# UNCOVERING THE REALITIES OF PROSTITUTES AND THEIR CHILDREN IN A CROSS NATIONAL COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN INDIA AND THE U.S.

by

Hena John-Fisk

A dissertation submitted to the faculty of
The University of Utah
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

College of Social Work

The University of Utah

August 2013

Copyright © Hena John-Fisk 2013

All Rights Reserved

# The University of Utah Graduate School

# STATEMENT OF DISSERTATION APPROVAL

The dissertation of	Hena John-Fisk		
has been approved by the following supervisor	ory committee members:		
Caren Frost	, Chair	4/27/12 Date Approved	
L. Henry Liese	, Member	4/27/12	
David S. Derezotes	, Member	A/27/12 Date Approved	
Patrick T. Panos	, Member	4/27/12	
David Hawkins	, Member	Date Approved  4/27/12  Date Approved	
and by Jannah Mather the Department of College of Social Work		, Dean of	

and by Donna M. White, Interim Dean of The Graduate School.

### **ABSTRACT**

This qualitative study examines the needs and challenges of prostitutes and their children. A review of research regarding prostitutes indicates that the needs and experiences of prostitutes, their children, and stakeholders who provide services to this population have been neglected. The first part of the study looks at the challenges prostitutes face trying to be successful mothers. The study was conducted in the U.S. and India. The findings of this study reveal that these women face difficulties in their daily lives. Due to the distinct differences between the interventions and policies in both countries, each group shares a different relationship with their children. The findings of the study strongly advocate for joint programs for prostitutes and their children to help ensure them all a better future. The second part of the study was conducted with children of prostitutes who live with their mothers in red light areas of Mumbai, India. The participants discussed the experiences and challenges they face in their daily lives as children of prostitutes, their relationships with their mothers, and support programs needed for a better life. All of the child participants conveyed that they did not want to be separated from their mothers. The children had good relationships with their mothers and wanted to support their mothers as they aged. The final part of the study examines challenges stakeholders encounter while providing services to prostitutes and their children. The stakeholders also shared their views about the difficulties that children of prostitutes and their mothers face. The stakeholders expressed what support they thought

would be helpful for this group. This study is presented in the form of three distinct scholarly manuscripts. Each of the manuscripts has its own research questions and findings that contribute to the overall research agenda in unique ways. Each study makes its own specific recommendations for social work policy, practice, and research.

Together, the three manuscripts add to our knowledge about prostitutes as mothers, as well as defining their children's needs and challenges.

For the women and children of the red light area – for letting me share their stories My mother, who has always been my inspiration and strength

Thank you all for being in my life

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTR	RACT	iii
ACKNO	OWLEDGMENTS	ix
Chapter	-	
1. II	NTRODUCTION	1
	Statement of Problem	1
	Purpose of the Study	2
	Literature Review	4
	Review of Policy	13
	Theoretical Framwork	22
	Research Design	25
	Methods of the Study	29
	Data Analysis	30
	Manucripts	32
	References	37
	COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MOTHERING AMONG PROSTITUTES IN THE U.S. AND INDIA	44
	Abstract	44
	Introduction	45
	Theoretical Framwork	
	Literature Review.	49
	Methods	56
	Findings	59
	Discussion	70
	Social Work Policy and Implications	73
	Limitations	
	Conclusion	74
	References	76
	UNDERSTANDING THE VOICES OF CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTES	
	FROM MUMBAI, INDIA	80
	Abstract	80

Introduction	81
Literature Review	81
Theoretical Framework	84
Methods	86
Findings	
Discussion	
Limitations	
Conclusion.	
References.	
4. UNCOVERING THE LIVES OF CHILDREN OF PROST	ITUTES THROUGH
EYES OF STAKEHOLDERS IN MUMBAI, INDIA	108
Abstract	108
Introduction	109
Literature Review	110
Theoretical Framework	112
Methods	115
Findings	
Discussion	
Social Work Policy, Research, and Implications	
Limitations	
Conclusion.	
References	
5. CONCLUSION	140
Disseration Summary	140
Conclusion of Overall Research	
Social Work Policy Implications	
Strengths and Limitations of the Dissertation Studies	
Future Research	
References	
Appendices	
A. INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR PROSTITUTES	154
B. INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR CHILDREN	157
B. INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR CHILDREN	13/
C. INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR STAKEHOLDER	159
D. CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH (PROSTITUTES IN THE U.S.)	161
	101
E. CONSENT TO PARTCIPATE IN RESEARCH	

	(PROSTITUTES IN INDIA)	165
F. 1	PARENTAL PERMISSION DOCUMENT	169
	ASSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN A STUDY (CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTES)	173
Н.	CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH (STAKEHOLDERS)	176

# **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Thank you Almighty God for all the grace and blessings in my life. I am humbled by the unending support so many people in my life have given me to make this dissertation possible. I am grateful for the financial support from the College of Social Work, Dean Jannah Mather, and the JACL's Rev. H. John Yamashita family scholarship. I want to thank the participants for allowing to me share their stories, dreams, fears, and ideas. Thank you to my committee for your encouragement, suggestions, and important critiques. My Chair, Dr. Caren Frost, deserves a special thank you for not only supporting me with her constant encouragement, guidance, and financial support for my research, but for also supporting me when I was sick. I would like to extend my gratitude to Dr. David Hawkins for always being there for me.

I would also like to thank all of the faculty and staff of the College of Social Work, especially Dr. Emma Gross, Dr. Hank Liese, Dr. Scott Boyle, Delva Hommes, Wanda Brown, and Candace Minchey for their encouragement and support. I would also like to thank Dr. Edward Buendia, Dr. Frank Margonis, and Dr. Jeanette Misaka from the College of Education for all of their support. I want to especially thank my friends and colleagues Marcella Hurtado, Lakhvinder Maan, Sharvari Karandikar-Chheda, Augustina Naami, Miseong Kim, Dena Ned, Irene Ota, and Henry Poduthas for their constant encouragement during this doctoral program. I would like to extend my gratitude to Abhigya Mookherjee, Roxan Bagban, Diana Peters Rawat, Delphine Mur, Dan Gebhardt,

and Jennifer Julander for their help during my research. My research would be incomplete without the generosity of the following families: Mangat-Grewal, Peter-Rawat, Marques, Thorat, and Radha Rokhe for providing me a home during my research in India. I would like to thank Priti Patkar and her staff for all of their support. I would also like to extend my gratitude to Dianne Cunningham for being a wonderful mentor. Lastly, my deepest gratitude goes to my mother Chhaya John, who has never once wavered from her unconditional love and support. I would like to thank my extended family, especially great-grandma Hazel Houchard for her blessing, Guy, Lisa, Chieko, and Fred Fisk, Keith and Juan Humbert, and Jana, Chaz, and Charlie Cassel for all providing wonderful vacations, which let me take a break from my work and motivated me to finish my dissertation. This dissertation would not have been complete without you being in my life. I would also like to extend my gratitude to all my friends and family whose names I might not have mentioned here. Thank you all—from the bottom of my heart.

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

# Statement of the Problem

Prostitution, including the exchange of sex or sexual activity for food, money, drugs, or other commodities (Dalla, 2000), is an institution linked to a number of social problems, such as the transmission of HIV/AIDS, increased drug use, increased violence, and more. There has been much research about understanding the risks, antecedents, causes, solutions, and prevalence of prostitution (Hope, 2007; Hughes, 2004; Hughes, 2005; Potter, Martin, & Romans, 1999; Rankin, 2002; Raymond, Hughes, & Gomez, 2001; Sanders, 2004; Valandra, 2007; Weiner, 1996); however, there is a lack of research about the needs and risks that children of prostitutes face or what support prostitutes need to be successful mothers. Previous research found three important concerns associated with prostitutes and their children. First, prostitutes often remain in the sex trade in order to support their children financially (Dalla 2000). Second, women who work in prostitution and who lose custody of their children as a result often report that this fuels their drug use; prostitution then becomes a means to support their habits (Hope, 2007). Third, children of prostitutes are victimized in a multitude of ways, including neglect, malnutrition or abandonment, loss of shelter, and an increased risk of entering prostitution (Dalla, 2000). In this research, I used the lens of Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory to further understand the social issues of prostitutes

and their children in Denver, Colorado and Mumbai, India.

# Purpose of the Study

Previous research regarding prostitution has considered only the risks, antecedents, and prevalence of prostitution (Hope, 2007; Hughes, 2004; Hughes, 2005; Potter, Martin, & Romans, 1999; Rankin, 2002; Sanders, 2004; Valandra, 2007; Weiner, 1996) or evaluated the impact of diversion programs (Wahab & Davis, 2004). These studies did not examine the needs of children of prostitutes or what supports prostitutes need to be successful mothers. The purpose of this study is to understand the needs and experiences of prostitutes and their children.

In India following the outbreak of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in 1981, research on prostitution and trafficking became increasingly important. As a result, most of the studies concerning the sex industry in India have been conducted on the topic of HIV/AIDS and the prevention and spread of HIV infection. These past studies can be broadly divided into two areas. The first area of study addresses HIV risks for prostitutes (Marten, 2005; Pauw & Brener 2003; Wojciki & Malala, 2001). These studies have examined the correlation between violence and HIV risk among prostitutes. The second category involving gender-based violence among prostitutes (Dalla & Kennedy, 2003; El-Bassel, Witte, Wada, Gilbert and Wallace, 2001; Karandikar & Prospero, 2008; Monto, 2004; Raphael & Shapiro, 2004; Simons & Whitbeck, 1991; Wechsberg & Lam, 2005) has investigated the forms and severity of violence among prostitutes, street vs. brothel-based prostitution, and substance abuse. In both of these categories, studies have not considered the experiences and needs of prostitutes and their children, nor have they

explored the types of support the children of prostitutes and their mothers need to overcome their current situations. Present legislation in both the U.S. and India does not address the needs of prostitutes and their children such as education, housing, job training, or health care. Children face constant stigmatization and discrimination due to their mother's profession.

The importance of this study is twofold. First, the literature reveals a lack of empirical study about the needs of prostitutes and their children. Furthermore, there is also a gap in research on stakeholder views of the services they need to help this group as well as the challenges they face in providing services. My prior work with prostitutes in India has highlighted the number of problems these children face, increasing my interest in this research. In addition, I wanted to understand the experiences and needs of this population here in the U.S. where the services for prostitutes are limited. Last, the findings from the U.S. study will be compared with the Indian study to understand and evaluate the needs children of prostitutes and prostitutes in a more in-depth manner.

The term prostitution is politically loaded (Kesler, 2002; Overall, 1992; Pheterson, 1990) and has changed over the time. Moreover, many prefer to use other terms to discuss individuals who work in the industry, including commercial sex workers, whores, call girls, etc. For this paper, I will use the term "prostitute," a term that is distinguishable from "sex worker" because sex work is a broad category that might include those employed in phone sex, pornography, stripping, and poll dancing (Hope, 2007). Also, in both the U.S. and India, "prostitutes" is the term used in all prostitution-related laws. Using a legal term will help in the comparison of the problems of children of prostitutes.

## Literature Review

# Prostitution

According to prostitution laws in Colorado, "prostitution means any person who performs, offers or agrees to perform any act of sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, masturbation, or anal intercourse with any person not their spouse in exchange for money or other things of value" (ProCon.org, 2008). Similarly, in the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act of India (PITA) in 1986, prostitution "means the sexual exploitation or abuse of persons for commercial purposes, and the expression prostitute shall be construed accordingly." Based on these definitions, prostitution is considered illegal in both the U.S. and India but is still a concern for lawmakers and police. Although it is illegal, prostitution continues to be widely practiced in both countries. The Indian Constitution and U.S. federal and state laws prohibit any forms of trafficking and prostitution (Hughes, 2004; Nair, 2005). Prostitution is illegal in the U.S. except for in 11 rural counties in Nevada (ProCon.org, 2009). The number of prostitutes in the U.S. is unknown due to a lack of reliable source data. Despite law enforcement efforts to curb its spread, as well as general social disapproval, prostitution has maintained a persistent (if not conspicuous) place in the U.S. In 1992, the U.S. ranked tenth in the world in the arrests of prostitutes (McClanahah, McLelland, Abram, & Teplin, 1999).

In India, prostitution is part of a larger network of criminal activity and is a multi-million dollar business (Karandikar, 2008; Menen, 2007). Even though prostitution is illegal in India, the country still has Asia's largest red light district called Kamathipura (Karandikar, 2008; Menen, 2007). The prevalence of prostitution cannot be accurately described because the number of prostitutes involved in prostitution changes everyday.

According to UNAIDS' country report, there are 1.26 million female prostitutes in India (UNAIDS, 2010). The BBC news in 2006 reported that the number of prostitutes in India has risen by 50% in less than a decade. Mumbai has over 125,000 prostitutes; the majority of them come from the states of Nepal, West Bengal, Orissa, Bihar, Andhra Pradesh, and Karnataka (Ghosh, 1996; Karandikar, 2008). Additionally, there are 5.4 million children of prostitutes in India, most of whom live with their mothers in the red light area (NHRC, 2008).

# Causes of Prostitution

The reasons women have entered prostitution have varied over the last 150 years. There have been multiple studies devoted to this subject (Benjamin & Masters, 1964; Bullough & Bullough, 1978; Esselstyn, 1968; James, 1980, 1976; & Silbert & Pines, 1982). Two important factors that can help explain why certain women become prostitutes are susceptibility and exposure. Susceptibility refers to certain psychological characteristics, such as "a feeling of complete worthlessness" (Bess & Janus, 1976), "alienation" (Brown, 1979), or "self–abasement" (Bullough, 1965). These characteristics are believed to predispose certain women to become prostitutes (Jackman, O'Toole, & Geis, 1963). These personality attributes, when coupled with personal crisis (Maerov, 1965), traumatic events such as incest or rape (James, 1976), serious deprivation, physical and sexual abuse, overindulgence, crime, violence, substance abuse, or emotional problems (Silbert & Pines, 1982) make some women particularly vulnerable to prostitution.

In a recent study, Hughes (2004) discussed four reasons why prostitution happens. First, prostitution is caused due to the demands for sex by men. Second, women

are actively recruited by traffickers, pimps, brothel owners, organized crime members, and corrupt officials. Third, states tolerating or legalizing prostitution contribute to the demand for prostitution. And fourth, there is cultural impact, particularly from the mass media, that plays a major role in normalizing prostitution by portraying prostitution as a glamorous way to make a great deal of money quickly and easily (Hughes, 2004). In both the U.S. and India, women and children come into the flesh trade due to a constellation of these reasons.

Sixty percent of female prostitutes in the U.S. are of international origin, while the remaining 40% are native citizens (Raymond, Hughes, & Gomes, 2001). Many prostitutes are recruited into prostitution through organized businesses and crime networks, such as escort services, bars, brothels, clubs, "biker gangs," and the mafia (Raymond et al., 2001). In addition, U.S. servicemen have also been involved in recruiting Asian women, especially from Korea, Vietnam, and Japan, into the sex industry in the U.S. Husbands and boyfriends have acted as pimps for some of these international (20%) and U.S. (28%) women (Raymond et al., 2001).

In India, women are trafficked into the flesh trade from all parts of the country (HAQ, 2001). Many minors also are forced into this flesh trade, especially the children of prostitutes who have grown up in brothels. Trafficking happens in a very organized manner with the sole objective of selling women to brothel keepers. The women, who become the victims of the sex trade, are mostly poor, unemployed, and lacking in social and economic support (Joardar, 1984; Mukerjee & Das, 1996). These circumstances make it easy for a trafficker to lure young women to cities with the promise of a job and better livelihood. Furthermore, many traffickers exploit family connections and

acquaintances to target young women for the sex trade (Raymond et.al, 2001).

The mere vulnerability of these marginalized and disadvantaged groups renders them increasingly more amenable to harm (Sanghera, 2002). Once induced or forced into the sex trade, women are then brought to a main city like Kolkata, Mumbai, Delhi, or other metropolitan areas (Nair, 2006). In most cases, traffickers then take the women or minors to the brothels where they can sell them for more than \$200 U.S. Afterwards, the women are treated as the sole commodity of the brothel keepers and are forced to solicit. A woman who arrives at a brothel this way is then bound to earn the money to pay back the brothel keeper the price paid to the trafficker (Patkar, 2001). The challenges endured by prostitution mentioned earlier leads to a vicious cycle of poverty and slavery.

# Types of Prostitutes

According to Harcourt and Donovan (2004), there are two types of prostitution based on how service is provided, which are "direct" and "indirect" forms of prostitution. Types of "direct" prostitution are street, bar, brothel, escort, private, window or doorway, and transport, to mention a few (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004). Street prostitutes do not have a fixed place to solicit (Joardar, 1964). Street prostitution is widespread in the United States, Europe, United Kingdom, Australia, Eastern Europe, Southeast Asia, Latin America, and in some parts of Africa (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004). In street prostitution, women solicit to customers who are passing on foot or in automobiles (Joardar, 1984). Services are performed in customers' cars, trucks, in nearby hotels, alleys, doorways, and so on. These women typically charge less compared to other types of prostitutes. This form of prostitution is considered undesirable and dangerous due to the violence involved in it (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004). On average, these prostitutes have the least bargaining

leverage over condom use and choice of sexual practices, and they have the highest risk of harm from customers or others (Law Library, 2009). Due to their visibility, these women face higher risks of arrest and are also associated with drugs, diminished neighborhood property values, and other criminal activities (Law Library, 2009).

In the bar, club, karaoke bar, and hotel type of prostitution, prostitutes visit places where client are easily available, and solicit to customers of those bars, clubs, and hotels (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004). Services may be provided in the club or bar itself, or in a hotel room rented by either the prostitute or the customer. The prostitute's income varies according to the prestige and price range of the bar, hotel, or establishment and its client's wealth. These women receive a share of the money they charge customers, and their share can vary based on the percentage of fees demanded by the manager of the club or employee(s) for referrals or protection. The prostitute's risk of harm and arrest are low to moderate as long as the collaborative relationship with the establishment is maintained and the prostitute does not venture into unfamiliar territory (Law Library, 2009).

Another type of direct prostitution is brothel prostitution, which is the most common types of prostitution in Nevada, Australia, New Zealand, Southeast Asia, Europe, Latin America, and India. According to the Indian Immoral Traffic Prevention Act of 1956, a "brothel" "includes any house, room, conveyance or place, or any portion of any house, room, conveyance or place, which is used for purposes of sexual exploitation or abuse for the gain of another person or for the mutual gain of two or more prostitutes" (p. 1). In India, this kind of prostitution is illegal, whereas in the U.S., this is the only legal form of prostitution and hence less risky for police violence. Conversely, in India, this form of prostitution is more coercive and violent because brothel keepers have

total control of the women and their money. These women face a great deal of violence from the brothel keeper, pimps, and customers, and are thus very vulnerable and do not have any say on the price, kind of service, or condom use.

Escort prostitution is another kind of "direct" prostitution. In this type, prostitutes receive a phone call, text, or email by an agent. This is different from other forms of direct prostitution like street walking and is not bound to a particular location (Law Library, 2009). Escorts "rely upon referral and screening either by an agent, by a restricted circle of other prostitutes in the same market, or by familiar clients" (Law Library, 2009). The prices in this type of prostitution are high and they can influence sexual acts and condom use. Since the clients are often affluent and intermediaries are used, there is a lower risk of arrest and violence (Law Library, 2009).

The second type of prostitution is "indirect." This kind of "prostitution is not always the sole of primary source of income for individuals" (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004, p. 203). Some "indirect" forms of prostitution are "bondage and discipline, [sexual fantasy through role play] lap dancing, massage...[which] involve little or no genital contact and therefore have little sexual health risk" (Harcourt & Donovan, 2004, p. 203).

# **Effects of Prostitution**

Prostitution is associated with an increased risk of rape, assault, and sexually transmitted diseases, just to mention a few issues. In a study of 294 female street-based prostitutes in Miami, Florida, 76% reported experiencing violence in the previous 90 days (Kutz, Surratt, Inciardi, & Kiley, 2004). In addition to these problems, women in prostitution are often single mothers who have borne children from different sexual partners (Dalla, 2006). The average number of children per mother is 2.4 (Dalla, 2000;

Weiner, 1996). Additionally, because prostitution is illegal in the U.S., these women are at greater risk of facing interruption or termination of parental rights, denial of social services, and expulsion from family support services (Weiner, 1996). Drug use and legal issues also lead many women to abandon their children. Studies by Dalla (2000, 2001, 2004, and 2006) found that of 105 children who had mothers in prostitution, fewer than 20 remained in the care of their mothers. In a separate study, Weiner (1996) found that only 19% of 1,963 prostitute participants retained custody of their children. Thus, it is important to understand the struggle of these women and children caused by this type of abandonment. The current detention and foster care programs do not address the needs of this population; hence, there is a need to know what kind of services will help this group.

