

*Reading and the Work of Restoration*  
*History and Scripture in the Theology of*  
*Hugh of St Victor*

FRANKLIN T. HARKINS

This book represents the first comprehensive study of the role of *historia* in the processes of reading and restoration (or salvation) in the theology of Hugh of St Victor. By providing a close reading of Hugh's major works, it affords a window onto the holistic vision of liberal arts education, scriptural exegesis, moral formation, and spirituality that attracted young students to the Parisian School of St Victor in the early twelfth century.

Hugh's teaching on memory-training and his view of the liberal arts as roads leading the reader toward God have the aim of preparing students for scriptural reading and its three subdisciplines – *historia*, allegory, and tropology. This pedagogical program both draws on and diverges from the thought of Augustine. For Hugh, the fallen human being begins to be restored to the image of God through a program of ordered reading in the liberal arts and Sacred Scripture; this restoration continues at the fundamental level of *historia* even as the student advances through reading's higher disciplines. In responding to and concretizing the moral teaching found in the scriptural text, the reader comes to participate in the ongoing history of salvation.

MEDIAEVAL LAW AND THEOLOGY 2

*General Editors*

Joseph Goering  
Giulio Silano

STUDIES AND TEXTS 167

*Reading and the Work of Restoration*

*History and Scripture in the Theology of  
Hugh of St Victor*

FRANKLIN T. HARKINS



PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIAEVAL STUDIES

*Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication*

Harkins, Franklin T.

Reading and the work of restoration : history and scripture in the theology of Hugh of St. Victor / Franklin T. Harkins.

(Studies and texts ; 167)

(Mediaeval law and theology ; 2)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-88844-167-6

1. Hugh, of Saint-Victor, 1096?-1141 – Teachings. 2. Augustine, Saint, Bishop of Hippo – Influence. 3. Education (Christian theology) – History of doctrines – Middle Ages, 600-1500. 4. Saint-Victor (Abbey : Paris, France). I. Title. II. Series: Studies and texts (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies) ; 167 III. Series: Mediaeval law and theology ; 2

B765.H74H38 2009

189<sup>l</sup>.4

C2009-903822-6

© 2009

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies

59 Queen's Park Crescent East

Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5S 2C4

[www.pims.ca](http://www.pims.ca)

MANUFACTURED IN CANADA

Dedicated to my beloved wife, Angela,  
and to the memory of my dear teacher and friend,  
Michael Signer (1945–2009)



# Contents

Abbreviations	<i>ix</i>
Acknowledgments	<i>xi</i>
Introduction	I
CHAPTER ONE	
Memory, History, and Visualization: Laying the Foundation of Hugh's Pedagogical Program	13
Mnemotechnique and History in the <i>Chronicon</i>   14	
Memory as Introspective Philosophy in Augustine   41	
Visualizing the Ark of Noah: Beginning to Build the "Ark of Wisdom"   64	
CHAPTER TWO	
Reading in the Liberal Arts: Beginning to Restore the Created Order	73
Original Order: Creation of Humankind in the Image of God   74	
From Order to Disorder: The Fall and Its Effects   100	
Restoration by Reading: Re-ordering Humankind's Knowing and Loving   112	
CHAPTER THREE	
Sacred Scripture and the Foundation of History	137
The Distinctiveness of Sacred Scripture   141	
Augustine on Scripture's Twofold Signification   150	
Ordered Scriptural Reading and Restoration   159	
History as the Foundation ( <i>Fundamentum</i> )   171	
Hugh in Context: The <i>Sensus Litteralis</i> in the Twelfth Century   187	

CHAPTER FOUR

Allegory: Erecting the Edifice of Faith on  
Successive Sacraments throughout History 197

Erecting the Allegorical Edifice on the Sacraments of Faith | 198

World History as the Context for Human Restoration | 209

Successive Sacraments throughout History | 220

One Faith: Three Kinds of Faithful? | 240

CHAPTER FIVE

Tropology: Living the Love Signified in Scripture 254

Hugh's Theoretical Teaching | 255

Hugh's Practical Teaching | 276

Reader Response and Spiritual Transformation | 290

Conclusion 297

Bibliography 301

Primary Works | 301

Secondary Works | 307

Index of Scriptural Citations 325

General Index 327



# Abbreviations

Primary sources are cited using the conventional internal reference, followed by the modern edition (abbreviated where necessary) in parentheses, and the translation, where relevant. Frequently cited works use the abbreviations listed below. Detailed information about editions and translations cited can be found in the bibliography of primary works.

## Series

- CCCM Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis (Turnhout: Brepols, 1966–)
- CCL Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina (Turnhout: Brepols, 1953–)
- CSEL Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum (Vienna: F. Tempsky, and various imprints, 1866–)
- FCh Fathers of the Church: A New Translation (New York: CIMA, 1947–1949; New York: Fathers of the Church, 1949–1960; Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1960–)
- PL Patrologiae cursus completus: Series Latina, ed. J.-P. Migne, 221 vols. (Paris: Migne, 1844–1864)

