



Self- Devouring Growth

A PLANETARY PARABLE

AS TOLD FROM SOUTHERN AFRICA

Julie Livingston

Self-Devouring Growth

BUY

CRITICAL GLOBAL HEALTH:

EVIDENCE, EFFICACY, ETHNOGRAPHY

A series edited by Vincanne Adams and João Biehl

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

Self- Devouring Growth

A PLANETARY PARABLE

AS TOLD FROM SOUTHERN AFRICA

Julie Livingston

DUKE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Durham and London

2019

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

© 2019 Duke University Press
All rights reserved
Printed in the United States of America on
acid-free paper ©
Designed by Amy Ruth Buchanan
Typeset in Arno by
Tseng Information Systems, Inc.

Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 9781478005087 (hard cover : alk. paper)
ISBN 9781478006398 (pbk. : alk. paper)
ISBN 9781478007005 (ebook)

Cover art: James Cullinane, *Rain Drawing 2*, 2017.
Ink and acrylic on panel, 12 × 9 in. Courtesy of the artist
and Robert Henry Contemporary, New York.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

FOR HAZEL

DUKE

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

CONTENTS

	Acknowledgments	ix
	PROLOGUE: A Planetary Parable	1
1	Rainmaking and Other Forgotten Things	11
2	In the Time of Beef	35
	
	<i>Cattle to Beef: A Photo Essay of Abstraction</i>	61
	
3	Roads, Sand, and the Motorized Cow	85
4	Power and Possibility, or Did You Know Aesop Was Once a Slave?	121
	Notes	129
	Index	153

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This little book has been buoyed by an ocean of generosity. My gratitude is deep, expansive, and heartfelt for all those who carried it, and me, along. Most significantly, I owe an enormous debt to the many people over the years in Botswana who gently, patiently, wedged open spaces in my imagination for new worlds to grow.

The book began as a lecture written for the Johannesburg Workshop in Theory and Criticism (JWTTC). I am grateful to the organizers: Julia Hornberger, Zen Marie, Achille Mbembe, and Dhammamegha Leat for the invitation and thought-provoking workshop, and to my fellow JWTTC 2015 participants (especially Anne Allison, Kaushik Sunder Rajan, and Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi) for encouragement and ideas. Ghassan Hage will see how his own paper planted a seed that grew. I am deeply indebted to Catherine Burns, who not only asked terrific questions in Johannesburg but also took good care of me when I was ailing. Toby Jones and Megan Vaughan each read early drafts of that lecture (which became chapter 1), sharpening my thinking enormously and encouraging me to continue.

Drafts of chapter 2 were developed as part of a series of meetings organized by Abou Farman and Richard Rottenburg. I am so grateful to both of them and to the other members of the Measures of Future Health group—Miriam Ticktin, Susan Erickson, Sandra Calk, Vincent DuClos, and Celia Lowe—for asking all the right questions across multiple drafts, and for their superb scholarship that sets me thinking. I am especially grateful to Abou for the careful editorial advice.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

In addition to the JWTC and Measures of Future Health, I benefited enormously from the patience, intelligence, and generosity of many audiences where I tried out various parts of the manuscript: the Anthropology Department at Stanford, the Anthropology Department at University of Michigan, the Anthropology Department at Duke, the Department of the History of Medicine at Johns Hopkins, the Discard Studies Group at New York University (NYU), the Colloquium Series on Shifting Social Contracts in Postcolonial Governance at The New School, the Anthropology Department at the University of Amsterdam, the Anthropology Department at Brown, the Ifriqiyya Colloquium at Columbia, the History Department at Columbia, the MacArthur Fellows Forum, the Seminar in Global Health at Princeton, the Epicentre workshop on Configuring Contagion in Biosocial Epidemics at Aarhus University, the History Department at NYU, the Department of the History and Sociology of Science at the University of Pennsylvania, the Department of Social and Cultural Analysis at NYU, and the Anthropology Department at NYU. I am particularly grateful to Bruce Grant, Victoria Koski-Karrell, Elizabeth Roberts, Scott Stonington, Antina von Schnitzler, Adriana Petryna, Joao Biehl, Carolyn Rouse, Rijk Van Dyck, Lisa Stevenson, Lotte Meinart, Lynn Thomas, Dean Saranillo, Gil Anidjar, Zenia Kish, Dilshanie Perera, Jess Auerbach, AnneMaria Makhulu, Charlie Piot, Randy Matory, Vivian Lu, Dean Chahim, Lana Povitz, Nuala Caomhanach, Lochlann Jain, Harris Solomon, Mana Kia, and Mamadou Diouf for their thoughtful comments and questions.

At NYU I am fortunate indeed for the presence of so many smart, creative, and hilarious faculty and staff in the Department of Social and Cultural Analysis and the History Department. In particular I thank my co-teacher Thuy Linh Tu who taught me more than I could possibly hope for when we taught “Strategies” together. (Someone ring the bell, I said Strategies.)

