

JEWISH IMMIGRATION TO  
NORTH AMERICA:  
THE CANADIAN EXPERIENCE  
(1870-1900)

Jonathan D. Sarna

**H**ISTORIANS of Canadian Jewry too often assume that the Jewish experience in the United States can serve as a model for understanding Canadian Jewish history.<sup>1</sup> In the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, North America could be treated as a single large country;<sup>2</sup> and historians seem to believe that this was also true of the late nineteenth century.<sup>3</sup>

The history of eastern European Jewish immigration to Canada, however, shows such a conception to be misleading. In the last three decades of the nineteenth century, Jews came from eastern Europe both to the United States and to Canada; but the immigrant Jewish communities which took shape in both countries diverged strikingly. From 1870, immigrants to the United States settled overwhelmingly in East Coast cities, and were concentrated in a fairly narrow range of trades. In Canada, Jews from the same areas in Europe were far more widely diffused geographically and occupationally.

*Jewish immigration to Canada: 1870-1900*

Reliable Canadian Jewish immigration statistics are available only after 1901.<sup>4</sup> Nevertheless, for the 1870-1900 period a working figure of 15,000 Jewish immigrants can be accepted. Since Canada's Jewish population, as measured by the census, rose from 1333 in 1871 to 16,401 in 1901,<sup>5</sup> we are probably not far wrong, especially since many of the Jews who migrated from Canada to the United States were included in Canadian immigration statistics, but had departed before the census takers could have counted them.

While 15,000 is a small figure when compared to the some 600,000 Jews who were entering the United States during the same period, it is

large when viewed against the background of the great southward migration which was simultaneously driving thousands of Canadians out of their country.<sup>6</sup> Given the choice, why did any Jews come to the depression-wracked<sup>7</sup> Northern Dominion? Some probably had no alternative. Jewish relief agencies simply included Canada in their distribution plans. This was especially true of London's Jewish organizations which, like their non-Jewish counterparts, maintained closer ties with Montreal than with New York.<sup>8</sup> As early as 1875, Montreal's Young Men's Hebrew Benevolent Society (YMHBS) complained that the Ladies' Emigration Society of London was sending them impoverished immigrants indiscriminately.<sup>9</sup> Until 17 June 1882, London's Mansion House Committee sent 105 Jews to Montreal, 359 to Winnipeg and about 50 to other Canadian cities (Toronto, Quebec, Hamilton, and Queensport).<sup>10</sup> Mainland Europe also was sending Jews to Canada.<sup>11</sup> The 1891 Berlin Conference on Emigration, for example, considered the Northern Dominion to be one of a number of possible havens for fleeing Russians.<sup>12</sup> Only eight years later, the Jewish Colonization Association (ICA) directed no less than 2,202 Rumanian Jews to Canada's shores.<sup>13</sup>

Other Jews were transported to Canada upon arrival in New York. In 1882, Bella Rosenbaum was sent to Winnipeg together with a group of other immigrants with 'no relatives or friends to claim them'.<sup>14</sup> A year later, New York's Hebrew Emigrant Aid Society directed several newcomers to Montreal.<sup>15</sup> Moreover, there were cases of unfortunate Jews who were wilfully misled. In 1887, YMHBS of Montreal urged Europeans to fight swindlers who 'lie to immigrants' about their ultimate destination. A year later that society protested about having to care for Jews who believed that they were headed for New York.<sup>16</sup>

By the 1890's American immigration restrictions were more stringent; consequently, more immigrants came to Canada. A 'Mr. Lebo-wich', who wished to go to St. Louis, landed in Montreal since laws prohibited paupers from entering United States ports.<sup>17</sup> Others went to Canada when President Harrison quarantined immigrant vessels in order to prevent the spread of epidemics. The Dominion was then desperately in need of new settlers; it could not afford to be too selective.