## Works by Hugh of St Victor

- |                        |   |
|------------------------|---|
| <i>Adnot. in Pent.</i> | <i>Adnotationes elucidatoriae in Pentateuchon</i>         |
| <i>Chron.</i>          | <i>Chronicon</i>  |
| <i>De archa</i>        | <i>De archa Noe = De arca Noe morali</i>                  |
| <i>De inst. nov.</i>   | <i>De institutione novitiorum</i>                         |
| <i>De sacr. fid.</i>   | <i>De sacramentis christianae fidei</i>                   |
| <i>De sacr. leg.</i>   | <i>De sacramentis legis naturalis et scriptae</i>         |
| <i>De script.</i>      | <i>De scripturis et scriptoribus sacris</i>               |
| <i>De trib. dieb.</i>  | <i>De tribus diebus</i>                                   |
| <i>Did.</i>            | <i>Didascalicon</i>                                       |
| <i>Epitome</i>         | <i>Epitome Dindimi in Philosophiam</i>                    |
| <i>In hier. coel.</i>  | <i>In hierarchiam coelestem S. Dionysii</i>               |
| <i>Libellus</i>        | <i>Libellus de formatione arche = De arca Noe mystica</i> |

## Works by Augustine

<i>Conf.</i>	<i>Confessiones</i>
<i>De civ. Dei</i>	<i>De civitate Dei</i>
<i>De doct.</i>	<i>De doctrina Christiana</i>
<i>De Gen. ad lit.</i>	<i>De Genesi ad litteram</i>
<i>De Gen. ad Man.</i>	<i>De Genesi adversus Manicheos</i>
<i>De Gen. lit. imp.</i>	<i>De Genesi ad litteram imperfectus liber</i>
<i>De lib. arb.</i>	<i>De libero arbitrio</i>
<i>De mag.</i>	<i>De magistro</i>
<i>De ord.</i>	<i>De ordine</i>
<i>De Trin.</i>	<i>De Trinitate</i>
<i>Retr.</i>	<i>Retractationes</i>
<i>Sol.</i>	<i>Soliloquia</i>

### **Works by Other Authors**

*Ad Her.*                      *Ad Herennium*

Cicero  
*De Orat.*                      *De Oratore*

Honorius Augustodunensis  
*De anim. ex.*                *De animae exsilio et patria*

Peter Lombard  
*Sent.*                              *Sententiae in IV libris distinctae*

Quintilian  
*Inst.*                              *Institutio Oratoria*

Thomas Aquinas  
*ST*                                *Summa Theologiae*

# Acknowledgments

The successful completion of this monograph, which represents a revision of my doctoral dissertation submitted to the Department of Theology at the University of Notre Dame in 2005, would not have been possible without the generous support, encouragement, and untiring assistance of many people. My parents, Bill and Mary Harkins, and my brother, Vernon, have encouraged and supported me in profound and incalculable ways throughout my life and career. I owe another debt of gratitude to Professors Susan Keefe and David Steinmetz of Duke University for introducing me to the world of medieval church history and theology, and for inspiring me to pursue a career in this field.

I am most grateful to my colleagues in the Department of Theology at Fordham University for inviting me to join the faculty in 2007 and helping to make my transition smooth and enjoyable. Special thanks go to Terrence Tilley, our department chair, for – among other things – giving me a very manageable first-year course load that enabled me to complete work on the book, and to Robert Himmelberg, Interim Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences at Fordham, for his generous support of this publication.

This project would not have come to fruition without the aid of various faculty members of the Department of Theology and the Medieval Institute at the University of Notre Dame. John Cavadini, Joseph Wawrykow, Brian Daley, SJ, Randall Zachman, and Lawrence Cunningham have been particularly helpful and encouraging. I also owe a special thanks to Grover Zinn of Oberlin College for his interest in this project and in my research more generally since my days as a graduate student. On more than one occasion Grover generously hosted me at Oberlin for insightful discussions of the Victorines, and he kindly made available to me a facsimile copy of a manuscript of Hugh's *Chronicon* (MS Troyes 259).

Several libraries and a number of adept librarians assisted in locating and procuring the necessary books and materials for my research. I am much obliged to Susan Feirick of the circulation department of Hesburgh Library at Notre Dame; Marina Smyth of Notre Dame's Medieval Institute Library; Patricia O'Kane of Gumberg Library at Duquesne University; Stephan Frederick of the inter-library loan department at the Christopher Center for Library and Information Resources at Valparaiso University; and Charlotte Labbe, director of inter-library loan services at Walsh

Library on the Rose Hill campus of Fordham University. I thank the Master and Fellows of St John's College, University of Cambridge, for granting permission to use the initial on fol. 1r of their MS K.25 as the cover image for this book. And I appreciate the kind and timely assistance of Jonathan Harrison, librarian at St John's College, in securing this permission.

I also wish to acknowledge the Lilly Fellows Program and Christ College at Valparaiso University, where I taught as a postdoctoral fellow from 2005 to 2007, for affording me the time and resources to work on this project. I particularly thank John Steven Paul, Mark Schwehn, Mel Piehl, and Christoffer Grundmann.

The final version of this book owes much to a number of people who read and commented on it at various stages. The members of my dissertation committee at Notre Dame, namely John Cavadini, Cyril O'Regan, and Joseph Wawrykow, gave critical observations and valuable suggestions. Brian Stock of the University of Toronto read an earlier version of the work in its entirety and provided detailed notes and insightful recommendations, particularly on my treatment of memory in Augustine. To the anonymous readers at PIMS for their criticisms and suggestions for improvement, I owe a debt of gratitude. A heartfelt thanks goes to Fred Unwalla, editor at PIMS, for his untiring and indispensable work in guiding the book – and me – through the publication process, from manuscript review to editing to final production. The book has been much improved by the astute questions and comments of series editor Joseph Goering, particularly on Chapter Four, and by the superb copyediting of Megan Jones. I also thank James Carley at PIMS for his enthusiastic interest in my work from the outset.