Many of the ideas here took me back to discussions in graduate school with one of my most beloved mentors, the late Ivan Karp. My debt to him is enormous. So many thanks to Mike McGovern, who since our time in graduate school has consistently set the standard for how to carry the very best of those

DUKE

x ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

concepts we learned forward, and to Randy Packard for teaching me to pay careful attention to political economy even when it was unfashionable. Other ideas were born during a collaborative project with Jasbir Puar. I hope Jasbir can see her genius lurking here, and the grounding I get from our many years of conversation. Still other ideas began in Gaborone in 2007 amid conversations and debates with Patrick Monnaesi and Betsey Brada. *Ke a leboga ditsala tsa me.*

While writing this book I was immensely lucky to work very closely with some of the most marvelous graduate students: Tyler Zoanni, Steven Thrasher, Emma Shaw Crane, Sunaura Taylor, Laura Philips, Andrew Seaton, and Emily Lim Rogers. Each of them gives me badly needed hope for this world. I trust Sunaura Taylor and Emma Shaw Crane will see how much they taught me and how the conversations begun in our respective directed readings have stayed with me. Emily Lim Rogers deserves special thanks for hunting down images and permissions, and helping me think through options with great patience. Participants in my 2018 Interspecies Seminar—Justin Linds, Emily Lim Rogers, Faith McGlothlin, Nuala Caomach, Tanvi Kapoor, Sam Prendergast, Tristan Beach, Katherine McLeod, Lukas La Rivière, Leandra Barrett, Daryl Meador, Laura Murray, Katherine Sinclair, Zeynep Oguz, and Brittany Haynes—opened up so many new ideas, while reminding me of the joys of thinking together.

As someone whose mind at times—and despite my best intentions—has a tendency to swim in dark waters, and whose body often gives way at inopportune moments, I depend on my brilliant friends to guide me toward the light and keep me safe and well. At various moments as this book took shape Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi, Jasbir Puar, Nicole Fleetwood, Thuy Linh Tu, Zoe Wool, Kris Peterson, Sherine Hamdy, Jennifer Morgan, Herman Bennett, Nikhil Singh, Annika Tamura, Marikka Tamura, Lynn Thomas, Lotte Meinart, Megan Vaughan, Audrey Bedolis, Louise Gore, Ed Cohen, Anne Hubbell, Jennifer Cole, David Schoenbrun, Gary Wilder, Elly Truitt, Elaine Freedgood, Stephanie Cohen, Adam Keats, Vincanne Adams, and Stacey Langwick have offered their clarity, inspiration, and irreverence

and kept me going. A million thanks to Shannon Green—the ultimate body-genius—for her steady presence in my life.

In great feats of generosity, Vincanne Adams, Pierre Duplessis, Deborah Durham, Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi, Kris Peterson (my rescue cow!), and Andrew Ross read the entire manuscript with great insight and provided me with vital feedback. *Ke a leboga thata* (a gazillion thatas) to Jackie Solway, who, in addition to reading the whole book and saving me from numerous errors of fact and interpretation, also generously gave me many of the photographs used here. I am particularly thankful to Anna Tsing, and an anonymous reviewer who offered detailed comments and that invaluable gift—encouragement.

I am deeply grateful to the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation, and especially to Cecilia Conrad and Marlies Carruth for their ongoing support, and invitation to try new things. A residency at the University of Washington's Whitley Center and a fellowship at the Mesa Refuge for Writers offered me space to think and write far away from the concrete of Manhattan, for which I am ever thankful. I am especially indebted to Peter Barnes and Susan Page Tillet of Mesa Refuge, and to Bob Friedman who supported my fellowship there. At Mesa Refuge I hit the jackpot with two amazing fellow-writer housemates, Brandon Keim and Susan Ochshorn. Conversations with Brandon, ever curious and patient lover of all creatures carried me over the finish line.

I know how fortunate I am to have Ken Wissoker as my editor. Having him and Cathy Davidson in New York City now just makes it all the better. I am grateful to Ken, Joshua Tranen, Liz Smith, and the staff at Duke University Press for the care they bring to their work and to Jehanne Moharram for such expert copyediting. Thank goodness there are still books in this world.

This book is dedicated to Hazel, whom I love so much. Though she is coming of age in these troubling times, I take comfort in the fact that she is one of the strongest people I know.

Upon my return at the end of a long trip I like to listen to Sibelius's *En Saga*. As the music plays, I feel the burdens of the journey falling away even as I unwind its transformative moments and stow them carefully away. So too, it seems, at the end

DUKE

xiii ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

of a book, especially one imagined as a parabolic journey. Behrooz gave me this piece of music, and as with all his gifts, my life would be so impoverished without it. It is nearly impossible for me to imagine having written this book without such a beautiful mind to dialogue with or such a beautiful soul to inspire me and keep me close. He has read every word, and more than once. It was he, I believe, who first came up with the term “self-devouring growth.” Like all things he touches, this book and its author are better for his love and care.