Women who are trafficked into prostitution in India face similar challenges upon arrival at the brothel. Apart from the stress of being trafficked (Saarthak, 2002), these women often face the daunting task of having to raise their children within the context of an unfamiliar environment (Pardeshi & Bhattacharya, 2006). The child of a prostitute faces extraordinary danger; female children face difficult prospects and are expected to enter the trade like their mothers, while males are expected to help in the trade.

Moreover, the brothel keeper has vested interests in maintaining this oppressive structure, because it results in the perseverance of the flesh trade and the continuation of future sources of income. Though there are no empirical studies about the oppressive structure created by brothel keepers/madams, this gap in the literature can be filled by future research.

One common result of the brothel keeper's oppressive structure is that the children of prostitutes often struggle to meet their basic needs. Frequently, these children

do not have adequate food, safe shelter, education, and clothing. Furthermore, brothel keepers take advantage of this deprivation, commonly using children to pressure their mothers into providing sexual acts to customers without condoms or to work extra hours so that the brothel keeper can make more money. This typical pattern is used in red light areas of Kamathipura and Falkland Road, two neighboring red light areas in Mumbai, India.

The red light district itself also presents prostitutes and their children with a series of challenges. These areas, which are full of criminal activities such as drug trafficking and use, gambling, and gang violence, create a dangerous environment for women and children. As a result, these districts are not safe for a child's growth and development. There is continuous fear among mothers that their children either will become the victims of sexual exploitation or be forced into the trade.

Sanitary conditions are also a concern in these areas, and poor environmental health standards have been known to increase health hazards for children, which in turn can put children's development at risk. Not surprisingly, these districts are not hygienic places to live, and women and children who reside in these areas are at risk for any number of infectious diseases, including malaria, typhoid, hepatitis, and other environmentally related maladies. Past studies have shown that environmental hazards have adverse effects on children's development (Carpenter et al., 2000; Suk, 2002; Wegman, 1999). Hence, it is important to look at what challenges these children face and what support is necessary for them to overcome these situations.

In addition to environmental hazards, these women and children are at risk of infection from various sexually transmitted diseases, such as HIV/AIDS, gonorrhea, and

syphilis. Prostitutes in India are at an especially high risk of contracting HIV/AIDS. Seventy percent of prostitutes in Kamathipura are estimated to be HIV positive (Avert, 2006), and the incidence of any sexually transmitted infection is an estimated 90% (Legislative Assembly Bill VII, as cited in Gangoli, 2006). These infections put a prostitute's ability to care for her children in serious jeopardy.

The lack of family structure in the red light district puts complete responsibility on the prostitute to provide for her children. In the red light area, there is an absence of a traditional family structure. Most children do not know their biological fathers, so they call the dominant male in their mother's life father. This male usually is the mother's lover, favorite customer, pimp, or trafficker. The male does not take any responsibility for the child or the mother. This person often abuses the prostitute physically, emotionally, and sexually (McElroy, 1998) and even takes her earnings (Karandikar & Prospero, 2008). In such a situation, the only family a prostitute may have is her children, who are also completely dependent on her.

The problems faced by prostitutes are similar to those faced by other single working mothers. In a study by Rani (2006), single parents who struggle for economic stability usually have to spend more time at work, which leaves their children unattended most of the time. In a similar way, prostitutes often must work from sunset to sunrise, leaving their children unattended during the night, which makes their children more vulnerable to the dangerous environment of the red light area. During the night when their mothers are at work, children either wander in the community or sleep where their mothers are having sex with a client. In addition to the psychological problems this can create, many children also must battle malnutrition resulting from poor diet because most

of the time, they do not have enough to eat or their mothers do not have the time or the money to provide them with food. Many prostitutes have to give 50% of their earnings to the brothel keepers and pimps can take up to 30% as well (Patkar, 2006). Thus, a prostitute may be allowed to keep about 20% of her earnings. With this 20%, she has to take care of her child, buy food and medication, and pay rent. The money is not sufficient for all these needs. In these circumstances, women often must work extra hours to make more money in order to provide for the needs of their children. These needs of prostitutes and their children have not been addressed by legislation either in India or the U.S. In the following sections, I will look at the history of prostitution reform in the U.S., and the history of prostitution in India to set a broader context for understanding the needs of these women and their children.

# Review of Policy Responses

# History of Prostitution Laws in the U.S.

In the U.S., the aid that service providers and lawmakers have made available to women in prostitution has changed based on institutional ideas concerning how to best help these women. Rarely have the opinions of prostitutes been consulted. Legislators, social reformers, and public opinion have generally labeled prostitution as a social evil, leading to the creation of vice-crusades to stamp out brothels, red light districts, and the trafficking of women. Policy makers saw prostitutes as a cause of venereal infection who corrupted young men and threatened the family. The sale of liquor, gambling, drugs, and dance halls and disorderly premises also were often associated with prostitution (Esselstyn, 1964). In the following section, I will examine how the policies and services changed over the course of time based on changes in opinion/attitude regarding U.S.

prostitutes.

During the mid-1800s, many social reformers viewed prostitutes as victims and set themselves to the task of controlling male sexual aggression and protecting women who lost their "virtue" (Boyer, 1978; Boyer & James, 1983; Rothman, 1978). Early research shows that women during this period were often seen as victims of exploitation. In response, the U.S. Congress passed the Mann Act of 1910, which made it a felony to transport women across state lines for prostitution and debauchery (Sloan & Wahab, 2000). Nevertheless, institutional protection was often a double-edged sword, and many women during this period were also forced to endure compulsory physical exams. Prostitutes were held responsible for transmission of disease and the government made medical examination mandatory for any woman working as a prostitute. Many feminist and other purity reformers argued against this law and viewed it as a form of sexual assault (Hobson, 1987).

During the early 1920s, prostitutes were seen as "fallen women" who, due to personality problems, joined sex work. Service providers believed that these personality issues could only be resolved through casework and therapy (Boyer, 1978). Service providers also adopted a colonial approach to solve the problems of prostitution. In the 1950s, the discourse on prostitution was shaped largely by psychiatrists, who thought that the cause of prostitution could be traced back to the "neurotic," "frigid," and/or "masochistic," tendencies of individual women (Hobson, 1987). These assumptions considered personality problems to be the source of the behaviors; therefore, researchers ignored the real reasons women were entering prostitution. The children of prostitutes and their needs were also ignored.

It was in the late 1970s that prostitution was finally viewed through the lens of the economic situation. Researchers began to postulate that women's economic conditions might be motivating them to engage in sex work (Bullough & Bullough, 1987).

However, there were no services designed at the time on the basis of this view. In fact, some policies, in which prostitutes were considered criminals, seemed to demonstrate a retreat to earlier, less progressive attitudes (Wynter, 1987). These policies viewed prostitutes as criminals and not as victims of various circumstances such as serious deprivation, physical and sexual abuse, crime, violence, substance abuse, and emotional problems (Silbert & Pines, 1982). In recent years, the detention programs that have been developed to prevent prostitution have not been so different from those prevalent during the 1900s, when women's personalities were considered the cause of prostitution. All of these programs have been developed and deployed based on the view of policy makers rather than the actual needs of the prostitutes.

# History of Prostitution in India

The history of prostitution in India dates back to the Indus Valley civilization, which existed around 3000 B.C. Due to the mysterious extinction of this civilization, there are no available written documents to prove the existence of prostitution during this period, but excavations have unearthed a statue of a bronze dancing girl from this era. This statue featured a naked woman wearing heavy jewelry on her neck and one arm, standing in a provocative posture, with one arm on her hip and one leg half bent. Referring to this bronze figurine, Bashan said "...this dancing girl is a representative of temple dancers and prostitutes, such as existed in contemporary Middle Eastern Civilization and were an important feature in later Hindu culture, but cannot be proved"

(Singh, 1997, p. 11). The Vedic Age followed this undocumented era of prostitution.

The Vedas, authors of one of the holy books of Hindu, referred to prostitution as one of their cultures' organized and established institutions. Even in Indian mythology, there are many references to high-class prostitution in the form of *Apsaras*, which are demigods, acting as prostitutes; some of their names are Menaka, Rambha, Urvashi, and Thilothamma (Jaishankar & Haldar, 2008). These *Apsaras* were revered for their perfect form, and possessed unsurpassed beauty and feminine charms. According to legend, prostitutes were highly trained in music and dance, and entertained divinities and their guests in the court of Lord Indira, one of the Hindu Gods (Joardar, 1984).

The rulers of the Aryan dynasty of India, which followed the Indus Valley and Vedic Civilization, sought to emulate the system of the Vedic celestial court and developed a system of guest prostitution (Joardar, 1984). As its name suggests, this type of prostitution involves providing guests of the royal court with prostitutes. As such, prostitutes became common during the reign of the two ancient rulers, Pandavas and Kauravas. Prostitutes were an important part of the royal court and having concubines was common even among aristocrats. Even the famous ruler and founder of the Mayuran Dynasty (322-185 B.C.), Chandra Gupta Mayura, appointed a superintendent for prostitutes called *Ganikasdyasha*. In order to regulate the practice, *Kautilya*, the prime minister of the Mauryan dynasty, created a code of conduct for prostitutes in his *Arthasasthra* (Singh, 1997). This period effectively normalized prostitution as a part of Indian court life.

Other than the *Arthasasthra*, there are many ancient literatures that discuss prostitution. The famous book *Kama Sutra*, written by Vatsyayan, a noted Indian sage of

the Third Century B.C., devotes a number of passages to prostitutes and their way of life. In the *Rig Veda*, secular prostitution is commonly discussed (Singh, 1997). Another ancient scholar, Dandin, gives readers an account of prostitutes in his two classic works *Dasa Kumara Charita* (Adventure of Ten Princes) and *Mrichchha Katika* (Clay Cart) (Singh, 1997). Even Kalidas, a famous poet of the ancient era, discussed prostitutes in his *Meghadhoot* (Jordan, 1987). These are some of the ancient scholarly works that provide us with details about the history of prostitution in India. During these eras, religious practices frequently promoted prostitution as well.

In the famous Mahakala temple of Ujjain, holy prostitutes were also commonly seen. The girls of the temple were offered for service of God and their religion. In South India, they were known as *Devadasi* and in North India as *Mukhies* (Singh, 1997). These girls performed dances during prayer services of the temple. Over time, spiritual leaders misused the system for immoral purposes. Under the disguise of religious dedication of girls to temples, clandestine prostitution developed. This tradition continued even during the Mughal dynasty (1526-1857 A.D.), except during 1658-1707 A.D when Aurangzeb ruled (Singh, 1997).

Rather than resembling these historical occurrences of prostitution, the current state of affairs for prostitutes in India more closely reflects recent political and social development. After the downfall of the Mughal Empire in the 18<sup>th</sup> century, concubines, as well as dancing and singing girls, came out of the royal palaces. These women lacked literacy and professional training, which left them with no choice but public prostitution (Jordan, 1984). During British rule, the place of women in India further worsened. Conditions continued to deteriorate, and in the absence of state control and regulation,

prostitution thrived on a large commercial scale. Social stigma and economic hardships of women made them an easy victim to traffickers (Jordan, 1984). These situations have not changed much in the current Indian scenario. In the following section, we will look at the current legislation for prostitutes in independent India.

# Prostitution Laws in Independent India

The problems faced by prostitutes and their children in India are not addressed by present policies. The main prostitution law in India is the Immoral Traffic Prevention Act (PITA) of 1984, which replaced the Suppression Immoral Traffic Act (SITA) of 1956.

PITA does not address the previously mentioned problems; rather, it treats prostitutes as criminals.

The current prostitution laws in India that legislate prostitutes are ambiguous. They create a system where prostitution is allowed to thrive, but which also attempts to hide it from the public. According to SITA, prostitution "is the act of a female offering her body for promiscuous sexual intercourse for hire, whether in money or in kind and whether offered immediately or otherwise and the expression prostitute will be construed accordingly" (SITA, 1957, p. 1). This law dictated that prostitution is neither legal nor illegal; rather it is tolerated since prostitutes can practice their trade privately but cannot legally solicit customers in public. In particular, the law prohibited prostitutes from carrying on their profession within 200 yards of a public place. Unlike other professions, however, prostitution does not fall under normal labor laws, and thus prostitutes were not entitled to minimum wage benefits, compensation for injuries, or other benefits that were common in other types of work. They possess the right to be rescued and rehabilitated if they desire, as well as all the rights of other citizens. However, prostitutes can rarely

invoke these rights, since they cannot easily escape from the brothels, due to the control of the brothel keepers and pimps.

In 1986, SITA was replaced by the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, or PITA. Under this new act, prostitution was defined as "the sexual exploitation or abuse of persons for commercial purposes" (PITA, 1986, p. 1). This law considered trafficking a moral issue and took a preventive approach towards trafficking. Another section of the Act sought to punish anyone (with a sentence of not less than 7 years) found guilty of detaining a person on premises where prostitution is carried out. PITA also considers prostitution-related activities such as pimping and keeping the profits made from prostitutes as criminal. The Act draws a distinction between prostitution and the exploitation of prostitution; only the exploitation of prostitutes is considered wrong. The Act prohibits keeping a brothel or allowing premises to be used as a brothel. In order to clarify this point, the Act defines a brothel as including "any house, room, conveyance or place, or any portion of any house, room, conveyance or place, which is used for purposes of sexual exploitation or abuse for the gain of another person or for the mutual gain of two or more prostitutes" (PTIA, 1986, p. 1). Furthermore, detaining a person in a brothel for prostitution, with or without consent, is also a crime. Finally, living off the earnings of prostitution is a crime. For example, a husband living with his wife and allowing his wife to be a prostitute is also guilty of a crime. Even though these laws have been long established, women are still forced by brothel keepers and pimps into prostitution. The presence of Kamathipura, Asia's largest red light district, is proof that PITA is ineffective in reducing the exploitation of women. PITA also considers prostitution within 200 meters of any public place such as hospitals, nursing homes,

schools, colleges, offices, and religious institutions as a "nuisance" that may be punishable with imprisonment for up to 3 months. This 3-month imprisonment is increased to 6 months in cases where solicitation is accompanied by words, gestures, or willful exposure by the prostitute, even if she is in her own house but can be seen from outside (PITA, 1986). The detainment of the prostitute can complicate matters, especially if she has a child. Due to detention, the children of prostitutes could be left alone in the brothel. This parental gap in the life of these children makes them more prone to exploitation and trafficking. Thus, we see that the PITA magnifies the problems of prostitutes and their children, and there is a need to work with these women to create laws that would support them in their lives.

PITA does not distinguish between prostitution and trafficking; instead, trafficking under the Act is addressed merely as prostitution-related activity. According to Article 5 of the Act, trafficking is defined as "procuring, including or taking a person for the purpose of prostitution" (PITA, 1986, p. 2). However, the Act never clearly defines human trafficking and limits the crime of procurement to prostitution. PITA focuses on criminalization and punishment, but it does nothing to prevent prostitution or human trafficking. Nowhere in the Act is there any mention of addressing the root cause of the trafficking infrastructure or the appropriate preventive measures that must be taken to warn young women about the dangers of prostitution or the dangers of trafficking. PITA does discuss rehabilitation, e.g., protective homes for prostitutes who are minors, but these homes do not facilitate the empowerment of these women. The Act also does not recognize trafficked persons/prostitutes as victims, and the Act further stipulates that these women are entitled to trial only if the government determines it is necessary.

Hence, structural barriers in the legal system prevent women from bringing traffickers to justice. For example, in the few cases that do come to trial, prostitutes are often the sole witnesses against the trafficker or pimps. The lack of witness protection, however, places these women at risk if they testify. As a result of a lack of witness protection, few women come forward to fight for justice, leaving the trafficker free to exploit more innocent women and children.

Finally, even in cases where a conviction is secured, PITA does not provide for the forfeiture of the assets of the trafficker, which may be used to compensate the victims of trafficking. If a provision such as this were to be added to the current Act, the assets could also be used to initiate programs of assistance and protection, as well as provide incentives to police officers who investigated cases of trafficking. In other words, proactive steps like this one could help to defray the cost of enforcing the law. Most importantly, the recognition that the trafficked person is a victim of a crime requires noncriminalization of the victim of trafficking. This victim-centered approach is currently absent in the Act. As it now stands, PITA punishes the woman in prostitution, not the client, except in cases where he is discovered engaged in a sexual act with a prostitute in a public place.

To break the chain of prostitution and prostitution-related activities, it is necessary to create laws and support based on the needs of prostitutes and their children. Research will be conducted to understand the needs and experiences of these women and their children, so that support programs and laws can be tailored to empower them and eliminate their social exclusion. In this study, two theoretical frameworks will be used to get an in-depth understanding of the problems of prostitutes and their children. In the

following section, I will discuss both these theories and employ them in order to examine these issues.

# Theoretical Framework

Various theoretical lenses have been used to evaluate prostitution, including feminist and Marxist feminist views, domination theory, black feminist theory, differential association theory, labeling theory, strain theory, Goffman's impression management theory, and conflict theory. While these theories offer various contextual approaches, I will use Human Ecological System Theory to understand the lives of prostitutes and the needs of their children. Additionally, employing the lens of Social Exclusion Theory, I will examine how prostitutes and their children have been systematically excluded from mainstream society.

# **Human Ecological System Theory**

Human ecological system theory, as proposed by Urie Bronfenbenner (1989), is concerned with the interaction and interdependence of humans. In this theory, human development is a reciprocal and life-long process of interaction between persons and their environment, which manifests in a set of nested structures. The names of each of these structures or contextual systems arise based on its distance from the individual (Hope, 2007). Bronfenbrenner's original theory proposed four systems or levels, and later a fifth one, the chronosystem, was added (Bubolz & Sontag, 1993). Each system contains roles, norms, and rules that can shape human development as well as help to explain the specific behavior or experience of an individual, in this case a prostitute (Hope, 2007).

The microsystem is the individual's immediate environment (e.g., family, school,

peers). The mesosystem is comprised of connections between immediate environments (e.g., a child's school and peer group). The exosystem is the external environment setting, which only indirectly affects the development of children (e.g., parent's workplace). The macro- system is the larger cultural context, including the national economy and laws, as well as political, cultural, and subcultural systems. Finally, the chronosystem, which is time-related, reflects dynamic environment transitions. By identifying these various systems, I will be able to better examine and understand the experiences and needs of the prostitutes and their children.

Both micro and meso systems will be used to explore the immediate lives of women in prostitution. These models will also be used to examine the lives of their children in the context of socialization agents, e.g., school, peers, and family. Finally, they will allow us to investigate important questions: How do these children socialize? What are their experiences? What are their challenges?

The exosystem will help us to look at the work experience of these women and its effects on their own day-to-day lives and the lives of their children. The macro system also will be useful for researching how the various legal ramifications impact the experiences of these women. The chronosystem will also permit us to survey circumstances that may have affected a sex worker's decision to enter prostitution in the past, as well as her current life situation and future prospects. Through this process, we will achieve a more holistic view of prostitution, as opposed to the more narrow investigations that have been performed in the past, and that have led to disapproval and censure.

# Social Exclusion Theory

Parkin derived social exclusion theory from Weber's discussion on social closure theory (Alexander, 2005). According to Combat Poverty (1986),

Social exclusion is the process whereby certain groups are pushed to the margins of society and prevented from participating fully by virtue of their poverty, low education or inadequate life skills. This distances them from job, income and education opportunities as well as social and community networks. They have little access to power and decision-making bodies and little chance of influencing decisions or policies that affect them, and little chance of bettering their standard of living.

Social exclusion theory examines the systematic method of discrimination used to isolate people from mainstream society due to their ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, ancestry, gender, age, disability, HIV status, and migrant status or place of habitation (Silver & Miller, 2003). Social exclusion can lead to exclusion from educational opportunities, leading to unequal education (Barry, 2002). In addition, social exclusion can limit access to political participation, which can propel people into a cycle of poverty (Barry, 2002). According to the British Medical Journal (BMJ), social exclusion may contribute to children's poor educational performance and achievements, unmanageable behavior, drug misuse, unemployment, teenage pregnancy, homelessness, crime, and suicide (BMJ, 2001). Importantly, social exclusion can be experienced at different levels because it can affect individuals, groups, or geographic areas (Jermyn, 2001). According to the Department of International Development (DFID) in their social exclusion policy document,

Discrimination can occur within public institutions, such as the legal system, or in organizations that manage education and health services, as well as in households and the community. These types of institutionalized exclusion can in turn lead to denial of income, assets and services. (DFID, 2005, p.1)

Research by Campbell et al. (2006) found that social exclusion causes changes in

a person's brain function and can lead to poor decision-making and a diminished learning ability. The research linked social exclusion to an individual's failure to exert self-control. For instance, people who are rejected in social situations often respond by abusing alcohol, expressing aggression inappropriately, or performing poorly at school or work (Campbell et al., 2006) This theory, then, can help us understand in a profound manner the effect that exclusion resulting from prostitution can have on the life and wellbeing of a prostitute and her children. This understanding will help us develop and determine appropriate interventions.