Although it is certainly true that most eastern European Jewish immigrants to Canada had originally hoped to settle in the United States, it need not be inferred that those who came to Canada were unhappy with their lot. Before the turn of the century, it was still easy for a dissatisfied immigrant to stray south and enter the United States—legally or illegally.<sup>18</sup> Montreal Jews provided generous help when 'called upon to assist large numbers to different parts of the United States'.<sup>19</sup> Nevertheless, thousands remained in Canada, while some individual Jews (like Isaac Halpern and Alexander Harkavy) actually

moved to Canada after having settled in the United States.<sup>20</sup> Apparently, therefore, many Jews who came to Canada did so of their own free will.

Some may have come with dreams of setting up farms. Canada was eager to promote agricultural immigration during that period,<sup>21</sup> and paid particular attention to the possibility of enticing Jewish immigrants to her frontier. In early 1882, for example, Sir Alexander Galt, the Canadian High Commissioner in London, wrote to Canada's Prime Minister John A. Macdonald<sup>22</sup>:

The Jewish persecution in Russia has induced me to write Rothschild suggesting that I would like to discuss with him the feasibility of removing the agricultural Jews to Canada. It seems not a bad opportunity of interesting the Hebrews in our North West.

Thomas Greenway, Premier of Manitoba, tried to draw Jewish farmers to his province in 1890; and a similar plan was taken up by the federal government a year later.<sup>23</sup> By 1897, Prime Minister Laurier actually agreed to grant Jews free land in Manitoba and offered them 'such a measure of self-government as will enable them to make their own by-laws substituting Saturday for Sunday'.<sup>24</sup> While nothing came of these schemes, Jews certainly responded to the invitation to populate the newly opened Canadian West. Many laboured on the Canadian Pacific Railroad and some certainly took advantage of generous homestead grants.<sup>25</sup> In the United States, by this time, frontier opportunities were already limited.

Jews in search of a warm welcome also had good reason to remain in the Northern Dominion, since immigrants to the United States, especially in the 1890's, faced both popular and official hostility.<sup>26</sup> Admittedly, French Canadian Catholics, fearing a further weakening of their social position, opposed the entry of all non-French immigrants (even the Irish Catholics), and especially Jews.<sup>27</sup> Trade union hostility was also evident, as was antagonism from other quarters.<sup>28</sup> But the contemporary English-language press was in favour of Jewish immigration: the *Manitoba Free Press* described Jews as an 'industrious population' and regretted that more did not come. The *Gleaner*, *Montreal Gazette*, and *Montreal Star* also had only sympathy and encouragement for those refugees of the 1890's.<sup>29</sup>

On the other hand, the United States at that period already had considerable legislation regulating and restricting immigration. A literacy test measure was killed only by executive veto. Earlier, President Harrison had warned that mass immigration of Jews 'is neither good for them nor for us'.<sup>30</sup> In Canada, meanwhile, immigration was unrestricted;<sup>31</sup> and Jews were offered bounties and special benefits if they would only come and settle.

The attitude of the North American Jewish community to the

immigration of co-religionists may also have drawn Jews northward. While the German Jewish community in the United States was ambivalent and cautious, alternately hostile and sympathetic, usually condescending and paternalistic,<sup>32</sup> the attitude of Canadian Jews was almost totally positive. When, in 1881, there was an increase in the number of refugees arriving in the New World, United States cities sent threats and denunciations; Montreal, on the other hand, asked for a delay 'until better arrangements than now existed could be effected'.<sup>33</sup> Even when, in 1891, YMHBS funds were almost totally depleted, the same attitude prevailed. A special board meeting voted that 'none of these people shd. [sic] be sent back as long as there was a dollar in the treasury'.<sup>34</sup> The Society's president, Harris Vineberg, declared: '. . . our earnest desire is to permanently benefit our poor, unfortunate and destitute co-religionists'.<sup>35</sup>

This concern and interest were buttressed by several factors which distinguished the Canadian Jewish community from its United States counterpart. Of greatest importance, as Louis Rosenberg has stressed,<sup>36</sup> is the fact that

With few exceptions the Jews who came to Canada from 1881-1914 were from the same areas and from religious, cultural and social environments similar to those who preceded them.

