

Traditional Knowledge of Caribou and Caribou People

APPENDIX C:

Traditional Knowledge Workshop Report (2016)

Report on the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan Traditional Knowledge Workshop



Yellowknife, NT
March 30–31, 2016

Acknowledgements

The BCRP is grateful to community members who participated in the TK Workshop for their generous contributions of knowledge, insight, guidance, and encouragement.

Thanks are given to Bertha Catholique and Celine Marlowe of Łutsel K'e for tirelessly providing interpreting services and Janet Murray for *in situ* transcribing and note-taking.

Gratitude is also owed to Karin Clark of ENR at GNWT who believed strongly in this workshop and worked hard to make it possible, not only by securing funding, but also through organizing complicated and ever-changing logistics. Thanks too for others on the BCRP Project Team including Dan Ohlson, Shawn Francis and John Nishi.

Finally, many thanks are sent to 4A and 7A for providing the opening and closing prayers for the TK Workshop, and to the Honourable ENR Minister Wally Shuman for giving the opening address to the TK Workshop and for providing words of encouragement and gravity to the workshop and its participants. Thank you! Masi! Quana/koana!

Disclaimer

This is a living document released by permission of participants of the Traditional Knowledge Workshop convened by the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NWT. The document does not represent the results of community consultation.

Traditional knowledge of Indigenous peoples is intellectual property and is protected by international intellectual property rights on indigenous peoples. As such, Aboriginal peoples reserve the right to use and make public parts of their traditional knowledge as they deem appropriate from time to time. Use of this traditional knowledge by any other party does not infer comprehensive understanding of the knowledge, nor does it infer implicit support for activities or projects in which this knowledge is used in print, visual, electronic, or other media.

© Natasha Thorpe and Joanne Barnaby. 2016. Report on a Traditional Knowledge Workshop. Yellowknife, NWT. March 30-31, 2016.



TrailMark Systems Inc.

Primary Office - TLU / TEK Consulting

Suite 412 - 645 Fort St.

Victoria BC, Canada, V8W 1G2

P: 250.383.7979

E: info@trailmarksys.com

The caribou is a long story. Some say its climate change. The government blames the hunters. The biologists blame the hunters. We have meetings like this and we have to think about the predators too such as wolves and thinking about the feeding grounds like whether moose is going to come. — 3A

Traditional knowledge is very different from scientific knowledge because you can use some of this stuff on the caribou but traditional knowledge is living, it's today, it's not something that you can pull out of a drawer like scientific knowledge where there is data written down. Traditional knowledge is alive, it's at the moment and every single species is different. — 6A

If there is no more caribou we are really going to suffer. We are going to have to do our utmost to prevent [the population] from declining. — 4A

Report Summary

Developing the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan (BCRP) requires a high-level of community input through traditional knowledge, sound science, and the development of innovative ways of bringing both ways of knowing together. A workshop focusing on traditional knowledge (TK) of the Bathurst caribou was convened as one way in which communities could engage in the BCRP. Results from the TK Workshop are the focus of this report.

The workshop took place in Yellowknife, NWT on March 30-31, and included representatives from the Aboriginal organizations: Athabaskan Denesuline, Bay Chimo/Bathurst Inlet Hunters and Trappers Organization, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Łutsel K'e Dene First Nation (LKDFN), North Slave Métis Association (NSMA), NWT Métis Alliance (NWTMA) and Tłı̄chǫ Government (TG). During the second day of the workshop, representatives from the following agencies observed: Barrenground Outfitters Association, Beverly and Qaminirjuaq Caribou Management Board, Dominion Diamonds, Government of Nunavut (GN), Government of the Northwest Territories (GNWT), Kitikmeot Inuit Association (KIA), NWT Wildlife Federation, Wek'èezhì Renewable Resources Board (WRRB).

Discussions throughout the TK Workshop centred around the following guiding questions:

- How can the relationship between people and caribou be healed? Who needs to be involved? When Where?
- What do the youth need to understand to continue a healthy relationship with Caribou?
- How do you know that you are being listened to?

The following important underlying themes guided discussions throughout the TK Workshop:

1. The relationship between people and caribou is suffering and needs to be renewed and healed.
2. Respect is at the core of the relationship between people and caribou: lack of respect is why caribou are in decline and the caribou-people relationship is changed.
3. People understand caribou and are their guardians.
4. People depend on caribou for their way of life: people are caribou and caribou are people.
5. Many threats (roads, development, predators, forest fires/current burn policy, climate change, wasteful harvesting, cumulative effects, etc.) have changed the relationship between people and caribou and caribou well-being.
6. Caribou are smart and can adapt: they learn to avoid people and predators, they know where to go for good food, etc.
7. Youth must be taught how to respect caribou and given opportunities on-the-land to learn the caribou way of life.
8. People predicted caribou populations would decline.
9. People feel strongly that TK should have been accepted as fact earlier.
10. Everybody must all work together: all people of NU and NWT as well as community members, biologists and other resource people.

Building on discussions that emerged around these themes, participants presented the following recommendations:

1. Renew spiritual relationship with caribou
2. Carry out an on-the-land healing ceremony
3. Teach the Youth
4. Curtail mineral exploration and development: how much is enough?
5. Protect key areas (e.g., calving grounds, caribou crossings, land bridges)
6. Increase on-the-land monitoring (i.e., community-based monitoring)
7. Support incentives to encourage people to reduce hunting caribou (e.g., alternate harvest, subsidized meat programs)
8. Integrate more TK to understand the Historic Range of the Bathurst Caribou
9. Review Fire Fighting / Burn Policies
10. Repair / Reclaim Damaged Habitat
11. Look to Other Successful Examples
12. Trust / Honour TK

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	1
Disclaimer.....	1
Report Summary	i
Table of Contents.....	iii
1. Background	1
2. Workshop Overview	1
3. Proceedings: Key Themes	5
3.1. Renewing the Relationship between Caribou and People: Respecting Caribou Determines their Well-being.....	5
3.2. People Depend on Caribou.....	7
3.3. Traditional “Management”: People Understand Caribou and are their Guardians.....	8
3.4. Caribou Face Many Threats.....	10
3.4.1. Mining Exploration and Development	11
3.4.2. Environmental Change	14
3.4.3. Predators	15
3.4.4. Cumulative Effects.....	15
3.5. Caribou are Smart and can Adapt	17
3.6. Youth are the Future	17
3.7. Caribou Populations / Numbers Change	19
3.8. TK Should Have Been Accepted as Fact Earlier	21
3.9. Working Together for Caribou	22
4. Outcomes: Recommendations	24
5. Immediate Next Steps	29
6. References	30
Appendix A: Draft Workshop Agenda	31
Appendix B: Workshop Presentation.....	32
Appendix C: Workshop Evaluation Data	33
Appendix D: Workshop Evaluation Forms	34

1. Background

The Bathurst Caribou Range Plan (BCRP) is being prepared by a working group composed of government and non-government agencies and organizations from the Northwest Territories, Nunavut and Saskatchewan. The Plan will recommend approaches for managing and reducing the impact of cumulative disturbance on Bathurst caribou and their habitat. The Plan is considering other values supported by land use, including traditional practices and economic development, and is focusing on range and population-scale effects and solutions. The Plan will provide tools and approaches to reduce impacts on caribou and improve land use decision-making across the Bathurst caribou herd's range based on both western science and traditional knowledge (TK).

The BCRP started in 2014 with a large group and we talked about what we wanted to do in terms of a range plan and what did we mean when we said range plan. We meant a plan to manage caribou habitat. When we say caribou habitat we mean the activities that are taking place on the land and these could be communities, they could be roads, they could be things like forestry, mining, and other kinds of industrial development. But how can we manage, how can we think about, how can we undertake some of these activities in a way that is not going to harm caribou, or in a way that will allow caribou to come back to be more plentiful in the future. — Karin Clark

TK must be interwoven into the BCRP in a meaningful, consistent, and respectful way, not only through the process of developing the BCRP, but also throughout the outcomes. Although challenging in that it is a new approach, the *strategic decision-making process* that guides the BCRP is grounded in TK. The BCRP Working Group recognizes and honours TK and so convened a workshop of TK holders from across the range of the Bathurst herd to guide the BCRP. This report presents results from this workshop.

2. Workshop Overview

Herds are getting smaller and smaller and smaller and it's time for us to step away from that approach from planning with our minds, need to work from the heart, need to go and meet with the caribou and deal with them from our heart if we are going to understand what the caribou need now. . . . If you are feeling that what we are doing is unusual, it is. — Joanne Barnaby

The purpose of the TK Workshop was to bring together TK experts from across the range of the Bathurst herd to discuss key issues, themes, concerns, and understandings related to the Bathurst caribou and their habitat. Outcomes from the TK Workshop are just one step towards informing the BCRP and process.

The TK Workshop was held at the Days Inn in Yellowknife, NT, from March 30-31, 2016 followed by a one-day session of the BCRP Working Group on April 1, 2016. The session was co-facilitated by Joanne Barnaby (Barnaby Consulting) and Natasha Thorpe (Trailmark Systems) from 8:30 to 4:30 daily. Pido Productions provided audio support and translating equipment. Bertha Catholique and Celine Marlowe

of the LKDFN provided interpreting services. Janet Murray provided *in situ* and post production transcription of recordings.