# Research Design

# Rationale

The rationale of the study is twofold. First, the literature reveals the lack of a needs assessment about these issues and there have not been studies conducted to understand the needs of the children of prostitutes. Additionally, there is a lack of research on stakeholder views about the needs of prostitutes and their children and the challenges that stakeholders face in providing services to this group. Due to my work with prostitutes in India, I am interested in this research because I had glimpses of their problems. Hence, I want to understand the experiences and needs of this population in the U.S. and India, where the services for prostitutes are limited. Last, comparing the state of affairs among Indian prostitutes with those of U.S. prostitutes may help to reveal similarities and differences that deepen our understanding of their problems. I want to understand the experiences and needs of these populations, which have been neglected by the lack of laws based on the needs of prostitutes and their children in India and the U.S.

# Research Questions

From the literature, I have developed three research questions that I will address in my research. These questions are:

- 1) What comparisons can be made between the needs of prostitutes and their children in the U.S. and India? What are the models of service needed to support prostitutes as mothers and their children?
- 2) What are the experiences, educational challenges, and needs of children of prostitutes? What types of services do they need to overcome these challenges?
- 3) What challenges do stakeholders face in providing services to this population? What do these stakeholders think are the challenges faced by their clients and what support do they think their clients need?

# Research Study Setting

The study was conducted in two parts: one in the U.S. and the second in India. The U.S. data were collected with the help of the nonprofit organization "Empowerment Program, Service for Women" in Denver, Colorado. The Empowerment Program works with women who are infected with or affected by HIV/AIDS and women who are involved with the criminal justice system (Empowerment Program, 2009). For the U.S. study, I contacted the executive director of the Harm Reduction Program, who referred me to the director of the Empowerment Program. I contacted the executive director of the Empowerment Program, informed her about the study and gave her a referral sheet. She then gave these to the program's clients. All the participants who choose to volunteer in

the study informed the organization. After I received the participant list, I visited the organization in Denver in order to meet with participants. An appointment was fixed according to their convenience. I conducted face-to-face interviews with the volunteer participants and each interview was audiotaped with the participant's consent.

The second phase of the study was conducted in Mumbai where I visited brothels, schools, and NGOs, and informed women, children, and stakeholders about the study. I briefed them about the scope and goal of the study and left a referral sheet with prostitutes, their children, and stakeholders. Participants who volunteered for the study informed me about their decision whether to participate during my next visit. I acquired the mother's consent prior to interviewing children and also took child assent before conducting the interviews. Participant's consent was obtained prior to the interviews, which were conducted based on the participant's convenience. Interviews were also conducted at the participants' choice of location. All interviews were audiotaped with participants' consent.

## Participation Selection Criteria

After acquiring approval from the University of Utah's Institutional Review Board (IRB), qualitative interviews were conducted. For this study, purposive and snowball sampling techniques were used to recruit potential study participants. In purposive sampling, participants are selected based on some specific characteristic (Patton, 1990). The study sample is comprised of female prostitutes who solicit in Denver, Colorado and Mumbai, India. This study included 17 women, six from the United States and 11 from India. The prostitutes from Denver were in contact with the nonprofit "Empowerment Program, Service for Women," and the participants in Mumbai

solicited in Kamathipura and Falkland Road. The participants were at least 18 years old and had been involved in prostitution for at least 6 months. They all had children. These women were asked to answer questions about the experiences, needs, and challenges in their profession, and the needs and challenges of their children.

In the Indian study, 20 children of prostitutes and 8 stakeholders were also interviewed. The children of prostitutes were invited to participate in the Indian part of the study. These 20 children were from 7 to 17 years old and were asked to answer questions regarding their life experiences and needs as children of prostitutes. The 8 stakeholders in Mumbai were comprised of a nonprofit origination's assistant director, social workers, afterschool teachers, and school teachers who work with prostitutes and their children. These stakeholders were asked to answer question concerning the needs of these women and their children. They also answered questions regarding the challenges they face in providing support and the types of help they need to overcome these challenges.

I conducted brothel visits in the red light district of Mumbai and informed the women, stakeholders, and children about the nature, purpose, and scope of the study and provided them with a referral sheet. The participants who volunteered for the study informed me on my next visit that they wanted to be involved in the study. I used a snowball sampling process to get more participants for the study. Each participant from the U.S. study was compensated with \$20 U.S. and in India with 100 Rupees for participating in the research. Each child participant in India was given a Hindi/Marathi/English dictionary.

In the India study, all interviews were primarily done in Hindi. Some participants

switched back and forth from Hindi to Bengali or Marathi and English. The participants in India and the U.S. were informed about the study and consent was taken. The participants were informed that the study was voluntary and that they could withdraw from the study at anytime. All personal information such as their name and contact information were kept confidential. In the U.S. study, 1 out of 6 participants and all the participants in the Indian study used pseudonyms.

# Methods of the Study

According to Denzin and Lincoln (1994), paradigms assist me to decide on the methodologies. A good study's methodology is based on a paradigm, and guided by a theoretical framework. For this study, I used the constructive paradigm. According to Guba and Lincoln (1994), constructive ontology is local and specific in nature. There is not just one reality; there are multiple realities based on individual and social experiences. The epistemology of the constructive paradigm is transactional and subjective (Guba and Lincoln, 1994). In this paradigm, I am not finding "truth" but instead creating reality with the research participants. The methodology of this paradigm is a continuous process of interpreting reality through dialogue. Understanding of reality takes place through interactions between participants and me where each interaction builds on previous interactions to reach a consensus about reality. By using the constructive paradigm, I viewed the prostitutes, children, and the stakeholders as experts about their lives. Their stories helped me to understand their reality, which was created through interactions and dialogues.

## Data Collection

I conducted face-to-face interviews with volunteer participants. Each interview was audiotaped with the participant's consent. I could not take field notes because it distracted the participants and it was difficult to successfully manage two separate tasks (interviewing and writing/recording) at the same time. I also maintained a reflective journal where I wrote my personal biases and thoughts about the interviews; this activity allowed me to identify my personal/emotional responses to the material and subjects and helped me to avoid mixing my feelings with the analysis. The main topics that were addressed in the interview guide were background, work experiences, children, support and needs, challenges in providing support and how to overcome these challenges, experiences, and the needs of the children of prostitutes.

# Data Analysis

In qualitative studies, data collection and data analysis typically go hand-in-hand to build a coherent interpretation of the data (Marshall & Rossman, 1999). I was guided by initial concepts and developed an understanding of these concepts but shifted and modified as I collected and analyzed data (Schatzman & Strauss, 1973). I followed Marshall and Rossman's six phases of data analysis: (a) organizing the data; (b) generating categories, themes, and patterns; (c) coding the data; (d) testing the emergent understandings; (e) searching for alternative explanations; and (f) writing the report (Marshall & Rossman, 1999). Each of these process elements are discussed below.

# Organizing the Data

After the interviews were conducted, they were transcribed and translated by professionals, peers, and by myself. All transcribed interviews were read and reread to become familiar with them. While reading the transcripts, I made necessary editorial changes to make the field notes retrievable, and generally "cleaned up" the data, as suggested by Pearsol (1985).

# Generating Categories

I identified the salient themes, recurring ideas or languages, and patterns of belief that linked the people and the settings together (Marshall & Rossman, 1999.) In the initial phase, I performed line-by-line coding of the data. After going through each transcript, I interpreted and analyzed the emerging themes in the study. By questioning the data and reflecting on my conceptual framework, I created various categories. Each category was then read and reread to identify differences between them and to develop themes. Each theme was studied intensively to see if these multiple themes could be merged or separated. After these themes emerged, they were coded.

# Coding

After reading the transcripts and forming categories and themes, each theme was coded in a different color. Additionally, I used memo writing to more fully illustrate the significances of each category. In order to do this, I wrote down my thoughts on the side of each color-coded themes as memo writing prescribes. This process helped me to analyze my ideas about the codes.

# Testing Emergent Understanding and Searching for Alternative Explanations

I evaluated the data to understand their usefulness and determine whether they helped to answer the research questions. After finding categories and themes, I critically analyzed the data for alternative explanations. I identified all possible alternate explanations and then determined whether my interpretations of events and situations were the most plausible (Marshall & Rossman, 1999). This exploration helped to establish other views and deepened my knowledge and understanding of the data from various angles.

# Writing the Report

Since I used the Multiple Article Path (MAP) for the production of the study report, three manuscripts were written for this dissertation. I tried to capture the vividness and details of the data and present them in an analytical format. I wrote manuscripts on each of the groups interviewed for the study: prostitutes, children of prostitutes, and stakeholders who provide services to this population. The three articles will be submitted to scholarly journals. These manuscripts will also be given to the organizations that helped me to collect data.

## Manuscripts

Comparative study of mothering among prostitutes in the U.S. and India
Research Questions

What comparisons can be made between the needs of prostitutes and their children in the U.S. and India? What are the models of service needed to support prostitutes as mothers and their children?

## Methods

This research was conducted in two phases: the first in Denver, U.S. and the second in Mumbai, India. This study included 17 women, 6 from the United States and 11 from India. Participants for the U.S. phase were contacted through an intervention program in Denver. The second phase of the research was conducted in India's red light district of Kamathipura and Falkland Road. Purposive sampling along with snowball sampling techniques were used to invite participants into this study. I conducted brothel visits to inform prostitutes about this study.

# Data Analysis

In-depth personal interviews were conducted with all 17 participants. All interviews in the U.S. were conducted in English, but the interviews in India were conducted by me in Hindi and Bengali based on the participant's choice of language. All interviews from the Indian study were translated and then transcribed. Interviews from the U.S. study were transcribed as well. In both cases, interview responses were transcribed in the form of narratives in keeping with the nature of the participants' answers. Data derived from the study were analyzed using the six phases of Marshall and Rossman's (1999) method. Each transcript was thoroughly read, extracts were categorized into themes, and each emerging theme in the study was interpreted. The themes were closely studied to examine if they were related to the research questions.

## Journal

This manuscript will be submitted to the Journal of Sex Research (JSR). This journal centers around various scientific studies on sexuality. This journal also has a

history of accepting manuscripts related to studies of prostitutes. In addition, this journal accepts a vast array of scholarly material concerning prostitution research, including international studies. This focus makes it an excellent match for the first manuscript, as it is a comparative study of prostitutes in the U.S. and India.

# Understanding the Voices of Children of Prostitutes from Mumbai, India Research Questions

What are the experiences, educational challenges, and needs of children of prostitutes? What types of services do they need to overcome these challenges?

#### Methods

This study included 20 children of prostitutes from the red light area of Mumbai. The participants were enrolled in the study during home/brothel visits that I conducted in the red light district of Mumbai. I used the snowball sampling process to obtain saturation point for the study.

## Data Analysis

In-depth personal interviews were conducted with all 20 participants. All interviews were conducted in Hindi or Bengali based on the participant's choice of language. All interviews were translated and then transcribed in the form of narratives, in keeping with the nature of the participant's answers. The six phases of Marshall and Rossman's method of analysis were used to analyze the data (Marshall and Rossman, 1999). In the initial phase, I did line-by-line coding of the data. After going through the transcript, I determined the emerging themes in the study. After these themes emerged, I evaluated the data to understand the usefulness of the themes and determined whether

they helped to answer the research questions.

Journal

This manuscript will be submitted to Family Relations: Interdisciplinary Journal of Applied Family Studies. This journal focuses on child and parent relationships, family diversity, and cross-cultural/international issues, among many other family-related topics. The journal's focus on relationships between children and parents makes this article a good fit for this journal.

Uncovering the Lives of Children of Prostitutes through

Stakeholders Interviews in Mumbai, India

**Research Questions** 

What challenges do stakeholders face in providing services to this population? What do these stakeholders think are the challenges faced by their clients and what support do they think their clients need?

## Methods

The participants for this study consist of 8 stakeholders who provided education-related services to children of prostitutes. Purposive sampling along with the snowball sampling techniques were used to recruit study participants. I conducted visits to schools and nonprofit agencies in the red light area of Mumbai to enroll participants for the study. The interview questions were predetermined and were semistructured. All interviews were conducted either in Hindi, English, or Marathi depending upon the participant's choice of language. All interviews were translated and transcribed in form of narratives in

keeping with the nature of the participant's answers.

# Data Analysis

The data were analyzed using the six phases of Marshall and Rossman (1999). I completed line-by-line coding during the initial phase of data analysis. The themes were read and reread to examine if they were related to the research question. Themes were interpreted through the lens of Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory.

## Journal

This manuscript will be submitted to International Social Work. This journal focuses and publishes articles on international social work interventions. This manuscript will fit well in this journal since it discusses stakeholder perceptions of children of prostitutes in India. This manuscript conveys stakeholder challenges in catering to this population and what services this group requires.

## References

- Alexander, M. L. (2005). Social inclusion, social exclusion and social closure: What can we learn from studying the social capital of social elites? Paper presented at International Conference on Engaging Communities, Brisbane, Queensland. Paper retrieved from <a href="http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf">http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf</a>.
- AVERT (2005). HIV/AIDS in India. Retrieved October, 25, 2008 from http://www.avert.org/aidsindia.htm.
- BBC (2006). Prostitution "increase" in India by Upasana Bhat, New Delhi. Retrieved on 12<sup>th</sup> March 2008, from <a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south-asia/5140526.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south-asia/5140526.stm</a>.
- Benjamin, H., & Masters, R. E. L. (1964). *Prostitution and morality*. New York: Julian.
- Bess, B. E., & Janus, S. S. (1976). Prostitution. In B. J. Sadock, H. I. Kaplan, & A. M. Freeman (Eds.), *The Sexual experience* (pp. 564-610). Baltimore: Williams and Wilkens.
- BMJ (2001). Social exclusion: Old problem and new name. *British Medical Journal*, *323* (7306), 1-2. Retrieved September 19, 2008 from <a href="http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf">http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf</a>. *323 doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.323.7306.0*
- Boyer, D. K., & James, J. (1983). Prostitute as victims. In D. E. MacNamara & Karmen (Eds.), *Deviants: Victims or victimizers?* (pp. 109-146). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Boyer, P. (1978). *Urban masses and moral order in America, 1820-1920.* Cambrigde, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Bryan, J. H. (1965). Apprenticeships in prostitution. *Social Problems*, 12, 287-297.
- Brown, M. E. (1979). Teenage prostitution. *Adolescent*, 14, (56) 665-680.
- Brofenbrenner, U. (1989). Ecological Systems Theory. In R. Vasta (Ed.) (1991). *Six theories of child development: Revised formulations and current issues* (pp.187-249). London: UK, Philadelphia: US, J. Kingsley.
- Bubolz, M. M., & Sontag, M. S. (1993). Human ecology theory. In P. G. Boss, W. J. Dohety, R. LaRossa, W. R. Schumm & S. K. Stienmets (Eds.), *Sourcebook of family theories and methods: A contextual approach* (pp. 419-447). NY: New York, Springer.
- Bullough, V. L. (1965). Problems and methods for research in prostitution and the behavioral science. *Journal of History of Behavioral Sciences*, 1 (3) 244-251.

- Bullough, V. L., & Bullough, B. L. (1978). *Prostitution: An illustrated social history*. New York: Crown.
- Bullough, V. L., & Bullough, B. L. (1987). Women and prostitute: A social history. Buffalo, NY: Promethus, Books
- Campbell, W. K., Twenge, J., Clementz, B., McDowell, J., Krusemark, E., & Brunnell, A. (2006). Social exclusion changes brain function and can lead to poor decision-making. *Science Daily*. Retrieved April 20, 2008, from <a href="http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm">http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm</a>
- Dalla, R. L. (2000). Exposing the "Pretty Woman" myth: A qualitative examination of the lives of female streetwalking prostitutes. *Journal of Sex Research*, *37*, 344-353.
- Dalla, R. L. (2001). Et tu Brute: A qualitative analysis of streetwalking prostitutes interpersonal support network. *Journal of Family Issues*, *22*, 1066-1085.
- Dalla, R. L. (2004). When the bough breaks...examining intergenerational parentchild relational pattern among street level sex workers and their parent and children. *Applied Developmental Science*, 7, 216-228.
- Dalla, R. L. (2004). "I fell off the mothering track." Barriers to "effective mothering" among prostituted women. *Family Relation*, *53*, 190-200.
- Dalla, R. L. (2006). "You can't hustle all your life." An exploratory investigation of the exit process among street-level prostituted women. *American Psychological Association*, 30, 276-290.
- Dalla, R. L., Xia, Y., & Kennedy, H. (2003). "You just give them what they want and pray that they do not kill you" 'street–level sex workers' reports of victimization, personal resources, and coping strategies. *Violence Against Women*, *9*(11), 1367-1394.
- DFID (2005). Reducing poverty by tackling social exclusion. Published by the Department for International Development. Retrieved April, 21, 2008 from http://www.dfid.gov.uk/pubs/files/social-exclusion.pdf.
- El-Bassel, N., Witte, S. S., Wada, T., Gilbert, L., & Wallace, J. (2001). Correlation of partners violence among female street-based sex workers: Substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. *AIDS Patients Care and STDs 15*(1), 41-51.
- Esselstyn, T. C. (1968). Prostitution in United States. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Sciences*. *376*, 123-135.

- Gangoli, G. (2000). Silence hurt and choice: Attitudes to prostitution in India and the west. London School of Economics. Retrieved from http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/25207/
- Ghosh, S. K. (1996). *The world of prostitution* (Vol. 1 and 2). New Delhi: APH Publishing Corporation.
- Govinda, R. (2002). *India Education Report: A Profile of Basic Education*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Gu, J. H., Chen, H., Chen, X., Lau, J. T., Wong, R., Liu, C., et al. (2008). Severity of drug dependence, economic pressure and HIV-related risk behaviors among non-institutionalized female injecting drug users who are also sex workers in China. *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, 97(3), 257-267.
- Harcourt, C., & Donovan, B. (2005). The many faces of sex work. *Sex Transmitted Infection*, 81 (3), 201-206. doi: 10.1136/sti.2004.012468
- HAQ Center for Child Rights. (2001). Child trafficking in India. New Delhi: HAQ.
- Hirchi, T. (1972). The professional prostitue. In R. R. Bell & M. Gordon (Eds.), *The social dimensions of human sexuality* (pp. 249-267). Boston: Little Brown.
- Hobson, B. M. (1987). *Uneasy virtue: The politics of prostitution and the American reform tradition.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Hope, E. A. (2007). Exploring the family lives of people in prostitution: A contextual approach using a human ecological systems model. (Doctoral dissertation). (Accession Order No. AAT 3285654)
- Hubbard, P., Matthews, R., & Scoular, J. (2008). Regulating sex work in the EU: Prostitute women and the new spaces of exclusion. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, *15*, 137-152.
- Immoral Traffic Prevention Act, 1986 (ITPA). Retrieved on 14<sup>th</sup> March 2008, from http://ncpcr.gov.in/Acts/Immoral Traffic Prevention Act (ITPA) 1956.pdf
- Jackman, N. R., O'Toole, R., & Geis, G. (1963). The self-image of the prostitute. *Sociological Quarterly, 4*, 150-161.
- James, J. (1976). Motivations for entrance into prostitution. In L. Crites (Ed.), *The female offenders* (pp. 177-205). Lexington, MA: Lexington.
- James, J. (1980). *Entrance into juvenile prostitution*. Washington D.C.: National Institute of Mental Health.