Canadian Jewish leaders did not look down upon the eastern European newcomers.

The harmony of interests which allied old and new Jewish immigrants is most evident in religious observance. In the United States, of course, religious divisions reflected ethnic divisions: modern Reform Hebrews who worshipped in a Temple looked down on old fashioned, Orthodox Jews who *davened* in *Schule* (prayed in a synagogue). In Canada, on the other hand, most of the community was united in its devotion to Orthodoxy.<sup>37</sup> Solomon Schechter noted this difference while on his tour of North American cities: in the United States he found Reform Jews, the people of wealth and influence, constituting the *kehillah*, while other groups were the *minyán*; precisely the opposite situation, he discovered, prevailed in Montreal.<sup>38</sup>

Perhaps for this reason, there was surprisingly little hostility between Montreal's German-Polish Sha'ar Hashomayim Synagogue, and the more recent immigrant congregations. In the early 1890's, when Montreal Jews debated whether to pay school taxes to the Catholic or to the more pro-immigrant Protestant School Board, only Shearith Israel (the ritually Sephardi synagogue of Canada's earliest Jews) favoured the Catholics. Sha'ar Hashomayim, YMHBS, B'nai Jacob (the Russian congregation) and Emanu-El (the small Reform congregation) were united on the subject and they successfully championed the Protestant School Board.<sup>39</sup> Such an alliance would have been un-

## JEWISH IMMIGRATION TO NORTH AMERICA

likely in any of the ethnically and religiously divided Jewish communities of the United States.

The attitudes of the settler-Jewish communities towards their own immigrants were also influenced by considerations of status and image. Here again, Canadian Jews displayed far less concern than did their United States counterparts. Less successful, far less numerous, and living in an environment both tolerant of cultural diversity (Canada saw itself as a mosaic) and receptive to immigrants, Canadian Jews could welcome their brethren from abroad without fearing for themselves. Besides, as first-generation immigrants, the leaders of the Canadian Jewish community probably had greater understanding of the immigrants' lot than did the second-generation Jews who, in the main, were the leaders in the United States.

Once Jews had settled in Canada, for whatever reason, their relatives began to join them. H. Wolofsky reports that he came to Montreal in the late 1890's to join his brother;<sup>40</sup> Max Vanger gave the same reason for coming to New Brunswick some years later.<sup>41</sup> By then, however, Canada was much more attractive; from 1896, its economy showed a sharp upward trend: wheat prices rose, gold was discovered in the Yukon, and industry grew at a rapid pace. 'The nineteenth century was the century of the United States; the twentieth century will be the century of Canada,' asserted the Dominion's Prime Minister, Wilfred Laurier.<sup>42</sup> United States citizens, including Jews, began to move north of the border.<sup>43</sup>

### *Jewish settlement in Canada: 1870-1900*

Eastern European Jewish immigrants to the United States tended overwhelmingly to settle in East Coast cities. Unlike their German predecessors, who had spread over the face of the country while engaged in peddling and entrepreneurial pursuits, those from eastern Europe moved into a handful of manufacturing industries (chiefly textiles) in urban port cities.<sup>44</sup> Since by the end of the nineteenth century, maximum opportunity in the United States lay in these very cities,<sup>45</sup> there was little incentive for immigrants to go further afield.

The Canadian situation was altogether different: the frontier was just opening up as eastern European Jews began to immigrate. There were abundant opportunities for pioneers and pedlars. Consequently, Canadian Jewish immigrants, unlike their counterparts south of the border, did not cluster in urban centres. Much like United States German Jews of the preceding generation, Canadian Jewry spread to the far reaches of their new-found homeland.

Table 1 makes clear that Canadian Jews were far more likely to head West in the 1870-1900 period than they had been previously. By the turn of the century, Jews were 4.74 times as likely to be in the

JONATHAN D. SARNA

East than in the West, while the comparable figure three decades earlier had been 13.65. In the United States, of course, the trend was precisely in the opposite direction: during the period of mass immigration, the percentage of Jews in every sector of the country, except the East, declined markedly.