The penultimate word of gratitude goes to my excellent doctoral director, passionate mentor, and most generous friend, the late Michael Signer, whose love of the Victorines inspired this project and whose learning contributed to it in profound ways. I deeply regret that Michael, without whom this book would never have seen the light of day, was himself never able to see the work in its final published form. I will be forever grateful for the innumerable ways Michael, with his irrepressible love of learning and his extraordinary generosity of spirit, encouraged and supported me in this and all my scholarly endeavors. I also wish to acknowledge Betty Signer for her many acts of kindness and encouragement over the years.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to thank my wonderful wife, Angela. Without her deep love, steadfast faith, and unflagging support through the years, for which I am grateful beyond words, this book would not have come to fruition. In love and gratitude, I dedicate this book to Angela and to Michael's memory.

Bronx, New York  
Feast of St Patrick, 2009

# Introduction

Sometime during the early 1120s, an Augustinian canon regular and master named Hugo began his teaching and writing career at the School of St Victor in Paris.<sup>1</sup> Very little is known about the origins and early life of Hugh of St Victor. Indeed, Jerome Taylor has rightly observed that “the primary evidences which tell us of Hugh’s life are few, enigmatic, [and] sometimes contradictory.”<sup>2</sup> The earliest sources offer three different views of Hugh’s origin. First, the oldest extant document (Robert of Torigny’s *De Immutatione Ordinis Monachorum*, 1154), states that Hugh was from Lorraine in northeastern France. Secondly, two Benedictine manuscripts, which provide the next oldest account of his birthplace, testify that Hugh was from Ypres in Flanders. Finally, the account of Alberic de Trois-Fontaines (d. 1241) maintains that Hugh was of Saxon origin. Though Alberic’s account was the latest, by the end of the thirteenth century the community of canons regular at the Abbey of St Victor had accepted Hugh’s Saxon origin.

In what is the most thorough examination of the evidence conducted during the last century, Jerome Taylor derives an account of Hugh’s origin and early life by combining the traditional Victorine view with that of Johann Winningstedt, a sixteenth-century Augustinian canon in the episcopal city of Halberstadt in Saxony.<sup>3</sup> According to Taylor, Hugh of St Victor was born Hermann, the son of Conrad, the Count of Blankenburg, probably in the Blankenburg castle in the diocese of Halberstadt toward the end of the eleventh century (between 1096 and 1100). When Hermann

1 See Patrice Sicard, *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école* (Turnhout, 1991), p. 17; Rebecca Moore, *Jews and Christians in the Life and Thought of Hugh of St. Victor* (Atlanta, 1998), pp. 15–21; and Dale M. Coulter, *Per Visibilia ad Invisibilia: Theological Method in Richard of St. Victor (d. 1173)* (Turnhout, 2006), Appendix: “Annotated Chronology of the Twelfth-Century School of St. Victor,” pp. 233–256, esp. p. 237. Hugh began his career at St Victor before 1125 and began to direct studies at the school in 1133.

2 Jerome Taylor, *The Origin and Early Life of Hugh of St. Victor: An Evaluation of the Tradition* (Notre Dame, IN, 1957), p. 6.

3 Taylor, *Origin and Early Life*, esp. pp. 5–25 and 67–69.

passed from boyhood to youth, his parents sent him sixteen miles northeast of the castle of Blankenburg to the Augustinian house of St Pancras (established by Bishop Reinhard in 1112) in the village of Hamersleben, where he began his education.<sup>4</sup> Attracted to study, Hermann chose, against his parents' wishes, to stay at St Pancras and eventually became a novice in the order there.

Because the Emperor Henry V began to war against the Saxon nobles around 1115, Bishop Reinhard decided to send Hugh away from Hamersleben to Paris. He was accompanied by his uncle and namesake, archdeacon Hugh of Halberstadt, who shared his nephew's desire for flight from the world.<sup>5</sup> The pair traveled to Marseilles and obtained precious relics of the martyr Victor, which they presented to the Parisian Abbey of St Victor on June 17 in a year shortly after its founding (probably between 1115 and 1118).<sup>6</sup> Hugh's uncle financed the building and furnishing of a new abbey church at St Victor. This version of Hugh's arrival at St Victor is supported by twelfth-century documentation that the Victorine community celebrated the "Feast of the Reception of the Relics of Saint Victor" on June 17 and offered the Mass on this feast for the soul of "Magister Hugo," giver of the relics.<sup>7</sup>

Whereas Taylor's historical reconstruction accounts for much of the twelfth-century data, it has failed to gain wide scholarly acceptance largely because of its employment of later traditions. Indeed, in his more recent consideration of Hugh's beginnings, Joachim Ehlers critiques the common historiographical use of Winningstedt's sixteenth-century evidence by Taylor and others.<sup>8</sup> Additionally, Ehlers largely discounts the theory of

4 It is noteworthy that most scholars of Hugh's life consider the autobiographical passage in VI.3 of the *Didascalicon*, where he insists on the primary importance of learning well all the "least things" that pertain to the literal or historical sense of Scripture, to be Hugh's description of his studies under the Augustinian canons of St Pancras. Furthermore, Joseph de Ghellinck maintains that Hugh's address in the prologue to *De arrha animae* to Brother G. and all the servants of Christ at the monastery in Hamersleben suggests the affection of an old friend and former resident of St Pancras (Joseph de Ghellinck, *Le mouvement théologique du XIIe siècle*, 2nd ed. [Bruges, 1948], p. 187 n3).