DUKE

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS xiii

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

PROLOGUE

A Planetary Parable

If growth automatically generated well-being, we would now be living in a paradise. We are in fact going down the road to hell.

—Serge Latouche, *Farewell to Growth*

Pathological consumption has become so normalized
that we scarcely notice it.

—George Monbiot, *The Gift of Death*

There is no end
To what a living world
Will demand of you.

—Lauren Olamina,

Earthseed: The Books of the Living

THIS LITTLE BOOK CONTAINS a parable of sorts about self-devouring growth, a term I use to refer to the ways that the super-organism of human beings is consuming itself. This is not a new tale. Many others have offered their versions over the years.¹ But like all parables, the lessons are worth contemplating anew.² The story is told from Botswana, southern Africa's miracle land, but self-devouring growth is everywhere to be seen. Wherever you sit reading this you are in a world organized by self-devouring growth. It is so fundamental as to be unremarkable, and yet it is eating away at the very ground beneath our feet. Whether you are a Motswana or someone who has never set foot in southern Africa such that the details of this particular version of the story are new to you, the plotlines should be familiar as they are yours and mine as well.³

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

Parable is a realist genre. What is to follow is not merely allegory. But parables also have larger meanings that are revealed through their structure as “illustrative parallel” or extended metaphor. Perhaps it is helpful to know that parable and parabola share a common root.⁴ In a parable we travel out, unfolding the metaphor in a parabolic shape. By journey’s end, we will have returned to the same plane on which we started, but somewhat farther along, in the hopes of having learned something from our experience along the way. In this case we will follow three metaphors in sequence. Each of them is material in nature. Each has a thingyness one can touch, see, smell, hear. Parables reveal urgent and sometimes uncomfortable truths that are hiding in plain sight.⁵ They conjoin the listener (and in this case the teller as well!) to recognize herself within the story. As your narrator, my use of the word “we” is not accidental. I have located myself at various moments in this account. So can you.

Botswana offers as fine a protagonist as any for this tale, which necessarily journeys at times to other lands. I have chosen her as our central character in this parable because I know her well and love her dearly, not because she is somehow more misguided than others. Far from it. Botswana is an upper-middle-income country, a “developing” country, in fact a paradigmatically successful one. She’s never gone to war. The modern nation of Botswana was born poor but peaceful amid a devastating drought. She came of age in a tough neighborhood surrounded by the violence and greed of institutionalized racism on all sides. Yet since gaining independence from Great Britain in 1966, Botswana has undergone decades of spectacular postcolonial economic growth, though things have leveled off of late. Out of the diamonds found secreted in her rock, the country has built schools and a system of universal health care, telecommunications and roads, clean water and pensions, vast nature preserves, and a functioning democracy. Of course, there was a time when human society was structured in such a way that nature preserves and old-age pensions were unnecessary. That does not take away from this impressive and vital postcolonial achievement, and the skill and intelligence of the people behind it. But it does remind us that industrial modernity is only one way to live.

Botswana is widely regarded as a developmental success, a miracle even.⁶ But even that success, it seems, presents its own uncertainties, its own horizon as growth becomes self-devouring. This growth has become the organizing logic of her development, its hoped-for future. And yet insatiable growth predicated on consumption will inevitably overwhelm.⁷ Botswana is a place from which we can think about the telos of development in relation to what the pope is calling “ecological sin.”

Botswana forces difficult questions onto the table; the moral of the story is not a simple one. The signs on the ground at present are anxious ones; we should divine their truths with great care. The future is always uncertain; no one knows what lies ahead. Sometimes dire scientific prophecies fail to materialize as forecast. Sometimes destruction comes out of seemingly nowhere and catches everyone by surprise. Scientific predictions of African environmental collapse have a long and troubling history. This is because scientific authority has been used to blame African practices for environmental challenges from desertification to ebola. Yet upon closer examination these problems arise out of complex political and economic histories rooted in European colonialism and/or corporate capitalism.⁸ My parable is not anti-science, this would be a false move. While its predictions need to be understood as provisional, a welter of scientific observation underpins the stories that lie ahead.

In 2016 record-breaking temperatures reached 44 degrees Celsius in the town of Maun in Botswana’s northern Okavango region, and over 43 degrees in other parts of the country. If global temperatures continue to climb in the ways scientists predict, Botswana will be one of the many places that will have more days of extreme heat, with predicted increases in heat-related deaths, an upsurge in malaria and dengue fever (diseases that were historically absent, except for endemic malaria in Okavango), and increasing drought, with attendant food and water insecurity.⁹ Grassland pasture is giving way to thornbush. The water table is sinking. Scientists predict that the wild painted dogs and the elusive antbear will die out in this shifting ecology. They caution that the spectacular Okavango Delta—the hub of Botswana’s high-end eco-tourism industry, the nation’s second largest in-

come earlier, and site of some of the earliest human societies—will lose biodiversity as flooding and water distribution patterns shift and the water table drops. The day will eventually arrive when the diamonds that propelled Botswana's climb out of poverty are finished. The predictions are so dire that many either turn away in fatalism or dismiss them as exaggeration. Wherever we look, anticipating disasters now drives its own kind of growth industry.¹⁰ What if the end is nigh, but for a major rethinking and reorientation of human activity?

