

38800175  
Q/T TOT PD-AAD-145-EICLASSIFICATION  
PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE <b>Food For Work</b>		2. PROJECT NUMBER <b>388-0017</b>	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE <b>USAID/BANGLADESH</b>
		4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES		6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 1976	B. Final Obligation Expected FY 1980	C. Final Input Delivery FY 1980	A. Total \$ <b>26,213</b> B. U.S. \$ <b>2,806</b>
		From (month/yr.) <b>Oct. 1, 1977</b> 19p. To (month/yr.) <b>Sept. 30, 1978</b> Date of Evaluation <b>November 27, 1978</b>	
8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR			
A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)			B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION
1) Letter of instruction to local government entities informing them of a) new project proforma preparation schedule for FY-80 projects b) CARE's role in assisting helping PIO's in proforma preparation with actual responsibility for proforma preparation assigned to the PIO's c) ration rate policy toward allied factors.			MRR
2) MRR will render decision with regard to USAID, CARE WFP recommendation to decentralize FFW project approval authority.			MRR
3) MRR will request the Deputy Commissioners to provide large scale maps for use by PIOs and CARE			MRR
4) CARE units will make available workshop sessions to help and assist all PIO's who express an interest, prior to, or during the FY-79 dry season program.			CARE
5) MRR to issue letter of instruction which reinforces last year's instructions re the District Steering Committees			MRR
6) MRR will issue letter of instruction which a) instruct Fisheries and Thana Supervisors to certify (in addition to the PIO certification) project completion reports, b) instructs PIOs to concur to			MRR
(PLEASE TURN OVER)			
9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS			10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	A. <input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	B. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or <input type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	
11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)			12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval
Jon O'Rourke, Acting Food for Peace Officer Ronald Burkard, Director, CARE/Bangladesh A.N.M. Eusuf, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Relief & Rehabilitation			Signature <i>[Signature]</i> Typed Name <i>[Signature]</i> R.L. Podol Date <b>Acting Director</b>

and initial the CO Dev's sub-allotment, and to  
send copies of the suballotment to the CARE  
Unit, c) lays down new standardized and uniform  
procedures for final project reporting on all  
local initiative projects, including WFP  
projects, d) issues a new simple PIO visi-  
tation monitoring form.

MRR

January 30, 1979

- 8) CARE will purchase measurement tapes, ranging  
poles and other appropriate equipment as  
deemed necessary by CARE

CARE

FY 79

- 9) MRR will provide to USAID and CARE a copy  
of a) its LSD-wise wheat distribution list,  
b) its FY-79 project priority list.

MRR

December 15, 1978

- 10) MRR will continue efforts to fill all PIO  
vacancies and replace non-technical staff  
with technical qualified PIOs

MRR

13. SUMMARY - After three (3) years of implementation the five year USAID/CARE Food for Work (project is progressing well) in terms of its project goal/purpose which is to (provide direct employment for rural landless people by the completion of rural earthwork projects.) In FY-76 CARE selected 531 projects for implementation; the BDG issued 61,000 MT of wheat to these projects creating 15 million workdays of employment and excavating 1 billion cubic feet of earthwork. CARE reimbursed the BDG with 42,811 MT of PL-480 Title II wheat.

In FY 77 CARE approved 1,160 projects for implementation, and the BDG issued 77,472 MT of wheat creating 23 million workdays of employment and excavating 1.4 billion cft of earthwork. The CARE reimbursement to the BDG amounted to 66,204 MT of Title II wheat, or 85.5% of the wheat issued to the project by the BDG. During 1977 CARE conducted on-site previewes and on-site final surveys on 215 of the 1,160 projects. These 215 projects represented 29,000 MT of projects or 29% of the total amount of wheat approved for implementation.

In FY 78 the BDG utilized 96,273 MT of wheat on 1,020 CARE approved projects. CARE increased its intensive monitoring (i.e. on-site preview and post-project completion surveys) to 339 projects representing 54,000 MT, or approximately 50% of the total amount of tonnage which CARE approved for implementation (110,000 MT). CARE monitoring concluded that 85,991 MT (88.9% of 96,273 MT) resulted in earthwork accomplished according to the approved project plan and approved payment rates, and therefore, that amount (i.e. 85,991 MT) of Title II food will be reimbursed to the BDG.