5 Taylor, *Origin and Early Life*, p. 13.

6 On the probable date of Hugh's arrival at St Victor, see Coulter, *Per Visibilia ad Invisibilia*, Appendix, pp. 236–237.

7 Taylor, *Origin and Early Life*, pp. 67–68.

8 Joachim Ehlers, *Hugo von St. Viktor. Studien zum Geschichtsdanken und zur Geschichtsschreibung des 12. Jahrhunderts* (Wiesbaden, 1973), pp. 27–35. Ehlers maintains, for example: "We must set aside all of the more recent historiography since Winningstedt's episcopal chronicle of Halberstadt that does not make reference to useful new biographical sources, especially the genealogical classification tests which so often are not completely absurd but unprovable" (p. 32).

Hugh's Flemish origin by virtue of the fact that it depends mainly on a single isolated source from the twelfth century.<sup>9</sup> Ehlers concludes that the earliest evidence seems to support the Saxon theory, although he acknowledges that the data can be (and, indeed, occasionally are) read as suggesting Hugh's origin in the Flanders-Lorraine boundary region.<sup>10</sup>

While much about Hugh's origin and early life still remains shrouded in mystery, it is certain that Hugh was at the Abbey of St Victor by 1118.<sup>11</sup> Ten years prior, in 1108, William of Champeaux (c. 1069–1122) had resigned as archdeacon of Paris and retired from his teaching post at the cathedral in order to establish a small community on the left bank of the Seine just outside the city walls.<sup>12</sup> The abbey received its charter from King Louis VI in 1113 and was consecrated by Pope Paschal II in 1114. The community that was established and grew at St Victor consisted of canons who lived according to the Rule of St Augustine.<sup>13</sup> Thus, they united clerical status with a full common life.

From the time of the abbey's inception, young men from all over Europe were attracted to St Victor by the educational opportunities its school offered. Indeed, the School of St Victor began humbly with William of Champeaux teaching his students who had followed him to the new abbey just outside the city walls. He offered free instruction to all comers, a policy continued in the school until around mid-century.<sup>14</sup> William and

- 9 Ehlers, *Hugo von St. Viktor*, pp. 30–31.
- 10 On the possibility of the Flanders-Lorraine hypothesis, see Ehlers, *Hugo von St. Viktor*, pp. 32–33.
- 11 Moore, *Jeus and Christians*, p. 18. On the Flemish theory of Hugh's origin, see F.E. Croydon, "Notes on the Life of Hugh of St. Victor," *Journal of Theological Studies* 40 (1939): 232–253; and Roger Baron, "Notes biographiques sur Hugues de Saint-Victor," *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 51 (1956): 920–934.
- 12 On the founding and early history of the Abbey of St Victor, see Fourier Bonnard, *Histoire de l'abbaye royale et de l'ordre des chanoines réguliers de St.-Victor de Paris*, vol. 1: *Première période (1113–1500)* (Paris, 1904), pp. 1–17; Robert-Henri Bautier, "Les origines et les premiers développements de l'abbaye Saint-Victor de Paris," in *L'Abbaye Parisienne de Saint-Victor au moyen âge: Communications présentées au XIIIe Colloque d'Humanisme médiéval de Paris (1986–1988)*, ed. Jean Longère (Paris and Turnhout, 1991), pp. 23–52; and Jean Châtillon, *Théologie, spiritualité et Métaphysique dans l'œuvre oratoire d'Achard de Saint-Victor: Etudes d'histoire doctrinale précédées d'un essai sur la vie et l'œuvre d'Achard* (Paris, 1969), pp. 53–85.
- 13 For an introduction to the history and manner of life of the Augustinian canons regular, see J.C. Dickinson, *The Origins of the Austin Canons and Their Introduction into England* (London, 1950); and Jean Châtillon, *Le mouvement canonial au moyen âge: Réforme de l'église, spiritualité et culture*, ed. Patrice Sicard (Paris and Turnhout, 1992).
- 14 R.N. Swanson, *The Twelfth-Century Renaissance* (Manchester, 1999), pp. 12–39.

the School of St Victor exemplify the transformation of education that was taking place in the first half of the twelfth century. In this period the place of teaching became subordinate in importance to the person of the teacher. The most significant and distinctive teaching of the period became deinstitutionalized (i.e., detached from the cathedral and monastic schools of the past) and attached to “masters” (*magistri*) who taught wherever they could find a place to do so.<sup>15</sup> The *magistri* constituted a new social category that began to appear outside the traditional structures of ecclesiastical education. By the first few decades of the twelfth century, the title “master” not only designated an officially recognized position and status in the new schools (e.g., Master Ivo of Chartres, Master Anselm of Laon, Master Bernard of Chartres, Master Abelard, Master Peter Lombard), but also certified the teachings and pronouncements of these men.<sup>16</sup>

The great masters of the early twelfth century taught new techniques of reading, analyzing, and organizing traditional legal, medical, and theological texts. These particular skills, which were necessary for the highest positions in government and ecclesiastical administration, were rare, difficult, and brought great rewards to students who mastered them.<sup>17</sup> Thus, students enthusiastically sought out masters from whom to learn these new techniques, and masters, in turn, sought a critical mass of students to teach.