- Jermyn, H. (2004). The art of inclusion (Vol. 35). London: Arts Council England.
- Karandikar, S., & Prospero, M. (2008). "My one-way ticket to Kamathipura." Rights of sex workers comprised. *Research for Sex Workers*, 10, 12-15.
- Kesler, K. (2002). Is a feminist stance in support of prostitution possible? An exploration of current trends. *Sexuality*, 5(2), 219-235.
- Kendall-Tackett, K. A., Williams, L. M., & Finkelhor, D. (1993). Impact of sexual abuse on children: A review and synthesis of recent empirical studies. *Psychological Bulletin*, 113(1), 164-180.
- Kurtz, S., Surratt, N., Inciardi, J., & Kiley, M. (2004). Sex work and "date" violence. *Violence Against Women, 10*(4), 357-385.
- Maerov, A. S. (1965). Prostitution: A survey and review of 20 cases. *Psychiatric Quarterly*, *39*, 675-701.
- McClanahan, S., Mclelland, G., Abram, K., & Teplin, L. (1999). Pathways into prostitution among female jail detainees and their implications for mental health services. *Psychiatric Service*, *50*, 1606-1613.
- Marshall. C., & Rossman, G. B. (1999). *Designing qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.), California: Sage Publication.
- Martin, L. (2005). Commercial sex workers: Victims or fighters of the HIV epidemic in Cambodia. *Asia Pacific Viewpoint*, 46(1), 21-34.
- Mendes, P. (2002). Excluding undesirables from the local community. *Social Alternatives*, 21(3), 48-54.
- Menen, R. (2007). Karma Sutra, Essays from the Margin: Canada Saga Books.
- Monto, M. A. (2004). Female prostitution, customers, and violence. *Violence Against Women*, 10(2), 160-188.
- Mrinal, N. R., & Rekha, Y. S. (1994). Problem of first generation learners. *Indian Journal of Psychometry and Education*, 25, 69-73.
- Mukherjee, K. K., & Das, D. (1996). *Prostitution in the six metropolitan cities of India*. New Delhi: Central Social Welfare Board.
- Nair, P. M. (2005). *Trafficking of women and children in India*. New Delhi: Orient Longman Publication.
- National Human Rights Commission Report, New Delhi. Retrieved on 6<sup>th</sup> October 2008,

- from
- http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/India/Gay\_rights\_should\_be\_respected\_prostit ution\_legalised\_NHRC\_chief/articleshow/3565933.cms
- Overall, C. (1992). What's wrong with prostitution? Evaluating sex work. *Signs*, *17*, 705-724.
- Patkar, P., & Patkar, P. (2006). Child trafficking issues and concerns, Mumbai. Retrieved on 1<sup>st</sup> December 2007, from http://www.preranaatc.org
- Pardeshi, G., & Bhattacharya, S. (2006). Child rearing practices amongst brothel based commercial sex workers. *Indian Journal of Medical Science*, 60(7), 288-295.
- Pauw, I. B. (2003). "You are just whores –you can be rapid:" Barriers to safer sex practices among women street sex workers in cape town. *Culture Health and Sexuality*, 5(6) 456-481.
- Parkin, F. (1979). *Marxism and class theory: A bourgeois critique*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Pearsol, J. (1985). Controlling qualitative data: Understanding teachers' value perspectives on a sex equity education project. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Education Research Association, Chicago.
- Pheterson, G. (1990). The category" prostitute" on scientific inquiry. *The Journal of Sex Research*, 27(3) 397-407.
- Potter, K., Martin, J., & Romans, S. (1999). Early developmental experiences of female sex workers: A comparative study. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, *33*, 935-940.
- Rani, N. I. (2006). Childcare by poor single mother study of mother- headed family in India. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, *37*, 75-91.
- Raphael, J., & Shapiro, D. L. (2004). Violence indoor and outdoor prostitute venues. *Violence Against Women, 10*(2), 126-139.
- Raymond, J. G., D'Cunha, J., Dzuhayatin, S. R., Hynes, H. P., Rodriguez, Z. R., & Santos, A. (2002). A comparative study of women trafficked in the migration process. *Patters, profiles and health consequences of sexual exploitation in five countries (Indonésia, Philipines, Thailand, Venezuela and United States). CATW.*
- Raymond, Hughes, & Gomez (2001). Sex Trafficking of Women in United States

- International and Domestic Trends. U.S. Department of Justice Report.
- Rankin, S. (2002). The sex industry exposed. *American Feminist*, 9(1), 10-37.
- Rothman, S. M. (1978). Women's proper place. A history of changing ideals and practice 1970 to the present. New York: Basic Books.
- Sander, T. (2004). Controllable laughter: Managing sex work through humor. *Sociology*, *38*(2), 273-291.
- Sanghera, J. (2002). Trafficking of children and women in India: Thinking though, thinking beyond-A critical framework of analysis for strategic action. New Delhi: UNICEF.
- Saarthak. (2002). *The Sound of Silence: A Manual for Forming Therapeutic Relationships*. New Delhi: Saarthak and UNIFEM.
- Simons, R. L., & Whitbeck, L. B. (1991). Sexual abuse as a precursor to prostitution and victimization among adolescent and adults homeless women. *Journal of Family Issues*, *12*(3), 361-379
- Sripati, V., & Thiruvengadam, A. K. (2004). Constitutional amendment making the right to education a fundamental rights. *International Journal of Constitutional Law*, 2(1), 148-158.
- Stadum. (1992). *Poor women and their families: Hard working charity cases, 1990-1930.*New York: State University of New York Press.
- Schatzman, L., & Sehenkein, J. N. (1973). *Field research: Strategies for a natural sociology*. Engle-wood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Silver, H., & Miller, S. M. (2003). Social exclusion: The European approach to social disadvantage. *Indicators:New York*, 2(3), 5-21.
- Silbert, M. H., & Pines, A. M. (1982). Entrance into prostitution. *Youth and Society, 13*, 471.
- Solan, L., & Wahab, S. (2000). Feminist voices on sex work: Implications for social work. *Affilia*, 15, 475.
- The Suppression of Immoral Traffic in women and Girls act of 1956.

  Typology -prostitution. Retrieved July 31st July 2009 from http://
  Lahttp://law.jrank.org/pages/1879/Prostitut-Typology-prostitution.
- UNAIDS Country Progress Report (2010). Retrieved on March 24, 2012 from <a href="http://www.unaids.org/en/dataanalysis/monitoringcountryprogress/progressreports">http://www.unaids.org/en/dataanalysis/monitoringcountryprogress/progressreports</a>

- /2010 countries/india 2010 country progress report en.pdf
- Valandra. (2007). Reclaiming their lives and breaking free: An Afrocentric approach to recovery from prostitution. *Affilia*, 22, 195-208.
- Wahab, S., & Davis, R. (2004) An evaluation of the Salt Lake prostitution diversion program. Unpublished report. College of Social Work, University of Utah.
- Wechsberg, W. M., Luseno, W. K., & Lam, W. K. (2005). Violence against substance abusing South African sex workers: Intersection with culture and HIV risks. *AIDS Care*, 17(sup1), 55-64.
- Wojcicki, J. M., & Malala, J. (2001). Condom use, power and HIV/AIDS risks: Sex workers bargain for survival in Hillbow/Joubert Park. Berea, Johannesburg. *Social Science & Medician*, *53*(1), 99-121.
- Weiner, A. (1996). Understanding the social needs of streetwalking prostitutes. *Social Work*, 41(1), 97-105.
- Wynter, S. (1987). WHISPER: Women hurt in systems of prostitution engaged in revolts. In F. Delacoste & P. Alexander (Eds.), *Sex work: Writing by women in the sex industry*, (pp. 266-270). Pittsburgh, PA: Cleis.

#### CHAPTER 2

# A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MOTHERING AMONG PROSTITUTES IN THE U.S. AND INDIA

#### Abstract

There has been much research about understanding the risks, antecedents, causes, solutions, and prevalence of prostitution, but there is little scholarly work about the needs and risks that prostitutes face as mothers. I used Human Ecological Systems and Social Exclusion Theories to further understand the social issues prostitutes face as mothers in Denver, Colorado and Mumbai, India. Purposive and snowball sampling techniques were utilized to recruit prostitutes and ex-prostitutes. The study reveals that women in prostitution need tailor-made support systems to exit prostitution. The research findings strongly advocate for joint programs like counseling, shelter, or self-esteem programs for women and their children instead of separate programs where women are sent to detention and children are sent to foster care. The findings also suggest the need for 24hour hot line services, outreach programs by ex-prostitutes, job-readiness training, housing, shelters, emphasis on early education for female children, counseling services, and prostitution anonymous groups. Prostitutes in India say that they want to do anything to provide an education and better livelihood for their children. This study also revealed that these women go through sexual abuse, and experience violence from pimps and partners. They face discrimination from family, police, society and the legal system. This

study makes specific suggestions regarding research, policy, and interventions for social work profession.

# Introduction

Motherhood is one of the most difficult and stressful phases of a prostitute's life (Dalla, 2000; Sloss 2002; Sloss & Harper, 2004). According to Arendell (2000), "Mothering is the social practice of nurturing and caring of children, which involves dynamic activity and ever evolving relationships" (p. 1192). Prostitutes are often the sole caretakers of their children, unlike other women who may have family support. Even though motherhood is a difficult phase in their lives, many of these women have had multiple children before and/or after entering the flesh trade (Dalla, 2002; Parriott, 1994; Sloss, 2002; Sloss & Harper, 2004). Prostitutes face several professional hazards like stress, oppression, stigma, incarceration, housing problems, financial crises, mental health problems, and lack of appropriate medical and psychological care (Sloss, 2002; Sloss & Harper, 2004); however, these professional hazards have not stopped them from becoming mothers. Even with these challenges, many prostitutes become mothers because they feel it is the only psychological space they have for themselves, and for many, parenthood becomes the primary reason for their survival (Castaneda et al., 1996). It is hard to obtain the exact number of children of prostitutes in the U.S. and India due to the illegal nature of prostitution. According to the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) report in India, there are approximately 5.4 million children of prostitutes, and most live with their mothers in red light areas (NHRC, 2008). In the U.S., women lose custody of their children if they are convicted of prostitution. Due to this, it is hard to know the exact number of children they have, their whereabouts, or other important

information about their children.

Though many prostitutes have a desire to become mothers, most do not receive adequate support to become successful mothers. There have been very few empirical studies looking at the relationship between prostitutes and their children or what support the women think they need to overcome their professional hazards and become successful mothers. The research presented in this article builds on the existing literature regarding prostitutes as mothers. The goal of this paper is to understand the challenges and experiences of prostitutes as successful mothers. Specifically, this article will seek to answer the following questions: What comparisons can be made between the needs of prostitutes and their children in the U.S. and India? What are the models of service needed to support prostitutes as mothers and their children? This study uses the lens of Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory, with the research being conducted in two phases: the first portion was carried out in Denver with ex-prostitutes and the second part was conducted in the red light area of Mumbai with current and exprostitutes.

## Theoretical Framework

I used Human Ecological Systems Theory to understand the lives of prostitutes and the needs of their children. Additionally, I employed the lens of Social Exclusion Theory, and examined how prostitutes and their children have been systematically excluded from mainstream society.

# **Human Ecological Systems Theory**

Human Ecological Systems Theory, as proposed by Bronfenbrenner (1989), is concerned with the interaction and interdependence of humans. In this theory, human development is viewed as a reciprocal and life-long process of interaction between people and their environment, which manifests itself as set of nested structures (Bronfenbrenner, 1989). The names of each of these structures or contextual systems arise based on its distance from the individual (Hope, 2007). Each system contains roles, norms, and rules that can shape human development as well as help to explain the specific individual behaviors or experiences of individuals in this article about prostitutes as mothers. Human Ecological Systems Theory has five systems or layers: microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, macrosystem, and chronosystem. The microsystem is the individual's immediate environment. The mesosystem is comprised of connections between immediate environments. The exosystem is the external environment setting, which only indirectly affects the development of children. The macrosystem is the larger cultural context, including the national economy and laws, as well as political, cultural, and subcultural systems. Finally, the chronosystem, which is time-related, reflects dynamic environment transitions. By identifying these various systems, I will be able to better examine and understand the experiences and needs of the prostitutes and their children.

Understandings of micro- and mesosystems were used to explore the immediate lives of women in prostitution and how it affects their mothering. The exosystem helped me to look at the work experiences of these women and its effects on their own day-to-day lives and the lives of their children. The macrosystem was useful for researching how various legal ramifications impact these women's experiences. The chronosystem also

permitted me to survey the circumstances that may affect prostitute's current life situations and future prospects. Through this process, I achieved a more holistic understanding of prostitution, as opposed to narrower investigations of prostitutes that have been performed in the past that have led to disapproval and censure of women in this profession.

# Social Exclusion Theory

Parkin derived Social Exclusion Theory from Weber's discussion on Social Closure Theory (Alexander, 2005). Social Exclusion Theory examines the systematic method of discrimination used to isolate people from mainstream society due to their ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, ancestry, gender, age, disability, HIV status, and migrant status or place of habitation (Silver & Miller, 2003). Social exclusion can lead to exclusion from educational opportunities, which means unequal education (Barry, 1998). This exclusion or lack of opportunity can cause unpreparedness for college and a lack of skills to succeed. Unequal education can limit access to political participation (Barry, 1998). According to the British Medical Journal (BMJ), social exclusion may contribute to children's poor educational performance and achievements, unmanageable behavior, drug misuse, unemployment, teenage pregnancy, homelessness, crime, and suicide (BMJ, 2001). Importantly, social exclusion can be experienced at different levels since it can affect individuals, groups, or geographic areas (Jermyn, 2001). Social exclusion can cause changes in a person's brain function and can lead to poor decision-making and diminished learning ability (Campbell et al., 2006). Research has linked social exclusion to an individual's failure to exert self-control. For instance, people who are rejected in social situations often respond by abusing alcohol, expressing

aggression inappropriately, or performing poorly at school or work (Campbell et al., 2006). This theory, then, can help us to understand in a profound manner the effect that exclusion resulting from prostitution can have on the life of a prostitute and her children. This understanding will help social workers to develop and determine appropriate interventions.

## Literature Review

According to prostitution laws in Colorado, "any person who performs, offers or agrees to perform any act of sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, masturbation, or anal intercourse with any person not their spouse in exchange for money or other things of value commits prostitution" (ProCon.org, 2008). Similarly, the 1986 Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act of India (PITA) defines prostitution as "the sexual exploitation or abuse of persons for commercial purposes or for consideration in money or in any other kind" (p. 1). These definitions clearly show that prostitution is illegal in both the U.S. and India, but its illegality does not mean that it is uncommon in either country. The Indian Constitution and U.S. federal and state laws prohibit any forms of trafficking and prostitution (Nair, 2005; Raymond, Hughes, & Gomez, 2001). There are no reliable data available on the number of prostitutes in the U.S. In India, Mumbai alone has over 125,000 prostitutes; the majority of them come from the states of West Bengal, Orissa, Bihar, Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka and Nepal (Ghosh, 1996). Dalla (2000, 2001, 2003, 2004) summarized studies on the causes that can push women to enter into prostitution. She found that sexual abuse during childhood is linked to female prostitution (Dalla, 2003). No matter the reason these women entered into prostitution, their lives on the

streets are difficult. These women face extreme forms of violence from partners, pimps, brothel keepers, and customers (El-Bassel et al., 2001; Kutz et al., 2004; Monto, 2004; Raphael & Shapiro, 2004; Simons & Whitbeck, 1991; Wechsberg & Lam, 2005). Studies by El-Bassel et al., (2001), Monto (2004), Simons and Whitbeck (1991), Wechsberg and Lam (2005), and Raphael & Shapiro (2004) show a connection between violence towards prostitutes and their HIV/AIDS status. Finally, women in prostitution face felony charges, and if they are incarcerated while their children are minors and in their care, they stand to lose their parental rights (Dalla, 2000; Weiner, 1996).

Apart from these problems, women involved in prostitution often face the daunting task of having to raise their children within the context of an unfamiliar environment (Pardeshi & Bhattacharya, 2006). In almost all cases, these women are single mothers who have borne children from different sexual partners (Dalla, 2004), and despite numerous challenges, many bear multiple children, before and/or after entering the flesh trade (Dalla, 2002; Parriott, 1994; Sloss, 2002; Sloss & Harper, 2004).

According to Dalla (2002), 51% of her 48 participants who were still working in the street had become pregnant, carried on their pregnancy, and had children. In a study in New York by Weiner (1996), 1,963 street level prostitutes were interviewed and among them, 69.4% had children. Each of these participants had 2.25 children on average.

Similarly, Dalla (2000) found that 88% of her participants had 2.4 children on average and some had as many as seven children.

In spite of these challenges, many prostitutes choose to become mothers because they feel motherhood is the only psychosocial space they have of their own and the only reason for their survival (Castaneda et al., 1996). Like every other woman, motherhood is

an important phase in the lives of prostitutes. Motherhood is also one of the most difficult and stressful phases of a prostitute's life (Dalla, 2000; Sloss, 2002; Sloss & Harper, 2004), in large part because she does not have family support and must be the sole caretaker of herself and her child. Even though it is a difficult phase in their lives, many are mothers or will become mothers. They have a desire to be mothers but do not receive any support to become successful mothers, which calls for programs tailor-made for prostitutes with children.

In various studies conducted in the U.S., Dalla (2000, 2001, 2003, 2004) considered the relationships between prostitutes and their parents, caregivers, and partners. Dalla found that these relationships are often clouded with sexual abuse, domestic violence, substance abuse, and abandonment from the prostitutes' parents or caregivers. Additionally, similar patterns are reflected in the relationships that the prostitutes form with their own children. Dalla's research found three important concerns associated with prostitutes and their children. First, prostitutes often remain in the sex trade in order to support their children financially. Second, women who work in prostitution and lose custody of their children as a result often report that this fuels their drug use; prostitution then becomes a means to support their drug habits. Third, children of prostitutes are victimized in a multitude of ways, including neglect, malnutrition or abandonment, loss of shelter, and an increased risk of entering prostitution themselves (Dalla, 2003). Like Dalla, Weiner (1996) learned that female prostitutes face a great deal of violence and often lose the custody of their children. Importantly, Weiner's study found that female prostitutes are reluctant to use any social services due to the fear of arrest or losing custody of their children, and this makes these women especially

vulnerable to violence, intimidation, and exploitation.

Another study in the U.S. conducted by Sloss and Harper (2004) examined the ways in which motherhood affects the work of female prostitutes and found that 13 women out of 16 study participants who prostituted during pregnancy were emotionally strained, and felt ashamed or guilty about working in the street. The women also worried about the health of their unborn child. The participants in the study reported that they continued their work to provide for their children, were careful during work to avoid arrest, and worked around their children's schedule; however, 14 women had lost custody of their children. These studies reflected similar findings in terms of female prostitute drug use, violence faced at work, and issues in a woman's personal life. These women lacked support for childcare from family or partners and most of them had lost custody of their children due to their life style.

Unlike these empirical studies in the U.S., there are few scientific studies regarding female prostitutes as mothers in India. The sole empirical study, performed by Pardeshi and Bhattacharya (2006), looked at child bearing, childcare practices, family support, and placement options of children of brothel-based female prostitutes. The study found distinctive differences between Devdasis child-raising practices and family support from those of non-Devdasis female prostitutes. Devdasis are girls who are offered for the services of God and their religion. Devdasis perform dances during prayer services of the temple. Overtime, priest and spiritual leaders have exploited these girls and many of them have been sold into prostitution (Singh, 1997).

In addition, Pardeshi and Bhattacharya's (2006) study revealed that many prostitutes find it difficult to get admission for their children in schools due to a lack of

birth certificate or a father's name. The study found that prostitutes preferred to keep their children away from the red light area. Women in the study reported that it is hard to raise their children single-handedly and their situation is made even more difficult due to the stigma attached with their profession. The study did not look in detail at relationships between the prostitutes and their children, and the researchers did not ask participants what kind of support would benefit them.

In other research in India concerning prostitutes as mothers, Das (1991) presented a report that described various difficulties female prostitutes face when bringing up children. Das (1991) found that prostitutes face violence from brothel keepers who keep children away from mothers in order to increase these women's productivity. Even with these challenges, female prostitutes still want to have children because it is the "only avenue of tangible relationship that is genuine and meaningful and lasting" (p. 34). Also, they have children for emotional, economic, and old age support.

Apart from these two studies in India, there has been a serious gap in the research on the motherhood aspect of prostitutes in India or in other countries. In a study conducted in Mexico City by Castaneda et al. (1996), the researchers found that female prostitutes who are parents play a double life, one of mother and the other of prostitute. Many join prostitution to provide for their children, parents, and sometimes siblings. Most reported concerns about their children's education and safety, while fearing that their children's future will be like theirs. This study notes that many prostitutes want to become mothers because "maternity is the only psychosocial space prostitutes have access to, and they perceive it as their principal motivation for living" (Castaneda et al., 1996, p. 230).

In a similar study by Chege et al. (2002) in the slums of Kenya, the study team found that female prostitutes are almost always the sole caretakers of their children and that 81.2% of mothers live with at least one of their children in Kenya. Nearly all women provided for their child's immediate needs, and only one third of women had secured resources for the future of their children. The study also found that many women "sent all or some of their children to live with extended families in rural homes" (Chege et al., 2002, p. 387). In this situation, the women still provided for their children to be taken care of financially.