Many Canadian Jewish immigrants in this period settled in small towns (some of which, like Toronto and Winnipeg, rapidly became big cities), far removed from the economically stagnant eastern cities.

TABLE I. *Distribution of Jewish Immigrants*

Area	United States						
	Jews <sup>a</sup> 1877		All Origins <sup>b</sup> 1870		Jews <sup>a</sup> 1905		All Origins <sup>b</sup> 1910
	No.	%	%	No.	%	%	
North-East	116,017	50.64	30.9	1,103,700	70.80	28.1	
South	45,122	19.64	30.9	125,510	8.11	32.0	
North-Central	46,478	20.24	32.6	277,000	17.77	32.5	
West	21,465	9.32	6.6	51,500	3.30	7.4	
Area	Canada <sup>c</sup>						
	Jews 1871		All Origins 1871		Jews 1901		All Origins 1901
	No.	%	%	No.	%	%	
East	1,242	93.16	97.01	13,544	82.58	87.98	
West	91	6.84	2.99	2,857	17.42	12.02	

<sup>a</sup> Joseph Jacobs, 'United States: Statistics', *Jewish Encyclopedia*, New York, 1911, vol. XII, p. 374. Jacobs's statistics do not add up to 100 per cent.

<sup>b</sup> David Ward, *Cities and Immigrants*, New York, 1971, p. 60.

<sup>c</sup> Louis Rosenberg, *Canada's Jews*, Montreal, 1939, pp. 10, 19.

Frontier communities needed pedlars, storekeepers, merchants, and wholesalers; and the Jews readily provided those services.

Indians came to rely on Jews as suppliers and distributors,<sup>46</sup> as did other settlers. A Mennonite historian relates:<sup>47</sup>

Jewish immigrants were frequently drawn to the Mennonite towns. . . . Both groups were familiar with each other's ways of life from the Old Country, and were able to communicate easily with each other because of the great resemblance of Yiddish to German.

Jewish-Ukrainian relations could be similarly described. Many Canadian Jews hailed from the Ukraine and were familiar with the Ukrainian language and customs. For their part, Ukrainians had traded with Jews in Russia and they now gave them preference over other pedlars and merchants;<sup>48</sup> as a consequence, close personal relations developed. One Vasyl Yatsiw, who arrived in Winnipeg in

## JEWISH IMMIGRATION TO NORTH AMERICA

1892 and saved \$200 in two years, even 'entered into a business partnership with a Jew'; unfortunately, they did not prosper.<sup>49</sup>

The careers of early eastern European Jews in Canada have been summed up by Lyon Cohen<sup>50</sup> (later President of the Canadian Jewish Congress):

The occupation of the first East European immigrants on their arrival was selling wares among the farmers. When in the course of time their positions improved, they became general store-keepers. . . . Those who were more successful later came to Montreal and entered the retail, wholesale and manufacturing trades.

Of course, many immigrants did not attain the third stage, and some may never have wanted to do so. A typical example was Yudel Brown, described in Ephraim Lisitzky's autobiographical *In the Grip of Cross Currents*.<sup>51</sup> After several years as a village pedlar, Brown opened a shop in tiny Ahmic Harbor, Ontario. 'His store acquired a reputation, and farmers came to buy from far and wide';<sup>52</sup> but Yudel Brown never moved to the big city.

With such opportunities available in the hinterland, it is no wonder that Canadian Jewish immigrants, unlike their contemporaries in the United States, were advised to head for the frontier.<sup>53</sup> Peddling, while eschewed as degrading and unprofitable by eastern Europeans in the United States,<sup>54</sup> could still prove lucrative in the Northern Dominion; urban industries were clearly not the only possible road to success.

