THE LITERACY DESIGN COLLABORATIVE ARGUMENTATION MODULE

ON REVENGE

Eleanor Dougherty

Information Sheet

Module Title: On Revenge

Module Description (overview):

Taking revenge on a real or perceived grievance is a response that individuals and social groups experience. Accordingly, philosophers, social scientists, and artists have contemplated its grip and asked questions about it moral and even practical role in our lives. In this module, students contemplate the meaning of "revenge" in political and social contexts and argue a position. They read two essays, one from the 17th century and another one by contemporary authors.

Template Task (include number, type, level)	Teaching Task
Task 2 (Argumentation L1,2,3)	Is "revenge" justifiable? After reading Francis Bacon's essay, "On Revenge" and the article by Peter S. Adler
[Insert essential question] After reading	and Robert J. Benjamin, write an essay that addresses
(literature or informational texts), write a/an (essay, report, or substitute) that addresses	the question and support your position with evidence from the texts. L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing
the question and support your position with evidence	views. L3 Give one or more examples from past or
from the text(s). L2 Be sure to acknowledge	current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your
competing views. L3 Give one or more examples	position.
from past or current events or issues to illustrate and	
clarify your position.	

Grade(s)/Level: 9-12

(The essay can be modified to match students' readiness by eliminating L2 and/or L3.)

Discipline: ELA

Course: English

Author(s): Eleanor Dougherty

Contact information: LDC Design Team

On Revenge 10.13.10

Section I: What Task?

What task sets clear, measurable goals for learning?

A. Template task (include number, type, le
--

Task 2 (Argumentation L1,2,3)	
[Insert essential question] After reading (literature of report, or substitute) that addresses the question and suppose sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give one or moto illustrate and clarify your position.	ort your position with evidence from the text(s). L2

B. Standards: The CCR Anchor Standards from the common core standards are already identified by the Literacy Design Collaborative for all Argumentation tasks.

Number	CCR Anchor Standards for Reading (Argumentation)		
I	Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the		
	test.		
3	Analyze how and why individuals, events, and ideas develop and interact over the course of a text.		
8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.		
9	Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.		
10	Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently.		
Number	CCR Anchor Standards for Writing (Argumentation)		
I	Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.		
4	Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.		
9	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.		
10	Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audience.		

Content Standards:

Number	Content Standard(s)	
MA 16	General Standard 16: Myth, Traditional Narrative, and Classical Literature	
MA 19:30	Write coherent compositions with a clear focus, objective presentation of alternate views,	
	rich detail, well-developed paragraphs, and logical argumentation.	

Content Standards Source: Massachusetts Curriculum Framework

C. Teaching Task:

Background:

In a letter to the editor, the writer says, "John Allen Muhammad has been executed. His punishment is over. Meanwhile, his victims are still dead. So is the death penalty truly a matter of justice or merely revenge?"

Prompt:

Is "revenge" justifiable? After reading Francis Bacon's essay, "On Revenge" and the article by Peter S. Adler and Robert J. Benjamin, write an essay that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from the texts. L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give one or more examples from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position

Extension (optional):

- Essays are collected for a class magazine on "Questions for the 21st Century."
- Students participate in a seminar on the question with local professors, community activists, and other relevant invitees.

LDC Argumentation Rubric for Teaching Task			
ADVANCED			
Focus	Addresses all aspects of the prompt with a highly focused and convincing response.		
Reading/Research	Demonstrates accurate and effective use of reading materials to develop argument or		
_	proposal and a solid understanding of content as presented in the prompt.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a substantive and credible claim or proposal (L2) Acknowledges relevant		
	competing arguments, defending or qualifying the claim or proposal as appropriate.		
Development	Develops a detailed and convincing argument or proposal; provides relevant evidence in the		
	form of examples or explanations with statements from reading material. (L3) Makes a		
	clarifying connection(s) that illuminates argument and adds depth to reasoning.		
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasoning; applies a logic model, such as		
	deductive reasoning.		
Conventions	Demonstrates a well-developed command of standard English conventions and cohesion;		
	employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.		
	MEETS EXPECTATIONS		
Focus	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response.		
Reading/Research	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal		
	and an understanding of the content as presented in the prompt.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a credible claim or proposal (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while		
	defending the claim or proposal.		
Development	Develops a satisfactory argument or proposal using reasoning with adequate detail to		
	support claim or proposal; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or		
	explanations relevant to the argument or proposal. (L3) Makes a relevant connection that		
	helps to clarify argument or proposal.		
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasoning; applies a logic model.		
Conventions	Demonstrates a satisfactory command of standard English conventions and cohesion;		
	employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.		
_	NOT YET		
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.		
Reading/Research	Demonstrates weak use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a claim or proposal but is weak or off task; (L2) Attempts to acknowledge		
	competing arguments.		
Development	Lacks details to support reasoning; examples or explanations are weak or not relevant. (L3)		
	Connection is not relevant.		
Organization	Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing.		
Conventions	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language		
	and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.		