Participants in the TK Workshop included:

- Athabaskan Denesuline: 1A, 1B, 1C
- Bay Chimo/Bathurst Inlet HTO: 2A, 2B
- Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board – 3A
- Łutsel K'e Dene First Nation (LKDFN): 4A
- North Slave Métis Association (NSMA): 5A, 5B
- NWT Métis Alliance (NWTMA): 6A, 6B
- Tłıchq Government (TG): 7A, 7B, 7C

Note that Nunavut delegates were not present during the first day of the workshop due to cancelled flights. Delegates from the YKDFN were absent for unknown reasons.

The following observers were present on the second day of the TK Workshop:

- Kitikmeot Inuit Association (KIA): 8A
- GNWT: 9A, 9B
- NWT Wildlife Federation: 10A
- Government of Nunavut (GN): 11A
- Dominion Diamonds: 12A
- Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board (WRRB): 13A
- Barrenground Outfitters Association: 14A
- Beverly and Qaminirjuaq Caribou Management Board: 15A
- 16A (PhD Student)

The BCRP Project Team prepared a proposed draft agenda (Appendix A) based on feedback from previous BCRP community sessions; identified “gaps” in the BCRP process where TK might provide particular insight; and a strong understanding of current issues with the Bathurst caribou, in particular, the damaged relationship between caribou and people and the sharp decline in population over the last few years. The proposed agenda and guiding questions were reviewed and approved by participants at the outset of the workshop.

Discussions throughout the TK Workshop centred around the following guiding questions:

- How can the relationship between people and caribou be healed? Who needs to be involved? When? Where?
- What do the youth need to understand to continue a healthy relationship with Caribou?
- How do you know that you are being listened to?

Before the BCRP Working Group can consider how to meaningfully integrate TK, a broader discussion—one at the forefront of the hearts and minds of northerners—needs to take place around how to heal the relationship between people and caribou. Indeed, this is the “elephant in the room” and provided the starting point for discussion for the TK Workshop. Accordingly, facilitators provided a quick overview of the conditions and events leading up to the TK Workshop based on their collective experience working with Bathurst caribou herd communities and hearing the following common sentiments:

- People have been talking about the problems related to the disappearance of the caribou for a long time.
- Elders have been talking about the relationship between human beings and caribou and our responsibilities.
- Back when the world was new, there were agreements made between people and animals; there is concern that we have broken those agreements.
- The traditional laws that have been in place for hundreds of years have been broken and this is why the caribou have left us.
- Some elders have been saying that we need to go back and talk to the caribou and see what they need from us as human beings to allow them to come back.
- Need to go and make amends, apologize to the caribou so we can clear the way so caribou can speak to us again and tell us what they need.
- Elders have been trying to help by sharing their TK.
- TK shared by the different aboriginal groups is really valuable.
- Some Elders say what we are doing is not enough; that what we are doing and what government is doing to prevent herds from disappearing is not enough and not working.
- Elders have been frustrated for a long time about not having a place for the spiritual connection with caribou to be understood and relevant to decisions related to caribou management and caribou habitat.

I've been at these meetings a long time and we are going to tell you again what we told you before but I think we are going to have a really hard time because we know the problem but people are listening but they can't do anything about it because of industry so I don't know, we might be wasting our time unless we are going to do something very serious to make it work. — 6A

Participants opted to work as one large group rather than smaller break-out groups and remained in a talking circle formation to encourage open conversation between all participants. A key element of facilitation was to record key points, themes and quotes on large ‘sticky-notes’ that were posted on the wall (Figure 1). As the workshop progressed, key themes emerged under which each post-it sticky-note was then organized. These themes became the ‘bones’ of the TK Workshop (see Section 3) that ultimately informed the recommendations (see Section 4).



Figure 1 Key points, observations, themes and recommendations were showcased on the walls during the workshop to form an evolving record

The workshop was audio-recorded and transcribed nightly. Verbatim transcripts were critical to “getting the words right,” which is important given a legacy of Aboriginal peoples feeling that their words have been misconstrued or appropriated. With quality simultaneous notes, it was possible to present a list of preliminary recommendations, observations, and other key findings for participant comment on the final day of the workshop (Appendix B).

In an effort to continuously improve the BCRP, an evaluation form was circulated at the close of the workshop. Results from completed forms combined with comments shared during the closing circle suggested that this initiative was a success according to participants (Appendix C).

The document includes a mixture of summaries of key messages along with quotes from session participants that give examples or bring alive the messages with a story. We hope that this will make the messages more meaningful and useful for both Aboriginal communities and the BCRP.

3. Proceedings: Key Themes

The following important underlying themes guided discussions throughout the TK Workshop:

1. The relationship between people and caribou is suffering and needs to be renewed and healed.
2. Respect is at the core of the relationship between people and caribou: lack of respect is why caribou are in decline and the caribou-people relationship is changed.
3. People understand caribou and are their guardians.
4. People depend on caribou for their way of life: people are caribou and caribou are people.
5. Many threats (roads, development, predators, forest fires/current burn policy, climate change, wasteful harvesting, cumulative effects, etc.) have changed the relationship between people and caribou and caribou well-being.
6. Caribou are smart and can adapt: they learn to avoid people and predators, they know where to go for good food, etc.
7. Youth must be taught how to respect caribou and given opportunities on-the-land to learn the caribou way of life.
8. People predicted caribou populations would decline.
9. People feel strongly that TK should have been accepted as fact earlier.
10. Everybody must all work together: all people of NU and NWT as well as community members, biologists and other resource people.

Each of these ten themes is elaborated in the following sections.

3.1. Renewing the Relationship between Caribou and People: Respecting Caribou Determines their Well-being

The first theme of the workshop was that respect has always been at the core of the relationship between people and caribou. Recent times have brought a fundamental change in this relationship because caribou are no longer being treated with respect.

The problem right now is that we have to go back to our relationship with the caribou. We have to go back to the land with our young generations, teach them and give the culture back. — 1B

As a native, the way I was taught, the traditional way, respect the animals and respect the land and they will respect us back. Need to pass this onto younger generations. Want caribou for your son or grandson? Then respect the animals. If you like caribou meat and you want your kids to have caribou meat, then respect the wildlife. — 3A

Talking to the elders to respect the caribou is never to leave antlers where the routes are. I don't know about the Dene land but in Nunavut we have markers and we are told not to destroy them because those are the caribou paths. A lot of times the elders are right but no one listens to them. — 3A

Part of the spiritual work is to work on the traditional trail system that goes all over the land. That's how you meet the animals, and go to the grave sites, and that's what we are trying to do revive the trails. We traveled from Gamètì to the barrenland and we revived that trail system, the trail hadn't been used in 60 years so it took a long time to find the trail. So it's important to open that up so people can go and build that relationship and learn from the land. — 7C

The Dene drum: we need to bring that tradition back, that's what will bring the caribou back. They hear that and they come back. I think we can't tiptoe around things that are happening in the core areas with industry and it's something we need to tackle head on. It's something we always seem to shy away from that because industries voice is strong and I feel like even since we started things have been going backwards. When you hear that Nunavut just opened calving grounds to development, that is something we should be talking about here, those are big problems and we should be able to talk about that and not shy away from it. — 1A

Disrespect threatens caribou well-being and causes fractures in the relationship between people and caribou. Workshop participants spoke to the importance of healing the relationship between people and caribou and advocated for respect as a key first step:

We are talking about how to heal the relationship between people and caribou but I also think we need to heal the relationship between the land and the people. If you look at the map there is stuff all over the place and you see that we haven't respected the land in a way that will sustain caribou. The Athabasca Dene are caribou people, that's who they are, I know there are other communities that are as well. So everyone suffers when the caribou suffer. — 1A

When caribou are respected, they will give themselves to people:

I have heard that I am a good hunter. In reality I am not that good but I leave my community, I usually take a few people with me. I do a prayer, I talk to the caribou, talk to the animals ahead. What I want to do with it, that I have to feed people at home. I speak to the Creator in my language. People are looking for caribou all over the country but the caribou find me because they know what I am going to do. I am really lucky. I know the animal and I know where to go but the animals gives itself to me. I appreciate it. When I use my own language I break down, it is too powerful. — 6A

A lot of things happening related to caribou because we love it and we live with it. The caribou come back from the north for people to use them. — 7A

In many cases, caribou “luck” comes through respect demonstrated towards caribou:

The luck has ignored us. We are not taking care of caribou right. In order for me to talk about this and how it will come back and be lucky, it is a lot of work that has to be done. When I was thinking about this I don't blame younger woman but younger men too.
— 7A

Workshop participants recognized that the relationship between caribou and people is suffering and, through this awareness, are taking the first steps in healing. They acknowledged the need to help people learn and understand the historic relationship between people and caribou and how traditional laws maintained the integrity of that relationship.

3.2. People Depend on Caribou

The second theme of the workshop was that people across the range of the Bathurst herd have long respected and depended on caribou for subsistence and sustenance, extending back to the time when caribou and people could speak to one another and people could become caribou. The years when caribou migration routes came close to camps or communities meant health and wealth in terms of clothing, tools and more.