Of course, in 1901 more than 60 per cent of Canada's Jews did live in Montreal and Toronto; and most of them were recent immigrants<sup>55</sup> who, like their counterparts in the United States, tended to find work in the needle trades.<sup>56</sup> In the United States, however, 90 per cent of immigrant Jews were in big cities<sup>57</sup> and, according to Kuznets, 65.6 per cent of all Jewish immigrants (1899-1914) were involved in manufacturing. The comparable figure for pre-1920 Canadian Jewish immigrant occupations was 27.3 per cent. On the other hand, while 47.7 per cent of the Canadians were involved in transport and trade, only 9.2 per cent of those in the United States were in those occupations.<sup>58</sup>

Admittedly, Kuznets's figures were based on occupations in 1899-1914 while Rosenberg's data apply to the 1931 position of pre-1910 immigrants; but the margin is so vast that the contrast remains great. Further, it is striking that less than half of Canada's most successful early Jewish immigrants were in the clothing trade.<sup>59</sup>

It was only in the twentieth century that the overall geographic and occupational patterns of United States and Canadian Jews became increasingly similar. By then, the economic situation in Canada had improved, its frontier had been developed, and Jewish immigration to the Northern Dominion had increased sharply.<sup>60</sup>

NOTES

<sup>1</sup> I am grateful to Professors Eugene Black, Leon Jick, and Marshall Sklare for their assistance in the preparation of this paper.

<sup>2</sup> Marcus L. Hansen, *The Mingling of the Canadian and American Peoples* (completed and prepared for publication by John Bartlett Brebner), New Haven, Conn., 1940, deals with this theme. See also Ismar Elbogen, *A Century of Jewish Life*, Philadelphia, 1945, p. 133.

<sup>3</sup> See the translation by Ralph Noveck of Benjamin G. Sack, *History of the Jews in Canada*, Montreal, 1965. Sack agrees with American Jewish historians and propounds a trifold division of Canadian Jewish history into Sephardi, German-Polish, and Russian periods without any apparent historical basis; cf. Louis Rosenberg, 'Two Centuries of Jewish Life in Canada 1760-1960', *American Jewish Year Book*, no. 62, 1961, pp. 28-32. Joseph Kage in *With Faith and Thanksgiving*, Montreal, 1962, pp. 37-9, similarly interprets the Canadian Jewish economic structure on the basis of Oscar Handlin's 'A Century of Jewish Immigration to the United States', *American Jewish Year Book*, no. 50, 1949, pp. 11-18. Although recent scholars are more careful to distinguish between the United States and Canada—notably, Lloyd P. Gartner in 'North American Jewry', *Migration and Settlement: Proceedings of the Anglo-American Jewish Historical Conference*, London, 1971, pp. 114-27—some popular historians appear to persist in the old errors: see Rick Kardonne's portrayal of Canadian Jewish history in 'Montreal, Quebec: Up from the Ghetto', *Present Tense*, no. 2, Winter 1975, pp. 50-5.

<sup>4</sup> The basic statistical study of Canadian Jewry is Louis Rosenberg's *Canada's Jews: A Social and Economic Study of the Jews in Canada*, Montreal 1939. See also M. C. Urquhart and K. A. H. Buckley, *Historical Statistics of Canada*, Toronto, 1965.

<sup>5</sup> Rosenberg, *Canada's Jews*, op. cit., p. 10: the figure is for 'Jews by religion'.

<sup>6</sup> David C. Corbett, *Canada's Immigration Policy: A Critique*, Toronto, 1957, p. 121.

<sup>7</sup> Peter Waite, *Canada 1875-1896: Arduous Destiny*, Toronto, 1971, pp. 174-178, minimizes the extent of the 1873-96 Canadian depression, noting the growth in both Gross National Product and population during the period. Still, the mood in Canada was 'sullen with disillusionment, with disgust for the present and disbelief in the future': Donald Creighton, *A History of Canada, Dominion of the North*, Boston, 1958, pp. 353-5 and 365.

<sup>8</sup> Maldwyn A. Jones, 'The Background to Emigration from Great Britain in the Nineteenth Century', *Perspectives in American History*, vol. VII, 1973, p. 74.