What were Botswana (as the people of Botswana call themselves) to do but grow their economy as best they could when the British left them deeply impoverished, and proletarianized, on a planet already polluted and warming through no fault of Botswana themselves?¹¹ Botswana have managed their development trajectory quite well—and yet, as you will read in the story that follows, all this and more may be in jeopardy in the coming years. Climate change and environmental conditions have long been part of a national conversation in Botswana, where technical expertise in conservation, agriculture, and geology is deep and authoritative. And yet . . . setting this story in Botswana will help elucidate our planetary predicament—an existential crisis if there ever was one, for those who live in the interstices of what are often narrated as the great political and economic divides of the contemporary world—rich/poor; first world/third world; north/south. A caution is perhaps in order for my fellow American readers—before you think you know what's best for Botswana, you might consider the dynamics of growth in California.

The Problem of Self-Devouring Growth

Economic growth is a paradigm that has become so second nature that when people are thinking about a place in this world and how to improve it, immediately they/we assume that growth must be the basis of that effort. Without us really noticing it, growth has become this unmarked category granted magical powers. As growth remains the common sense, the unexamined imperative, and so much is done in its name, a cascade of

unseen consequences, side effects, also become second nature, a process I call self-devouring growth.

Self-devouring growth is a name for a set of material relationships. By material I mean there is something with physical properties being devoured. Growth is not inherently bad. Growth can be healthy, can be a sign of vitality. Self-devouring growth departs from these other forms by operating under an imperative—*grow or die; grow or be eaten*—with an implicit assumption that this growth is predicated on uninhibited consumption. The perversion happens in two linked ways: first in how the protagonists of growth envision and appropriate the resources upon which it is fed, and second in how they attend to the production of waste that is a by-product of consumption-driven growth. This particular model of growth even became a logical means of constructing healthy, robust societies, such that there is something intractable about this thinking—grow the economy, grow a business, grow a market, grow, grow, GROW! is a mantra so powerful that it obscures the destruction it portends.¹²

In other words, self-devouring growth is a cancerous model. These are mutant forms of out-of-control growth that emerge in nodes but eventually spread into every crevice of the planetary body, harnessing its blood supply, eating through its tissue, producing rot and pain that will eventually kill the larger organism. As with cancer, we mourn each individual loss as tragic, be it Bob Marley, my Aunt Jill, the American bison, or the Guatemalan farmland now lying open as a suppurating wound after the Canadian-owned nickel mine consumed the bedrock. And yet the big picture of what is driving these losses is almost too big to take in. And so the larger dynamic of destruction is somehow accepted as the necessary cost of the good things in life.¹³

We pour our hopes into technological solutions. Technologies can be wonderful, but they are insufficient to save us from a problem whose roots lie deeper. Certainly electric cars are better than gasoline-powered cars. But if everyone is to have one, and if everyone is to want a new one every few years, we will still consume vast quantities of glass, aluminum, plastic, and steel, still have a problem of disposing of used tires and brake fluid, of building road capacity, of mining cobalt, nickel, lithium, and

graphite to power them. The capitalism that structures the contemporary global economy is the most significant engine of this dynamic, its organizing telos, and peddler of its narcotic. Ever more intensive forms of capitalist consumption animate a system that will harm everyone, even those whose consumption mainly remains aspirational. But while self-devouring growth is the central dynamic of capitalism, it cannot be reduced to it.¹⁴ The former Soviet Union undertook its own version of self-devouring growth. So did Maoist China.

When later in this book we follow Botswana beef into a Norwegian primary school cafeteria — a Scandinavian socialist space if there ever was one — what we will find is nonetheless part of a larger system of growth-led planetary devastation that will happen long before the poor get their turn at the trough.¹⁵ Despite some of the redistributions of socialism, consumption by the elite, middle class, and aspirant grows at rates that far outstrip these leveling forces, dictating a disposition toward growth without end. The underclass — standing there on the front lines as they always must do — may get little growth but be devoured nonetheless. Sir Richard Branson, airline magnate, and his “team” rode out Hurricane Irma in the well-stocked and fortified bunker on his private Caribbean island, while people in neighboring Barbuda (perhaps home to some of his “team”) lacked such protections entirely. Recovery becomes its own growth industry.¹⁶