Because this food, if you were to replace all the caribou meat that is used in Nunavut, it would cost 20 million dollars to replace the caribou meat they eat every year, so when those caribou are gone who's going to pay for that? Not to mention the way of life, and the cultural way of life. They live on caribou, they depend on caribou, they think caribou, and everything is centered around caribou. — 6B

These people [Europeans] are coming to our house. Europeans have a fence around their yard and keep it clean. The range of the caribou is our yard, our life. We have to look after this. — 6A

People have always expressed deep gratitude and reverence for caribou for offering themselves to people. Although people are not as dependent on country foods as they were in the past, people continue to depend on caribou for their cultural identity. Elders have been known to slip into depression and lose their health without caribou, not only from the absence of caribou meat in their diet but also because they “miss being with them” spiritually.

Just like to say that times have changed a lot from when we were much more dependent on caribou. Time has come for us to carry out our part of the deal. Caribou took care of us, when we had nothing else, we were totally dependent and that's why most of us are here today. It's an interesting relationship we have with caribou: at the same time as being our loved ones, they are our beautiful food. Now that we know the trouble that the caribou are in is largely our own doing we have to do something to help them back for getting us here today. — 5A

While people have always understood that the relationship between caribou and people is grounded in respect, they have also depended on caribou so intensely that there were times when people flowed between the caribou and human worlds and were able to speak the same language.

3.3. Traditional “Management”: People Understand Caribou and are their Guardians

The third theme of the workshop was that, for generations, people have considered caribou populations, migrations, behaviour and well-being through people speaking the same language as caribou and transitioning between being a person and caribou. The incredible closeness between or melding of people and caribou, has meant that respecting and taking care of caribou are part of traditional laws. For example, workshop participants explained that respecting caribou was to act as their guardians:

And the caribou do understand human people. Even though I go by myself on the land. I understand because I have been there. All the animals do understand you. All the animals that are migrating are all suffering. It is not only the humans because they are not getting meat. There are animals that are skin and bones...starving. — 4A

We are related to caribou. — 1B

They say leave caribou alone. Caribou is not going to talk for themselves. Help our generation to go slow. Today because they have high-powered machines they can go far in one day and come back. In dog team day everything is slow and being take care of well. — 7A

Way in the past when elders talked to me, if you are taking care of animals right, they will come back in spirit and the spirit will come back to life. If you are not doing the right things, they will not come back. Today we are getting to that. We want caribou and we kill them but bones are going to the dump and the caribou numbers are going down. — 3A

Discussions during the workshop provided clarity on how people moved back and forth between being caribou and living in relationship with caribou:

Way in the past, animals have been human beings. — 6A

In fall time we go live with caribou. The good hunters, there are a lot of people like that. They go anywhere and they meet caribou right away because the animal knows that this person, the way it will be treated and be taking of, this is why the animals gives itself to him. This is how the elders were taught. This is the way my culture works in the past. Before my time. They call the K’awoo [hunting leader], the boss, people follow him because he is a 'lucky' person with fish or moose. — 7A

One participant gave a particularly strong example of the interconnectedness between people and caribou:

I'm not speaking 100% [my Aboriginal language] anymore. That is something to look at, the disruption from my culture. I cannot speak 100% [my Aboriginal language] all day because I am not with my elders anymore. I look at the migration routes in the same way. We are leaving something out in between, [there is] a void in between the migration route. There is a void in me. . . . That is the way I think. The way I speak is just like a migration route. My life has been disrupted because I am not speaking 100% Inuinnaqtun anymore. — 2A

One workshop participant explained that a caribou spirit can come back two or three times, but only if it is respected.

Workshop participants explained that, given people are caribou and caribou are people and people must be guardians of caribou, it is necessary for people to speak on behalf of the caribou:

Everybody lives on caribou and eats caribou. Everyone is after the caribou, so of course they have problems. Like elder 7A says, caribou don't talk, that is why we are here for them. I learn and listen, they all have the same message. We have to get the leaders to help us and take direction from our people. — 6A

The caribou is really important. The caribou doesn't talk for itself and we have to talk for him. How can we help in any way? We put something there for our future generation. If you have seen this, you follow the way. Then you can live with the caribou a long time. That's the way I was looking at it. By listening to others, leave them alone but not forever. — 7A

Since northern Aboriginal peoples have always “studied” and “monitored” caribou numbers, migrations, behaviour, and well-being, they feel a sense of urgency associated with recent and profound changes in caribou. Never before have people felt it is more important to take care of caribou and to act as their guardians.

We all have different things to do so there is no time to do things with others unless they see something written this is the only time they look at it. — 7A

I think the harvest information is a very critical piece of the puzzle as to what is going on with the herds. — 6B

Workshop participants explained that some groups have voluntarily stopped harvesting in order to help bring numbers back, even though this is very difficult:

It doesn't benefit them to stop eating the caribou, it's not something they want to do, but it is something they will do to preserve the caribou for future generations. — 7B

The elders they have been raised on caribou meat, they crave it, they will do anything to get it but it is just so difficult and the herds are so low that we don't want to impose any more hardships on the herds that are being depleted. So we start hunting more moose and more buffalo. — 6B

We aren't waiting for government: we are the first to stop hunting the Bathurst. I hunted all my life. This is the first year that we are not going to hunt caribou, any caribou, we are buying meat from the south but we are already doing this. I went to the elders and they weren't happy about it, but I said let's try it for one year to help the caribou, if they like the beef and the buffalo from the south maybe we will do it again next year. — 6A

We are encouraging people to try and save the caribou for the future and are exploring different things [meat sources] for our community. — 2B

We passed a motion that the Métis in the south Slave weren't going to access and hunt the caribou until the numbers come up and we did this voluntarily. — 6B

In summary, being caribou guardians requires that people listen to caribou, manage themselves, accept sacrifices, and breathe life into traditional laws: the true challenge is to “manage” people and the way they use the land and treat animals.

We are always trying to manage animals, I never seen one human management board that is managing the humans that are hurting the environment through industrial activity. — 6A

3.4. Caribou Face Many Threats

A fourth theme was that human activities threaten caribou around the circumpolar north, with the Bathurst herd being one of many to decline in recent years. Workshop participants spoke of threats from various perspectives ranging from a high-level or global scale through a regional or range scale through a low-level or localized scale. Global change, atmospheric fallout, industrial development, over-hunting, forest fires were mentioned. Predators were also cited as a key natural threat. Cumulative impacts were recognized as a driving force behind caribou decline and degradation of their habitat.

In the late 30s, Giant Mine was developed and caribou moved away. After that the caribou started moving away from people. In 1925 Łutsel K'e became settled and caribou again moved away. After this the caribou hardly come this way. In 1979, I fought fire and this whole country is all burnt [south slave]. Lichen takes 50 years to mature before the caribou stomach can digest that. Now in the 2000's and late nineties this whole area burned in north slave. Caribou moved away because all that food is burnt. Then after that they have the mines kick in so the haul roads interfere with the caribou crossing. — 7A

We did a TK study combined with science looking at the food around the mine around Diavik and as Joseph was saying at 30 km away from the mine, it was almost normal,

but the closer you got to the mine the more dust there was and the less sign of caribou. Harry Apples said the [East] Island [Diavik mine site] is dead to caribou, caribou don't go there anymore. — 7C

Workshop participants explained that human expansion and development across the range of the Bathurst herd (itself an act of disrespect) has changed the relationship between people and caribou such that caribou fear and are no longer happy to see people anymore. Caribou were said to have started to move away when communities, roads and development came to the North. Workshop participants cited the fact that the Beverly and Ahiak caribou stayed on the coast this year as evidence that caribou are “staying away.” Other factors such as climate change and increases in predators have also changed caribou.

3.4.1. Mining Exploration and Development

Mineral exploration and development across the range of the Bathurst herd, particularly since the 1990s, largely explains caribou decline according to participants. Workshop participants spoke to the cultural dilemma they face, knowing that the strong relationship between caribou and people depends on the ability of people to respectfully harvest caribou and for caribou to offer themselves to people and yet recognizing that mining provides some opportunities. Some elders have indicated the need to apologize to the caribou for allowing industrial development to take place even while they expressed their fears that such activity could hurt the caribou.

In [my area] we have [several] mines near us. The Bathurst caribou, the last time we saw them was 1995. Our tradition suffers when we don't see them and we can't stop hunting caribou and if we stop that we are going to be suffering. The government would be happy and give you money right now. Look what they did to us the pollution, the mine industry, look at the environment around us. The reason I, I'm not saying not stopping or reducing but it's our right so I will continue, it doesn't matter right now: we don't have any caribou. We went to Manitoba to get caribou this year. I have been growing up in the wilderness and I still today harvest other animals like moose, muskox. Moose that's only a season, just temporary but caribou is our full time. — 1B

A suggestion was to carry out assessments on how many jobs versus caribou are “needed” by communities and to plan mining operations accordingly:

I think we need a needs assessment done in every community, how many people are there? How many jobs are needed? How many people want training and need training? That can do the jobs and from there you can kind of gauge as to what amount of industrial activity that will take place within that region. Also a needs assessment for caribou, how many caribou are needed for these people to live the way they used to be. — 6B

There are all those mines out there do we really need that many mines? . . . In my community there are only a few people that work in the mines but we get a big impact

from no caribou. We don't benefit from the mines but we sure feel the impact and they are impacting the caribou. How many mines do they need? — 6A

In our country there is no place for the caribou to hide, a few eskers its flat and pretty easy for a human to travel so we have to get a message to the government that too much activity is not good for the animals. — 6A

In recent years, the clustering of developments around the Lac de Gras area has created a barrier to caribou migration. As such, workshop participants explained that caribou migration routes have deflected away from the traditional crossings such as “the Narrows” (known as at “Nàk’ooᓃaa to the YKDFN) between Lac de Gras and Lac du Sauvage.