Beard et al. (2010) reviewed a large range of literature on the vulnerability and resilience of drug users as well as the children of prostitutes in countries around the world. In several cases, an organization in Zambia that catered to orphaned children of prostitutes faced problems with reuniting these children to extended families because these children often were sold into prostitution. The researchers argued and warned against forceful removal of children from their mothers; placing them in prison with their parent or in protection centers where little care is provided to the children, may lead to a cycle of vulnerability. A study in Bangladesh by Ling (2001) found that children tend to enter the flesh trade like their mothers and that little importance is given to education, particularly for girls. This study also revealed that children's physical, mental, social, moral, and spiritual development are affected due to the brothel environment.

These findings are consistent with the frameworks of Social Exclusion Theory and Human Ecological Systems Theory. In accordance with Social Exclusion Theory, all of the studies reflected the systematic discrimination faced by prostitutes around the world due to the public's stance toward their profession. A lack of adequate support, such

as alternative job opportunities and safe housing for prostitutes, prevents them and their children from being part of mainstream society. This vicious cycle of discrimination and exclusion can be explained by Social Exclusion Theory, and illustrates why these women are viewed as unsuitable mothers, and why their parental role is overlooked by society and in research. Human Ecological Systems Theory is valuable for this research because it helps illustrate the interpersonal relationships that shape human development, and this theory is needed in order to fully comprehend the lives of prostitutes and their children. In all the studies reviewed, the researchers viewed prostitutes as mothers and not as criminals. When children are involuntarily removed from their mothers, the interpersonal relationship between the two is damaged, and this affects the mother's life as well as the child's development. Human Ecological Systems Theory helps us to understand the effect that a prostitute's environment has on her decision making and how other people can shape her attitudes and behavior. This theory helps explain why some prostitutes turn to drug abuse to cope with the violence they face (Dalla, 2000; Graham & Wish, 1994) while others chose other outlets. The focus in Human Ecological Systems Theory on the effect a parent's workplace can have on children's development is also useful for this study.

The findings of this study will add to the research about female prostitutes as mothers. This article looks at how these women go beyond their capacity to be mothers and what support they need to fulfill this role. The women in this study shared their experiences as prostitutes and as mothers. They discussed the challenges they face in providing for the needs of their children, their dreams for their future, and the support they need to improve their prospects for themselves and their children.

## Methods

# **Participants**

This study included 17 women, 6 from the United States and 11 from India (see Table 1 for demographic detail). The participants shared their experiences as mothers, they discussed their relationships with their children, and they identified the support and programs they feel they need to be successful mothers.

Participants in the U.S. study ranged in age from 33 to 48. Three identified themselves as African American, 1 as Native American, and 2 as Caucasian. Two women lived in the shelter, 3 women lived alone, and 1 woman lived with a partner. The years of educational experience ranged from 9<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> grade (mean 10.25 years). All 6 participants were no longer involved in prostitution, but the period of their last involvement varied from 2 months to 6 years prior to the interviews. All 6 reported using drugs; the choice of drugs varied from marijuana to crack cocaine, and in each case, the length of sobriety coincided with the last incident of prostitution. The total number of children to these participants was 22 (see Table 1 for demographic detail).

Among the 11 women who participated in the Indian study, their ages ranged from 30 to 46 years. These women came from different states of India: 4 came from Karnataka, 2 were from Maharashtra, 2 were from Uttar Pradesh, 2 were from West Bengal, and 1 came from the neighboring country of Nepal. The living situations of these women were different from their counterparts in the U.S. Out of 11 women, 8 rented a small space in the red light area or in a brothel itself. One lived in a rented hut in a slum and 1 lived on the streets on her days off from the night care shelter. The years of educational experience ranged from none to 6th grade (mean 1.27 years). Six out of 11

participants were no longer involved in prostitution, but the time of the last incident varied from 5 to 15 years prior to the interviews. All 11 participants did not mention using drugs or alcohol; however, this lack of discussion does not mean that there is an absence of alcohol and drug use by prostitutes in India. The total number of children born to these participants was 24 (see Table 1 for demographic details).

# Research Process

This research was conducted in two phases: the first in Denver, U.S. and the second in Mumbai, India. All the participants in the study were prostitutes or exprostitutes above the age of 18 years and had at least 6 months experience as prostitutes. I received IRB approval from the University of Utah. All the participants in the U.S. were contacted through an intervention program in Denver. The intervention program works with women who have been infected or affected by HIV/AIDS and women who are involved in the criminal justice system. All participants attended the intervention program as a requirement of the court. The organization informed its clients about the study and 6 women volunteered to participate. Each of the participants had been in prostitution for 10 to 20 years. Five of them were streetwalkers, and 1 was a stripper. All interviews took place in the agency's office in Denver. Each participant was briefed about the study and verbal consent was obtained before the interview. Even though each participant was given a choice of picking a pseudonym, only one chose to do so. The participants who used their real names explained that they did so in order to feel a sense of contribution to the study and society. Interviews were audiotaped with prior permission.

The second phase of the research was conducted in India's red light district of Kamathipura and Falkland Road. Purposive sampling along with snowball sampling

techniques were used to invite participants into this study. The researcher conducted brothel visits to inform prostitutes about this study. Eleven women volunteered to participate in the research; all had been in prostitution from 5 to 25 years. The interviews were conducted in a vacant room of an old school building in the red light district in Mumbai.

In-depth personal interviews were conducted with all 17 participants. Each participant was asked about the challenges they faced as a mother, the challenges they thought their children faced, and what support would be required for their betterment. The interview questions were predetermined and were semistructured, but the order in which questions were asked varied depending on each participant's answer to the prior question. The length of interviews varied from 40 to 90 minutes. All interviews in the U.S. were conducted in English, but the interviews in India were conducted in Hindi and Bengali based on the participant's choice of language. All interviews from the Indian study were translated and then transcribed by professionals, peers, and myself. My colleagues and I transcribed the interviews from the U.S. study word-for-word; in both cases, interview responses were transcribed, in the form of narratives, in keeping with the nature of the participants' answers. I verified all of the transcripts, and read and reread the data to ensure familiarity. While reading, I made necessary editorial changes to make the field notes retrievable, and generally "cleaned up" the data, as suggested by Pearsol (1985). Participants in the U.S. phase were compensated with \$20 and Indian participants were compensated with rupees 100 (approximately U.S. \$2.50).

## Data Analysis

Data derived for the study were analyzed using the six phases of Marshall and Rossman's (1999) method. Each transcript was read thoroughly and I categorized extracts into themes and interpreted each emerging theme in the study. Themes were chosen based on how the interview extracts answered the research questions. I read and reread the themes to identify differences between them. After intensive study of the themes, I decided to either merge or separate themes. The themes were closely studied to examine if they were related to the research questions. Themes were interpreted through the lens of Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory.

# **Findings**

The findings of the study were based on the analysis the narratives of all 17 participants. Three major themes emerged: prostitutes relationships with their children, experiences of prostitutes as mothers, and the support programs needed to help them be successful mothers. Motherhood is a reality in the life of prostitutes. However, mainstream society views prostitutes as criminals and not mothers, and this attitude most often leads to the discrimination and exclusion of these women. The criminalization of prostitutes makes it difficult for them to have custody of the children and/or provide for the needs of their children.

## Relationship with Their Children

Motherhood for the women in this study was an important aspect in their lives and a main reason for survival. When these women were separated from their children, many chose to abuse substances to help cope with their loss. As a result, these women reported

not only losing their sobriety but also their ability to maintain any healthy relationship. After separation, many felt that their children no longer respected them or were willing to have cordial relationships with them. The women from Denver reported wanting to do anything to have a better relationship with their children but failed because their children would not forgive them. Angela is facing a similar situation of loss of children like her counterparts. She is doing everything to keep custody of her 3-month-old son, who was at the time of the interview in state custody. Angela said, "I just love him so much; I didn't think it was possible to love someone so much. He's the greatest thing that's ever happened to me. I love my other children, and I think about them on a daily basis, but Andrew and I have a special bond... it would just kill me if I ever lost him." Faith, from Denver, lost her two children when they were young, and they were forced to grow up in foster care, leading them to have a negative relationship with their mother. According to Faith, "... They are grown now, my daughter is 30, and my son is 27; they haven't forgiven me...We don't get along." Faith's daughter drinks a lot, and when Faith prevents her from drinking, she does not listen and insults her. Faith has tried to take her to her counselor, but her daughter has refused. Constant rejection from her children damaged Faith's self-esteem, and obstructed her process of moving away from substance abuse or prostitution. The relationship of these women with their children has never been the same due to the separation from their children.

Unlike women in the U.S. study, the women in the Indian study have maintained a positive relationship with their children, and some have even reported using the relationship as an inspiration to leave prostitution altogether. Gita said, "...After my child was born, I left prostitution completely." Gita left prostitution when her son was growing

up. She performed menial jobs to provide for her son. Today, her son is in high school and dreams of completing his college education at a prestigious school in India.

The 6 women, who left prostitution, worked in homes as domestic helpers, or work in NGOs or schools to provide for their children. Sometimes they even borrow money for their children's tuition fees. Rabia said, "I have only one son. I have no one in my life. I will educate him until he wants...He wants to become a doctor... I will do anything for him." These women do not want their children to have the same fate they have suffered. Saanvi stated, "I thought to myself that I was tricked but I do not want my children to be in this line of work." One of the biggest challenges these women face is

trying to educate their children due to financial difficulties and lack of support. Even with these challenges, these women want the best for their children—like any other parent in the world. As Mamata said, the women were ready to "work or beg to get a better life for their children." In the next section, the study participants express the various challenges they faced as mothers.

# Prostitutes' Experiences and Challenges as Mothers

In the interviews, participants shared their stories about the various struggles they face bringing up their children. In every case, the women demonstrated remarkable honesty and candor when discussing these experiences with the interviewer. During the interviews conducted in Denver for this study, 4 participants revealed that they no longer had custody of their children or had lost their parental rights due to their profession; in some cases, the women claimed that this separation had been the source of abandonment issues among their children. One mother with six children gave two children up for adoption, while the other four of her children live with family members. Four women had children who were in foster care. Only 1 woman had a day-to-day relationship with her children, due to the fact that she entered prostitution after her children were adults.

The separation or loss of a child was cited repeatedly by these women as an instrumental factor leading to depression, re-entry into prostitution, and drug and alcohol abuse. Meredith, a 39-year-old, said that "[s]ome stuff happened with the social services, and they took my kids, so I started back prostituting and using drugs, like crazy, like I was going insane. Because when they took my kids away from me, I lost my mind." Responses like this illustrate the negative effect that separation from children can have on prostitutes. Meredith's account also demonstrates how the vicious cycle of losing custody

of children can push mothers back into prostitution and substance abuse.

Apart from the constant threat of involuntary separation from their children, these women face the challenge of bring up their children in an unsafe environment. Each of these women realized that the neighbourhoods in which they live were full of criminal activity, including drug trafficking and use, gambling, and gang violence, and this creates a dangerous environment for both the women and their children. These districts are not very safe, nor are they conducive to a child's growth and development and for this reason, some women voluntarily send their children away to live with extended family or in governmental/private boarding homes. Rabia, a 35-year-old from India, realized the danger of the red light area and wanted to protect her child by sending him to a boarding school. Rabia said "I am thinking of getting a house before he [her son] becomes bigger...Yes, the children [from her son's school] do tease him...." This situation was especially common among the participants of the Indian portion of the study, but it is also worth noting that the mothers who chose to send their children away maintained regular contact to ensure the stability of their relationships and wellbeing of the children. Veronica, from Denver, said, "I decided to give him [her son] away. I did not want him to drag him onto streets with me and that's just not the place for children. So I gave all my children for adoption, not adoption but family members...well I have contact with [the] other four and things are going pretty smoothly. But back then when I was getting high, I could not drag my children into this. Some women felt its okay to do that but I did not do it." Veronica, now an ex-prostitute, was involved in drugs when she worked on the streets of Denver, an environment where she noted narcotics were easily available. Realizing how drugs could adversely affect her children's lives, she chose to send her children to a

safer environment. Veronica has said that she has regular contact with her children, and they share a healthy relationship. Today, all of her children are in school and are trying to build a better future for themselves.

Like Veronica, 1 participant in India placed her child with her extended family, and 4 other participants from India placed their children in government/private boarding homes to ensure their safe shelter and a better environment for development. Bindu, a 40-year old from India, said, "I did not want to show him [her son] what I do or where I stay. That's why I have put him in boarding school for 18 years." The popular discourse about prostitutes is that they do not care about their children and cannot be good mothers, but the narratives in this study reflect a different picture. These women demonstrated an awareness of their children's wellbeing and sought a better life for them.

Some women who kept their children in boarding school faced violence from their partner and/or ex-partner because they did not want to bring their children back to the red light area. Reena, describing her ex-partner and pimp who sold her into prostitution, said "... he hit me just four days ago...he had lodged a complaint at the police station that he wanted the children back from the boarding school...My life is already spoiled. I cannot spoil my children's life." Reena feared that as soon as her children come back to the red light district, her ex-partner might sell them into prostitution. Reena was ready to face violence to protect her children from her expartner/pimp and the red light district's influence. For their children's welfare, prostitutes may pay a big price of violence, as well as the pain of being separated from their children. Some women wanted to move out of the red light district with their children if they had the chance because they are well aware about the vices of the red light area.

Lavanya, a 39-year old from India who is now a cook at a NGO shelter, stated:

[N]ow that my children have grown up, I want to move away from here. We can move out of this place and work hard so that we can have a small house of our own. My husband [partner] contracted HIV. My husband gave me this sickness and I don't want my children to fall in bad company and get this disease. I want them to have a better life. That's what I want mostly. If we move to a better place, my children will improve.

The women in both studies also expressed that the need for safe shelter was a big challenge due to their profession and lack of finances. Women in the Indian study expressed a desire to move out of the red light area, but none said they could afford safe housing, and all said that financial difficulties and the stigma attached to their profession were obstacles. Sachi, a 45 year old from India, said, "I need a lot of help...I want to go away from this area...somewhere, even a small house would do. But I do not know when that will happen." None of the women owned their homes and each lived either in motels or shelters (in Denver), or in brothels or rented rooms in the red light area (in India); each also reported living on the streets. Lola, from Denver, shared her experiences of being homeless: "I've been homeless for almost 2 years. I slept in my trunk, back and forth, on and on, in and out, back and forth in my house." Lola highlighted the unsteady housing situation many prostitutes face. Some women in India have tried to save whatever they can to get a small hut far away from the city, but as one participant explained, the struggles of living on the street until more stable housing is found can be emotionally and physically draining. Bela, an ex-prostitute in India, works at a night care shelter. She sleeps in the shelter during her working days but has no place to go on her day off. Bela said that "...It is very difficult to stay in the night when the center (the night care shelter) is closed...I sleep outside the closed shops... I am searching for a house...You know I have two girls so I have to find a safe place." Indeed, a number of these women worry

that they will not be able to save up enough money to escape the current situations in time—a concern exacerbated by the fact that children can only stay in boarding school until they are 18. Once they reach 18, children must move back to live where their mothers stay (i.e., the red light district). When this happens, these children end up back on the same streets from which their mothers wanted to protect them. Lavanya, from India, said "...many of them have daughters who come after the age of 18 back...they have no place to go but come back to the same area...There are women who have saved a little money but they do not have enough to move out from this place."

Prostitutes faced a multitude of other challenges such as lack of a constant last name for their children and worries about their health. Last names frequently change when a woman changes her partner. Due to this, children's last names differ from their mothers, causing them problems during school or college enrollment because the documents fail to prove a relationship between them. This situation also leads to problems where mothers cannot make their children the beneficiaries of their bank accounts because of different last names. Sachi, from India, said "There is a mistake in his (son) name in the ration card, he has a different name; his name is P... on the card. His surname is K...I want to change his name, I do not want to keep P... or K... I want it to be N... My older son's last name is N.... My last name is T...."

In addition to the above-mentioned problems, these women worry about their children's future due to their health. Three out of the 11 Indian women interviewed reported having HIV/AIDS. One of these women wants her children to have a formal education degree so that they can take care of themselves. Lavanya said, "...My CD4 count reduced considerably...I was advised to start on ART [Medicine for HIV]. Now, I

work here in this NGO as a cook. I worked hard to educate my children...I enrolled them to a para-professional course, the social work course. I also got my second son enrolled in MS-CIT [computer course]." Another woman informed her children about her HIV status because she did not want them to learn about her reality from others. In addition, she told them that she could not provide for them in future due to her health. Saanvi said,

Today my children are big. I brought them up. I will not allow his [her partner] to take my children away. I have told my story to my children. I became HIV positive just because of my husband [partner]...I am growing old...I cannot feed you all now...I have told them that I have AIDS and I cannot work any more. If you guys can work and feed me then please do so. I told my daughter I can teach her until 12<sup>th</sup> grade as I do not have the strength to pay for her further education.

These are some of the challenges these women face in their lives, which makes it hard for them to move out of the profession or become successful mothers. These women, like other mothers, are concerned for their own children's welfare, a fact that is overlooked by society, policy makers, law enforcement, and social service agencies. These women need support to overcome the environmental challenges to become successful mothers. The exclusion that these women face due to their profession makes it harder for them and their children to assimilate within mainstream society. In the next section, the study participants expressed the various needs and support they require to be successful mothers.

# Programs and Support

Each of the participants in the study have 10 to 20 years of experience in prostitution. Each has faced adversity and expressed a need for certain support and services that, if delivered, could change their lives. Five women from the U.S. wanted more than one chance to get their child back. Tina, from Denver, stated that "...the first

time, they [child protective services] gave me one chance, and with that chance I tried and then failed. And then, they took him [her son] and then I went through all these things and got him back. And in the second time, there wasn't any second time." Tina stated that both her children have been adopted by foster parents, and she has no legal right to have any contact with them. The participants advocated for joint programs where both the mother and child can stay together in a safe shelter and attend interventions which help them build healthy, stable, and life-long relationships though joint counseling, self-esteem training, and empowerment programs. These programs should be designed based on the needs of these groups to help prostitutes to exit the flesh trade. Faith said: "...separately do not do that, putting the mother in jail and the kid in foster care, don't do that...I want my kids back" (sobbing). The separation from their children made these women abuse drugs and alcohol and go back into the flesh trade. In nearly every case, the U.S. women said that their children never forgave them.

Apart from these programs, women expressed a need for a 24-hour phone service, which they could use if they wanted to come out of prostitution. Angela said: "24-hour phone service. To call someone and say I do not want to go back on the streets today, but I need money for my baby's food, or diapers, or a place to stay. Can you help me... something like that..." Faith too thought an anonymous support group where prostitutes could help and support each other would be a welcome idea; "...[if I could] go to counseling just for prostitution. Not any talking about drugs, talking just about prostitution. They have Alcoholics Anonymous, they should have Prostitution Anonymous..." Meredith expressed a need for more resources available to women, especially for those who are on welfare so that they do not feel forced to turn to

prostitution to fulfill their needs. Meredith said "Have more money for the rent, the utilities, for the food stamps, because I had that, at the time I had a welfare in that time...it was just enough to pay the rent, and the food stamps barely last the month..."

In addition to these support programs, women expressed the need for education for female children, self-esteem training for young girls, programs where they can confide to someone about abuse, or receive job training, and groups where their children could accompany them. Tina said, "More services for women and children together [are needed]. Somewhere the children can be, while their mothers are in groups. And somebody watch their kids, so that they know that somebody is taking care of their kids while they are in the group."

The women from Indian expressed similar needs. All of the women in the Indian part of the study wanted to move outside of the red light area and live in a safe place with their children. They explained how much financial support for the education of their children would help. Reena stated: "It would be great if my children stayed with me... If I got some support to get a rental place somewhere. I want to leave this place, this environment, [but] I am helpless..." Other participants in the Indian study agreed.

Lavanya, now working as a cook, has three children and needs financial help for their education. She said "My one son wants to do MSW; the tuition fees are a lot. If someone helps us with some financial assistance with his school tuition, then that would be very helpful...My salary is not so much that I can afford the expense of [his] study...Most importantly moving out of this location will improve our chances of success." In addition to these needs, women require good health care since they are much more likely to come in contact with life-threatening diseases. Reena stated that she would be very grateful for

a "ration from the government and health care support when [she is] sick."

Finally, Saanvi summed up all of these needs in a few sentences when she said, "...a lot of women have house problems. They are closing this place [gentrification of the red light area] but they do not give house...The government should provide accommodation where these women can get a decent job and where school will be accessible for children and they can be well taken care of...Ration card, voting card, all these will really help. As they can use ration card to get cheap grocery and voting card can help them [to] vote [in elections]." In addition to Saanvi, Faith said, "I would really want a program that would help them, society, policy makers, and social workers, to understand the needs specifically for kids whose mothers are protitutes. There is nothing out there like that. Something that will make them understand that there are survivers too." These are some of the systems of support that these women need to have a better life, escape prostitution, and become better mothers.