Section 2: What Skills?

What skills do students need to succeed on the teaching task?

LDC Example Skills List				
Canaitia Chilla	Sandant Skilla Dafinad ("Abilian to ")			
Specific Skills What skills are essential?	Student Skills Defined ("Ability to") How do you define/describe those skills?			
vviidt skiiis die essendal! How do you define/describe triose skiiis!				
Skills Cluster 1: Preparing f	or the Task			
Bridging Conversation	Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills,			
	experiences, interests, and concerns.			
2. Task analysis	Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.			
3. Project planning	Ability to plan so that the task is accomplished on time.			
Skills Cluster 2: Reading Pr				
I. Reading "habits of mind"	Ability to select appropriate texts and understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task.			
2. Essential vocabulary	Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of a text by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.			
3. Note-taking	Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.			
4. Organizing notes	Ability to prioritize and narrow notes and other information.			
Skills Cluster 3: Transition	to Writing			
Bridging Conversation	Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase.			
Skills Cluster 4: Writing Pr	ocess			
Initiation of task	Ability to establish a claim and consolidate information relevant to task.			
2. Planning	Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an			
	argumentation task.			
3. Development	Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.			
4. Revision	Ability to apply revision strategies to refine development of argument, including			
	line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.			
5. Editing	Ability to apply editing strategies and presentation applications.			

Section 3: What Instruction?

How will teachers teach students to succeed on the teaching task?

ADAPTED FROM LDC INSTRUCTIONAL LADDER I

(includes adjustments to customize for the particular task)

Skills Cluster 1: Preparing for the Task

Optional Pre-test

Administer classroom assessment as pre-test if need to gather information.

I.Bridging	Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, Pacing:				
conversation	experiences, interests, and concerns.				
Mini-task	Prompt: In a quick write, write your first reaction to the task prompt. What Product:				
	strategies might you use to gain knowledge of the issue and form an opinion?	response			
Mini-task scoring	No scoring				
Instructional	Teach or review content required for the task depending on when in the sequence they				
strategies/ notes	teach the content – before or during the production of the task. If teaching Levels 2 and/or				
	3, discuss the demands embedded in these levels as well.				
	• Conduct a seminar to help students focus on the task's question or ideas and to "open"				
	their minds to possible ways of thinking about the prompt.				
PD/ preparation	Discuss in detail the reading strategies that apply to the task.				
	• Discuss in detail the type of writing, the structure, and the rubric and materials you will use				
	(e.g. literature, maps, data).				
	• Do the task to ensure understanding of the demands and cognitive processes in it.				
	• Create a template for students to use during the writing process.				

2. Task analysis	Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.	Pacing:	
Mini-task	Prompt: In your own words, write a brief explanation of what the task is Product:		
	asking you to do.	Short	
		response	
Mini-task scoring	No scoring		
Instructional strategies/ notes	 Review each student's response to ensure she/he understands the task. Ensure relevant reading material is selected or provided. Have students share responses so that students can hear/know what each other is doing and encourage them to help each other when appropriate. Discuss in detail the prompt, type of writing and structure, the product, and the rubric. 		
PD/ preparation	 Collaboratively plan the task: e.g. How much time to teach each step? How much time to score? How to conduct scoring? Do we need any training on specific aspects of the task? Who has the expertise? 		