These people that always had caribou, this year they had none. . . . It goes to show the hardships these people have to go through. The only place to get caribou is in Nunavut and even some of those places it's hard to get, the caribou are staying away from development. There is probably good food and no disturbance. Maybe after a few years those caribou know to stay away. There is nothing. I think Nunavut is seeing the same thing. — 6B

If you look at it right from the Bathurst Inlet there's a fence. The caribou come down here, this whole country is burnt here, the whole lot of it. It is just like a fence lined up so the caribou follow it but don't cross it, they come here then they change direction, they move on. You change or destroy their food on them and they move away. There is too much activity [so] they move. . . . So you really have to watch caribou you can't disturb them too much. The mines are lined up like a fence and the caribou follow the fence, they get deterred and now they are gone way down to N Saskatchewan. The food was burned and changed, then you add the fence which is the barriers created by mining. — 6A

Research carried out by the Tłı̨chq̓ (Dedats'eetsaa: 2016) affirms this perspective:

One of the assumptions we made was caribou come from the north and they migrate through the area but the elders say they are blocked by the mines so instead they moved to the east and the west. So that's the assumption: if you destroy food in one area, what happens to the migration of caribou further away from them? . . . Caribou start to associate this noise with people and so they try to stay away. Where before caribou would see people and be happy, now they see people and run away. Now you have miners on the land so you create a different relationship. Habitat destruction but also they don't want to go towards people because of fear. — 7C

Industry itself is on the migration route. It is splitting the migration route in half. Industry and whatever is happening out on the land. That is destroying the migration routes, the mines and projects on the land. You break that migration route. Once that caribou are migrating, their migration route is split if there is something in front of them that they don't like. Once they see it, they will always look at it [that way] for the rest of their lives. — 2A

Roads and power lines were mentioned as threats to caribou:

The only place to get caribou is Nunavut and even some of those places it's hard to get, the caribou are staying away from development. There is probably good food and no disturbance. Maybe after a few years those caribou know to stay away. There is nothing I think Nunavut is seeing the same thing. Baker Lake has a long 112 km road and caribou are starting to stay away from there now as well. — 6B

When they put the power line in we haven't seen caribou past it since it went in. Lots of noise from the power lines. Lots of caribou south of Cree Lake in Saskatchewan. South of Fond du Lac. Before they build the road to the mine, caribou were there. — 1B

Finally, dust from roads and mining activities such as blasting has affected caribou and important habitat according to workshop participants. Caribou are like people and don't like their food covered.

Dust on caribou food is like pepper on mashed potatoes for me. I don't like pepper on my mashed potatoes, I won't eat it. Caribou do not like dust on their food and even though it may not have chemicals in it, they don't like it and will go somewhere else to find clean food. — 6A

I think the last 3 or 4 years ago, we did research about 15-20-30 km south of the first mine and we took samples all of those caribou foods and brought it to the camp and then every few km closer to the mine, as we got closer to the mines it got dusty and dustier the closer to the mine. — 7A

The caribou couldn't go near the mine because they couldn't eat anything. — 7A

Animals need the plants to be as clean as possible from dust. — 2A

One of the Tłı̄ch̄ elders did study around mine sites. 30 km outside in to the mine. Caribou migration they cannot use that land no more. Caribou threw [what used to be] the better land away because of what is on that land now. — 7A

Some workshop participants suggested ways in which mining operations could be improved to manage impacts:

They need to put bigger filters in their plants, they should use better fuel, the cheap fuel they are using sets off a lot of emissions in the air, also all their haul roads should be

watered down not with calcium because calcium brings all the animals in they all want that salt, when they blast they should water it down to keep the dust down. — 6A

Throughout the workshop and in other caribou-related events, many Elders have shared their beliefs and fears that too much exploration and mining within the caribou range would result in caribou population and decline and loss, long before the mines were established. Their fears have come to pass and they believe that the cumulative effects have proven to be too much for caribou. They feel that they have sacrificed too much: in exchange for mining jobs, which have not met expectations, they have lost a major food source that had sustained them for thousands of years.

3.4.2. Environmental Change

Participants shared their observations of how global change is causing shifts in the ranges, habitats, and behaviours of other animals that can lead to competition with the Bathurst caribou for key habitat, particularly during these times of intense fire activity. In addition, caribou were said to be scared away from other animals encroaching on their range.

Another thing, talking about buffalo. This range that is moving slowly to the north. At the same time moose and caribou are moving out to the barrenland. Four years ago we saw moose, beaver and muskrat at Courageous Lake. Never seen that before. All these buffalo are moving after them. Not only buffalo, but there are porcupines in my community. They are scary animals. Porcupine quills got into dogs last summer. These animals in the south are coming way north because of warming. What will happen with animals we live with? Abandoned mines and exploration camps on the barrenlands, there are a whole bunch of them. Caribou coming down they start to see the things that were not there before. — 7A

*I think the biggest problem is predators and other animals taking the feeding ground.
— 3A*

Burned areas were also cited as causing shifts in migration routes, particularly in the last few years, as climate change is causing more fires:

All these camps that they are blocking the caribou migration and we need that cleared up, its their road. . . . If something is blocking them, they can't go through it, they go around it. So this is why we want to clear all the barrels and tent frames everything that is laying around in that area should be taken out. — 7A

The natural global warming has gotten stronger over the years because of industry. We have to look at cumulative effects on everything and the way the communities are experiencing what they haven't seen before. We have grasshoppers and they are migrating in certain ways, industry is giving a lot of cumulative effects by what they are bringing to the north. — 2A

In the Tłjchq area, we can't always just look at forest fires in the summer time and try to only protect the places. We should talk about it and protect all the green ones that the animals can use and let it go the burned part so that should be relooked at: it should be protected. — 7A

I want to emphasize what Joseph said yesterday that the large fires have changed migratory routes and there is no food for [caribou]. There are only a few areas left that are unburned and those areas should be protected so caribou can come back. — 7C

This summer we were thinking that we want to bring those people over to the place near to where all my [ancestors] come from and study all the food for the caribou and the routes the caribou used but today the caribou don't go the way they used to, the routes are all bushy now. Forest fire areas the caribou used to use those areas for food and now it is all burned so they stay north. — 7A

Workshop participants spoke at length about how changes to the government burn policy and current forest-fighting practices have led to loss of key caribou habitat.

They fought fires in the past to protect the caribou range. Nowadays they don't fight fires, the only place they fight fires is around the communities so all the lichen and caribou moss is burned [in the south slave]. — 6A

Back 20-30 years it was all burned down (South Slave). When you fly from Fond du Lac to Łutsel K'e it's all burned, all gone. No food for caribou, nothing to eat. — 1B

3.4.3. Predators

Workshop participants explained that predators are driving caribou populations down.

Predators are the most that are killing off the caribou. Too many wolves and grizzly bears back home. Muskox populations are really south now from our areas. In the past I always tell people that we control wolverines, wolves and grizzly bears through use of furs. — 2B

They pointed out that traditionally people actively harvested caribou predators. It was common for a trapper to harvest several hundred wolves and to also hunt grizzly. Now there are so few full time trappers and these populations have grown significantly and have added significant pressure on the caribou. Several participants expressed the need to reduce the wolf and grizzly populations as they have experience with this being effective in maintaining a balance.

3.4.4. Cumulative Effects

Workshop participants expressed their frustration around the cumulative effects of human activities across the range of the Bathurst caribou. Everything from global warming to mineral exploration and development to forest fires were said to be causing shifts in the locations of migration routes; areas for over-wintering, calving, and post-calving; and overall caribou well-being.

Global warming is blamed for everything but that global warming is caused by people and the country is drying up. Of course it's drying up. If you look on the Slave River, six dams on the Peace River. Fort McMurray is taking half of the water. The fish in the river can't even be eaten. I flew over Uranium City and looking at the tailings pond, there was a yellow fluid that flows into Lake Athabasca. There is a dam on Snare River. And then they say the water is naturally dropping! — 6A

Warmer temperatures are also having an impact on caribou health:

The herds that are left are getting decimated from the predators also more and more hoof rot. Everything is thawing out, the permafrost is thawing and everything is wetter and the hooves can't dry out. . . . Also we are getting moose way up on the tundra, and these moose have different diseases and we don't know how the caribou will deal with these. — 6B

This is one of the problems [mining corridor] there are mosquitoes, water, air, hunters, food is burning everything is against the caribou . . . — 6A

Finally, disrespect and wastage of meat were said to be another reason why caribou populations have declined:

One of the biggest contributors to caribou decline is wastage. The amount out there is terrible. I have to bring it up it is part of the responsibility of everyone in the room. We all have to bring this up to the young people and show them that it's not right, that if you kill a caribou you have to respect it. Just because there are lots, don't just take the legs and leave the rest. Every caribou matters. It matters to every person living on the land. When the caribou don't come back people used to starve. — 6B

Protecting key habitat from these multiple threats was at the forefront of discussions ranging from key caribou crossings to land bridges to calving grounds.