Using this figure of 85,273 MT, and based on the ideal 3 seers (6.2 lbs.) of wheat per 70 cubic feet per person per day, it can be very roughly estimated that (30 million workdays of employment were created and approximately 1 million person received employment for a 30 day period.) (The individual CARE final project reports estimate that approximately 20 million work days of employment were created on the 339 projects (54,000 MT) which they surveyed. The annual goal of the project is to create 35 million workdays of employment and give part-time employment to 1 million persons.)

The FY 1978 met with a (variety of difficulties which were identified and discussed during the PES session which was held at the Ministry of Relief on November 27 and attended by representatives of the BDG, CARE, USAID and the World Food Program.)

- a) Inadequate project design formulation;
- b) Gross misappropriation of wheat primarily through manipulation of the "allied factors" portion of the ration rate;
- c) Inadequate performance of the District Steering Committees and and the need to decentralize project acceptance authority to the District or Subdivisional levels;
- d) Localized shortages of wheat;
- e) No apparent increase in the number of women FFW laborers;
- f) Lack of effective training/motivation for the PIOs.

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY - The formal evaluation session was held on November 27, 1978, and was the regular annual evaluation which is called for in the Project Paper. It was conducted in accordance with PES requirements including scope, methodology and design. An issue/agenda paper prepared by the USAID FFPO was the basis for discussion during the session and is included as an attachment to this report. The key individuals participating in the evaluation were:

- 1) Mr. A.F. Choudhury, Joint Secretary/Ministry of Relief,
- 2) Mr. Sultan Miah, Deputy Secretary/Ministry of Relief,
- 3) Mr. Ron Burkard, Director/CARE,
- 4) Mr. Robert Allen, FFW Coordinator/CARE,
- 5) Mr. Paul McVey, Technical Consultant/CARE,
- 6) Mr. Jon O'Rourke, USAID/Food and Nutrition Office,
- 7) Mr. Trevor Page, World Food Program/Senior Advisor.

15. EXTERNAL FACTORS - Not pertinent at this time.

16 and 17. INPUTS - OUTPUTS :

a) Project Design (The quality of the projects submitted by the BDC to CARE in 1977 were inferior to those of 1976.) The (proformas submitted to CARE in September of 1978 for the FY- 79 season were slightly better although there remains great room for improvement.) To improve the design of the project proposals CARE, USAID and WFP supported, and the Ministry of Relief concurred, to the following courses of action to improve FFW project design.

i) No later than January 1979 the Ministry of Relief will issue a letter of instruction to the appropriate local government entities instructing that project proforma preparation begin immediately for FY-80 program. The deadline for submission of FY-80 projects will be June so the local authorities will have at least 5 months to prepare their projects.

ii) CARE will reduce the number of its monitoring visits to on-going FY-79 dry season projects and will devote this liberated time to assisting and helping thana officials, in the means and methods of planning well-designed project proposals for FY 80 and all subsequent years. The January BDC letter of instruction will spell out CARE's efforts to assist and help thana officials in the methodology of planning the various stages of projects.

iii) All participants agreed that large scale (i.e. 1:50,000-1:250,000) maps are an absolutely essential ingredient to good planning of FFW projects. The Ministry of Relief should request the Deputy Commissioners to provide thana maps for the PIOs and CARE.

iv) The Ministry of Relief has instructed each subdivisional headquarters to form a technical subcommittee composed of WDB, BADC, MRD, etc. staff. This technical committee will be given one month to review the FFW project proposals, and by 15 June they will return the project proposals to the SDO who will forward them to the Relief Ministry NLT July 15.

b) Decentralization - USAID, CARE and WFP felt very strongly that it is desirable to decentralize the decision making authority by giving District Selection Committees the authority to approve projects for implementation. The Ministry of Relief agreed in principle to the proposal, but decided to consider it further before finally deciding the course of action it will take. In lieu of full decentralization, in FY-80 three districts namely Sylhet, Comilla & Patuakhali be accorded the "participated decision making" authority jointly by the district administration and a team consisting of CARE, WFP and MRR on a pilot basis for one year. The team will make tentative selection of schemes with the participation of district administration subject to final approval by the Ministry.