3. Project planning Ability to plan so that the task is accomplished on time. Pacing:		Pacing:		
Mini-task	Prompt: Create a project timeline. Product: Timeline			
Mini-task	Meets: Creates a "doable" timeline that paces reading and writing Not yet: Attempts to			
scoring guide	processes	processes. meet the criteria		
Instructional	Model a common or sample timeline & homework.			
strategies/	Provide students with a timeline template.			
notes	Discuss the importance of planning.			
PD/	Create sample timelines, homework, timeline template and other appropriate tools to			
preparation	support student planning.			

Skills Cluster 2: Reading Process				
I. Reading "habits of mind"		Ability to select appropriate texts and understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task.	Pacing:	
Mini-task		pibliographic form the two sources and note how each lates to your task.	Product: List or Bibliography	
Mini-task scoring guide	Meets: Selects appropriate text(s) for task (if applicable). Creates a first draft of a bibliography (if applicable). Writes in readable prose. Not yet: Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"		Attempts to meet the	
Instructional strategies/ notes	in the			
PD/ preparation	 Review and discuss reading strategies that pertain to specific types of texts and to the task Agree on a bibliographic format. Plan for students who need extra time, resources, or assistance. 			

2. Essential	Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of a text(s) by locating	Pacing:		
vocabulary	words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.			
Mini-task	Prompt: In your notebook, identify key words or phrases as you read and define them denotatively and connotatively in context of the passage in the work you are reading. Add terms we identified as the "language of the discipline."			
Mini-task	Meets:	Not yet: Attempts		
scoring guide	 Identifies vocabulary, phrases and notes their denotative meaning and, if applicable, their meaning in context of the passage(s). Writes in readable prose. 			
Instructional strategies/ notes:	 Writes in readable prose. Select any key words you want students to define. Review "denotation" and "connotation." Use of dictionary and other sources to acquire understanding. Teach strategies for understanding words in context. Introduce language of reading and writing relevant to task (e.g. composition, memo, rhetoric, tone, concise). Introduce or review relevant terms used in the discipline (e.g. longitude, socialization, demographics). Introduce or reinforce language that applies to the discipline and literacy practices: e.g. rhetoric, headings, symbolism. 			
PD/ preparation:	 Determine strategies for teaching vocabulary and language of the discipline and literacy practices in reading and composition. Determine what the "language of the discipline" relevant to this task will be. Students will be introduced to English from the 16th-17th centuries and will need to decode the language. This is a good opportunity to include a lesson on the history of English language. 			

3. Note- taking	Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.	Pacing:
Mini-task	Prompt: Using a note taking method, select information (passages, facts, data) relevant to the task; list (bullet) each source and note relevant information, quotes, or passages. L2 As you take notes, note any competing views another person might take. L3 Add notes in which you give one or more examples from past or	Product: notes & short response

	current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position. What does "plagiarism mean and what strategies can you use to avoid it?"	
Mini-task scoring guide	 Meets: Accomplishes task by selecting relevant source material to support controlling idea (include L2 and 3 if applied to task). Answers question about plagiarism correctly and provides appropriate strategies for avoiding it. Writes in readable prose. 	Not yet: Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"
Instructional strategies/ notes:	·	
PD/ preparation:	 Strategies for teaching note taking skills, summarizing and paraphrasing. Review or develop a plagiarism policy. Determine strategies for avoiding it. L2 Show how authors insert and acknowledge competing views. L3 Demonstrate how authors insert and use examples from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify a position. 	

4. Organizin	P. Organizing notes Ability to prioritize and narrow notes and other information. Pacing plan:		
Mini-task	Prompt: Prioritize relevant information in your notes on which to Product: notes and gra		
	build you	sequence or process.	organizer
Mini-task	Meets:		Not yet: Attempts to
scoring guide	structSugge topic.	des a prioritized set of notes that connect points for logic cure or line of thought. sts implications drawn from information about the issue or ses in readable prose.	meet the criteria for "meets"
Instructional strategies/ notes:	Students prioritize notes from "most important" to "least important" or "most relevant" to "least relevant."		
PD/ preparation:		gies for developing cognitive strategies as well as practical or orting evidence.	nes for prioritizing ideas,