The tataa [land crossings] is one of those concepts and one of the areas that should be protected. . . . Caribou go east or west after these blockages, what happens when you put a mine there? The elder Harry Apples says the island is dead to caribou maybe we should put something there to protect certain areas. — 7C

The tataa that he is talking about is in between the Lac de Gras and Mackay Lake they used to use when coming back from the north. . . . They are still doing the same thing but not many animals anymore crossing it should be really protected. — 7A

Also in Nunavut we strongly feel about protecting the calving area. The hunters and trappers organization, the Inuit Regional office in the Kitikmeot region, tourism, exploration camps, supporting us and Nunavut [Wildlife] Management Board is supporting us. We have to work together and it takes hard work to get to that goal but we cannot give up it is our main food. — 3A

3.5. Caribou are Smart and can Adapt

A fifth theme underlying the workshop was that caribou have long been recognized as smart, sensitive and alert animals and are known to adapt to human disturbances of various types and scales. As elaborated in the previous section, workshop participants spoke of how caribou have adjusted their migration routes to avoid mineral developments or burned habitats; they know where to find good food; and they know not to overlap ranges with other animals who may be eating the same food. Aboriginal peoples also know that herds will break up and join other herds. The question outstanding is whether these “adaptations” will enable caribou well-being and survival.

They are smart animals. On calving grounds, there should not be mining and exploration. Calving grounds should be kept the way it is. Nothing should be built, no mining or roads.
— 7A

Dogs were the only means of travel in those days. The dogs understand. The caribou will never wait for you when you travel with a dog team. When you hunt a caribou you have to sneak up on them. — 4A

My job is to get the view out that caribou is a person, something that needs to be respected. This used to be caribou habitat, right here. Need to think about caribou as intelligent, sentient beings. Treat the meat, the blood, and the bones with respect because caribou is a smart animal. Caribou will not come to us because it is a smart animal. Talking about it like a person to person. We as persons need to take that upon us. Feed the water, give back to the land. We have been reviving old trails where people used to go to get caribou; where people used to intersect with caribou. — 7C

3.6. Youth are the Future

Another key theme expressed by participants in the TK Workshop was that youth face profound challenges today as they try to balance two worlds: the old and new as well as the traditional and modern-day. At the same time, there is worry that youth do not know enough of the traditional laws and so will not be safe out on the land or able to show the necessary respect to caribou. These are challenges facing all communities represented at the TK Workshop.

A lot of these kids, get them out of the house from the TV. I've seen guys out hunting caribou. Their dad is out in a snowstorm cutting up a caribou and both boys are sitting in the truck. They have to know how to survive and they have to get out there. The elders aren't going to be around forever. Other kids in the communities don't have the luxury of growing up in the bush; somebody has to teach them. — 6B

Nobody thinks of pulling the sinew for the moccasins, nobody pulls the kidney fat out for the elders that want it. It's not total use of the whole animal. It's going to take a long time to get a new generation to have half the respect that the elders really had. — 14A

Today the environment, younger generations with drugs and alcohol, how do we get them to go back to the land? We need this kind of recommendation to get the young people to go back to the land. — 1B

I see all the young people in our community of Kugluktuk, some have never been out on the land. I see them chasing hikhik [ground squirrel] and chasing ptarmigan. They are made this way. We are made to provide for ourselves and we chase ptarmigan, birds and hikhik. That is Inuk culture in him or her instilled in him because of his culture. He wants the hikhik and that bird and that animal. We depend on these little hunters and gatherers. The way I look at it, other cultures trying to change our way of living and cultural way of doing things. That is a lot of money available to change someone's culture. — 2A

We hunters respect what we catch. The harvesters have to educate our younger generations. The younger generation has really fast machines and really fast rifles. The younger generation are not like us they are stuck between native and non-native. We have to teach them how to harvest and not only caribou. Need to teach generation to generation. Pass on knowledge to them or all animals will keep declining. — 3A

People recognize the importance of ensuring that traditional knowledge is passed from one generation to the next:

In the old days, they hunt with snowshoes and walk after caribou. If they want to kill them they have to follow them until they get it. They look at the weather too and sometimes it changes. That is how they follow the animals, the way they hunt. So this is the culture that we have left on the side. We are not white but we follow these people. We don't know where we are going but we follow them. We need to come back and figure out where we left off from our traditional laws. It will take a long time to do that. — 7A

What I am telling you now is how I lived through the land. I have been everywhere out in the barrenland. There are trails all over that I have been on. The way the men work is how I worked all my life and lived on the barrenland. I don't say it is so hard to work. . . . The young generation is going to be suffering and it will be hard [without caribou]. We are leaving our rewards [teachings] for the young people for the ones that are listening. — 4A

We need to keep them out there and teach all four seasons. There is lots to be learned. Some of our children have been doing that. No one wants to be out on the land without money anymore. In communities they are breaking cultural rules. . . . I think if we as natives across the north and have teachers living out on the land for the full seasons. So we can have a school, send them to these people on the land. . . . A one week project is wasting money. That child in one week will look at it but in another week he will forget it again. Needs the full experience of the four seasons. — 2A

I think it's a really key point to try to find a way that's grounded in the traditional knowledge of respect for caribou that can help the next generation who are going to have all these new tools [technologies, models, collar data, etc.] coming up, we have to find a way to use the respect and knowledge have to guide ourselves before it becomes a problem. — John Nishi

Participants discussed some of the hard choices needing to be made around balancing industrial development opportunities with their costs. Advice was given on how development could be more accommodating to northern cultural ways:

If we don't open the mine our younger people won't have a job but if we let them open the mine then our children will have jobs. — 7A

We want more people working and the mines have to take into consideration that. These people, they were traditional users of the land they are not used to a job 6-6 or 9-5 or whatever, a trappers routine is a little bit different, you get up when you feel like it and go when you feel like it so when they have a schedule for two weeks then they go home for two weeks so they have a schedule they are not use to so you have look at the and try to be flexible with these people, be patient with them, not the minute they don't show up fire them you have to look at the way they use to live and blend it in with your style. So look at that aspect maybe get a month off here and be more flexible and try to accommodate their life style too. And I think you will find a lot more people working at the mine. — 6B

Workshop participants expressed concern about youth and spoke to the importance of making sure that youth are taught well in both worlds. People recognized that youth are the future and how they respect caribou and balance human activities in a world of opportunity and cumulative effects will influence the future of the Bathurst caribou. People commented that the work they were doing will benefit future generations.

3.7. Caribou Populations / Numbers Change

The seventh theme was that people across the range of the Bathurst caribou herd know that caribou come and go and that their numbers increase and decrease in cycles; however, most workshop participants explained that never in living memory have numbers of the Bathurst caribou been so low.

My ekwò, where did it go? — 6A

Today we thought we were lucky, except the last 15 years. I keep thinking why they are declining? Always going down, worse and worse. I live with the animals and love them. — 7A

At the same time, a few participants shared that they didn't think that caribou numbers were decreasing but rather going elsewhere to forage and join other herds:

The caribou are not declining. They will come back and migrate again. They are not disappearing they are going to other areas to have food to eat and join other caribou. This is what caribou people know. That is how the caribou are travelling, they migrate all over and return again. — 4A

Participants have lived through many cycles in wildlife populations in the past and remember hearing stories, if not their personal experiences, of years when the caribou migrations did not come close to their camps or communities.

As an example, we had lots of Peary caribou, we had lots of them, and they are small little white caribou. They have disappeared and 30 years later we are starting to spot them again. For Bathurst herd, if we continue to hunt without respect it will take another 30 years for the population to go up. Elders have to be listened to. Resource people are helping us by inviting us and our elders to workshops. — 3A

Whether caribou numbers will increase again or whether they will come back to people was said by some workshop participants to be in the hands of the Creator:

None of us know when they will come back to us. Only the Creator knows. We have to rely on the Creator maybe then we will get the caribou back. That is how my grandparents would talk to me. All these young students they do not understand me, some do but most have lost their language and it is very difficult to teach them. This is a little story that I wanted to share. We are talking about caribou. They are declining and having problems. Sometimes in life we go through hardships and this is one of those times. Those who remember what I said maybe in the future it will get better for us. The elders used to look ahead to the future and that is what is happening today. — 4A

Disrespecting caribou, for example, through specific actions was also blamed for lower numbers:

You cannot hit and you cannot point the paddle to a caribou like a stick. If you do, then the caribou go down. Last time caribou came around 2009? I heard in my community that someone beat up a caribou with a stick. This is how our culture works. This is the way our elders have been telling us. Same with the berries, blueberries, cranberries on the barren grounds cannot be brought back to places like Wekweètì or the caribou will not come back. A lot of people pick berries and bring them back. I say don't do that, there may not be caribou but they don't believe me. We are suffering because we are not following what our elders have told us. A friend of mine says this morning, if you listen to elders what they say is powerful and strong. They don't write, they know. They look way ahead. — 7A