As usual, in three districts, after the regular review by the Technical Committee, the SDOs will forward FFW project proposals to the DCs by June 30. The DCs will arrange the joint meeting of the "participated decision making" agencies to make the selection NLT July 31. MRR will issue the detailed instruction to the SDOs and DCs by January 31, 1979.

The Ministry also agreed to provide CARE, USAID and WFP with copies of the priority lists for the FFW projects.)

c) Misappropriation - It was generally agreed that misappropriation is potentially the most insidious negative influence in the entire FFW program. On WFP projects 'allied factors' account for approximately 40% of the wheat payments, while in CARE "surveyed" projects it appears that they may account for much less. All recognized that the "allied factors" portion of the ration rate is possibly the single largest loop hole for corruption. CARE, WFP and USAID strongly support the elimination altogether of allied factors in the ration rate. To do this the standard ration rate would be raised above the present 3 seers per 70 cft. The workers, who do not understand the allied factors calculations, would then become quickly aware of the new rate and will ensure that their ration is not sc�ffoned off by the project committee.

The Ministry will consider the donor proposal to eliminate the allied factors in consultation with the WFP Evaluation team due in early March and April, 1979.

The Ministry will also issue a letter of instruction which reiterates the requirement for signboards at each project site to help eliminate corruption.

d) District Steering Committees - All participants agreed that the District Steering Committees serve a useful function, but their activities should be revitalized by a letter of instruction to the field reinforcing (and revising if necessary) last year's instructions re the committees.)

e) Women's Participation - Fewer than one percent of the FFW laborers are women, and in FY 78 there may have been fewer women employed on FFW than in FY-77. All agreed that women should be encouraged to participate, and on November 18 the Relief Ministry issued a letter of instruction to the thanas encouraging once again recruitment of women for the projects. In FY-79 CARE is accepting for the first time up to 64 (i.e. one for each subdivision) all-womens projects which provide a preferential rate to the women workers.

f) Project Implementation Officers - The PIO's represent one of the most significant inputs into the Food for Work program since they (along with the SDOs and COs) are key links between the Ministry in Dacca and the project in the field. At present there are 123 non-technical PIOs, and there is a shortage of 20 PIOs nationwide. There is also a standing Relief Ministry policy to hire only technically qualified PIOs. To improve PIO performance, it was agreed to do the following:

i) CARE units will provide training to each PIO prior to or during the FY-79 dry season activity. The Relief Ministry will issue a circular to local government officials informing them of this training effort and asking for their cooperation.

ii) Fisheries and MRD thana Supervisor certification in addition to the PIO certification will be required in order to validate that the project is complete. The PIOs will be required to concur to and initial the CO (Dev's) suballotment (i.e. suballotment of the D.O.) to the Project Implementation Committee. Copies of the suballotment should be sent by the PIO and CO to the CARE Unit office. These procedural changes will be put into effect as soon as possible through an immediate letter of instruction.

iii) The Ministry of Relief will revise and shorten the PIO monitoring report and circulate it to the thanas for duplication.

g) Wheat Shortages - Localized shortages of wheat seriously disrupt project implementation. Very little can be done by CARE, USAID, and/or WFP to affect project-specific wheat logistics. However, the Relief Ministry has already sent to the Ministry of Food an LSD-wise list of wheat requirements and will provide copies of that list to provide USAID, CARE, and WFP.

h) Standardization of Final Reports - It makes good common sense to require each local initiative project, regardless of sponsoring agency, to maintain the same final reports. WFP has no objection to this course of action. The Relief Ministry will review the issue and issue instructions accordingly if it is decided to standardize the present system.

18. GOAL - The goal of the project is to "provide direct employment for rural landless and near landless people." The measures of goal achievement are that a) "approximately 35 million work days will be created annually" and b) "approximately 1 million persons will receive employment". In FY 78 the USAID/CARE program succeeded in creating roughly 30 million workdays of employment employing about 1 million persons.