Both students and masters found what they needed in the urban centers of northern Europe, particularly in Paris and the surrounding area.<sup>18</sup> Around 1100 Paris began a period of very rapid growth, both geographic and economic. Such growth meant that there was not only sufficient room for schools and lodgings, but also an abundance of readily accessible food and wine. Furthermore, Paris offered wide freedom for independent masters to establish and operate their own schools. The educational

15 R.W. Southern, “The Schools of Paris and the School of Chartres,” in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, ed. Robert L. Benson and Giles Constable (Cambridge, MA, 1982; repr., Toronto, 1991), pp. 113–137. On the educational transitions of the twelfth century, see also Swanson, *Twelfth-Century Renaissance*, pp. 12–39.

16 Marie-Dominique Chenu, *Nature, Man, and Society in the Twelfth Century: Essays on New Theological Perspectives in the Latin West*, ed. and trans. Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little (Chicago, 1968; repr., Toronto, 1997), pp. 272–279.

17 Southern, “The Schools of Paris.”

18 The following summary of the advantages of Paris as an educational center in the first half of the twelfth century relies on Southern, “The Schools of Paris.” See also Gilbert Dahan, *L'exégèse chrétienne de la Bible en Occident médiéval, XIIe–XIVe siècle* (Paris, 1999), pp. 91–92, who notes that “the sufficiently generalized phenomenon of urbanization of the society led to the creation and development of schools located in the city, either attached to secular chapters of the churches (principally cathedrals) or created by regular canons (like St. Victor).”



monopoly that the cathedral school and the chancellor of Paris formerly had broke down early in the twelfth century in part because it was difficult for him to supervise the ever-growing urban area. As a result, the number of schools in Paris and its surrounding area increased rapidly. Indeed, at least twenty-five well-known twelfth-century schools can be counted within 100 miles of Paris. Because the educational dominance of Paris rested on the presence of many independent masters rather than on the fame of a single school, students continued to flock to the Paris area. According to R.W. Southern, by 1140 there were no fewer than 2,000 to 3,000 students in Paris.<sup>19</sup> And by the end of the century, there were about 4,000 students, roughly ten percent of the city's population, attached to about 150 different masters.<sup>20</sup> Quite clearly, then, in this premiere educational center students were easily able to find a number of learned teachers in many different disciplines, from grammar and logic to philosophy and theology.

By 1125, one such teacher who was particularly successful in attracting students was Hugh of St Victor. Hugh was helped in this regard by the fact that, in contrast to traditional monastic schools, St Victor was an "external" or "open" school – that is, in addition to providing formation for its own novices, it offered education to young men who were not members of the religious community at the abbey. This more outward-looking approach to education was surely a function of the vocation of the new Augustinian canons regular, who intended themselves and their ministry as more pastoral and active than that of traditional monks.<sup>21</sup>

Beginning with William of Champeaux, the community at St Victor understood itself as a new form of religious life that "remained open to the currents of intellectual life stirring in the Parisian schools while maintaining a steadfast fidelity to the ancient tradition of monastic spirituality."<sup>22</sup> Thus, under the leadership of Hugh, the School of St Victor placed a premium not only on the reading and interpretation of Scripture, but

19 Southern, "The Schools of Paris," p. 128.

20 Swanson, *Twelfth-Century Renaissance*, p. 34.

21 Swanson, *Twelfth-Century Renaissance*, pp. 17–18. Swanson enumerates other factors contributing to the rise of "open" schools in the twelfth century, including the emergence of a cash economy, which enabled those without aspirations to the religious life to purchase a religious education, and the decline of child oblation, which ended the "replicative tradition" of monastic education.

22 Grover A. Zinn, "History and Contemplation: The Dimensions of the Restoration of Man in Two Treatises on the Ark of Noah by Hugh of St. Victor" (Ph.D. diss., Duke University, 1968), p. 11. See also Dickinson, *Origins of the Austin Canons*, pp. 190–191; and Steven Chase, *Contemplation and Compassion: The Victorine Tradition* (Maryknoll, NY, 2003), pp. 21–23.

also on applying the new knowledge and techniques of liberal arts education (i.e., secular learning) to Scripture toward the end of knowing and loving God more profoundly.<sup>23</sup> In his pedagogy and theology, as we will see, Hugh subordinates the liberal arts to sacred knowledge in the development of a single salvific *philosophia*.<sup>24</sup> In this project Hugh relies heavily on and aims to complete the project of Christian education begun centuries earlier in Augustine's *De doctrina Christiana*. Indeed, because of important similarities between his theological thought and that of Augustine, Hugh was known even in his own lifetime as "a second Augustine" (*secundus Augustinus*).<sup>25</sup>

The profound influence of Augustine on the theology and pedagogy of Hugh of St Victor is perhaps most clearly seen in the twelfth-century master's basic understanding of history. Indeed, Roger Baron has rightly noted that "in the author of the *City of God* the author of *De sacramentis* discovered the reality and the sense of history in the unfolding of Scripture, and it is a temporal order that Hugh follows in his theological account."<sup>26</sup> That Hugh generally structured his theological, exegetical, and spiritual program according to the fundamental narrative of deeds done in time (i.e., the history) that constitutes Sacred Scripture owes much to Augustine. As the Victorine's conceptualizations of history and their dependence on those of Augustine are central to this monograph, we now turn to an overview of them by way of introduction.

In his great work, *De sacramentis christianae fidei*, Hugh divides history in three major ways, indicating his reception and adaptation of Augustine's understanding of *historia*. First, in the Prologue to Book I, Hugh affirms that all of history falls under the two general rubrics of *opus*

23 See, e.g., Jean Châtillon, "De Guillaume de Champeaux à Thomas Gallus: Chronique d'histoire littéraire et doctrinale de l'école de Saint-Victor," *Revue du moyen âge latin* 8 (1952): 139–162; Helmut G. Walther, "St. Victor und die Schulen in Paris vor der Entstehung der Universität," in *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter: Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Martin Kintzinger, Sönke Lorenz, and Michael Walter (Cologne, 1996), pp. 53–74.