Some might object, as they have since Malthus, that population growth drives the need for economic growth and so it is the poor, those chronic reproducers, who must be tamed. Yet this is a misunderstanding of how consumption, not to mention reproduction, works. Take New York City, where I live, as an example. A recent report estimated that only 2 percent of the one million buildings in my city accounted for 45 percent of the city’s energy use and attendant greenhouse gas emissions. These buildings included those where some of the wealthiest New Yorkers (Donald Trump, David Koch, Alice Walton — all climate-change deniers) reside. Meanwhile low- and middle-income New Yorkers, packed into tiny apartments and necessarily frugal about their energy use in our very expensive city, were nonetheless dispro-

portionately exposed to the dangers of Hurricane Sandy. Over half of the victims of the storm surge were renters with average annual incomes of USD 18,000,¹⁷ well below the city median of USD 60,000. Or consider the problem in regional terms. An average citizen of the United States like myself requires more than twice the amount of bioproductive space on our finite planet to support her consumption than the average European. The European, in turn, consumes twenty times the rate of most Africans.¹⁸ While the elite consume the most and then the middle classes, these days even the poor consume at escalating rates. Yet they are sold poor-quality goods that make them ill, and are forced to reside amid the toxic detritus — the by-products and the wastelands of growth.¹⁹

Development is often posited as economic growth.²⁰ Under its umbrella there are many projects and visions for better health, education, and well-being, but these are often subsumed by the hegemonic growth vision of development economists. Arguments are made that health, education, infrastructure, and institutional capacity will all facilitate growth. Units of analysis in turn truncate and bind relationships of distribution, such that redistribution is left a national affair at best.²¹ Proponents imagine growth as the way to ensure that the needs of the poor are taken care of. There is a sense that if everything grows then finally there will be enough. But this trickle-down fantasy will dry up as resource scarcity increases on our finite planet.

Meanwhile, up at the top and increasingly in the middle and even below, consumption escalates rapidly. Growth is said to bring jobs, but often it does not. Or the jobs arrive and then depart again never to return, or the jobs arrive, but they pay so little for work so numbing that they fail to be the ladders to the good life imagined by the growth proponents.²² This is certainly the case in Botswana, where the economy has grown, the population has urbanized, and yet despite persistent effort, unemployment remains intractable. Botswana has placed nets underneath her poorest citizens, who like the poor everywhere are disproportionately female; it has sought pathways for many out of the poverty that the colonial migrant labor system wrought. These are incredibly important achievements. But Botswana has been

unable to employ her people adequately in an economy structured around growth. Africa's miracle is the third most unequal country on the continent, the tenth most unequal on earth. The Gini coefficient tells as much about rampant consumption at the top, and increasingly in the middle, as it does about the poverty at the bottom. By 2015 the World Bank was cautioning that consumer spending, facilitated in large part on credit, was driving Botswana's economy.²³ The relationship between growth and personal debt is its own self-devouring paradox.

Is Another World Possible?

Growth-driven development is also predicated on a facile evolutionary model.²⁴ The implicit aim is to take Botswana or Honduras or Cambodia and, through economic growth, create infrastructure and consumption like there is in Canada or Australia. The same of course could be said for turning Brownsville, Brooklyn, into Park Slope. And yet, these developed economies that are the aspiration are the prime engines of a kind of voraciousness that is leading us off a cliff. Perhaps new goals are in order for Park Slope and Brownsville alike. Figuring out these goals will require understanding how Park Slope and Brownsville or, say, Honduras and Canada, are actually two sides of a single relationship. Figuring out these goals will also require a new imagination.

Over the past few centuries there have been forms of thought, modes of reasoning, and metaphysical understandings all over the world that were deemed irrational, superstitious, marginal, and whatever else under the sign of colonialism and enlightenment reason. But all our rational thought and rational knowledge—development, from economics to engineering being a good example—has produced a world that is highly irrational indeed over the long run, suicidal, self-devouring. What else might we find if we take seriously those forms of knowledge that have been purged or suppressed? I don't say any of this as a romantic gesture—replacing industrial (and postindustrial) capitalism and techno-science with nineteenth-century Tswana healing rites is neither tenable nor a plausible solution for what

ails us.²⁵ But as we follow these tales, I will show you forms of insight, ethical modalities, metaphysical flashes of brilliance, and modes of life worth contemplating. Such knowledge can contribute to the unlocking of our collective imagination, an imagination we are going to need quite dearly in the rapidly unfolding future.