19. PURPOSE - The purpose which the project is expected to achieve if completed successfully and on schedule is as follows:

"The completion of labor intensive rural earthwork structures using Title II commodities to pay workers for constructing such agriculturally oriented items as irrigation canals, flood control embankments, land reclamation embankments, roads, water tanks (i.e. reservoirs) etc. Between 1,000 and 1,400 projects will have been developed and implemented; one million persons will have received 100,000 MT of wheat for providing 35 million person-days of work; 2.5 billion cubic feet of earthwork will have been performed."

In FY 78 the BDG developed and implemented 1,020 CARE approved earthwork projects; approximately 1 million persons received 96,273 MT of wheat for providing 30 million person-days of work; 1.9 billion cubic feet of earthwork was performed.

20. BENEFICIARIES - A recent USAID financed study on the economic and nutritional effects of FFW projects contains a great deal of information which helps identify the FFW laborer. By interviewing some 2,300 workers on FFW projects and by visiting 430 FFW families in their houses the study was able to provide social economic and nutritional profiles of the FFW laborer (i.e. the direct beneficiary) and the laborer's immediate family (i.e. the indirect beneficiaries). The results of the study reveal that the typical FFW laborer is a local male, 32 years of age, owning 0.38 acres of farm land and having no other job opportunities during the time he is working on the FFW project. His occupation is agricultural laborer, and his annual income is among the lowest in Bangladesh. Less than 1% of the FFW laborers are female, one percent are below the age of 15 and 86% own less than one acre of farm land.

The FFW laborer families are the indirect beneficiaries and are composed of approximately 6 million persons (the average FFW family is 6.2 members). Their nutritional status, measured in terms of their nutrient intake, is lower than non-FFW families and significantly lower than the national average for all important nutrients. 19% of the FFW family children are severely malnourished. These facts confirms that FFW families are of Bangladesh's poorest of the poor primarily because of landlessness and unemployment. The participation of a laborer in the FFW program is primarily because of landlessness unemployment and poverty.

21. UNPLANNED EFFECTS - Not pertinent at this time.
22. LESSONS LEARNED - Not pertinent at this time.
23. SPECIAL COMMENTS - Not pertinent at this time.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

ISSUES/AGENDA  
FY-1978 PROJECT EVALUATION  
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 27, 1978  
Ministry of Relief and Rehabilitation

1. REVIEW OF PREVIOUS YEAR'S PROJECT EVALUATION REVIEW (PAR)

The PAR should begin by reviewing progress to-date in implementing the "Action Decisions" listed in the attached two sheets from last year's PAR.

2. PROJECT DESIGN FORMULATION

The quality of the projects submitted to CARE in 1977 by the Relief Ministry was considered to be inferior to that of 1976. The proformas submitted in September of 1978 seem to be slightly better, although there remains great room for improvement. Suggestions for improvement have been made:

a) In November of 1978 the Ministry of Relief should request Project Proformas for FY-80 implementation. This would allow the thana staffs 6-8 months during the dry season (when surveying is possible) to prepare their schemes for submission in June for implementation which should begin in December.

b) CARE should reduce the number of its monitoring visits and increase the amount of time that it spends assisting thana offices in planning and formulating their project proposals.

c) One of the largest constraints to adequate local planning is — the shortage of good maps. Often the thana plan books are based on outdated maps with little useful detail. The Survey of Bangladesh has aerial photographic survey maps. These are available in scale of 1:250,000 and 1:50,000 for the entire area of Bangladesh. In addition to the main physiographic features, roads, railways, village sites, houses, tanks, etc. are shown on these maps which are prepared in several colors along with district boundaries. CARE should attempt to obtain three (3) sets of these maps so that each of its units can begin to plot each year's projects. The Ministry of Relief should also make these maps available to PIOs to improve their planning capabilities.

Earth Resources Technical Satellite (ERTS) data can be used for maps of forests, ground water resources, rivers, canals, etc. Maps can be prepared from 1:5,000 to 1:2,000,000 scale, but for comparison purposes the 1:50,000 (1 inch = 1 mile) or 1:25,000 may be most useful for CARE and the Ministry of Relief. Specific requests can be made through the Bangladesh Atomic Energy Commission (Mahbub Choudhury, 605 Old Road 18 Dhamondi - 318014) to NASA.