24 See, e.g., Dominique Poirel, *Hugues de Saint-Victor* (Paris, 1998), pp. 49–63; Sicard, *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école*, pp. 89–95; and Dahan, *L'exégèse chrétienne*, p. 93, who affirms: "The Parisian school of St. Victor specialized in biblical exegesis, but the most important of its masters, Hugh, did not cease emphasizing the necessity of knowing the liberal arts for the study of sacred science."

25 Roger Baron, "Rapports entre saint Augustin et Hugues de Saint-Victor. Trois opuscules de Hugues de Saint-Victor," *Revue des études augustiniennes* 5 (1959): 391–429. On this title as originating with Thomas de Cantimpré (1201–1272), see Moore, *Jews and Christians*, p. 18, and de Ghellinck, *Le mouvement théologique*, p. 185.

26 Baron, "Rapports entre saint Augustin et Hugues de Saint-Victor," p. 395.

*conditionis* and *opus restorationis*, the work of creation or foundation and the work of restoration.<sup>27</sup> While secular literature treats the first, which concerns God's work of creating and sustaining the world, Sacred Scripture treats the second, which concerns the incarnation of Christ and all of Christ's sacraments, both those that came before the incarnation itself and those that came after it.

Hugh's concept of the sacraments of Christ that were given before the actual advent of Christ himself leads him to formulate another important conception of history. Hugh's second way of dividing history, which is indebted to Augustine's two cities, is that of the two families or two armies of humankind throughout history. In the Prologue to the First Book and throughout Book I of *De sacramentis*, Hugh teaches that all of humankind throughout history is divided into two camps, namely, that of Christ and that of the devil.<sup>28</sup> In contrast to Augustine's *civitates*, however, these two armies are formed not by two loves, but rather by two cosmic acts, namely, God's devising and giving his sacraments to his people, on the one hand, and the devil's giving his sacraments to the people whom he wishes to bind forever to himself, on the other. Even before Christ, then, God gave the *sacramenta* of Christ to his faithful people; and after Christ, different *sacramenta* were again given to God's single people. Hugh discusses God's people as an army consisting of those faithful pagans and Jews who marched before their King (*sive praecedentes*), as well as those believing Christians who have marched and continue to march after Christ their King (*sive subsequentes*). This single people of God is constituted by one faith, the contents of which are belief in God as creator and redeemer. Hugh points out that throughout time, the content of the faith has remained constant, though the cognition of that faith has varied – e.g., faithful Jews knew that a Messiah was to come but didn't know who exactly it was to be, whereas Christians know both that a Messiah has come and that this Messiah is Jesus Christ.<sup>29</sup>

Hugh treats the differences among pagans, Jews, and Christians in his third conceptualization of history and its divisions, namely, the Pauline-Augustinian notion of the *tria tempora*, which Hugh sets forth as *tempus naturalis legis*, *tempus scriptae legis*, and *tempus gratiae*. The time under the natural law is the time before the Old Testament includ-

27 PL 176: 183A–184A. For an English translation, see Hugh of St Victor, *On the Sacraments of the Christian Faith (De Sacramentis)*, trans. Roy J. Deferrari (Cambridge, MA, 1951), p. 3.

28 See, for example, *De sacr. fid.* Prol.I.2 and I.8.II (PL 176: 183B, 312A–D; trans. Deferrari, pp. 3–4, 148–149).

29 *De sacr. fid.* I.10.5 and I.10.6 (PL 176: 334A–C, 339B–D; trans. Deferrari, pp. 172, 177–178).

ing the pre-Sinaitic giving of the Law; the time of the written Law extends from the giving of the Mosaic law to the incarnation of Christ; and the time of grace is from the incarnation to the second coming. Where Hugh makes a significant original contribution to this schema that is, by his time, eleven centuries old is in his addition of an anthropological component. That is, unlike either the Apostle Paul or Augustine, Hugh explicitly links each of these *tempora* to a type of human. We will consider the ways in which Hugh adopted and adapted this three-fold Augustinian understanding of history in greater detail in Chapter Four of this work.

Finally, it must be mentioned that Hugh adapted the scheme of the *sex aetates historiae* as he had received it from Augustine. Hugh's outlining of the six ages of history is almost exactly the same as that formulated by the late-antique North African bishop, with identical divisions and correspondences with both the days of creation and the stages of human life. The one difference from Augustine is Hugh's sub-division of the first five *aetates* into four "successions," namely, the patriarchs (from Adam to Moses), the judges (from Moses to David), the kings (from David to the exile), and the high priests (from the exile to the incarnation).<sup>30</sup> Rebecca Moore has pointed out that Hugh provides the four "successions" in the place of the lists and divisions of secular rulers that some patristic and medieval theologians included as a supplement to their formulations of biblical history.<sup>31</sup> Such a substitution highlights Hugh's particular concern with Jewish history, which was an interest of the Victorines in general.