#### Discussion

All 17 women in this study were mothers. The narratives related by the women addressed a number of topics, but each also discussed three important themes—the relationships these mothers have with their children, prostitutes experiences and challenges as mothers, and support programs needed to help them. These findings were analyzed using two theories: Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory. These theories help illustrate the types of exclusion these women and children face. The constant struggle they endure to keep themselves and their children alive and safe from violence shaped their life and relationships.

Five out of the 6 women in the U.S. study had lost custody of their children as

part of criminal proceedings taken against them after they were either found guilty or indicted on prostitution charges. These women reported going back to prostitution and using drugs and alcohol after losing custody of their children, a reaction that is alarmingly common among prostitutes, according to previous research (Dalla, 2001). In fact, findings from this study are similar in a number of ways to previous literature regarding prostitutes; these women are at a greater risk of facing interruption or termination of parental rights, denial of social services, and expulsion from family support services (Sheldin, 1990; Weiner, 1996). This separation leads to greater emotional and psychological distress for these women and all 6 women were visibly emotional when discussing their children. Each also expressed a yearning for unification with their children, and a fear that they will not forgive them or accept their past. Many complained that foster care should not be the only program available to the children of prostitutes; instead, there should be joint programs where mothers and children work together to rise above the effects of prostitution.

The narratives of the participants in the U.S. study were similar to the findings of pervious research; prostitutes adopted the same parenting methods as their parents (Dalla, 2004). All the U.S. participants reported facing abandonment as a child from their parents or adult caretakers, and grew up in foster care. This finding is similar to Dalla's (2002) study. Five out of 6 women in the U.S. study abandoned their children, creating an "intergeneration legacy of abuse and abandonment" (Dalla, 2002, p. 224). The women in the Indian phase of the study did not report any kind of abandonment as all 11 participants had custody of their children. These women reported protecting their children from entering prostitution, trying to keep them safe, and working to create a bright future

for their children through education. All 11 women reported healthy relationships with their children. They did not report their children hating them but had hope that their children would look after them when they grow old. Some women voluntary placed their children in boarding schools for their children's education but maintained regular contact with their children (children's responses can be found in John-Fisk's (in progress) research on the children of prostitutes). Some of the women reported leaving prostitution because of their children. All of the women repeatedly claimed that they wanted the best education and future for their children and would do anything to provide that for them. The women wanted to move out of the red light area to provide a safe and better future for their children. The distinctive differences between the social work interventions and policies in the U.S. and India affect these women's ability to be successful mothers. In the U.S., if a woman is found guilty of prostitution, she can lose the custody of her child, and the child is placed in foster care, whereas in India, women arrested as prostitutes do not lose the custody of their children. Furthermore, in India, there are several organizations working with children of prostitutes to prevent second-generation trafficking and prostitution by trying to provide them with educations. In India, prostitutes and their children are viewed as a family unit and services are catered towards keeping them together. These are the major differences in the services and policies of these two countries, which has a strong impact on the future of children of prostitutes.

According to the study participants, current programs do not meet the needs of prostitutes and their children. Alternative programs suggested by participants include early education for girl children and self-esteem programs for young girls and women. Participants also insisted that foster care should not be the only option, but instead that

joint programs for both mother and child be created to overcome situational, occupational, and family conflicts. Additionally, women expressed an interest in hotline services where others could call for support to avoid going back to prostitution, receive counseling and outreach, and find new information on prostitution anonymous groups. Other support systems mentioned included job readiness programs, housing, and shelter for prostitutes. Apart from these programs, women in India requested financial support for their children's education, help to get a ration card and voter ID card, and better health care. All of these women felt that they could have been with their children, or their situation could have been different if they had received some support. These suggestions might be helpful for addressing the needs of prostitutes and their children.

# **Social Work Policy and Implications**

The Indian Constitution and U.S. federal and state laws prohibit any forms of trafficking and prostitution (Nair, 2005; Raymond, Hughes, & Gomez, 2001). According to U.S. law, women who are arrested for prostitution must be processed through detention programs, while their children are placed in foster care. The participants of the study suggested that policy makers and social workers should ask them about their needs before designing programs for them. This study voices the needs of prostitutes and their children and hopes that social work interventions will be based along the lines of what the women actually need to have a better life.

#### Limitations

Contacting active and former members of this population presents researchers with a number of challenges. First, the illegal nature of prostitution and fear of arrest

makes these women difficult to contact. Second, limited support programs for these women in many places makes it hard to get in touch with potential participants. Third, interviewing children from the U.S. portion of the study was impossible because they were not in the custody of their mothers and most were in foster care. The participants in the U.S. study choose not to use pseudonyms, so that they could feel a sense of contribution, but this could lead to their identification. It was not possible to conduct follow-up interviews or member checking the data with participants because of the distance between the research sites and the researcher's location.

# Conclusion

The present study reveals that women in prostitution need tailor-made support systems to come out of prostitution. The current policies of detention and foster care in the U.S. do not help these women or their children from the repercussions of prostitution. In this study, the women expressed the negative effects of detention and separation from their children. The research findings strongly advocate for joint programs for women and their children instead of detention and foster care. This study also revealed that these women go through sexual abuse, and experience violence from pimps and partners. They face discrimination from police, society, and the legal system. This study showed clear differences between the experiences of prostitutes in the U.S. and India. Indian prostitutes have a close relationship with their children because they had custody of their children, which differed from that of their U.S. counterparts whose children have negative views of them. Thus, this study has created knowledge from the narratives of these women about their and their children's needs. This study could be used for development of alternative policies and programs in the U.S. and India for prostitutes and their children.

Table 1.
Demographic Information

Variables	U.S.A ( <i>n</i> =6)	India ( <i>n</i> =11)
Age		
Mean	40.83	38.18
Range	33-48	30-46
Race/Ethnicity		
African American	3	
Caucasian	2	
Native American	1	
Education		
Mean	10.25 grade	1.27 grade
Range	9-12 grade	0-6 grade
Children	22	24
Mother	1	13
Father	1	
Extended Family	4	1
Foster Care	7	
Adopted	7	
Boarding Home		7
Jail	1	
Married	1	3
Age of Entry in Prostitution		
Mean	20.83	19.1
Range	13-45	15-28
Time in Prostitution		
Mean	18.5	14.6
Range	2-34years	5-25 years

#### References

- Alexander, M. L. (2005). Social inclusion, social exclusion and social closure: What can we learn from studying the social capital of social elites? Paper presented at International Conference on Engaging Communities, Brisbane, Queensland. Paper retrieved from <a href="http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf">http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf</a>.
- Arendell, T. (2000). Conceiving and investigating motherhood: The decade's scholarship. *Journal of Marriage and the Family, 62*, 1192–1208.
- Barry, B. M. (1998). *Social exclusion, social isolation and the distribution of income*. Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics.
- Beard, J., Biemba, G., Brooks, M. I., Costello, J., Ommerborn, M., Bresnahan, M., Flynn, D., & Simon. J. L. (2010). Children of female sex workers and drug users: A review of vulnerability, resilience and family-centered models of care. *Journal of International AIDS Society*, 13, 1-8.
- BMJ (2001). Social exclusion: Old problem and new name. *British Medical Journal*, *323* (7306), 1-2. Retrieved September, 19, 2008 from <a href="http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf">http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf</a>. *323 doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.323.7306.0*
- Brofenbrenner, U. (1989). Ecological Systems Theory. In R. Vasta (Ed.) (1991). *Six theories of child development: Revised formulations and current issues* (pp.187-249). London: UK, Philadelphia: US, J. Kingsley.
- Campbell, W. K., Twenge, J., Clementz, B., McDowell. J., Krusemark, E., & Brunnell, A. (2006). Social exclusion changes brain function and can lead to poor decision-making. *Science Daily*. Retrieved April 20, 2008, from <a href="http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm">http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm</a>
- Chege, M. N., Kabiru, E. W., Mbithi, J. N., & Bwayo, J. J. (2002). Childcare practice of commercial sex workers. *East African Medical Journal*, *79*, 382-389.
- Castaneda, X., Ortiz, V., Allen, B., Garcia, C., & Hernandez-Avila, M. (1996). Sex masks: The double life of female commercial sex workers in Mexico City. *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry, 20,* 229-247.
- Dalla, R. L. (2000). Exposing the "Pretty Woman" myth: A qualitative examination of the lives of female streetwalking prostitutes. *Journal of Sex Research*, *37*, 344-353.
- Dalla, R. L. (2001). Et tu Brute?: A qualitative analysis of street prostitutes' interpersonal support networks. *Journal of Family Issues*, 22, 1066-1085.

- Dalla, R. L. (2002). Night moves: A qualitative analysis of streetwalking prostitution' interpersonal support networks. *Psychology of Women Quarterly, 24,* 63-73.
- Dalla, R. L. (2003). When the bough breaks...: Examination intergenerational parent-child relationship patterns among street-level sex workers and their parents and children. *Applied Developmental Science*, 7(4), 216-228.
- Dalla, R. L. (2004). "I fell off [the mothering] track": Barriers to "effective mothering" among prostituted women. *Family Relation*, *53*,190-200.
- Das, D. (1991). Giving the children of prostitutes their due. *ICCW News Bulletin*, 39, 31-37.
- El-Bassel, N., Witte, S. S., Wada, T., Gilbert, L., & Wallace, J. (2001). Correlates of partner violence among female street-based sex workers: Substance abuse, history of childhood abuse, and HIV risks. *AIDS Patient Care & STDs*, 15(1), 41-51.
- Ghosh, S.K. (1996). *The world of prostitution* (Vol. 1 & 2). New Delhi: APH Publishing Corporation.
- Graham, N., & Wish, E. D. (1994) Drug use among female arrestees, onset patterns, and relationships to prostitution. *The Journal of Drug Issues*, *24*, 315-329.
- Hope, E. A. (2007). Exploring the family lives of people in prostitution: A contextual approach using a human ecological systems model. (Doctoral dissertation). (Accession Order No. AAT 3285654)
- Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act of India (1986). Retrieved on 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2008 from http://ncpcr.gov.in/Acts/Immoral\_Traffic\_Prevention\_Act\_(ITPA)\_1956.pdf
- Jermyn, H. (2001). Arts and social exclusion: A review prepared for the Arts Council of England. Retrieved April, 20, 2008 from <a href="http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21&id=134">http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21&id=134</a>
- John-Fisk, H. (In progress). Understanding the voices of children of prostitutes from Mumbai, India.
- Kurtz, S., Surratt, N., Inciardi, J., & Kiley, M. (2004). Sex work and "date" violence. *Violence Against Women, 10*(4), 357-385.
- Ling, B. (2001). Growing up in the brothel: Children in the Daulotdia and Kandapara brothel communities of Bangladesh. Executive Summary. *Save the Children Sweden*, 1-7.

- Marshall, C., & Rossman, B. G. (1999). *Designing qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). California: Sage Publication.
- Monto, M. A., (2004). Female prostitution, customers, and violence. *Violence Against Women*, 10(2), 160-188.
- Nair, P. M. (2005). *Trafficking of women and children in India*. New Delhi: Orient Longman Publication.
- National Human Rights Commission Report (NHRC (2008). *Times of India*. Retrieved on 6<sup>th</sup> October 2008, from <a href="http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/India/Gay\_rights\_should\_be\_respected">http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/India/Gay\_rights\_should\_be\_respected</a> prostitution legalized NHRC chief/articleshow/3565933.cms
- Pardeshi, G., & Bhattacharya, S. (2006). Child rearing practices amongst brothel based commercial sex workers. *Indian Journal of Medical Science*, 60(7), 288-295
- Parriott, R. (1994). The health of women in prostitution. CURA Reporter, 24, 10-15.
- ProCon.org (2008). Prostitution laws of Colorado. Retrieved on 11<sup>th</sup> October 2008 from <a href="http://prostitution.procon.org/view.background-resource.php?resourceID=726">http://prostitution.procon.org/view.background-resource.php?resourceID=726</a>
- Raphel, J., & Shapiro, D. L., (2004). Violence indoor and outdoor prostitute venues *violence Against Women*, 10(2), 126-139.
- Raymond. J. G., Hughes, D. M., & Gomez, C. J. (2001). Sex trafficking of women in United States: International and domestic trends. *U.S. Department of Justice Report*.
- Schatzman, L., & Sehenkein, J. N. (1973). *Field research: Strategies for a natural sociology*. Engle-wood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Shedlin, M. G. (1990). An ethnographic approach to understanding HIV high risk behaviors: Prostitution and drug abuse. *NIDA Research Monograph*, *93*, 134-149.
- Silver, H., & Miller, S. M. (2003). Social exclusion: The European approach to social disadvantage. *Indicators: New York*, 2(3), 5-21.
- Simons, R. I., & Whitebeck, I. B. (1991). Sexual abuse as a precursor to prostitution and victimization among adolescent and adult homeless women. *Journal of Family Issues*, *12*, 361-379.
- Singh, N. K. (1997). *Divine prostitution*. A. P. H. Publishing Corporation, New Delhi.
- Sloss, C. M. (2002). *The mental health needs and service utilization of women who trade sex.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, DePaul University, Chicago, IL.

- Sloss, C. M., & Harper, G. W. (2004). When street sex workers are mothers. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 33, 329-341.
- Weshsberg, W. M., Luseno, W. K., & Lam, W. K. (2005). Violence against substance abusing South African sex workers: Intersection with culture and HIV risks. *AIDS Care*, 17(sup1), 55-64.
- Weiner, A. (1996). Understanding the social needs of streetwalking prostitutes. *Social Work, 41*(1), 97-105.

#### **CHAPTER 3**

# UNDERSTANDING THE VOICES OF CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTES FROM MUMBAI, INDIA

### Abstract

According to Beard (2010), there is a huge gap in the literature about children of prostitutes. The purpose of the study is to look at the experiences, challenges, and needs of children of prostitutes. This study included 20 children of prostitutes from the red light area of Mumbai, India. The six phases of Marshall and Rossman's (2006) method of analysis were used to analyze the data. The three main research findings were experiences and challenges of children of prostitutes, the relationships these children have with their mothers, and support programs needed to help children reach a better life. All of the narratives indicated that these children do not have an easy life, but it does not stop them from being optimistic about their future. The participants communicated a dislike for the red light area and shared the hindrances they faced in their studies. All of the participants wanted a stable and safe shelter for themselves and their mothers. These children also communicated a constant fear of being discriminated against by larger society if their identity was revealed. All of the participants conveyed that they did not want to be separated from their mothers, had good relationships with their mothers, and wanted to support them in old age. This study provides a voice to the needs of children of prostitutes and hopes that social work interventions will be developed along the lines of

what the children and women state that they actually need to have a better life. The present study reveals that children of prostitutes need tailor-made support systems for a better future.

#### Introduction

According to Beard et al. (2010) "the literature on children of prostitutes are globally limited" (p. 2). Due to the illegal nature of prostitution, it is difficult to attain the exact number of children prostitutes have in India and globally. According to the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC), in India alone, there are approximately 5.4 million children of prostitutes, and the majority of them live with their mothers in red light areas (NHRC, 2008). There has been a lack empirical of research on children of prostitutes in India. To fill this gap in the literature, this study looks into the needs and experiences of children of prostitutes. This study was conducted in red light areas in Mumbai. I used Human Ecological Systems Theory to understand the lives of prostitutes and the needs of their children. Additionally, I employed the lens of Social Exclusion Theory to examine how prostitutes and their children have been systematically excluded from mainstream society.

#### Literature Review

Previous research regarding prostitution has only considered the risks, antecedents, and prevalence of prostitution (Hope, 2007; Hughes, 2004; Hughes, 2005; Potter, Martin & Romans, 1999; Rankin, 2002; Sanders, 2004; Valandra, 2007; Weiner, 1996) or evaluated the impact of diversion programs (Wahab & Davis, 2004). These studies neglected to examine the needs of children of prostitutes.

Apart from these above-mentioned research agendas, there is some research available on the mothering aspects of prostitutes. Multiple studies conducted in the U.S. by Dalla (2000, 2001, 2003, 2004) consider the relationship between prostitutes and their parents, caregivers, and partners. Dalla's research found three important concerns associated with prostitutes and their children. First, prostitutes often remain in the sex trade in order to support their children financially. Second, women who work in prostitution and lose custody of their children as a result often report that this loss fuels their drug use; prostitution then becomes a means to support their drug habits. Third, children of prostitutes are victimized in a multitude of ways, including neglect, malnutrition or abandonment, loss of shelter, and an increased risk of entering prostitution themselves (Dalla, 2000). In Dalla's research, she could not interview children of prostitutes because their mothers faced felony charges, and if they are incarcerated while their children were minors and in their care, they stood to lose their parental rights (Dalla, 2003; Weiner, 1996).

Like Dalla, Sloss and Harper (2004) examined the ways in which motherhood affects the work of female prostitutes. They found that during pregnancy prostitutes, were emotionally strained, and felt ashamed or guilty about working on the streets. The participants in their study reported that they continued to prostitute to provide for their children financially, were careful during work to avoid arrest, and worked around their children's schedules. Fourteen out of the 16 women in their study had lost custody of their children. Similar to other U.S. studies, Sloss and Harper did not interview children of prostitutes due to a lack of access to these children caused by legal ramifications. The lack of interviews with children creates a gap in the literature about the needs and

experiences of children of prostitutes in the U.S. There have not been any studies conducted that interviewed children of prostitutes in other parts of the world.

Similar to the U.S. literature, scholarly work on this topic in India also lacks research with the children of prostitutes. There are few scientific studies regarding female prostitutes as mothers in India. The sole empirical study, performed by Pardeshi and Bhattacharya (2006), looked at child bearing, childcare practices, family support, and placement options of children of brothel-based female prostitutes. In other research concerning children of prostitutes, Das (1991) presented a report that described various difficulties female prostitutes face when bringing up children, including violence from brothel keepers who keep children away from mothers in order to increase the women's productivity. Neither of these Indian studies considered the needs and experiences of children of prostitutes.

Beard et al. (2010) reviewed a large range of literature on the vulnerability and resilience of drug users' and prostitutes' children. The study found that the children of prostitutes face vulnerabilities such as separation from parents, sexual abuse, early sexual debut, introduction to sex work as adolescents, low school enrollment, psychosocial issues arising from witnessing their mother's sexual interactions with clients, and social marginalization (Beard et al., 2010). However, Beard et al. (2010) only reviewed relevant literature and did not conduct any significant primary data collection. Because of this approach, gaps in the literature remained intact.

These above studies did not examine the needs of children of prostitutes. Thus, the purpose of the study presented here is to find:

1. What are the experiences, educational challenges, and needs of children of

prostitutes?

2. What types of services do they need to overcome these challenges?

My prior work with prostitutes and their children in India has highlighted a number of the problems these children face, increasing my interest in this research. Since I wanted to understand the experiences and needs of this population in India, the importance of this study is two fold. First, the literature reveals the lack of empirical study about the needs of children of prostitutes. Second, the findings of this study will help us understand and evaluate the needs of children of prostitutes and their mothers in a more in-depth manner.

# Theoretical Framework

Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory was chosen for this study because it helped me to understand the responses of children of prostitutes in a comprehensive manner. Human Ecological System Theory is used to examine the voices of children of prostitutes, their every-day struggle for survival, and the affect of their mother's profession in their lives. Furthermore, Social Exclusion Theory was used to help examine children of prostitutes' opinions about the exclusion they endure from mainstream society.

#### Human Ecological Systems Theory

Human Ecological Systems Theory, as proposed by Bronfenbenner (1989), is concerned with the interaction and interdependence of humans. In this theory, human development is viewed as a reciprocal and life-long process of interaction between persons and their environments, which manifests in a set of nested structures, which are linked as different layers of social influence. Each system contains roles, norms, and rules

that can shape human development as well as help explain the specific individual behavior or experience of individuals. Human Ecological System Theory has five layers, which are the microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, macrosystem, and chronosystem. The microsystem is the individual's immediate environment (e.g., family, school, peers). The mesosystem is comprised of connections between immediate environments (e.g., a child's school and peer group). The exosystem is the external environment setting, which only indirectly affects the development of children (e.g., parent's workplace). The macrosystem is the larger cultural context, including the national economy and laws, as well as political, cultural, and sub-cultural systems. Finally, the chronosystem, which is time-related, reflects dynamic environment transitions.

Both micro- and mesosystems will be used to explore the immediate life of children of prostitutes in their family, school, and in the red light district. The exosystem will help us understand the effect of their mothers' work on the day-to-day lives of their children. The macrosystem will also be useful for interpreting how various legal ramifications impact these children's experiences. The chronosystem will also permit us to survey circumstances that may affect children of prostitute's current life situations and future prospects. Through this process, we will achieve a more holistic view of children of prostitutes, which will help us to understand their and their mothers' needs so that practitioners can develop and provide better support for these populations.