### 3. DISTRICT STEERING COMMITTEES

Last year there was an attempt to set up District Steering Committees. Although the convening of these meetings was sporadic, the committee seemed to have a significant positive impact on implementation in those districts where they were held. This year the Relief Ministry should remind and encourage the District authorities to convene these District Steering Committee meetings on a regular basis. The reinforcement of last year's letter of instruction might also include suggestions on FFW items which should be discussed and reviewed during the meetings.

### 4. DISTRICT SELECTION COMMITTEE

It is widely recognized that it is desirable to have controlled decentralization of the project selection process through the establishment of District Selection Committees. This is seen as a positive evolutionary step, despite some of the initial administrative changes that would be necessary. A period of transitional decentralization should be instituted as soon as possible. Under a transitional phase the Relief Ministry would set up the District Selection Committee which would be given the task of assigning priorities to each of the local initiative projects which the District submits to the Relief Ministry in Dacca. The ministry should issue the appropriate instructions re District Selection Committees in November 1978 - i.e. at the same time that MDR issues instructions re submission of FY 80 projects (see paragraph above 'Project Design Formulation').

### 5. MISAPPROPRIATION OF FFW WHEAT

It is said that misappropriation of Rural Works Program (RWP) funds was one of the primary reasons that the program lost its initiative in late 1960s. It is not known whether this RWP misappropriation was due to outright corruption, poor accountability management or inefficiency. But it is clear that allocations to the RWP budget fell dramatically when misappropriation became an issue. Since the FFW program so closely parallels the RWP the lessons learned in the 1960's are instructive.

In the (last two Food for Work dry seasons there have been hundreds of individuals prosecuted for misappropriation of FFW wheat, and many more have been implicated.) Although most of those individuals involved were Project Committee members and local officials at the thana and union level, others have been involved including some of the CARE staff. FFW misappropriation has become an issue in national newspapers.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Aside from insistence upon dogged (legal pursuit of known cases of FFW misappropriation, MRR and CARE should systematically examine ways, conventional and otherwise, to reduce the potential for FFW corruption.) (Much of the corruption is a direct result of conflicting and confusing instructions from the central government and inadequate accountability procedures. For example, many projects had neither project contract forms nor carrying costs available when the projects were ready to begin. Non-availability of forms or carrying costs are major factors encouraging misappropriation. In addition, (less than one half of the FFW projects had sign boards per MRR instructions. Finally, examination of the allied factors in the ration rate might reveal some adjustments in the rate and method of calculation would reduce possible manipulation of final survey figures.

#### 6. LACK OF FUNDS AND EQUIPMENT

It seems that one of the major constraints to proper implementation of FFW projects is the lack of motivation (for whatever reason) among local officials to do a good job. However, there are minor irritating bottlenecks which hamper the effectiveness of PIOs and these start, for example, (excruciatingly slow reimbursement of travel funds is, in effect, a disincentive to PIO field work. The restricted and chronically delayed allocation of carrying-costs is another impediment to efficient implementation. The lack of proper measurement tools, such as tapes, ranging poles, worksheets, etc. is an unnecessary impediment and can be alleviated by donor assistance through CARE.)

#### 7. PROJECT ACCOUNTABILITY

In the past local government and Project Committees have been told that the central government was going to provide the project accountability forms such as master rolls, measurement sheets, time and attendance sheets. In fact, (few forms were delivered by the central government to the Project Committee chairmen, and many local government units were belatedly told to print their own forms.

This foul-up delayed the start-up of many projects. In other cases projects had to be started before receipt of the forms, thus encouraging indulgence in misappropriation.

(The Ministry of Relief should fix a date well before December to supply the required forms and/or place funds for local government reproduction of forms. (It seems much easier and efficient to place the funds.) The absence of delay of forms should never be a constraint to FFW implementation or another loop hole for misappropriation.

8. WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION

Fewer than one percent of the FFN laborers are women. The limited recruitment of women can be attributed generally to customary beliefs about the traditional role of women. Fortunately these beliefs are gradually changing. It is now realized by many leaders in the country that women need employment, are able to work and can contribute to national growth. In fact, many tribal women unencumbered by traditional taboos have proven that their work output per day on FFN projects is greater than that of their male counterparts. During FY-78 the Government encouraged the recruitment of more women in FFN, but the indications are that the number of women in CARE projects has not increased, and, in fact, many have decreased in FY-78. During the past season CARE field officers made 2,941 visits to 1,020 project sites, and during those visits they noted if they saw women at work on the project. The following are the results of those visits:

## BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Contd. Page 1

Action decision Reached at Evaluation Review including items needing further study (Note- This list does not constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action)	10 Officer or Project Director responsible for item to be followed up	
5) Revision of master roll/Attendance register/measurement book.	CARE/BD	Mar. 31, 1978
6) Official Letters of Instruction to remind SDO's that Project Committees may not engage contractors for FFRW projects and if contractors are utilized the projects may be cancelled.	BDC	Oct. 31, 1977
7) Official Letters of Instruction to DCs, SDOs, COs, PIOs and Project Implementation Committees to urge the recruitment of women as well as men to participate in FFRW Program.	BGG	Dec. 31, 1977
8) Field units advised that only wheat to be utilized in FY 1978 CARE FWR Program.	BDC	Dec. 31, 1977
9) CARE will issue instructions to its regional units to submit bi-monthly monitoring/visiting summary reports to CARE/Dacca.	CARE	Nov. 30, 1977

## 12 Signatures:

Project Officer  
(Signed)

Mission of AID/W Office

(Signed)

Jon O'Rourke  
Asst. Food for Peace Officer  
10/21/77  
Date:Joseph S. Cooper  
Director  
10/21/77  
Date.

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY  
(Submitted to MO/PAY after each project evaluation)

1. Mission or AID/W Office Name	2. Project Number
USAID/Bangladesh	388-0017
3. Project Title	
Food For Relief Work	

4. Key project dates (fiscal years)			5. Total U.S. funding - life of project
a. Project Agreement Signed 6/28/76	b. Final Obligation FY 1980	c. Final input delivered FY 1980	\$2,136,000
6. Evaluation Number as listed in Eval Schedule	7. Period covered by this evaluation from Sept. 1, 1976 To: August 31, 1977		8. Date of this Evaluation Review August 25, 1977
	Month/Day/Year	Month/Day/Year	Month/Day/Year
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review, including items needing further study (Note--This list does not constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action)	10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow up	11. Date action to be completed	
1) The present rate of payment of 3 seers (6.15 lbs) per 70 cubic feet, should be changed in the FY 1979 Program to 43 seers of wheat per 1,000 cubic feet of earthwork.	CARE/USAID/ BDG	June 1978	
2) CARE will implement FFW projects in Chittagong Hill Tracts Area utilizing paddy to pay workers as long as the total amount of paddy does not exceed 5% of CARE program total.	USAID/CARE/ BDG	Sept. 30, 1977	
3) PIO Job descriptions to be reviewed for determining if revisions and re-issuance are necessary.	BDG	Nov. 30, 1977	
4) CARE/USAID/WFP to meet and discuss elimination of differences in their monitoring and reporting procedures.	CARE/USAID/ WFP	Nov. 30, 1977	

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

FIGURES ON THE EXTENT (BY VILLAGE AND PARISH GOES) AND GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION (BY DISTRICT) OF FEMALE PARTICIPATION IN C.A.R.E. STORED FOOD FOR WORK PROJECTS, FY-78.