Marie-Dominique Chenu's 1957 *La théologie au douzième siècle* has been perhaps the single most important work in outlining the emerging importance of history in the twelfth century, particularly in the theology and pedagogy of Hugh of St Victor.<sup>32</sup> And Patrice Sicard stands out as a notable exception to the general rule that Chenu's work on history in Hugh has had minimal influence on his French-speaking contemporaries. Indeed, Sicard, who is part of a French-language school of Victorine scholars that emerged in the 1980s and 1990s, demonstrates a keen awareness of Hugh's historicism and its impact on his theology in general.<sup>33</sup> For example, in Part II of *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école*, Sicard explains that salva-

30 See Hugh's *De scripturis et scriptoribus sacris* (PL 175: 9–28).

31 Moore, *Jews and Christians*, p. 129.

32 Marie-Dominique Chenu, *La théologie au douzième siècle* (Paris, 1957). The English translation by Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little is entitled *Nature, Man, and Society in the Twelfth Century: Essays on New Theological Perspectives in the Latin West*.

33 See Sicard, *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école*.

tion history provides the principle according to which Hugh organizes his entire theological system.<sup>34</sup>

The German school of Hugh research has also focused on the canon's historical outlook, most notably in the context of church-state relations. W.A. Schneider, for example, has a chapter on Hugh's treatment of pope and king in his 1933 *Geschichte und Geschichtsphilosophie bei Hugo von St. Victor*.<sup>35</sup> In his published dissertation, Joachim Ehlers considers the influence of the French monarchy on Hugh's understanding of history.<sup>36</sup> Friedrich Merzbacher treats Hugh's conceptions of authority and justice.<sup>37</sup> Heinz R. Schlette, in an article published in 1957 – concurrently with Chenu's seminal work – argued that Hugh combined universal history with an emphasis on the divine work of human restoration to produce a missionary thrust that represents the very essence of Hugh's theology.<sup>38</sup>

Recent scholarship in English has furthered the study of *historia* as a central theme throughout Hugh's corpus. For example, Grover Zinn has shown that “history is the foundation” of both the regular canon's exegetical and mystical works.<sup>39</sup> Based on an analysis of Hugh's conception of history in the two Ark treatises, as well as in his hermeneutic and in the *De sacramentis*, Zinn argues that “Hugh's theology unites in an intimate manner that which is most inward, the renewal of the *imago Dei* at the innermost core of the human person, and that which is preeminently outer, namely the succession of deeds done in time (*ordo rerum gestarum*) which comprises the divine ‘work of restoration.’”<sup>40</sup> Furthermore, William Green, in his article on Hugh's *Chronicon*, has illustrated that the learning of historical events was the first stage in the master's program of education at the School of St Victor and the prelude to the literal reading of the scrip-

34 See, e.g., p. 91 of Sicard, *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école*.

35 W.A. Schneider, *Geschichte und Geschichtsphilosophie bei Hugo von St. Victor. Ein Beitrag zur Geistesgeschichte des 12. Jahrhunderts* (Münster, 1933).

36 Ehlers, *Hugo von St. Viktor*.

37 Friedrich Merzbacher, “Recht und Gewaltenlehre bei Hugo von St. Victor,” in Merzbacher, *Recht – Staat – Kirche: Ausgewählte Aufsätze*, ed. Gerhard Köbler, Hubert Drüppel, and Dietmar Willoweit (Vienna, 1989), pp. 207–234.

38 Heinz Robert Schlette, “Heilsgeschichte und Mission. Ein Beitrag zur Missionstheorie nach Hugo von St. Viktor,” *Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft* 41 (1957): 25–44.

39 Grover A. Zinn, “*Historia fundamentum est*: The Role of History in the Contemporary Life according to Hugh of St. Victor,” in *Contemporary Reflections on the Medieval Christian Tradition: Essays in Honor of Ray C. Petry*, ed. George H. Shriver (Durham, NC, 1974), pp. 135–158.

40 Zinn, “*Historia fundamentum est*,” p. 136.

tural text, which Hugh also calls *historia*.<sup>41</sup> Although other such studies treat Hugh's understanding of history in certain select works or from a particular and limited perspective, there has been no full-length study of the role of *historia* in the processes of reading and formation toward restoration in Hugh's theology and pedagogy in general.<sup>42</sup> Furthermore, scholarship has paid too little attention to the patristic and early medieval sources of Hugh's understanding of history and reading, particularly his reception of Augustine.

The present monograph seeks to fill this lacuna in current scholarship by offering a thoroughgoing treatment of *historia*, reading, and the work of restoration in the thought of Hugh of St Victor. By providing a close reading of the Victorine master's most important writings, we seek to demonstrate both that and how history, reading, and restoration constitute the guiding principles of Hugh's theological and pedagogical program. Our consideration of the convergence of these seminal themes throughout Hugh's corpus will provide a window onto his holistic and integrated understanding of reading, Christian education and formation, and the spiritual life. Indeed, we will see that, according to Hugh, it is particularly in reading, internalizing, and living in accordance with the biblical account of the history of God's deeds that the student is re-ordered and restored to the image of God in which he was created. That is, in reading and responding to the work of restoration revealed in Scripture, the student comes to participate in the ongoing history of the divine work of restoration.

The thesis of this monograph is twofold. First, we will argue that, according to Hugh, the fallen and dis-ordered human being begins to be re-ordered and restored to the image of God by engaging in a detailed program of ordered reading, first in the liberal arts and subsequently in Sacred Scripture. Secondly, we seek to show that Hugh understands the reader's re-ordering, restoration, or transformation as beginning at the level of *historia* and as continuing at this level even as the reader advances through the disciplines. Furthermore, throughout the work and at each of Hugh's pedagogical levels, we will pay particular attention to how the Victorine adopts and adapts the thought of Augustine in his twelfth-century context.