# Social Exclusion Theory

Parkin derived Social Exclusion Theory from Weber's discussion on Social Closure Theory (Alexander, 2005). Social Exclusion Theory examines the systematic method of discrimination used to isolate people from mainstream society due to their

ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, ancestry, gender, age, disability, HIV status, migrant status, or place of habitation (Silver & Miller, 2003). Social exclusion can lead to exclusion from educational opportunities, leading to unequal education (Barry, 1998). According to the British Medical Journal (BMJ), social exclusion may contribute to children's poor educational performance and achievements, unmanageable behavior, drug misuse, unemployment, teenage pregnancy, homelessness, crime, and suicide (BMJ, 2001). Importantly, social exclusion can be experienced at different levels since it can affect individuals, groups, or geographic areas (Jermyn, 2001).

Campbell et al. (2006) argued that social exclusion can cause changes in a person's brain function and can lead to poor decision-making and a diminished learning ability. The research linked social exclusion with a failure to exert self-control. For instance, people who are rejected in social situations often respond by abusing alcohol, expressing aggression inappropriately, or performing poorly at school or work (Campbell et al., 2006). This theory, then, can help us to understand in a profound manner the effect that exclusion from mainstream society can have on children of prostitutes due to their mother's profession. This understanding will help us develop and determine appropriate interventions for these two vulnerable groups.

#### Methods

# **Participants**

This study included 20 children of prostitutes from the red light area of Mumbai, India (see Table 2 for demographic details). The participant's ages ranged from 8-16 years. These children hailed from different states in India; 8 were from Paschim Banga (West Bengal), 6 came from Karnataka, 3 were from Maharashtra, and 3 children were

unaware of their ancestral villages. All of the children lived with their mothers in the red light area, where their mother's had rented a small space in the red light area or in a brothel itself. The years of educational experience ranged from third to tenth grade when the interview was conducted. The participants shared their experiences as children whose mothers were prostitutes; they discussed their relationships with their mothers, peers, and teachers. They shared their challenges in school and in the red light area. They also identified the support and programs they felt they needed to be successful in their lives.

# Procedure

I received IRB approval from the University of Utah. The participants were enrolled in the study through home/brothel visits I conducted in the red light district of Mumbai. I informed the prostitutes and their children about the nature, purpose, and scope of the study and gave them a referral sheet. Those who were willing to participate informed me about their decision when I visited them again. After I developed the participant list, I met with each participant's mother and got their permission and the children's assent prior to conducting the interviews. An appointment was fixed at a time and date convenient for the children. The interviews were conducted in an old school building in the red light area. Additionally, I used snowball sampling to obtain enough participants for the study. Each participants was briefed about the scope and nature of the interview and were informed that participation in the study was voluntary and that they could withdraw from the study at any time. All personal information such as names and contact information were kept confidential. Pseudonyms have been used to quote the participant's voices. Each interview was audio-taped with consent. Child participants were compensated with a dictionary (Marathi-Hindi-English).

In-depth personal interviews were conducted with all 20 participants. These youth were asked questions regarding their background, school, support for studies, future, and their life experiences and needs as children of prostitutes. The interview questions were pre-determined and were semistructured, but the order in which the questions were asked depended on each participant's answer to the prior question. The length of interviews varied from 30 to 120 minutes. All interviews were conducted in Hindi or Bengali based on the participant's choice of language. All interviews were translated and then transcribed by other professionals, peers and me. The interview responses were transcribed in the form of narratives in keeping with the nature of the participants' answers. I verified all the transcripts and read and reread the data to ensure familiarity. While reading, I made necessary editorial changes to make the field notes retrievable, and generally "cleaned up" the data, as suggested by Pearsol (1985).

# Data Analysis

The six phases of Marshall and Rossman's method of analysis were used to analyze the data (Marshall and Rossman, 1999). In the initial phase, I did line-by-line coding of the data. After going through the transcript, I determined the emerging themes in the study. By questioning the data and reflecting on the conceptual framework, I identified various themes, such as educational challenges, teasing, discrimination, challenges in the community, and nonprofits to name a few. Information of each theme was then read and reread to identify differences between them, which led to the final themes of challenges, relationship with their mother, discrimination, future endeavors, and programs and supports. Narrative data around each theme was then studied intensively to see if these multiple themes could be merged or separated. I evaluated the

data to understand the usefulness of the themes and to see if they helped to answer the research questions. In addition, I made note of any negative instances of patterns and critically analyzed the data for alternative explanations, which helped identify another view and consider in-depth knowledge of the data from various angles. I used Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory to interpret and understand the themes.

# **Findings**

The participants of this study identified themselves as children of prostitutes, who were either born in the brothel or in the village where their mothers originated. All participants acquired services from nonprofit organizations in the neighborhood of the red light area, including day care, night care, and/or an after-school tutoring program. These children shared their day-to-day life experiences and challenges. The major findings of this paper are categorized into three themes as follows: challenges faced in school, the community, and nonprofits such as teasing and discrimination; relationship with their mothers; and needs and support for a better future.

# Challenges in School, the Community, and Nonprofits

Of the 20 participants, 18 went to public school in the vicinity of the red light area, and 2 children went to a school away from the red light area. These children faced numerous educational challenges, such as a lack of teachers in schools and nonprofit organizations, large class sizes, inability to read and write, difficulties concentrating, and repeating grades due to a lack of documentation or frequent migration.

Karishma, like other participants, faced challenges such as not being able to read

well. Karishma expressed that "I have problems only in language... I don't know how to read/study in language, science, geography... meaning... I can read single letters and say...I cannot read fluently." She said that she was unable to read fluently because of a lack of personal attention from her teachers: "[In the NGO after-school program] over here, there is no one to give me individual attention." Like Karishma, Anmol thinks it is hard to study because "...there are difficulties with studying...[because of a] lack of teachers..." Both Karishma and Anmol expressed that there are not enough teachers both in schools and in after-school programs run by nonprofit organizations. The same concern was presented by Yuvraai when he said that "Yes, they take the 5<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> graders together...4<sup>th</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> graders sit together in one class and bai [the school teacher] teaches them all... there are few teachers, that is why." Due to a lack of teachers, multiple classes are taught by the same teacher, which makes it very difficult for these children to concentrate in classes and learn. Another child named Akhil said "We are 1st - $2^{nd} - 3^{rd} - 4^{th}$  ... first we used to be  $1^{st}$  and  $5^{th}$  sit in the same class room. Sometimes, the teacher doesn't come." Mohit expressed similar concerns, "Teachers were not there [nonprofit]. No one is there to guide us. Dada used to come in the evening, but we have a shortage of teachers." These are some of the reasons given by these participants leading them to perform poorly in their academics. As Karishma summarizes, "[Read fluently] that is how I should be able to read but I cannot... that's what I often think, if I knew how to read, I would have passed."

Furthermore, these children perform poorly in school because the teaching is done in a local language that is often different from the children's native languages. Most of these children migrated from different regions of India and do not speak the local

language. Due to this, they are unable to understand what is taught. Mohit said, "My only problem is math and science and little bit of Marathi. I am not Marathi. I am Kannada. Sometimes the question paper is really hard. I cannot understand the lessons. Some words are very difficult and tough... I don't understand certain words." Like Mohit, most children have difficultly with a new language.

Apart from language issues, these children started from 1st grade when they moved from their village to Mumbai. Nine out of the 20 children had to start from 1st grade when they moved due to a lack of school exit certificates from their old schools since their mothers were uprooted and trafficked from their villages. In addition, there is no standardized test that these children can take to prove their level of education; neither are there any remedial classes for these children to learn the language to catch up with their peers in their grade. Surva had to start from first grade when she moved from her village in Paschim Banga to Mumbai and had to learn Marathi. Surya said, "Yes, I went to school in the village. I studied there until 4th grade. I am in 3rd grade here. I would have been in 7th grade if I was in the village." Unlike Surya, Armaan was in a boarding school near Mumbai and had his education in the local language Marathi, but still had to start from 1st grade due to a lack of standardized books. Armaan said, "I was in boarding in Lonawala. I studied until 7th grade there, and failed. Now I am in 3rd std. [grade] because the books are different here. Yes, I studied in Marathi medium, but books are different here, so I can't read books. First I was in 1st grade then now I am in 3rd grade."

In addition to these challenges, the participants reported having a hard time concentrating on their studies, because adults from the brothel ask these children to run errands. Saikat said, "I do not like staying here. The area is not good. I cannot study at

home. There is a lot of noise. People play music very loudly. Yes, people do ask to get tea or other things. And then I get disturbed in my studies." Like Saikat, Mohit faces the same problem. He suggested the need for a facility only for older children where they can sit and study without disturbances. Mohit said, "If it's crowded, we cannot study. And then they make us run errands and this distracts us from our studies. We need a facility where no one will disturb us but only for older children that will help us concentrate."

Apart from running errands for adults, these children mentioned a great deal of noise due to fights in the community, which make it hard to concentrate. Udar, who is in 8th grade, finds it hard to study at home so he goes to different agencies to study. Udar said, "After coming home [from school], I freshen up and then invariably, there are fights in the *basti* [red light area]... then because of cash shortage, my parents' tempers are also short... they are mostly angry... I take my books and go out and study..." Like Udar, Anmol also finds it hard to study in the community. Anmol said, "Over there [the red light area]... lot of disturbance in studies because every day there are fights... so I have difficulties. So I [either go] to Shiv Sena center or I [go] to [NGO]."

In addition, these children cannot study in the community because they do not have the space nor can they switch on the lights in the morning because prostitutes in the brothel where they stay are sleeping in the morning. Armaan said, "I try to study here. I cannot study at home because when I switch on the lights, the women shout at me. So I study outside the house. But here, it is difficult to study." Like Armaan, Samak expressed that he "Cannot study any time, only when someone is awake at home, then I can study. I go out and study..." Manish sums up what others said, "In our area, there is no chance that we can study. House is also very small. I cannot study there, no space. There is

constant fights and use of abusive language in our area." Jasmine found it hard to concentrate and remember her lessons: "I need someone to explain things to me... now, if the teacher teaches me... the moment I start playing I forget the whole lesson..."

Furthermore, the participants also shared their concerns about being disturbed by other children when they study in after-school tutoring programs in nonprofit agencies. Kamal said, "But most of the times when children play a lot of mischief, I am not able to study." Nargis adds to Kamal's concern, "Yes, when I have to do my studies, I get angry, especially when the teacher is teaching us and some children are creating a racket. Yes, I have told this to the social worker here. She shouted at these children but they do not listen to her." Nargis also expressed her concern about these children's behavior, which led to a teacher not coming back to teach. Nargis said,

We who have to study, we sit in a different room. There was a teacher here before. She used to teach very well. She used to explain each question again and again. She taught math, language, and everything. The students played a lot of pranks on her, did not listen, made her cry two, three times. The children back answered several times. Then the teacher stop coming so they [agency] are looking for a new teacher since one year.

These are several problems these children face to get a good education and perform well in their academics.

#### Teasing and Discrimination

Apart from the above mentioned problems, these children face a great deal of teasing from their peers in school, the community, and nonprofit agencies. The children reported that teasing leads to fighting and calling each other names. Samak said, "Sometimes [I fight when] they [other children] abuse me. Yes... they call me drug addict son...no my father [mother's partner] is not a drug addict, but the children call

such names." Unlike Samak, his peer Jasmine was teased by an adult man who wanted sexual favors from her in exchange for money. Jasmine said, "Once [man tease me] when we were in the garden. He was trying to bribe me with 100 rupees. I was there with my friends and my brothers and sisters, when we all started shouting at him, he went away. But we saw he followed us until the [NGO] and then went away..." In contrast to Samak's and Jasmine's experiences, Anmol faced discrimination because of where he stayed. Anmol's school is not in the red light area and he is the only child in his school from the red light area. Anmol said "You need to give your address in school. The teacher had asked if anyone had problems in studies or otherwise. I told them where I stayed and problem in my studies. I told them that I live in such-and-such area... so that's how they got to know...And then they tease me. Most tease." These children not only face discrimination because of where they are from but they fear that they will face discrimination once they go out of the red light area. Nargis shared her fears when she said,

I won't tell anyone where I live when I go to college. I won't tell them 'cause this is not a nice place. No one will be my friend. And they will tease me. Yes I am scared to go out from here. Will people understand me? Maybe if they are nice people then they will understand. If they are not nice, then they won't accept me. Only if my college authorities understand, then only I tell them where I live otherwise: I won't.

These are some of the challenges these children face in their day-to-day lives as children of prostitutes.

# Relationships with Their Mothers

All of the participants interviewed lived with their mothers in the red light area.

They shared how their mothers provide for them and protect them. They expressed

concern for their mother's work, health, partner, needs, and support. These children also expressed a desire not to be separated from their mothers, and how they wanted to support their mothers.

Nargis shared how her mother protected her when there was a police raid in the red light area. Like Nargis, all of the participants stated that their mothers were protective about them. Nargis said,

Once there were multiple raids going on in the community. When the raid was going on, I was standing near a store. The police started questioning me. "What are you doing here? Are you luring someone?" They were arresting me. Then, my mother came and told the police that I study in school and I stay at home. And I do not solicit. Then the police left me, otherwise they were going to arrest me.

The participants of the study were aware of their mother's profession and had concerns and anger towards the people who pushed their mother into the flesh trade.

Rajanigandha said,

I feel very bad seeing my mother be a prostitute. I want to tell her but then she would think that in spite of me knowing everything I'm trying to make her understand, so that is why I do not tell her anything. I feel like telling her that you should not wear short clothes and she is the mother of three children. She tells me that I'm earning and feeding you so why are you telling me. I get very angry. I feel like strangling the lady who brought my mother to this.

Apart from being concerned about their mothers' profession, the children in this study were also aware of the challenges their mothers faced. Ross was well aware that her mother did not want to solicit but had to provide basic amenities like paying rent. Ross said, "Mummy doesn't want to go for work but then she has to pay for the rent. If I tell her not to go, she won't. We have [to] pay the rent of Rupees 60 per day [approximately 1.20 U.S. Dollar]. She has to pay rent for 3 months now."

The children are also aware that their mothers are beaten up by their partners and expressed concern about these incidences. Surya said, "Yes, he [mother's partner] beats

her a lot. One day, he beat her and made her eye swell up. When I ask my mom why she is staying with him, she says she loves him." Surya also was aware that her mother had financial problems. Surya said, "We do not have much trouble except that my mom has to give her earnings to Anna. He is a money lender. We had borrowed money from him." Even though the children are aware of these problems, they still wanted to be with their mothers. Nargis expressed her concern about foster care and boarding homes:

I want to stay with my mom. No, I will not go. I will stay with my mom. Foster care is not nice. In boarding school, at least you can see your mom. Even if their mothers are prostitutes, they should be with their moms or in constant touch with their mom if they are in boarding school.

Similarly, Manish also wanted to be with his mother. Manish said, "I do not want to go away from here... I can't stay away from my mother." Rajanigandha contended that "I want to say that there should not be any Kamatipura [red light area]. So many die; many children lose their mothers. No one should separate us from our mothers. There are so many mothers here who have left their children in the village."

These children not only wanted to be with their mother but they also wanted to take care of them. Anmol said, "If I get a good salary, then I would like to take a room somewhere else and move my entire family... I will be able to take care of my brother and sister..." Likewise, Manish (7th grade) wanted to do something for his mother but felt bad that he was still small. Manish said, "I feel very bad. I want to take her and leave this place. But what can I do as I am small. We don't have enough money...I am not angry but it's a strange feeling about her working here. I love her very much. I won't leave her. Yes, I want to take my mom out of this area when I grow up." Like both Anmol and Manish, many other participants shared similar feelings. Jasmine said, "I will study and get a good job somewhere... and take a room on rent somewhere out and I will

take mummy there..." Rajanigandha said, "When I grow up, I will work and I will support my mother." All the participants expressed tremendous love and concern for their mothers. They wanted a better life for their mothers and wanted to support them in their old age.

# Needs and Support: For a Better Future

The participants in this study were well aware of their challenges, but it did not stop them from striving for a better future. All of the participants shared their future dreams, what they need to do to achieve that dream, and what support they would need to help fulfill that dream. The participants also expressed what programs would help children like them.

In terms of dreams, Samak said, "When I grow up, I want to become a scientist. I will have to put my mind to each and every subject... I'll study till the 15th grade [Undergradate]." Manish said, "I want to be a CA. Chartered Accountant... study math well. I take help of teachers in math." Khusi expressed her desire to be a doctor. Khusi said "I want to be a doctor. I want to be a childrens' doctor. The children get fever so I can cure them. I have to study until 12th [grade]. Then give exams and study in big colleges, learn computer and study hard." Like these children, Udar said, he wanted to be "a software engineer of computers. For that, I will have to study. From where I am learning (computers), I will have to ask the teacher what all is required... what qualifications..." Unlike his peers, Maan has not decided what he wants to be now: "Sometimes I feel I should be police but now I don't think, I just want to study. If we study well and get good marks, then only we can decide what we can become." In

contrast to these children Mohit just has a dream to support his mother. Mohit said, "I want to buy a house for my mother."

To achieve these dreams, these children identified certain support they require from their parents, nonprofits, and government. In addition, the participants were aware of the hard work they have to put in to achieve their dreams. Ross noted, "I want to be a doctor. For which I need to study a lot. I want to be a Pediatrician..." Manish stated, "Yes, I hope I will fulfill my dream. I will work hard to achieve my dream. Study a lot...Study well and hard and move ahead." These children also expressed what support they required to achieve their goals. Udar said, "I want to become a football player. I'm learning the football techniques from Magic Bus. They [parents and NGO] should send me to a bigger team." Unlike Udar, Manish feared that he might not get any support in the future. Manish expressed, "I want Non-Governmental Organization [NGO] to support me. I'm scared what if they ask me to go or leave."

In addition to these issues, children conveyed the need for career counseling and mentoring. Udar said,

If a software engineer can come and tell us what to do, that would help. I can use the Internet to find information. Like here, we have career guidance. I wish someone would come and talk to us about computer engineering. That would be helpful. If they ask the children what they want to become when they grow big and then accordingly bring professionals from those fields, then that would be very informative and helpful.

Similar to Udar, Manish conveyed the need for sessions (guidance) which help him choose a better high school. Manish said, "I have told Didi [the social worker] to take session on the different schools so we can have options. We should talk to different teachers of different schools so we can choose the best school for us." Apart from career counseling, some children communicated the need for a shelter for male children older

then 14 years of age because night care shelters have a policy of not accepting male children older then 14 years. Shelters for children, including street children, are often reluctant or do not take in children of prostitutes. Also, children in the red light area do not like to go to these shelters because they are far away from the red light area. Anmol said, "I go there [NGO]...I am older than 14 years so I cannot sleep here. Yes, there are problems [at home]. There is only one cot and there are five of us...Yes, I think they should be night care shelter for boys older than 14 years... not big boys but at least until school...or school or college student." Rajanigandha said,

I require help from my mother and [NGO]: they should encourage me and not stop me. From my mother, I need love. From father [mother's partner], I need that he feeds us. From my friends, I require support. I want to have my own beauty parlor/salon. I will learn English and Hindi. I will earn by stitching clothes.

Manish said he needs "Help in my studies, financial help. I need financial assistance, information and help to move out."

Nargis provided a holistic view of the needs of women and children in the red light district along with critiquing the context that perpetuates prostitution when she said,

I would ask the government to do something that would change this whole place and make it nice. Means that no one should solicits. Give them [prostitutes] jobs, which give them sufficient money so that they can take care of their families. Then, they stop being prostitutes. There should be better schools. They should be games organized for them [children] so that they can play and also study. And for myself...Maybe I will ask for a good job with a good salary. It should be close to my house.

# Like Nargis, Mohti also thinks that the

Government should provide employment to all the women in this profession. This will help them get better income and enough earnings for their need. That way, they can quit this...[prostitution]. If everyone gets a job, they will stop prostitution and this area will ultimately change...If they select only educated/literates, then the organization should teach the illiterates. Adult education. If they will also study, government will get them jobs. [Regarding ration card] Yes. With ration card, they can save on the money, which they now spend on buying grocery

at higher prices.

This study's findings critique the popular discourse that the children of prostitutes will not be successful. The findings of this study clearly show that these children are not only excelling in their studies but are also very mindful of what they want to do in the future, even with all of the obstacles in their lives. The narratives of the study convey the various supports these children need for a better future for themselves, their mothers, and the community.