3.8. TK Should Have Been Accepted as Fact Earlier

A common sentiment—the eighth theme—that continued to seep into discussions was that, owing to TK, people “knew better” or “predicted” that caribou would decline with increased development across the range of the Bathurst herd. Participants recounted their experiences voicing their forecasts at environmental assessment hearings, workshops and meetings, particularly since the mid-1990s. People expressed their frustration around feeling like their Elders (or they, themselves) were not heard:

When I was less than 20 I heard a prophet say that someday there won't be any caribou. That is what they were saying which is what is happening now. — 7A

It's kind of interesting what the elders were predicting in the 1990s and 2000s about the impacts of the mines. It predicts the effects of the mines and the last couple years we have been documenting the health effects and migration routes and we can see the great correlation between their predictions and what happened. — 7C

To me as a harvester, as chair of Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, my elders are the power. That's what should have happened in the first place. Biologists and mining camps should have listened to our elders in the first place. — 3A

The way I look at it is we know the problem. Traditional knowledge tells us the problem. Our people knew what it was like before industry came in or before Europeans came, how the animals used the country prior to the invasion of people. It seems like we moved out towards the west and the caribou have moved away from us. The only thing is when we do tell them the problem, what can or is going to be done about it? — 6A

We have been talking about this issue a long time. How come we haven't resolved it? Only way is to work together. We harvesters point fingers at mining companies. Government points fingers at us. — 3A

Frustration about apparent inaction by governments was also cited as leading to caribou declines:

I commented on that and I was talking about for caribou populations. Is what we were talking about the reason being is they waited too long for collecting information on other herds and those herds are just about gone now? — 6B

When will government, when will action actually happen at an early stage, when Aboriginal people are seeing these problems? Why is it taking so long for actions to occur? Why does it have to be at risk before they do anything? And I have lost my voice, I'm tired of saying it. It's time to listen and act early, rather than late! — 8A

Our experience . . . surrounded by . . . mines, they have seen a whole lot of changes to the environment, changes to caribou behavior, and the whole migration doesn't go south like it used to. You hear time and again industry coming into communities telling you all this and industry saying well our monitoring doesn't show any impact to the

caribou or the environment. It's kind of a slap in the face of all this knowledge. I think in a situation like this, our recommendation to industry would be to take it, listen to our knowledge. — 6A

Often people are consulted and nothing comes of it. I have been sitting in these meetings for 30 years would be nice to hear back what has become of these meetings. — 10A

The current status of the Bathurst caribou herd combined with threats facing their habitat calls for new ways of listening to and hearing one another; honouring frustration through meaningful action. With commitment, people can map a new way of working together.

3.9. Working Together for Caribou

The ninth theme was that participants expressed their interest in continuing to work together across the range of the Bathurst herd, regardless of their feelings of frustration around not being heard or having their predictions recognized. They emphasized that collaboration across territorial boundaries was important—imperative even—to “taking care” of caribou.

I strongly feel our wildlife is important to us. Doesn't matter if you are from NWT or Nunavut, we have to work together. A lot of biologists and miners make good money. They buy their food. The Dene and Inuit people live on caribou. That's the way the resource people and biologists need to think about it. — 3A

Something that we need to do, healing the caribou and trying to work with these animals, we have to do it all together: that's the only thing that we can do. — 7A

The elders have a strong power on wildlife, whether its caribou, wolf, sea mammals, they know it but no one listens to them. Before it's too late, we have to work together whether from NWT or Nunavut. We have to protect our wildlife. — 3A

Workshop participants expressed support for working together, but at the same time, criticized western science/biology for not being holistic, appropriate or “right” in some situations related to the Bathurst caribou herd:

We know everything about our country because this is where we are from. Not only in legend. But passed from our grandparents and their grandparents. I live by two laws. Traditional law the law of the land. . . . We have this whole range and we share it. We not only share the minerals, food but they have to share our knowledge too. That's the only thing they don't share because they won't listen, they don't understand. Scientific knowledge is grade 1. Scientists need to start listening to traditional knowledge. — 6A

Science they tend to know a lot of things when they take an animal apart, anatomy of any animal, they know the science part of all the insides. But they have not lived out on the land like we have for thousands of years. We know the whole picture not just the inner parts of any animal. Scientists they learn that by looking at the scientific way of doing it, taking things apart, that's their way of doing it. We need to meld science and traditional knowledge at all times doing projects out on the land, especially mining companies who might be working out on the land. We need to work more closely together. — 2A

It's good that we do more workshops like this, trying to make a really good decision and do something about this, just a few groups will go home. We all have different things to do so there is no time to do things with others unless they see something written this is the only time they look at it. — 7A

The next 20-40 years—even the next 10 years—is going to be crucial to maintain a relationship with the caribou and the caribou need to be there to have a relationship. I think there is experience around the table. The classic argument the concerns from peoples saying they are wrong and I guess the one thing we want to try and do is work together and I see on the one hand we are very good at knowing where the caribou are and when they are available we can harvest them. Collectively its very difficult to reduce the harvest before there are really strong signals, before there are real problems. — John Nishi

Mahsi we did a lot of work in the last few days, we did hear each other and we talked about wanting to work together and goals we want to reach, because if we stay together things might happen because our previous elders have been pushing that. We need to help one another and do it together. — 7A

Healing the relationship between people and caribou and ultimately supporting the Bathurst caribou herd will begin when people work together, for example, as per the recommendations put forth by participants in the TK Workshop.

4. Outcomes: Recommendations

You have to have the concrete items on the table in order for an industry plan to take place so I think industry development has to be engaged at a pace that is compatible to the people and the land—what it can sustain so that land does not take a back seat.

— 6B

By looking at these other places, you learn from people. Friends of ours, you know, we try to help one another to make clear recommendations for the future. This is what we try. — 7A

We need to figure out something that everyone will agree on. Otherwise we will come out of this with nothing if we don't think of something that all the ministers will sign.

— 12A

Building on the themes shared throughout the workshop, participants put forth ten key recommendations outlined in the following section. These included:

1. Renew spiritual relationship with caribou
2. Carry out an on-the-land healing ceremony
3. Teach the youth
4. Curtail mineral exploration and development: how much is enough?
5. Protect key areas (e.g., calving grounds, caribou crossings, land bridges)
6. Increase on-the-land monitoring (i.e., community-based monitoring)
7. Support incentives to encourage people to reduce hunting caribou (e.g., alternate harvest, subsized meat)
8. Improve the historic range of the Bathurst Caribou
9. Review firefighting / burn policies
10. Repair / reclaim damaged habitat
11. Look to other successful examples
12. Trust / honour TK

1. Renew spiritual relationship with caribou

Workshop participants explained that their spiritual beliefs and laws governing their relationships with caribou are critical to the health of caribou and that the relationship must be healed if the caribou are to return. As part of this, people must also heal their relationship with the land before the caribou will return. Most importantly, people shared that healing required work through the heart and not just the head. Reinstating spiritual practices such as paying the land and water when traveling or working will help make people mindful of the spirits of the land and conscientious of their behavior.

In the olden days, the feeding the fire is always what our elders did. I know that not many of us know that and we need to teach the youth so they can keep it going in order for relations between caribou and ourselves to heal. — 6B

2. Carry out a healing ceremony

A key part of healing the relationship with caribou will be to hold healing ceremonies on the land. Workshop participants fleshed out what the healing ceremonies would involve, recommending the following:

- Such events should be open to all Aboriginal nations who reside within the range of the Bathurst caribou.
- The intent is to facilitate spiritual ceremonies based on the traditions of each group in a manner that not only respects difference but also allows each nation to carry out ceremonies and traditions that are sacred to them.
- Ceremonies such as fire feeding, fasting, dreaming, drumming and other traditions effective in establishing a renewed relationship with caribou would be supported.
- Such activities must include men and women, youth and elders and active harvesters. One objective is to inspire youth to commit to sharing this experience with other youth and a renewed spiritual relationship with caribou.
- These events would take place over a minimum of 4-6 days providing sufficient time for preparation and ceremony.
- Charter float plane transportation would facilitate the participation of elders who might not be physically able to travel by land or water.

There was debate about whether the healing ceremonies should be held together or separately by each Aboriginal group and whether they had to take place on the barrenlands or they could occur on the territory of each Aboriginal group:

It's a good idea but for my community, we don't have to go right to the range to speak to the caribou. We could likely do something on our own. We could go by boat and not by air-elders prefer travel by boat than plane. We might propose to do our own thing on the south side of the lake. — 6A

3. Teach the youth

Participants recognized youth as the future and the necessity of teaching them in the traditional ways. Meaningful time must be taken to teach them our history and worldview. They must learn through ceremony and by being on the land, practicing hands-on learning throughout all seasons. The recommendation to teach youth was presented with the following context:

- Our elders are passing so we need to be teachers.
- We must work together to teach our youth.
- Youth must learn by doing.
- There is concern for youth who don't know the traditional ways, set nets, etc.
- Teach youth how to take care of caribou.
- Work we do today is for generations tomorrow.