41 William M. Green, "Hugo of St. Victor, *De tribus maximis circumstantiis gestorum*," *Speculum* 18 (1943): 484-493.

42 For example, Gillian Evans investigates Hugh's placement of history in the context of the study of the literal sense of Scripture ("Hugh of St. Victor on History and the Meaning of Things," *Studia Monastica* 25 [1983]: 223-234); and Rebecca Moore treats Hugh's sacramental approach to history, his emphasis on Jewish history, and the ways in which these foci of his theology determine his understanding of Jews and Judaism vis-à-vis the Christian faith (*Jews and Christians*).

In its general outline, this work will follow the pedagogical program of Hugh of St Victor. We begin, in Chapter One, with a consideration of Hugh's teaching on memory-training, a prerequisite for the student beginning to read. Here we treat the way in which Hugh, in both the *Chronicon* and the *Libellus de formatione arche*, teaches his students to order their minds for organizing, storing, and recalling what they read. The Victorine master's approach draws not only on techniques that were central to the *ars memorativa* of classical antiquity, but also on Augustine's Christian appropriation of the mnemonic tradition. Finally, we investigate how Hugh instructed his students in the mental visualization of history in his treatises on the Ark of Noah. We will see that the memorization and internalization of history is the *sine qua non* of all theological education and spiritual reformation, according to Hugh.

Having considered the necessary precondition of Hugh's pedagogical program, Chapter Two investigates the master's teaching on reading in the liberal arts. Here we will see that Hugh understands properly ordered reading in the arts as the real beginning of the process whereby the human person is restored to the image of God. The Victorine's view of restoration by reading is inextricably bound up with the foundational Christian narrative (i.e., the *historia*) of creation, fall, and redemption. As such, we preface our consideration of reading in the liberal arts with a treatment of Hugh's understanding of the original order (*ordo*) of human creation, on the one hand, and the disorder caused by original sin and the fall, on the other. In different ways, the various branches of philosophy and the arts within each serve as initial roads leading the reader toward the knowledge of God, the love of God, and the immortality that were lost as a result of the fall. Hugh's reception of the ancient tradition of Christian thinking about and use of the arts, particularly as propounded by Augustine, constitutes an integral part of our treatment in this chapter.

Chapter Three investigates Hugh's theology and pedagogy of scriptural reading in general, for which liberal arts study prepares the pupil. According to Hugh, the student moves ever closer toward the Wisdom in whose image he was created by reading Sacred Scripture. Here we concern ourselves principally with what Hugh understands as the first level or discipline of scriptural reading, namely, *historia*, which instructs the mind with knowledge. As a prelude, we look at Hugh's teaching on the distinctiveness of Scripture as set forth in the *Didascalicon* and *De scripturis et scriptoribus sacris*, and on ordered scriptural reading and restoration. As Hugh's understanding of the nature and purpose of Scripture depends heavily on the thought of Augustine, we also consider the latter on Scripture's twofold signification by way of background.

In Chapter Four, we treat the second discipline of scriptural reading, namely, allegory, and the way in which Hugh envisions it as contributing

to the student's continued restoration. It is in reading biblical texts allegorically – i.e., according to the mysteries of the Christian faith – that the student erects the edifice of faith in his mind. The successive sacraments that Christ has given to his faithful people throughout history provide, according to Hugh's teaching, a kind of second foundation (after the first foundation of history) on which the student builds. Here we analyze carefully the master's understanding of sacred history as set forth in *De sacramentis*, and compare it with that of Augustine. Hugh's understanding of sacraments throughout history represents a development of Augustinian thought which generally determined the way subsequent scholastic theologians – with ever increasing nuance and in ever more detail – conceived of “sacraments” both before and after the advent of Christ. In his infinite mercy, God, according to the Victorine, has provided fallen humankind with ample time and a suitable place for repentance and restoration. Indeed, the entire history of the world serves as the context for human salvation. Hugh seeks to teach his students how this particular view of history is to be found in the allegorical reading of the scriptural narrative.

Finally, Chapter Five considers Hugh's understanding of tropology, the third discipline of scriptural reading, and how it serves to move the reader further toward restoration and final beatitude. Here we seek to understand and elucidate not only Hugh's theoretical teaching concerning tropology, but also his practical teaching as revealed in *De institutione novitiorum*. We will see that the Victorine master is thoroughly informed by the ancient conviction that the love of wisdom – i.e., philosophy – is and must be a way of life into which one is formed by reading and practicing other spiritual exercises. For Hugh, Sacred Scripture is the Christian philosopher's most important authoritative text, of course. Taking his cue from Augustine, the Victorine master maintains that the scriptural narrative is not merely to be read, memorized, and meditated on. Rather, the *historia* that recounts God's loving works of creation and restoration exhorts the reader to become a participant in this ongoing narrative of salvation history by living a life that imitates the divine love. By utilizing the traditional “list of circumstances” – namely, who, what, when, where, why, and how – as a means of ordering nearly every aspect of the student's behavior and speech, Hugh connects *tropologia* back to the foundation of *historia* and its basic persons, places, and times. In making this pedagogical move, the Victorine master makes clear that the personal and spiritual transformation that appears to take place at the higher level of tropology is firmly rooted in and depends on the fundamental scriptural narrative of deeds done in time. Thus, as the following monograph seeks to elucidate, *historia* is, for Hugh, the *sine qua non* of both sacred reading and the restoration to the divine image toward which such reading finally aims.