District	Total No. of projects implemented per district	No. of projects where women were seen working by CARE	%	No. of women working during CARE Monitoring visits	No. of projects with P.I.C. reported employing women	
Chittagong	21	-	-	-	-	
Ctg. H. Tracts	3	-	-	-	-	
Comilla	66	1	1.5	35	3	
Noakhali	28	-	-	-	-	
Sylhet	121	20	16.5	1887	23	17.
Dacca	61	9	14.8	6929	11	13
Faridpur	63	7	11.1	302	8	12.
Mymensingh	118	3	2.5	250	6	5.
Tangail	90	6	6.7	407	12	13.1
Munshiganj	83	5	6.0	178	11	13.2
Jessore	25	1	4.0	19	1	4.0
Khulna	29	-	-	-	-	
Narsingha	14	1	7.1	129	1	7.1
Patuakhali	29	-	-	-	1	3.5
Bogra	45	2	4.4	560	3	6.7
Dinajpur	43	7	16.3	46	13	30.2
Rabna	26	-	-	-	-	
Rajshahi	58	7	12.1	263	12	20.7
Rangpur	37	7	7.2	969	22	22.7
	1020	76	7.5	11,264	125	12.

(Or about  
.003% of  
the CARE FW  
laborers.)

9. RATION RATE

The ration rate is based on an estimated average moving capacity per person per day of 70 cubic feet of earth. Added to this rate are "allied factors" for particularly heavy or difficult soil and for movement of the earth beyond the standard 'lead of 100' and lift of 5'. It is a well known fact that 'allied factors' provide a loop-hole for PICs and local officials with dubious intentions. MRR and CARE should consider putting a maximum limit on allied factors, or raising the standard ration rate to, say, 4 sears per 70 cft while eliminating the "allied factors" calculation altogether.

10. UTILIZATION OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION OFFICERS (PIOs)

The PIOs represent one of the Government's most important inputs into the Food for Work program. They are key links between the Ministry of Relief in Dacca and the project in the Field. If they are well qualified, honest and hard working, and if they are not "run down" by their COs, the PIOs can have a major positive impact on project planning and preparation, local level implementation and project accountability. Their central problem, however, will always be that they have a great deal of responsibility for implementation of the projects but not the corresponding authority. Therefore, in addition to honest, hard work and a technical background PIOs must be mature and tactful in their working relationships at the local level. Perhaps their greatest contribution is to serve as an important management information sources for all levels of Government concerned with FFW (U.P. Chairman, Thana CO, SDO, DC, Relief Ministry). The proper management of PIOs is therefore crucial to the success of the program. Several suggestions have been made to improve the overall effectiveness of the PIOs, and the following points should be considered for incorporation into MRR letters of instructions to the field:

A) At present the Circle Officers issue the Delivery Orders (DOs) to the Project Implementation Committee (PIC) without the concurrence or initial of the PIO. PIOs should become more intimately involved with the project implementation by concurring to and initiating the DO. All PIC wheat requisitions should also pass through the PIO.

B) There should be an MRR policy decision made to hire only technically qualified PIOs to gradually eliminate the non-technical staff. In some cases a PIO who is not a technical person is asked to certify a FFW project as complete even if it is designed and implemented by a Rural Development Ministry technical staff member.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

To foster a greater sense of responsibility on the part of the Thana Fisheries and Thana Rural Development technical staff it is advisable to require that Fisheries and MRD certification in addition to PIO certification that the project is complete.

C) PIOs should be required to submit to the CO, SDO, and DC monitoring and completion reports on all the FFW projects in his jurisdiction.

D) The Relief Ministry should continue to hire PIOs until all positions are filled. Vacated positions should always be filled with technically qualified staff.

E) The Relief Ministry should take a fresh look at the PIO job description and reissue making any necessary improvements.

F) To date PIO training has been very limited, and there was virtually none in FY-78. In addition to technical training, PIOs should be thoroughly familiar with the FFW program administration and procedures. There is always a need for refresher training in technical as well as policy/administrative aspects. In addition, training is needed to improve PIO motivation. A long-term PIO train plan should be developed by the Ministry, and short two-day district FFW workshops should be planned for December 1978.

G) Each CARE Unit and each PIO should draw up a tentative field tour schedule and share it with each other. This would result in greater coordination at the project level, and perhaps help alleviate PIO transportation difficulties. Ideally the PIO or thana official should always accompany CARE field staff during each visit to the project.

H) The Ministry of Relief should require that if work on a project stops or is suspended for any reason, the PIOs should inform the SDOs by letter with a copy to the CARE unit.

I) In their monthly reports to the SDOs the PIOs should include an LSD-wise wheat stock position. Likewise, the SDOs should incorporate the information from those reports in the SDOs' monthly status report which is sent to the Relief Ministry/Dacca.