	Skills Cluster 3: Transition to Writing		
/. Bridging	Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase.	Pacing plan:	
Conversation			
Mini-task	Prompt: : In a quick write, write about what you know now that you've read about the two texts. What position will you take?	Product: short response (with bullets) class work	
Mini-task scoring	No scoring		

Instructional	 Review professional or other samples of writing type and structure. 	
strategies/ notes:	 Deconstruct professional samples of the type of writing students will engage in: 	
	 Demonstrate patterns of development (e.g. from most important to least important) 	
	 Note the difference between a claim and a controlling idea or thesis 	
	 Note the difference between an "explanation" and an "argument" 	
	 Analyze purpose and audience 	
	Analyze tone and language choices	
	 Evaluate effectiveness – Do you get the information and explanation you expect? Why? 	
	• Conduct a seminar on the prompt's question (if using that version) or key issue or topic.	
	• Conduct a value-line exercise to ensure students understand a range of issues or options.	
	• Discuss the prompt and what students need to do to complete the writing portion.	
	Refer to rubric – point out demands and qualities of performance.	
PD/ preparation:	Collect professional samples with a range of structures and patterns of development (e.g.	
	deductive and inductive logic).	

Skills Cluster 4: Writing Process					
1. Initiation	1. Initiation of task Ability to establish a controlling idea and consolidate information relevant to task. Pacing:				
Mini-task	Prompt: Write a draft opening paragraph that includes a claim and sequences or Product:				
Mini-task scoring guide	bullets the key points you plan to make in your composition Meets: Writes a concise draft opening paragraph that establishes a claim and identifies key points that support development of your argument. Demonstrate strategies on how to open a composition — e.g, with background information, a question, quote, or grand sweeping statement Writes in readable prose		pts to meet		
Instructional strategies/ notes:	 Show students' opening paragraphs from professional works Collectively write a n opening with one or more paragraphs demo points that support the development of the explanation The "ingredients" of an opening, such as author's name, etc. and ra establishing an argument 	ange of approache	es for		
PD/ preparation	 Deconstruct the demands and qualities of performances embedded in the rubric. What strategies or methods can help students acquire these skills and qualities of performance? 				

2. Planning	Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an Argumentation task.	Pacing plan:
Mini-task	Prompt: Create a complete outline including key elements drawn from your reading and order them in some logical way (e.g. chronologically, sequentially, in importance). What points or reasons will you give to support your position?	Product: Outline/plan
Mini-task scoring guide	Meets:	Not yet: Attempts to meet the criteria for "meet
Instructional strategies/ notes	 Mini-lessons in logic structures Value-line activity or similar to explore possible responses/positions Use discussion-based strategies to develop thinking relevant to prompt Have students connect ideas among the arts, literature, events 	

3. Development Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure. Pacing place			Pacing plan:	
Mini-task	para for y para	npt: Redraft an opening for your composition with one or more graphs that establishes the controlling idea and provides a lead in your reader. Write an initial draft to include multiple graphs: an opening, development of your process, an ending to ide either a comment, conclusion, or implication	Product: O paragraph	pening and first draft
Mini-task scoring guide	•	ts: Provides an opening to include a controlling idea and an opening strategy relevant to the prompt Provides an initial draft with all elements of the prompt addressed Writes in readable prose	Not yet: A meet the c "meets"	ttempts to riteria for
Instructional strategies/ notes	 Focus on logic of the argument; provide a logic model for developing reasoning Demonstrate text structure as a means to develop argument; point our how authors of editorials and essays use these structures. How to end a composition –e.g. as a comment about next steps, a restatement of main finding or a description of unanswered questions Use of template for all levels to guide students through first draft 			
PD/ preparation	 Drafting strategies – conferencing and whole group Discuss use of technology to manage some of the feedback to students 			