We aren't going back. We can't. And why would we want to? That would mean a world without insulin, and quite possibly amid that rapacious obscenity of self-devouring growth, the Atlantic slave trade. Relying on women and girls to carry water on their heads many kilometers each day is not a romantic vision. The point is not that things are worse now than they were then (though they may be for some), but rather that we may well be devouring our future. If we are to think beyond the self-devouring growth drive, then we must open those repositories of the imagination—the before, the against, and the besides—that have been or are now being crushed by it.²⁶ There are many of them. This book opens the storehouse in Botswana and reads from a few corners of a vast field of insight.²⁷

The worlds therein are not utopian. Nor are these worlds homogenous or static. The territory of modern Botswana has been a place of dynamic human creativity longer than most other places on earth, though my story will be drawing from only a few centuries deep. Beginning in roughly 1400 CE, but picking up pace amid the droughts of the eighteenth century, groups of African settlers, who much later would be anachronistically referred to by historians as “Tswana,” moved onto the eastern plateau (the highveld) of present-day Botswana.²⁸ Their large herds of cattle gave them a mode of claiming territorial sovereignty. The highveld was not empty when they arrived. Nor were these “Tswana” one people or one polity. Mixed societies of Bantu, San, and Khoe people already there fled west as the newcomers arrived, heading farther into the Kalahari Desert. Or if they stayed, they might have had their cattle seized, or their hunting and gathering curtailed, rendering them as cattle-herding servants or slaves for the new residents.

Over the ensuing centuries, refugees and other migrant groups would be incorporated into the growing kingdoms/

DUKE

A PLANETARY PARABLE 9

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

chiefdoms. Ecological stress or political tension caused new groups to splinter off and settle new areas. As historian Paul Landau tells us, these societies were “well-equipped to embrace and absorb strangers.”²⁹ As such they were mixed and continually mixing, flexible and adaptive. The term “Tswana” used throughout my story hardens this fluidity and heterogeneity and thereby misleads. Absorption did not mean an erasure of origins. Hierarchies of origin and of genealogy mattered, as did those of gender and age. A whole welter of ethnic mythos, alternating between the romantic and the derogatory, emerged to characterize the ethnic underclasses and explain their oppressed status. The arrival of British missionaries and eventual colonization in the nineteenth century amplified such depictions while also consolidating a new ethnonym — Tswana. Among people there was debate, disagreement, and difference, there were struggles and tensions, much of which will necessarily be glossed over in the tale I will tell.

Though my story will efface some of this richness, it finds in Tswana thought and practice traces that suggest other politics by which distribution might proceed—amid a growth that is cyclical rather than relentless. Sometimes a cycle of growth was leveled through horrible experiences of collapse like famine, epidemic disease, or war. Such clues recall a place in which some property is collective and attendant responsibilities are assumed, yet managed through gendered and age-based hierarchies of access; politics that engage in participatory democracy amid palpable pecking orders of status and wealth and the private dealings they portend; people who prize autonomy but assume interdependence.

What follows will unfold in three parts: water, food, movement—all vital human needs. Or put another way, rain, cattle, roads—all distribution systems that are good to think with. There are others. One could tell a thousand and one tales of self-devouring growth, but I will limit myself to three.

NOTES

PROLOGUE. A Planetary Parable

Epigraphs: Lauren Olamina, “Earthseed: The Books of the Living,” in Octavia Butler, *Parable of the Sower* (New York: Grand Central Publishing, 1993); Serge Latouche, *Farewell to Growth* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2009); George Monbiot, “The Gift of Death,” *Guardian*, 11 December 2012.

1. Here are a few alternative versions of the parable I am reciting. There are too many to name them all here, including the significant literature from the Degrowth and Buen Vivir movements. Serge Latouche, *Farewell to Growth* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2009); Wolfgang Sachs, ed., *The Development Dictionary*, 2nd ed. (London: Zed Books, 2010); Butler, *Parable of the Sower*; Octavia Butler, *Parable of the Talents* (New York: Grand Central Publishing, 1998); Andrew Ross, *Bird on Fire: Lessons from the World’s Least Sustainable City* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013); Elizabeth Povinelli, *Geontologies: A Requiem to Late Liberalism* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2017); Bhrigupati Singh, *Poverty and the Quest for Life: Spiritual and Material Striving in Rural India* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015); *Water and Power: A California Heist* (film directed by Maria Zenovich, 2017); Ruth Wilson Gilmore, *Golden Gulag: Prisons, Surplus, Crisis, and Opposition in Globalizing California* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007); Eduardo Gudynas, “Buen Vivir: Today’s Tomorrow,” *Development* 54, no. 4 (2011): 441–447; Reviel Netz, *Barbed Wire: An Ecology of Modernity* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2004); Ghassan Hage, *Is Racism an Environmental Threat?* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2017); Giorgos Kallas, *Degrowth* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Agenda Publishing, 2018).

2. There is also a rich and important social science literature that takes up the failures of development and the violence (structural, cultural, intellectual, political, and economic) done in its name. These critiques are important, and this story does not contradict them but rather seeks to open a somewhat different narrative horizon. See, for example, Arturo Escobar,

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011); James Ferguson, *The Anti-politics Machine: Development, Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994); James C. Scott, *Seeing Like the State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1999); Tania Murray Li, *The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007); Akhil Gupta, *Red Tape: Bureaucracy, Structural Violence, and Poverty in India* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012); Timothy Mitchell, *Rule of Experts: Egypt, Technopolitics, Modernity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992). This literature includes the fictionalized parable by Richard Rottenburg, *Far Fetched Facts: A Parable of Development Aid* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2009).