<sup>9</sup> Simon Belkin, *Through Narrow Gates*, Montreal, 1966, p. 25.

<sup>10</sup> N. S. Joseph, quoted in Myron Berman, 'The Attitude of American Jewry Towards East European Jewish Immigration': unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Dept. of History, Columbia University, 1963, p. 528. See also Zosa Szajkowski, *Jewish Mass Settlement in the United States*, New York, 1966, p. 12, item 18, and Belkin, op. cit., p. 30.

<sup>11</sup> Bernard Figler, *Canadian Jewish Profiles: Rabbi Dr. Herman Abramowitz, Lazarus Cohen, Lyon Cohen*, Ottawa, 1968, p. 94.

## JEWISH IMMIGRATION TO NORTH AMERICA

<sup>12</sup> Zosa Szajkowski, 'The Attitude of American Jews to East European, Jewish Immigration (1881-1893)', *Publications of the American Jewish Historical Society*, no. 40, March 1951, p. 259.

<sup>13</sup> Belkin, op. cit., p. 41.

<sup>14</sup> Bella W. Rosenbaum, *My Life*, Montreal, n.d., p. 8.

<sup>15</sup> Szajkowski, 'The Attitude . . .', op. cit., pp. 272, 274. On p. 272, seven immigrants are listed as having been sent to Montreal by New York's Hebrew Emigrant Aid Society during the whole of 1882, but on p. 274 a different document lists eleven immigrants sent by the same society to Montreal in the two months between 1st June to 1st August 1882.

<sup>16</sup> Young Men's Hebrew Benevolent Society, Minutes of Annual Meetings, February 1887 and October 1888, *YMHBS Papers*, property of Jewish Family Service, Montreal, Canada.

<sup>17</sup> Director's meeting, 17 May 1891, *YMHBS Papers*. The matter is broadly discussed in the memo sent by the President of YMHBS, Harris Vineberg, to Baron Hirsch on 20 May 1890: Max Kohler Archives, Box 13, American Jewish Historical Society, Waltham, Mass.

<sup>18</sup> Canada was the back door for illegal entry into the United States, according to the 1890 report of the House of Representatives Select Committee on Immigration: M. T. Bennett, *American Immigration Policy*, Washington, 1963, p. 21.

<sup>19</sup> Vineberg to Hirsch, 20 May 1890: Kohler Archives, Box 13. It is worth noting that Milwaukee Jews, eager to stop the 1882 tide of immigration to their city, sent a letter to Montreal in addition to their letters to New York and London: L. J. Swichkow and L. P. Gartner, *The History of the Jews in Milwaukee*, Philadelphia, 1963, pp. 82-3.

<sup>20</sup> Alex J. Goldman, *Giants of Faith*, New York, 1964, p. 237; Sack, op. cit., p. 218.

<sup>21</sup> Jones, op. cit., p. 64. See Norman MacDonald, *Canada's Immigration and Colonization 1891-1903*, Aberdeen, 1966, pp. 30-48, 107-8.

<sup>22</sup> Stuart E. Rosenberg, *The Jewish Community in Canada*, vol. I, Toronto, 1970, p. 77.

<sup>23</sup> Arthur A. Chiel, *The Jews in Manitoba: A Social History*, Toronto, 1961, p. 49. See also Benjamin G. Sack, 'A Historical Opportunity Forfeited', *Canadian Jewish Year Book*, Montreal, 1941, pp. 98-107.

<sup>24</sup> Sack, *ibid.*, p. 105.

<sup>25</sup> Belkin, op. cit., p. 31. Ephraim Lisitzky's autobiography, *In the Grip of Cross-Currents*, New York, 1959, p. 190, suggests that by the turn of the century, American Jewish immigrants were well aware 'of those homesteads the Canadian government was giving free to all pioneers'. For a recent economic interpretation of the settlement of the Canadian West during this period, see K. H. Norrie, 'The Rate of Settlement of the Canadian Prairies', *Journal of Economic History*, no. 35, June 1975, pp. 410-27.