4. Curtail mineral exploration and development

Workshop participants recommended the mineral exploration and development be curtailed through limiting activity and/or staggering development and improving mining operations and/or practices. In addition, the question “how much is enough?” must be considered in light of cumulative effects. A limit to the number of mines operating at any given time must be set and this should be based on protecting caribou habitat as well as aiming to employ only northern residents. Exploration must also be curtailed.

They could have smaller mines for a longer time. Why take all the resources at once? There is a certain amount of wage economy that is needed but also to continue they're way of life, at one time and its slowly going to take over every community if we are not careful. 50 years from now there won't be anything left for anyone. — 6B

Enough is enough: How much development is enough to have a good life and live traditionally? I know they need diamonds, but do they need this many mines? It's too much. How much do you need? The people that are benefiting from the mines, I'd say at least 80% of those benefiting are not from here. I wouldn't trade my grannies dry meat for diamonds. — 6A

Workshop participants provided specific recommendations on how to improve mining operations to reduce their impact on the ecosystem:

The dust is the main cause and also the winter haul roads, they have to spread the trucks out a little more, right now they are what 5 minutes apart. — 6B

If there is a real recommendation coming out I would like to see something on the dust control, about the food and the dust. But what we can't do through traditional knowledge, we can't document the biochemical or what are the health effects. I would like to invite the industry or universities to meet with the Tłıchǫ government so we can set up a research program and then we can study that and the correlation. — 7C

5. Protect calving grounds, caribou crossings, land bridges and other key areas

One of the most discussed recommendations was the necessity of protecting key areas, especially the calving grounds of the Bathurst caribou. Protecting caribou crossings and land bridges was also seen as important. Specific action must be taken now to ensure that the Government of Nunavut does not open the calving grounds to exploration and development.

We have to fight for our animals and protect their habitat. We need to approach our leaders, it might take 10 years but we need to find a way of getting support for protecting habitat in the Nunavut area. — 3A

In addition to protecting key habitat from human activity, workshop participants recommended that important areas for caribou be protected from fire:

We identified migration corridors for ENR. A lot of the caribou range is burnt, but there are green strips here and there. And the caribou are following those narrow strips. Some of the strips go along ways near Manchester Lake. We identified them over the last 5-10 years. They have been putting effort into initial attack on some of the priority zones. We used to have remote camps to fight fires in caribou habitat. Looking at reviving the remote camps to protect the green areas out there now. — 6B

6. Increase on-the-land monitoring (i.e., community-based monitoring)

Workshop participants recommended that Aboriginal peoples increase on-the-land monitoring in order to better understand caribou well-being. There were two types of monitoring discussed. One was that monitoring be undertaken in each community of harvesting as well as on the winter road system in order to add to a sense of responsibility to follow the traditional self-management system when caribou are at risk. The second was to reinstate traditional monitoring systems where anyone traveling on the land reports their observations of the state of the environment to their community, this is especially critical to identifying cumulative effects.

We want to start a monitoring program, we have been working with hunters because they go out on the land and they come back and report their knowledge but the hunters in Wekweètì are not hunting anymore [because there are no caribou to hunt] so we still need to be on the land and get the information so we want to have a team of eight hunters and do monitoring based on traditional knowledge observing the caribou, the food, see how they are impacted by the planes and mines so its continuous research and it is continuous research from a traditional knowledge point of view. I feel very strongly the traditional knowledge is what's going to bring the real answers to the questions. — 7C

While monitoring was recommended, it must be done in combination with other actions:

We should have our own check point in Gamètì to see if they bring anything back but that's not the way it's set up right now. Care for the animals but it's not enough. Like me, if I go through this check point for lumber, these people that are working for us and the monitoring let's say for Bathurst how are we going to be watching it instead of teaching different ways? Some think different ways, we stop and tell them they shouldn't be killing these without a tag but "that's my right" that's the first thing we hear all the time. — 7A

7. Support incentives to encourage people to reduce hunting caribou (e.g., alternate harvest, subsidized meat)

Workshop participants recommended that incentives such as subsidizing alternate meat food sources be explored. Recognizing the extreme costs of buying meat for people who are dependent on caribou and subsidizing replacement meat from the land will help alleviate the pressure people feel to continue hunting caribou. Further, where possible, help people share meat between regions (help one another).

Caribou is a main food source for a lot of the outlining communities and it would be more accepted by the community if there were some form of subsidizing the cost of food that comes in on the plane, then it will give them more of a reason not to hunt caribou.

— 7B

8. Integrate more TK in understanding the historic range of the Bathurst Caribou

Workshop participants recognized that the defined range of the Bathurst caribou herd is very difficult to draw on a map, and recommended that the TK be considered in future initiatives to delineate the range. Another option is to consider a “fuzzy boundary” based on TK. Specifically, the TK of elders should contribute to updating the historic range of caribou and include the period that this occurred.

9. Review firefighting / burn policies

More in-depth work needs to be done to understand the traditional fire management practices to inform firefighting policies of the GNWT, according to workshop participants. Loss of caribou feeding areas through fire contributes to the survival pressures the caribou are now facing. The cost of losing a critical and staple food source must be taken into account when setting priorities.

10. Repair / reclaim damaged habitat

Participants recommended that damaged areas across the range of the Bathurst caribou herd be repaired and reclaimed, particularly areas that are key habitat where exploration or development has left behind materials.

There are a lot of abandoned exploration camps a lot of abandoned camps all over the land and we see that when we travel, a lot of old tent frames and oil drums and we flew over South side of Ekati and there is a small land bridge and there is big old abandoned exploration camps there preventing the caribou from going there and elders are always talking about those and that we need to map them out and we should be cleaning those spots up so that caribou can use them again. — 7C

11. Look to other successful examples

The workshop participants recommended that the BCRP Working Group look to other examples to guide the BCRP and how TK has been integrated.

Sometimes it's easier to look at things that have already worked so you don't have to reinvent the wheel. . . . If there are successful examples, the Porcupine, Caribou management plan which the GNWT is a signatory of, is a model to some other

jurisdictions but we seem to ignore it because it has specific ways of dealing with the population rise and drops. — 10A

12. Trust / honour TK

Finally, workshop participants recommended that TK be recognized, honoured, and trusted as fact to improve the well-being of the Bathurst caribou herd. The reliance on science alone has proven ineffective.

From what Tłı̄chq̄ are saying, caribou are not migrating where they used to. Same with our situation. . . . Industry has to look at that as fact and act on it, instead of trying to justify or defend and I think that would create a lot more trust and respect between the two groups if there was action done on the words of community on traditional knowledge. — 6A

5. Immediate Next Steps

In addition to the twelve recommendations above, the closing circle of the TK Workshop, several recommendations were presented as immediate next steps. These included the following directives:

- Lobby your organizations to protect the calving grounds
- Continue with TK programs in the NWT and NU
- Find funding to help caribou

Right now what I think is that we have to do more talking and more training and tell our younger people to protect this animal. — 7A

We have to come up with funding to recover the caribou. It will take a long time. — 3A

6. References

Dedats'eetsaa: Tłıchq Research & Training Institute. 2016. Ekwò zò gha dzô nats'êdè: "We Live Here For Caribou" Cumulative Impacts Study on the Bathurst Caribou. Tłıchq Traditional Knowledge and Land Use Study. Tłıchq Government.

Appendix A: Draft Workshop Agenda

BATHURST CARIBOU RANGE PLAN *Traditional Knowledge Workshop*

Date:	Place:
March 30, 2016	Commissioner's Room, Days Inn & Suites 4401 50th Avenue. Yellowknife
March 31, 2016	Commissioner's Room, Days Inn & Suites 4401 50th Avenue. Yellowknife

Purpose:

The TK Workshop will allow for a gathering of TK experts and members of the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan Working Group to consider the current relationship between people and caribou.

DAY 1 – March 30

Agenda Item	Start Time	End Time
<i>Arrival and Coffee</i>	08:00	08:30
Welcome and opening remarks	08:30	09:00
Background to the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan Considering the Relationship between People and Caribou – An Aboriginal Focus Questions to Consider: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How can the relationship between people and caribou be healed? Who needs to be involved? When? Where? 2. When we listen to caribou, what can we learn from them to better care for caribou today and in future generations? 3. What do the youth and younger generations need to understand to continue a healthy relationship with caribou? 4. What do we need in order to feel assured that our concerns and recommendations are understood? 	09:00	12:00
<i>Lunch Break – Catered</i>	12:00	13:00

Considering the Relationship between People and Caribou – An Aboriginal Focus (cont.)	13:00	16:00
---	-------	-------

DAY 2 – March 31, 2016

Agenda Item	Start Time	End Time
<i>Arrival and Coffee</i>	08:00	08:30
Opening and Introductions Recap of Day 1	08:30	09:00
Sharing Thoughts on People and Caribou within the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan Review of Recommendations	09:00	12:00
<i>Lunch Break – Catered</i>	12:00	13:00
Sharing Thoughts on People and Caribou within the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan (cont.) Reporting out from each Aboriginal Government and/or Organization on TK work to date: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Athabasca Denesuline • Kitikmeot Inuit Association • Łutsel K'e Dene First Nation • North Slave Métis Alliance • NWT Métis Nation • Tłı̨cho Government • Yellowknives Dene First Nation 	13:00	15:30
Next Steps and Closing	15:30	16:00

Appendix B: Workshop Presentation

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan
TK Workshop
Thoughts and Recommendations

March 31, 2016
Yellowknife, NT

Caribou . . .