4. Revision	Ability to apply revision strategies to refine development of argument, including	ing line Pacing plan:	
	of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpo	0 ,	
Mini-task	Prompt: Apply revision strategies for clarity, logic, language, Product: Revise		
	cohesion (students should do at least 2 drafts).	or more)	
Mini-task	Meets:	Not yet: Attempts to	
scoring guide	 Demonstrates use of revision strategies that clarify logic and development of ideas; embeds relevant details; improves word-usage and phrasing; and creates smooth transitions between sentences and paragraphs Applies a text structure to organize reading material content and to explain key points related to the prompt 	meet the criteria for "meets"	
Instructional strategies/ notes:	 Develop ways to manage revision process so that students get feedback in timely and helpful ways Draft study (students volunteer a segment for class or small group help and discussion) Peer feedback on clarity of thinking and development of claim/argument Student led revisions strategies such as read-aloud for peer and adult feedback Strategies for embedding information – citation methods, quoting, paraphrasing 		
PD/ preparation:	 Identify strategies for revising for IDEAS and LOGIC before editing grammar. Strategies such as individual & group mentoring; "what's good, what's needed" and peer feedback 		

5. Editing Ability to apply editing strategies and presentation		applications.	Pacing plan:
Mini-task	<i>Prompt:</i> Finalize draft for the readership; apply f visuals, neatness, formatting, copy editing).	inishing touches (e.g.	Product: Final draft
Mini-task	Meets:	Not yet: Attempts to meet the criteria for	
scoring guide	 Demonstrates use of strategies that enhance the readability and appearance of the work for presentation 	"meets"	

Instructional strategies/notes:	 Use of error analysis to encourage self-correction of language usage and grammatical errors Use of copy-editing mark
PD/	Editing strategies
preparation:	Technology and publishing methods

Final Draft	Submit your final draft before or on due date for scoring and feedback.
·	

Optional post-test	Administer classroom assessment as post-test to measure ability to perform	
	independently on shorter version of same template task	

Optional Extension	An activity that allows students to apply what is learned in the	Pacing plan:
	classroom to an experience involving non-school or other	
	audiences and situations.	

Prepare your essay for a class magazine entitled "Questions for the 21st Century."

Prepare talking notes based on your essay to participate in a seminar on the question with local professors, community activists, and other relevant invitees.

E. Materials, references and supports:

For Teachers	For Students
On Revenge" (original) http://www.authorama.com/essays-of-francis-bacon- 5.htmlhttp://www.authorama.com/essays-of-francis-bacon-5.html	
"On Revenge" http://www.mediate.com/articles/adler1.cfm	
Touchstones Discussion Project, volume I "On Revenge" by Francis Bacon. Available in English and Spanish.	

Section 4: What Results?

How good is good enough?

- A. **Student work samples:** Include examples of student work to represent each performance level on the teaching task.
- B. Other scoring supports: To be determined as scoring work progresses.
- C. Classroom assessment task: Design a classroom assessment task using the same template task as the one you will be teaching. You may modify slightly the template to fit the in-class, on-demand environment. You should also include student examples for the assessment task.

Background: N/A

Prompt:

What does "wisdom" mean? After reading Francis Bacon's essay "Of Wisdom for a Man's Self", write a short essay that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from the text. L2 Be sure to acknowledge a competing view. L3 Give one example from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position.

Essay source: http://www.authorama.com/essays-of-francis-bacon-24.html

LDC Argumentation Classroom Assessment Rubric			
MEETS EXPECTATIONS			
Focus	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing		
	response.		
Reading/Research	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading material to develop an		
	argument.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a credible claim and supports an argument that is logical and		
	generally convincing. (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while defending		
	the claim.		
Development	Develops reasoning to support claim; provides evidence from text(s) in the		
	form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument (L3) Makes a		
	relevant connection(s) that supports argument.		
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasons.		
Conventions	Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion;		
	employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.		
	NOT YET		
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.		
Reading/Research	Demonstrates weak use of reading material to develop argument.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a claim and attempts to support an argument but is not convincing;		
	(L2) Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments.		
Development	Reasoning is not clear; examples or explanations are weak or irrelevant. (L3)		
	Connection is weak or not relevant.		
Organization	Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing.		
Conventions	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks		
	cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.		

Teacher Work Section

What now, what next?

A. **Teacher thoughts.** Provide thoughts and ideas after teaching the module to different students in different classes

B. **Possible variations**. Add ideas for spin-offs or extensions to the module.