<sup>26</sup> John Higham, *Send These to Me: Jews and Other Immigrants in Urban America*, New York, 1975, pp. 116-73, and his *Strangers in the Land*, New York, 1955, pp. 35-105.

<sup>27</sup> Albert Rose, ed., *A People and Its Faith*, Toronto, 1959, p. 10. Cf. John B. Brehner, *Canada: A Modern History*, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1970, p. 216.

<sup>28</sup> In 1891, Mr. Davis of YMHBS suggested that 'we dispose of these people

[Jewish refugees] as quietly as possible so that labor unions be not aroused to interference': Directors' meeting, 27 July 1891, *YMHBS Papers*. See also the outburst against the Jews at Wapella agricultural colony in Chiel, *Jews in Manitoba*, op. cit., p. 47.

<sup>29</sup> *Manitoba Free Press*, 10 May 1882, quoted in Chiel, op. cit., p. 33, and newspaper clippings of the *Gleaner*, 16 May 1892 and the *Gazette*, 19 Feb. 1892, in *YMHBS Papers*. As for the *Montreal Star*, see the report of the Directors' meeting, 23 May 1892, *YMHBS Papers*.

<sup>30</sup> Quoted in E. Tcherikower, 'Jewish Immigrants to the United States, 1881-1900', *YIVO Annual*, vol. VI, 1951, p. 169. On United States restrictive legislation generally, see Higham, *Strangers in the Land*, op. cit., and Roy L. Garis, *Immigration Restriction*, New York, 1927.

<sup>31</sup> MacDonald, op. cit., p. 96.

<sup>32</sup> There is a vast literature on this subject: see especially Esther Panitz, 'The Polarity of American Jewish Attitudes Towards Immigration', *American Jewish Historical Quarterly*, vol. LIII, 1963, pp. 99-130 and Zosa Szajkowski, 'The Yahudi and the Immigrant: A Reappraisal', *American Jewish Historical Quarterly*, vol. LXIII, September 1973, pp. 13-44.

<sup>33</sup> H. E. Wilder, 'An Outline of the History of the Jews in Canada', *Israelite Daily Press Hundredth Anniversary Souvenir*, Winnipeg, 1932, p. 14.

<sup>34</sup> Special Advisory Committee Meeting, 27 July 1891: *YMHBS Papers*. See also Belkin op. cit., p. 34.

<sup>35</sup> Vineberg to Hirsch Fund, 11 February 1892, Borenstein Collection, item 5394, YIVO Archives, New York.

<sup>36</sup> Louis Rosenberg, 'Development of the Canadian Jewish Community', *Publications of the American Jewish Historical Society*, vol. L, 1960, p. 136.

<sup>37</sup> Reform Judaism developed in Canada long after it had matured in the United States. On Montreal's Temple Emanu-El see *The Emanu-El Story 1882-1960*, Montreal, 1960. More generally, see Albert Rose, ed., *A People and its Faith*, and Michael Brown, 'The Beginnings of Reform Judaism in Canada', *Jewish Social Studies*, vol. 34, 1972, pp. 322-42.

<sup>38</sup> Rosenberg, *Jewish Community in Canada*, op. cit., vol. 1, p. 129.

<sup>39</sup> *New York Hebrew Standard*, 8 July 1892; Hirsch School Committee Meeting, 23 May 1892, *YMHBS Papers*. In addition to the YMHBS papers, see on this episode the Spanish and Portuguese Congregation Minutes (typescript in the possession of Mrs. E. Miller, Montreal). My account differs from that found in Sack, *History of the Jews in Canada*, op. cit., pp. 214-215; 232-4, since he ignores the position of Shearith Israel in this controversy.

<sup>40</sup> H. Wolofsky, *Journey of My Life*, Montreal, 1945.

<sup>41</sup> Max Vanger, 'Memoirs of a Russian Immigrant', *American Jewish Historical Quarterly*, vol. LXIII, September 1973, p. 59.

<sup>42</sup> Edgar McInnis, *Canada: A Political and Social History*, New York, 1947, p. 370.