It's a long story, never-ending story

Thoughts and Themes

Threats to Caribou

- Caribou have learned to fear people through their experiences with development; shift in the relationship (not happy to see people anymore)
- Roads are like veins, spreading out on the landscape;
- Climate change impacts are causing animals like moose, porcupine to move northwards; increases in disease such as hoof rot
- Caribou started moving away when communities, roads and development came

Threats to Caribou (cont'd)

- Predators are a piece of the puzzle too
- Calving grounds must be protected (e.g. from development, consider predator control)
- Forest fire and burning policy changes caribou habitat
- Beverley and Ahiak caribou stayed on the coast this year – away from people, industry and roads

Understanding Caribou

- Caribou are going to better places to eat
- Caribou are smart; they learn where good food is
- Caribou are like people: they don't like their food covered
- The caribou used to migrate everywhere
- Caribou are smart: they migrate south and see new animals so keep on going
- A caribou spirit can come back 2-3 times but only if it is respected

Understanding People

- Our bodies are for pure water and animals
- I speak better in my language
- When I sleep on the ground, it's like I can hear it breathing
- Out on the land, you are happy all of the time
- I can't count on caribou to be there to hunt anymore
- Habitat (range) and harvesting recommendations are linked

People and Caribou

- All animals can understand people; caribou can understand people
- Our way of life changes when caribou are gone (e.g. Fort Smith)
- We live on caribou: it's our food
- We are the guardians of caribou
- We need to hear the caribou again
- We know how the caribou used the land before people came

People and Caribou (cont'd)

- There are agreements between people and caribou
- Rebuilding caribou trails could help rebuild relationship with caribou
- We need to talk for the caribou
- Leave the caribou alone, some people say
- Caribou took such good care of us during hard times

Cultural Rules

- Caribou seek out hunters who speak from their heart
- Animals give themselves when they know they are being respected
- This is our yard, our country, our store; we live by two laws: respect and traditional laws
- Antlers left on the caribou path should never be disturbed

Youth

- Our elders are passing so we need to be teachers
- We must work together to teach our youth
- Youth must learn by doing
- Concern for youth who don't know the traditional ways, set nets, etc.
- Teach youth how to take care of caribou
- Work we do today is for generations tomorrow

Working Together

- Elders are more like sociologists and not caribou biologists as they see caribou as people; not objects
- We have a lot of resource people, elders, biologists so we have to work together, Now.
- Inuit and other Aboriginal hunters feel strongly about protecting calving areas (in NU)
- As Aboriginal people , we have no real say in our homeland
- We have to work together – NWT and Nunavut – to keep herds healthy

Recommendations

Renewing our spiritual relationship with Caribou

- Our spiritual beliefs and laws governing our relationship with Caribou are critical to the health of caribou
- We must heal our relationship with Caribou if we expect them to return to us. To do this we understand that we must also heal our relationship with the land before the caribou will return

- In doing this healing, we must work from our heart and not our heads
- **We recommend that a trip be planned to the barren lands to provide elders, youth and spiritual leaders with an opportunity to begin this healing**

- Such an event should be open to all Aboriginal nations who reside within the range of the Bathurst caribou
- The intent is to facilitate spiritual ceremonies based on the traditions of each group in a manner that not only respects difference but also allows each nation to carry out ceremonies and traditions that are sacred to them.
- Ceremonies such as fire feeding, fasting, dreaming, drumming and other traditions effective in establishing a renewed relationship with caribou would be supported.

- Such a trip must include men and women, youth and elders and active harvesters. One objective is to inspire youth to commit to sharing this experience with other youth and a renewed spiritual relationship with caribou
- The event would take place over a period of 4-6 days providing sufficient time for preparation and ceremony
- Charter float plane transportation would facilitate the participation of elders who might not be physically able to travel by land or water.

Historic Range of the Bathurst Caribou

- The traditional knowledge of elders should contribute to updating the historic range of Caribou and include the period (what years) that this occurred

Fire Fighting Policies

- More in-depth work needs to be done to understand the traditional fire management practices to inform fire fighting policies of the GNWT
- loss of caribou feeding areas through fire contributes to the survival pressures the caribou are now facing

Curtailing industrial development

- Many elders shared their beliefs and fears that too much exploration and mining within the caribou range would result in caribou population decline and loss long before mines were established. Their fears have come to pass and they believe that the cumulative effects have proven to be too much for the caribou. They feel that they have sacrificed too much: in exchange for 25 years of mining jobs that have not met expectations, they have lost their major food source that has sustained them for thousands of years.
- **How much is enough** to have a good life and live traditionally? **How much is too much?**

On the land monitoring a good model

- Monitoring in each community of harvesting as well as on the winter road system (check points?) should be increased. This will add to a sense of responsibility to follow the traditional self management system when our caribou are at risk.
- Collect harvest info/data from everybody, everywhere.

Support incentives to encourage people to stop hunting caribou

- Incentives such as subsidizing alternate meat food sources should be explored. Recognizing the extreme costs of buying meat for people who are dependent on caribou and subsidizing replacement meat will help alleviate the pressure people feel to continue hunting caribou.
- Where possible, help people share meat between regions (help one another)

Appendix C: Workshop Evaluation Data

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan TK Workshop, March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT

Question	Very Good	Good	Neither Good nor Poor	Poor	Very Poor	Total Responses	Comments
How would you rate the meeting for working together?	5	5				10	
How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?	3	3	3			9	
How would you rate the workshop for respect among participants?	4	6				10	
How would you rate the workshop for coming up with observations and recommendations?	2	6	1			9	
How would you rate the camp for documentation of Traditional Knowledge?	3	2	2	1		8	Recording is good, but how TK was presented Day 2 did not reflect wholly the discussion on Day 1.
How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?	2	4	3			9	
How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?	5	4				9	

Question	Too much	Enough	Too little	Total Responses	Comments
How would you rate the length of the workshop?	2	7	1	10	
How would you rate the workshop for communications among participants?		8		8	

Response Summary to Open Questions

What were the strengths of the workshop?
 What did you enjoy about the workshop?

Aboriginal groups working together to protect the caribou and habitat. Working together. Food. Lots of issues, etc. Translation provided. Next time would bring Dene speaking Elder to participate. I like it so much! People give their concerns on caribou.

How could the workshop be improved?

Bring industry people to the workshops with the Aboriginal people of their homelands. More input from other organizations and other departments (government). Put strong actions to improve the issue. No clear direction on how info will be used in Bathurst Caribou Range Plan. Yes! Two days was enough time for now, but we need to meet again to verify, add and follow up. Perhaps other participants could join after we finish recommendations. Smaller group more comfortable for TK holders. Need better translating for elders.

Appendix D: Workshop Evaluation Forms

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsi! Masil!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

Aboriginal groups working together to protect
the caribou and habitat

11. How could the workshop be improved?

Bring industry people to the workshops
with the aboriginal people of their home lands.

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil! Masi!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

11. How could the workshop be improved?

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil Masil

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

Working together.

11. How could the workshop be improved?

More input from other organization. Also other departments. (Government)

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsi! Masi!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

11. How could the workshop be improved?

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil! Masi!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

Good. lots of ideas / issues etc.

11. How could the workshop be improved?

*Put strong Action to improve
the issues.*

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil! Masil!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor *Recording is good, but how TK was presented Day 2 did not reflect wholly the discussion on Day 1.*
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

- translation provided. Next time would bring Dene speaking Elders to participate.

11. How could the workshop be improved?

No clear direction on how info will be used in Bathurst Range Plan.

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil Masi!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

11. How could the workshop be improved?

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil Masil

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

I like it so much?

11. How could the workshop be improved?

~~yes~~ ?

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsil! Masil!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

11. How could the workshop be improved?

- two days was enough time for now. But we need
to meet again to verify, add, follow up
- perhaps other participants could join after we finished
recommendations. Smaller group more comfortable for TK holders

Bathurst Caribou Range Plan: TK Workshop Evaluation Form

Thank you for participating in the Traditional Knowledge Workshop for the Bathurst Caribou Range Plan on March 30-31, 2016 in Yellowknife, NT. We hope you enjoyed this gathering. We appreciate your honest and constructive feedback on your experience. Your responses will help us improve future workshops. Quana! Mahsi! Masi!

1. How would you rate the meeting for working together?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

2. How would you rate the workshop for considering the relationship between people and caribou?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

3. How would you rate the opportunities for you to communications among participants?

- Too many opportunities
- Enough opportunities
- Too few opportunities

4. How would you rate the respect among participants?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

5. How would you rate the coming up with observations and recommendations?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

6. How would you rate the documentation of Traditional Knowledge?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

7. How would you rate the length of the workshop?

- Too much time
- Enough time
- Too little time

8. How would you rate the venue and food for the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

9. How would you rate the facilitation of the workshop?

- Very good
- Good
- Neither good nor poor
- Poor
- Very Poor

10. What were the strengths of the workshop? What did you enjoy about the workshop?

People give their concerns on
carbon

11. How could the workshop be improved?

need better translating for elders