3. Setswana is a Bantu language. Nouns are formed through a system of prefixes added to root words. For example, Tswana is a root and used as a generic referent to anything pertaining to a large ethnic group whose people reside mainly in Botswana and South Africa; Motswana is a single Tswana person or citizen of the modern nation of Botswana; Batswana are two or more Tswana people; Botswana is the collective noun for all things Tswana and hence the modern nation of Botswana; Setswana is the language and/or customs/knowledge of Tswana people.

4. I am grateful to Jennifer Wenzel for alerting me to this.

5. Amy-Jill Levine, *Short Stories by Jesus: The Enigmatic Parables of a Controversial Rabbi* (New York: Harper One, 2014). I am grateful to Zenia Kish for this reference. See also Kevin Mills, "Parables, A-Z," *The Yearbook of English Studies* 39, nos. 1–2 (2009): 194. I am grateful to Elaine Freedgood for this reference.

6. Abdi Ismail Samatar, *An African Miracle: State and Class Leadership and Colonial Legacy in Botswana Development* (Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann, 1999). This is not to say that there are not problems of corruption or power struggles or discrimination against ethnic minorities, etc., some of which will be shown in the tale that follows.

7. Both consumption of resources and production of waste currently occur at a higher rate than the planet can regenerate. Allesandro Galli, Thomas Wiedmann, Ertug Ercinc, Doris Knoblauchd, Brad Ewing, and Stefan Giljum, "Integrating Ecological, Carbon and Water Footprint into a 'Footprint Family' of Indicators: Definition and Role in Tracking Human Pressure on the Planet," *Ecological Indicators* 16 (2012): 100–111; Mathis Wackernagel, Larry Onisto, Patricia Bello, Alejandro Callejas Linares, Ina Susana López Falfán, Jesus Méndez García, Ana Isabel Suárez Guerrero, and Ma. Guadalupe Suárez Guerrero, "National Natural Capital Accounting with the Ecological Footprint Concept," *Ecological Economics* 29 (1999): 375–390.

8. See for example, James Fairhead and Melissa Leach, *Reframing Deforestation: Global Analyses and Local Realities: Studies in West Africa* (London: Routledge, 1998); Hannah Brown and Ann Kelly, “Material Proximities and Hot Spots: Toward an Anthropology of Viral Hemorrhagic Fevers,” *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 28(2), 2014: 280–303; Robert Wallace, Marius Gilbert, and Roderick Wallace, “Did Ebola Emerge in West Africa by a Policy-Driven Phase Change in Agroecology? Ebola’s Social Context,” *Environment and Planning A* 2014, 46 (2014): 2533–2542; Emmanuel Kreike, *Deforestation and Reforestation in Namibia: The Global Consequences of Local Contradictions* (Leiden: Brill, 2010).

9. That includes an increase in days where the maximum temperature is projected to be between 39 and 51 degrees Celsius. Rebecca M. Garland, Mamopeli Matooane, Francois A. Engelbrecht, Mary-Jane M. Bopape, Willem A. Landman, Mogesh Naidoo, Jacobus van der Merwe, and Caradee Y. Wright, “Regional Projections of Extreme Apparent Temperature Days in Africa and the Related Potential Risk to Human Health,” *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 12 (2015): 12577–12604

10. Naomi Klein, *The Shock Doctrine: The Rise of Disaster Capitalism* (New York: Picador, 2008).

11. Through the 1990s (when the first such data was systematically catalogued), Botswana was a net carbon sink, absorbing more greenhouse gases than the nation produced. *Botswana Initial National Communication to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change* (Gaborone: Botswana Ministry of Works, Transport and Communications, 2001).

12. I am grateful to Kris Peterson for this phrasing.

13. S. Lochlann Jain, *Malignant: How Cancer Becomes Us* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014).

14. See Karen Bakker on the challenges of reducing the politics of water provision to public versus private. Karen Bakker, *Privatizing Water: Governance Failure and the World’s Urban Water Crisis* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2010).

15. My point here is not to be glib about how the redistributive institutions of socialism offers a check on consumption. Rather I am saying that the beef that is part of the redistributive flow is coming from Botswana where it is having the opposite effect. This is something I am confident most Norwegian would never have cause to know. I am grateful to Libby Wood for helping me to think this through.

16. Vincanne Adams, *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013); Klein, *Shock Doctrine*.

17. *Elite Emissions: How the Homes of the Wealthiest New Yorkers Help Drive Climate Change* (Climate Works for All Coalition, 2015).