<sup>43</sup> Corbett, op. cit., p. 121; Gartner, 'North Atlantic Jewry', op. cit., pp. 121-2.

<sup>44</sup> Lloyd P. Gartner, 'Immigration and American Jewry', in *Jewish Society Through the Ages*, edited by H. Ben Sasson and S. Ettinger, New York, 1973, p. 306.

<sup>45</sup> The advantages of the city over the farm are explored in Fred A.

## JEWISH IMMIGRATION TO NORTH AMERICA

Shannon, *The Farmer's Last Frontier: Agriculture 1860-1897*, New York, 1945, pp. 349-78. See also David Ward, *Cities and Immigrants: A Geography of Change in Nineteenth Century America*, New York, 1971.

<sup>46</sup> Bella W. Rosenbaum, 'In My Lifetime', *American Jewish Archives*, vol. XIX, 1967, pp. 16-19.

<sup>47</sup> E. K. Francis, *In Search of Utopia: The Mennonites in Manitoba*, Glencoe, Ill., 1955, pp. 69, 142, 154-6.

<sup>48</sup> Ol'ha Woycenko, *The Ukrainians in Canada*, Ottawa, 1968, pp. 53-5. Cf. Chiel, *Jews in Manitoba*, op. cit., p. 58.

<sup>49</sup> Joseph Oleskaw, 'About Emigration', published in Russia in 1895, quoted in Vladimir Kaye, *Early Ukrainian Settlements in Canada 1895-1900*, Toronto, 1964, p. 29. Oleskaw, who was a leading proponent of Ukrainian emigration, commented that the Ukrainian 'naturally lost his money'.

<sup>50</sup> Figler, *Canadian Jewish Profiles*, op. cit., pp. 43-4. Compare Isaac Mayer Wise's famous typology of the German Jewish pedlar in his *Reminiscences*, 2nd edn., New York, 1945, p. 38.

<sup>51</sup> New York, 1959, pp. 196-8.

<sup>52</sup> *ibid.*, p. 198.

<sup>53</sup> I. Medres, *Montreal Fun Nekhten*, in Yiddish, Montreal, 1947, p. 10. See Abraham J. Arnold, 'The Contribution of the Jews to the Opening and Development of the West', *Historical and Scientific Society of Manitoba Transactions*, Series III, no. 25, 1968-9, pp. 23-37; and his 'The Earliest Jews in Winnipeg 1874-1882', *The Beaver*, vol. 305, Autumn 1974, pp. 4-11.

<sup>54</sup> Aaron Antonovsky and Elias Tcherikower, *The Early Jewish Labor Movement in America*, New York, 1961, p. 145; Abraham Cahan, *The Education of Abraham Cahan*, Philadelphia, 1960, p. 229. The popular theory that eastern European Jews scorned peddling as a 'shameful occupation' is not borne out by the Canadian Jewish experience.

<sup>55</sup> 'Montreal', *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, vol. 12, p. 286; 'Toronto', *ibid.*, vol. 15, p. 261.

<sup>56</sup> Kage, *With Faith and Thanksgiving*, op. cit., pp. 37-9.

<sup>57</sup> Gartner, 'Immigration and American Jewry', op. cit., p. 306.

<sup>58</sup> Simon Kuznets, 'Economic Structure and Life of the Jews', *The Jews*, Louis Finkelstein, ed., vol. 11, New York, 1960, p. 1637 and Rosenberg, *Canada's Jews*, op. cit., pp. 377-86.

<sup>59</sup> Figler, op. cit., p. 95.

<sup>60</sup> For a comparative study of twentieth-century Jewish communities in the United States, Canada, and Argentina, see Moshe Davis, 'Centres of Jewry in the Western Hemisphere: A Comparative Approach', *The Jewish Journal of Sociology*, vol. V, June 1963, pp. 4-26. On contemporary Canadian Jewry, see Stuart E. Rosenberg, *The Jewish Community in Canada*, vol. II, Toronto, 1971.