O'Halloran Racial Gerrymandering and Representative Democracy. *Mimeo*.
2. **Affirmative Action**: David Austen-Smith 2006. Redistribution and Affirmative Action  
[http://www.kellogg.northwestern.edu/faculty/austen-smith/htm/papers/AffAct\\_5-01-06.pdf](http://www.kellogg.northwestern.edu/faculty/austen-smith/htm/papers/AffAct_5-01-06.pdf)

3. **Consociationalism:** Lijphart, Arend *Constitutional Design for Divided Societies* Journal of Democracy - Volume 15, Number 2, April 2004, pp. 96-109

*Further Reading:*

- Fryer G. Loury and T. Yuret 2007. An Economic Analysis of Color-Blind Affirmative Action <http://www.economics.harvard.edu/faculty/fryer/files/cbaarevision.pdf>
- A Lijphart [Consociational Democracy](#) World Politics, 1969

#### **14 [5 May; TBA] Presentations of Results from Experiments**