18. Latouche, *Farewell to Growth*, 23; see also Wackernagel et al., “National Nature Capital Accounting with the Ecological Footprint Concept”; V. Niccolucci, E. Tiezzi, F. M. Pulselli, and C. Capineri, “Biocapacity vs. Ecological Footprints of World Regions: A Geopolitical Interpretation,” *Ecological Indicators* 16 (2012): 23–30.

19. Rob Nixon, *Slow Violence and the Environmentalism of the Poor* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013).

20. Mexican author Gustavo Esteva explains that after Truman inaugurated the development paradigm in the late 1940s, foundational thinkers like Albert Lewis, the Caribbean economist and Nobel Laureate, understood development as synonymous with economic growth. In the ensuing decades, development proponents of a range of political persuasions from the radical left to the conservative right took up social issues in their own right (e.g., literacy, health). But the larger logic of development as measured by evolutionary stages of economic growth to which social developments were related or from which social developments were extensive has persisted. This relationship has taken various forms over time, and there have been key moments of disaggregation and dissent like in the 1970s. Gustavo Esteva, “Development,” in Sachs, *The Development Dictionary*, 1–23.

21. Mitchell, *Rule of Experts*.

22. James Ferguson, *Give a Man a Fish: Reflections on the New Politics of Distribution* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2015).

23. Brian Benza, “World Bank Warns Botswana,” *Mmegi*, 10 July 2015, <http://www.mmegi.bw/index.php?aid=52531&dir=2015%2Fjuly%2F10>.

24. This critique is foundational to the Latin American literature on development cited above.

25. As Michel Foucault says, “No! I am not looking for an alternative; you can’t find the solution of a problem in the solution of another problem raised at another moment by other people. You see, what I want to do is not the history of solutions, and that’s the reason why I don’t accept the word ‘alternative.’ I would like to do the genealogy of problems, of *problématique*. My point is not that everything is bad, but that everything is dangerous, which is not exactly the same as bad. If everything is dangerous, then we always have something to do. So my position leads not to apathy but to a hyper- and pessimistic activism.” Michel Foucault, “On the Genealogy of Ethics,” in *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, ed. Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983), 231–232.

26. Jean Comaroff and John L. Comaroff, *Theory from the South: Or, How Euro-America Is Evolving toward Africa* (London: Routledge, 2012); Povinelli, *Geontologies*; Anna Lowenhaupt Tsing, *The Mushroom at the End of the World: On the Possibility of Life in Capitalist Ruins* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2015); Kristina Lyons, Juno Salazar Parrenas,

and Noah Tamarkin, “Critical Perspectives: Engagements with Decolonization and Decoloniality in and at the Interfaces of STS,” *Catalyst: Feminism, Theory, Technoscience* 3, no. 1 (2017): 1–47.

27. Anthropologist Pierre du Plessis is working from another corner, and I am excited about the places where we meet. Pierre du Plessis, “Gathering the Kalahari: Tracks, Trails, and More-Than-Human Landscapes” (PhD dissertation, Aarhus University and University of California–Santa Cruz, joint program, 2018).

28. Paul Landau, *Popular Politics in the History of South Africa, 1400–1948* (Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 2013).

29. Landau, *Popular Politics*.

CHAPTER 1. Rainmaking and Other Forgotten Things

Epigraph: Bessie Head, *When Rain Clouds Gather* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1969).

1. Felicity Barringer, “World’s Aquifers Losing Replenishment Race, Scientists Say,” *New York Times*, 25 June 2015, <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/26/science/worlds-aquifers-losing-replenishment-race-researchers-say.html>.

2. Department of Attorney General of Michigan, “Schuette Files Civil Suit against Veolia and LAN for Role in Flint Water Poisoning,” https://www.michigan.gov/ag/0,4534,7-359-82917_78314-387198--,00.html.

3. Karen Bakker aptly observes that “water is, in some sense, a final frontier for capitalism.” Karen Bakker, *Privatizing Water: Governance Failure and the World’s Urban Water Crisis* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2010), 3.

4. Janet Roitman, *Anti-crisis* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013).

5. Veolia Water Technologies website, accessed December 2018, <https://www.veoliawatertechnologies.com/en>.

6. Veolia Water Technologies Botswana website, <http://www.veoliawatertechnologies.co.za/about-us/organisation/veolia-water-technologies-botswana/>. I am grateful to Victoria Koski-Karrell for drawing attention to this connection and for her keen engagement with an earlier draft of this chapter.

7. See, for example, Isaac Schapera, *Rainmaking Rites of Tswana Tribes* (Leiden: Afrika-Stuidecentrum, 1971); Paul Landau, “When Rain Falls: Rainmaking and Community in a Tswana Village c. 1870 to Recent Times,” *International Journal of African Historical Studies* 26 (1993): 1–30; Jean Comaroff and John Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution: Christianity, Colonialism, and Consciousness in South Africa*, vol. 1 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991); Julie Livingston, *Debility and the Moral Imagination in Botswana* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2005).