J) The PIOs should promptly review CARE's monitoring reports and take corrective action when and where necessary. If letters are sent by PIOs as a result of a CARE monitoring report copies should be sent to the CARE Unit.

11. AVAILABILITY OF WHEAT

Localized shortages of wheat occurred in those areas where there was a bumper surplus crop of rice coupled with a vigorous Food Ministry procurement program. Unavailability or untimely availability of wheat seriously disrupts project implementation efforts. WFP, CARE, USAID and the Relief Ministry should take the necessary steps to avoid such difficulties in the future.

a) No later than December first the Relief Ministry should provide the Food Ministry with an LSD-wise monthly breakdown of FFW wheat requirements. These requirements might be based on monthly labor requirements for each project as estimated in the project proformas. MRR should also obtain written assurances from the Food Ministry for the continuous supply of the required wheat as per the schedule submitted to MOF.

b) The PLOs should include an LSD-wise wheat stock position in their monthly reports to the SDOs, and the SDOs should incorporate those reports in their monthly status report which they send to the Relief Ministry.

12. PROJECT ACCOUNTABILITY AND RECORD KEEPING

CARE has been contracted by the Government of Bangladesh and USAID to assist in the development of a functioning national FFW system whereby local initiative projects are designed, approved, implemented and accounted for by adequate records. The EDG system which has been developed as a result of this effort has been applied to 90% of the local initiative FFW projects. It is recommended that this system be standardized and applied uniformly to all local initiative FFW projects whether they are Government, CARE, WFP, Canadian, etc. supported projects or whether they are Relief Ministry, Rural Development Ministry or Fisheries projects. This would help narrow another misappropriation loop-hole. The concurrence and active support of this proposal by WFP is needed.

13. TOP DRESSING AND TURFING

Earthwork structures need sometime to settle before final leveling and turfing can be started. At present, however, final leveling is either not done at all or is started immediately after the earthwork is completed. This is done primarily because, according to central government instructions, the final survey is not supposed to be done until after the top dressing and turfing is completed.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

The Ministry, CARE and the World Food Program should investigate ways to remove this constraint so that the FFW structures will be more lasting and thus have a greater impact on local agricultural production.

#### 14. UTILIZATION AND REIMBURSEMENT

An interesting way to measure the relative capacities of each district to program food is by measuring the percentage of authorized (i.e. GOed) amount per district by the amount of CARE wheat actually reimbursed. The districts which were reimbursed the greatest portion of this GOed amount are listed at the top while those that had the greatest difficulty programming FFW projects are listed at the bottom of the list:

District	% of GO earned as Reimbursement
Khulna	92
Kushtia	91
Dacca	90
Nosikhalii	87
Tangail	87
Comilla	84
Jessore	83
Rajshahi	82
Pabna	82
Chittagong Hill Tracts	82
Fardipur	81
Mymensingh	80
Chittagong	79
Sylhet	76
Dinajpur	71
Patuakhali	68
Rangpur	65
Bogra	62
Barisal	59

#### 15. REIMBURSEMENT TRENDS

According to CARE's 1976 records 42,811 MT of Title II wheat were reimbursed to the BDG for 1,409,111,221 cubic feet of earthwork excavated. This is an average of 4.68 pounds of Title II wheat for every 70 cubic feet of earth reported as moved.

According to CARE's 1977 and 1978 records, 1,351,051,750 cft and 1,695,031,533 cft were moved with reimbursements totally 65,204 MT and 85,991 MT respectively. Thus the average amount of Title II wheat for 70 cft increased from 4.68 lbs in FY-76, to 7.55 lbs in FY-77 and 7.82 lbs in FY-78.

The average amount of Title II wheat issued for every 70 cft has increased significantly indicating either a marked improvement in worker output, a significant decrease in misappropriation, or reduced effectiveness of the CARE monitoring/reimbursement effort.

16. SPECIAL EVALUATION

The PAK session should quickly review where each participating agency stands with regard to implementation of the key recommendations in the Special Evaluation (copy of Special Evaluation attached).