### Discussion

All 20 participants in this study were children of prostitutes. The narratives related by these participants touched on a number of topics, but each also discussed three important areas—experiences and challenges as children of prostitutes, the relationships they have with their mothers, and the support needed to help them reach a better life. These findings were analyzed using two theories: Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory. These theories helped illustrate the types of exclusion these children face in their day-to-day lives from peers, school, and society. For example, the participants recounted being teased and bullied when their classmates learned about their backgrounds, which made them feel like outsiders to their peers. Social Exclusion Theory is useful because this theory states that people can be excluded or prevented from fully participating in education and society based on where they are from or because of their identities. The study findings reveal various challenges these children face, and the way these obstacles complicate their lives as students and young adults who lack support from extended family or societal support.

All of the narratives indicated that these children do not have an easy life, but it

did not stop them from being optimistic about their futures. All of the children expressed a need for more teachers in school and nonprofit agencies. These children conveyed a need for small class sizes, which could help them to concentrate better. The participants communicated a dislike for the red light area and shared the hindrances they face in their studies. All the participants wanted a stable and safe shelter for themselves and their mothers for a better future. These children also communicated a constant fear of being discriminated against by larger society when their identity is revealed and loss of support if the NGO they use closes down.

All participants conveyed that they did not want to be separated from their mothers. The children had good relationships with their mothers and wanted to support them in old age. Some participants did not mind going to boarding schools if they could be in touch with their mothers. Some participants expressed a need for facilities which would provide night care shelter to male children above the age of 14 years. The participants conveyed their perspectives and interactions in the micro-, meso-, exo- and macrosystems conflict of Human Ecological Systems Theory. For the microsystem, the participants did not want to be separated from their mothers. For the mesosystem, participants said that they were bullied, excluded, and discriminated against by their school peers and as a response to this, they tried to hide their identity as children of prostitutes. For the exosystem, the children told the researcher that they strongly dislike the red light area and wanted to move out with their mothers. For the macrosystem, the participants expressed a desire to end the system of prostitution and abolish the red light area.

In addition to these items, the children expressed a need for financial support for

their education. They also conveyed a need for better jobs and housing for the women in red light area so that they can leave prostitution and have a better future. The children also expressed the need for ration cards and voter identification cards for their mothers and other women in the red light area. These are some of the suggestions these children offered that might be helpful for addressing their families' needs.

The study participants advocated for more teachers, remedial classes, career counseling, and mentoring programs to help them perform better in their academics. They expressed the need for facilities for older children where they could study without being disturbed by adults or younger children from the community. These participants conveyed the desire to live with their mothers. This study provides voice to the needs of children of prostitutes and hopes that social work intervention will be based along the lines of what the children say they actually need to have a better life. There were similarities in the recommendations given by the children of prostitutes and their mothers (John-Fisk, in progress).

## Limitations

Contacting child participants presents researchers with a number of challenges. First, during the time of the interviews, the schools were closed due to election and vacations. Second, older children had dropped out of school, making it hard to contact them. Third, girl children above the age of 14 years were hard to located because either they were sent to boarding homes or to their villages. Fourth, male participants younger then 11 years were less verbal than their female peers. I was not able to do member checking with them due to availability of the participants and distance between my location and that of the participants. Further research needs to be done with children of

prostitutes above the age of 17 to find out their experiences and recommendations.

# Conclusion

The present study reveals that children of prostitutes need tailor-made support systems for a better future. The research findings strongly advocate for support that does not remove children from their mothers, but aids them in becoming part of mainstream society. This study helps us to see the day-to-day lives of children of prostitutes, which has been missing from previous research. This study can be helpful for policy makers to be more aware of this vulnerable population to create policies designed to address the specific needs of this population. In addition, alternative policies and programs in India and elsewhere in the world for children of prostitutes should be considered and developed.

Table 2. Demographic Information

Name	Gender	Age	Grade	No. of years in red light area	State
Karishma	Female	10	4	6-7	Paschim Banga (West Bengal)
Bobby	Male	10	3	7-8	Paschim Banga
Yuvraaj	Male	9	5	8-9	Paschim Banga
Arnaav	Male	10	5	3-4	Karnataka
Akhil	Male	8	3	7-8	Maharashtra
Kamal	Male	12	8	11-12	Maharashtra
Rajanigandha	Female	11	3	4-5	Maharashtra
Udar	Male	13	8	11-12	Karnataka
Anmol	Male	14	10	13-14	Karnataka
Khushi	Female	14	3	3-4	Paschim Banga
Surya	Female	12	3	3-4	Paschim Banga
Jasmine	Female	13	3	3-4	Paschim Banga
Armaan	Male	12	3	5-6	Unknown
Shamak	Male	12	4	10-11	Unknown
Ross	Female	11	6	6-7	Paschim Banga
Maan	Male	11	3	10-11	Karnataka
Nargis	Female	12	6	11-12	Karnataka
Saikat	Male	12	3	4-5	Paschim Banga
Mohit	Male	16	9	15-16	Karnataka
Manish	Male	15	7	14-15	Unknown

#### References

- Alexander, M. L. (2005). Social inclusion, social exclusion and social closure: What can we learn from studying the social capital of social elites? Paper presented at International Conference on Engaging Communities, Brisbane, Queensland. Paper retrieved from <a href="http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf">http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf</a>.
- Barry, B. M. (1998). *Social exclusion, social isolation and the distribution of income*. Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics.
- Beard, J., Biemba, G., Brooks, M. I., Costello, J., Ommerborn, M., Bresnahan, M., Flynn, D., & Simon. J. L. (2010). Children of female sex workers and drug users: A review of vulnerability, resilience and family-centered models of care. *Journal of International AIDS Society*, *13*,1-8.
- BMJ (2001). Social exclusion: Old problem and new name. *British Medical Journal*, *323* (7306), 1-2. Retrieved September, 19, 2008 from <a href="http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf">http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf</a>. *323 doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.323.7306.0*
- Brofenbrenner, U. (1989). Ecological Systems Theory. In R.Vasta (Ed.) (1991). *Six theories of child development: Revised formulations and current issues* (pp. 187-249). London: UK, Philadelphia: US, J. Kingsley.
- Campbell, W. K., Twenge, J., Clementz, B., McDowell. J., Krusemark, E., & Brunnell, A. (2006). Social exclusion changes brain function and can lead to poor decision-making. *Science Daily*. Retrieved April 20, 2008, from <a href="http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm">http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm</a>
- Dalla, R. L. (2000). Exposing the "Pretty Woman" myth: A qualitative examination of the lives of female streetwalking prostitutes. *Journal of Sex Research*, *37*, 344-353.
- Dalla, R. L. (2001). Et tu Brute?: A qualitative analysis of street prostitutes' interpersonal support networks. *Journal of Family Issues*, *22*, 1066-1085.
- Dalla, R. L. (2002). Night moves: A qualitative analysis of streetwalking prostitution' interpersonal support networks. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 24, 63-73.
- Dalla, R. L. (2003). When the bough breaks...: Examination intergenerational parent-child relationship patterns among street-level sex workers and their parents and children. *Applied Developmental Science*, 7(4), 216-228.
- Dalla, R. L. (2004). "I fell off [the mothering] track": Barriers to "effective mothering" among prostituted women. *Family Relation*, *53*,190-200.

- Das, D. (1991). Giving the children of prostitutes their due. *ICCW News Bulletin*, *39*, 31-37.
- Hope, E. A. (2007). Exploring the family lives of people in prostitution: A contextual approach using a human ecological systems model. (Doctoral dissertation). (Accession Order No. AAT 3285654)
- Hughes. D. (2004). Best practices to address the demand side of sex trade trafficking. *U.S.* Department of Justice Report.
- Hughes. D. (2005). The Demand for Victims of Sex Trafficking. U.S. Department of Justice Report.
- John-Fisk, H. (In progress). A comparative study of mothering among prostitutes in the U.S. and India.
- Jermyn, H. (2004). *The art of inclusion* (Vol. 35). London: Arts Council England. Retrieved April, 20, 2008 from <a href="http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21">http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21</a> &id=134
- National Human Rights Commission Report (NHRC (2008). *Times of India*. Retrieved on 6<sup>th</sup> October 2008, from <a href="http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/India/Gay\_rights\_should\_be\_respected">http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/India/Gay\_rights\_should\_be\_respected</a> prostitution legalized NHRC chief/articleshow/3565933.cms
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, B. G. (1999). *Designing Qualitative Research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). California: Sage Publication.
- Pardeshi, G., & Bhattacharya, S. (2006). Child rearing practices amongst brothel based commercial sex workers. *Indian Journal of Medical Science*, 60(7), 288-295.
- Potter, K., Martin, J., & Romans, S. (1999). Early developmental experiences of female sex workers: A comparative study. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, *33*, 935-940.
- Rankin, S. (2002). The sex industry exposed. *American Feminist*, 9(1), 10-37.
- Sander, T. (2004). Controllable laughter: Managing sex work through humor. *Sociology*, *38*(2), 273-291.
- Silver, H., & Miller, S. M. (2003). Social exclusion: The European approach to social disadvantage. *Indicators:New York*, 2(3), 5-21.
- Sloss, C. M., & Harper, G. W. (2004). When street sex workers are mothers. Archives of

- Sexual Behavior, 33, 329-341.
- Valandra. (2007). Reclaiming their lives and breaking free: An Afrocentric approach to recovery from prostitution. *Affilia*, 22, 195-208.
- Wahab, S., & Davis, R. (2004). An evaluation of the Salt Lake prostitution diversion program. Unpublished report. College of Social Work, University of Utah.
- Weiner, A. (1996). Understanding the social needs of streetwalking prostitutes. *Social Work, 41*(1), 97-105.

#### CHAPTER 4

# UNCOVERING THE LIVES OF CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTE THROUGH THE EYE OF STAKEHOLDERS IN MUMBAI, INDIA

### Abstract

There is a lack of research examining stakeholder challenges in working with prostitutes and their children as well as a lack of information on what stakeholders view as the needs of this population. The purpose of this study is to fill this void in the literature by addressing these issues. The study participants consisted of 8 stakeholders working in red light areas of Mumbai, India. The research findings indicated that stakeholders face several challenges while providing services to this set of populations. The findings also suggest that prostitutes and their children encounter various challenges in their daily lives such as language barriers, discrimination, financial problems, and the need for safe spaces and shelter. Stakeholders also shared that some of the key supports this group require including the following: children need assistance for education, women and children need government issued identification documents, sensitization programs are needed for the general public and stakeholders such as doctors or police, and prostitutes need support programs like vocational training to exit the flesh trade. The recommendations made in this study can serve as a guide, a tool for advocacy, and/or as a needs assessment for organizations to develop programs for prostitutes and their children.

This study has the potential to help build and create policies and programs for organizations. This research gives a new dimension to the discourses on prostitutes by considering the views of stakeholders who provide services to both prostitutes and their children.

#### Introduction

According to Freeman (1984), stakeholders are "any group or individual who is affected by or can affect the achievement of an organization's objectives" (p. 46).

Freeman's (1984) definition of stakeholders originally referred to the business sector.

Waine, Tunstill, Meadows, and Peel (2005) state that "The term has been transferred to discussions of the activities of a wider range of organizations, including providers of public services" (p. 1). In social work, stakeholders consist of service providers, i.e., social workers, organizations, policy makers, and others. In the area of prostitution, stakeholders consist of customers, pimps, brothel keepers, police, policy makers, and social workers. These stakeholder groups will be discussed in this article.

There have been a number of studies working with the stakeholders for prostitutes (Karandikar, 2008; Monto, 2004; Wahab, 2005). This research has focused on stakeholders such as customers, intimate partners, and social workers to understand the violence in the lives of prostitutes and/ or to evaluate a prostitution-diversion project. However, there is a gap in the literature because almost no research has concentrated on stakeholders who provide services to the children of prostitutes. Since the children of prostitutes are often in foster care due to the illegal nature of prostitution, it is very difficult to contact them (Dalla, 2003; Weiner, 1996). The literature on prostitutes is incomplete without any empirical study on the stakeholders for children of prostitutes.

For the purpose of this article, stakeholders are defined as project directors, social workers, out-reach workers, after-school teachers, and public school teachers. This article's focus is on the challenges stakeholders endure in providing services, and will answer the questions: What challenges do stakeholders face to provide services to prostitutes and their children? What support do stakeholder's need to provide these services? This article is also interested in what stakeholders view as the various challenges prostitutes and their children face in their lives and what support is needed for them to have a better future.

## Literature Review

Research on stakeholders for prostitutes consists of customers, pimps, police officers, brothel keepers, social workers, and government officials. There has been some research related to customers, social workers, and intimate partners. In his summarization of research regarding customers of prostitutes, Monto (2004) found that police responses towards arresting customers were minimal until feminists criticized this strategy. Before this critique, only 10% of customers were arrested compared to the total number of prostitutes arrested (Monto, 2004). This critique led to the creation of vice police and john schools. His study gives detailed information about customers: their characteristics, motivation, attitudes, orientation, and experiences (Monto, 2004). In addition, the research emphasized the violence inflicted on prostitutes by their customers. In his research, Monto (2004) stressed the need to understand the violence associated with prostitution.

Similar to Monto (2004), Karandikar (2008) examined violence in the lives of

prostitutes. Karandikar (2008) studied prostitutes and their partner's perception of violence. Her findings revealed that prostitutes face severe violence from their male partners. The male partner used violence as a means to control the women and considered violence as solely a domestic affair (Karandikar, 2008). Her study recommended the decriminalization of sex work and argued for police sensitivity instead of harassment. She also recommended future research with other stakeholders like police officers or customers (Karandikar, 2008).

Adding to research on stakeholders, Wahab (2005) evaluated the Salt Lake City Prostitution Diversion Project (PDP) through stakeholder's recommendations. The majority of stakeholders of this program work in the Criminal Justice Service and the Harm Reduction Project. The study focused on stakeholder's perceptions, experiences, challenges, as well as the limitations of PDP (Wahab, 2005). The stakeholders included a wide range of people from prostitutes who were part of PDP, case managers, program directors from Criminal Justice centers, staff from the Harm Reduction Program, and a panel of PDP members. The study's findings revealed ideological differences between the two major stakeholders, the Criminal Justice Service and the Harm Reduction Program, on the objectives and operation of the PDP. All of the stakeholders emphasized that counselors needed more training, and recommended setting up a standard protocol for the different phases in the PDP (Wahab, 2005). The stakeholders recommended hiring full- and part-time staff instead of student interns who are not fully skilled in handling issues related to prostitutes. Also, due to the 9-month internship span, disruptions in the relationship between clinics and service providers occurred because social work interns changed every 9 months (Wahab, 2005). Additionally, due to the policies of the Criminal

Justice Service, prostitutes did not feel free to talk about their profession. These were some of the recommendations for improvement in the PDP.

All of the aforementioned studies on stakeholders are missing a discussion on the children of prostitutes. This lack points towards the need for further research with stakeholders about the children of prostitutes to get a holistic picture of this issue. The purpose of this study is to fill this gap in the literature by answering the following research questions:

- What challenges do stakeholders face in providing services to this population?
- What do these stakeholders think are the challenges faced by their clients?
- What support do they think their clients need?

This study will add to the literature on prostitution by giving us a more complete picture of the challenges stakeholders face in providing services. It also helps us to understand in an in-depth manner the needs of prostitutes and their children.

#### Theoretical Framework

Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory were chosen for this study because it helped the researcher to understand the participants' responses in a comprehensive manner. Human Ecological Systems Theory was used to understand what stakeholders' view as the challenges prostitutes and their children face in the various levels or systems of social influence. Furthermore, Social Exclusion Theory was used to examine stakeholder's opinions of the exclusion of children of prostitutes and their mothers from mainstream society.

## **Human Ecological Systems Theory**

Human Ecological Systems Theory, as proposed by Bronfenbenner (1989), is concerned with the interaction and interdependence of humans. In this theory, human development is based on the various relationships and interactions one has with people and their environment. These interactions and relationships shape a person's growth as an individual in the context of the various systems. Each system has its own specific and unique set of rules and regulations that molds an individual's human development. It also helps us understand the reasons behind individual behavior or experiences in a particular system. Human Ecological System Theory has five layers which are the microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, macrosystem, and chronosystem.

The microsystem is the individual's immediate environment (including mothers, school, peers, etc.). The mesosystem is comprised of connections between immediate environments (i.e., prostitutes and their children). The exosystem is the external environment setting, which indirectly affects the children due to their parent's profession and workplace (children face challenges do to their mother's profession as prostitutes). The macrosystem is the larger cultural context, including the national economy and laws, as well as political, cultural, and subcultural systems (it effects children when their mothers are arrested). Finally, the chronosystem is time-related, reflecting dynamic environmental transitions. The stakeholders in this study will help us to understand the effect of these systems on the children of prostitutes' development and in their daily lives. The in-depth knowledge gained from the perspectives of stakeholders about the lives of the prostitutes and their children helped me acquire a more complete picture of this population and the support required to better the lives of these children.

## Social Exclusion Theory

Parkin formulated Social Exclusion Theory from Weber's discussion on Social Closure Theory (Alexander, 2005). Social Exclusion Theory examines the systematic method of discrimination used to isolate people from mainstream society due to their ethnicity, race, religion, sexual orientation, caste, ancestry, gender, age, disability, HIV status, and migrant status or place of habitation (Silver & Miller, 2003). Social exclusion can lead to exclusion from educational opportunities, leading to unequal education (Barry, 1998). According to the British Medical Journal (BMJ), social exclusion may contribute to children's poor educational performance and achievements, unmanageable behavior, drug use, unemployment, teenage pregnancy, homelessness, crime, and suicide (BMJ, 2001). Importantly, social exclusion can be experienced at different levels since it can affect individuals, groups, or geographic areas (Jermyn, 2001).

According to Campbell et al. (2006), social exclusion can cause changes in a person's brain function and can lead to poor decision-making as well as diminished learning ability. Their research linked social exclusion with a failure to exert self-control. For instance, people who are rejected in social situations often respond by abusing alcohol, expressing aggression inappropriately, or performing poorly at school or work (Campbell et al., 2006).

This theory helped the researcher to understand stakeholder's views on the various forms of exclusion prostitutes and their children face because of the mothers' work or HIV status. The comprehensive knowledge gained from stakeholders helps us understand this group's struggle in their daily lives in mingling with people outside of the red light area and the effect of this discrimination on children of prostitutes and their

mothers. This understanding will aid us in developing appropriate interventions for this group in the future.

#### Methods

## Participants and Sampling

The participants for this study consisted of 8 stakeholders who provide education-related services to children of prostitutes: 1) school teachers of public schools in the red light area where children of prostitutes were enrolled, and 2) social workers and after-school teachers in organizations where children of prostitutes received education-related services. All 8 stakeholders have been affiliated with his or her organization from 6 months to 10 years.

IRB approval was obtained for this study from the University of Utah. Purposive sampling along with snowball sampling techniques were used to recruit study participants. I visited schools and nonprofit agencies in the red light area of Mumbai to enroll participants for the study. The stakeholders were informed about the scope, nature, and purpose of the study, and given a referral sheet with all of the study information. Those who volunteered to participate informed me, and an appointment was scheduled per the convenience of the stakeholder at his/her choice of interview location. All interviews were conducted at the workplaces of the stakeholders.

Each participant's consent was obtained before the interview and all interviews were audio taped. The participants were also informed that they had the right to withdraw anytime from the interview and their participation was voluntary. All personal information such as participants' names and the names of organizations has been kept confidential. No real names have been used in this article. The participants were offered

compensation for their participation in the study, which all refused to take due to organizational policy. I was asked to make a donation of the compensation amount to the organization, which I did.

Each participant was asked about the nature of their work, the challenges they face in providing services, the challenges they think the children of prostitutes and their mothers face, and what support is required for the betterment of this group. The interview questions were predetermined and were semistructured. The length of the interviews varied from 45 to 90 minutes. All interviews were conducted either in Hindi, English, or Marathi, depending upon the participant's choice of language. All interviews were transcribed by the researcher, professionals, and peers. The interviews were transcribed in the form of narratives, keeping in line with the nature of the participant's answers. I read and reread each transcript to verify the responses of the participants and to become familiar with the data. I "cleaned up" the data while reading the narratives, as suggested by Pearsol (1985).

#### Data Analysis

The data were analyzed using the six phases of Marshall and Rossman (1999). I did line-by-line coding during the initial phase of data analysis. After coding all of the interviews, I divided each code into several themes. Each theme was then coded, and arranged and re-arranged based on the similarity or difference of the topics. Each theme was studied in-depth and the themes were merged or separated. The themes were read and reread to examine how they were related to the research question. Themes were interpreted through the lens of Human Ecological Systems Theory and Social Exclusion Theory.

#### **Findings**

There are several organizations working in Mumbai's red light areas of Kamathipura, Falkland Road, and Grand Road, and in the Mumbai suburbs of Vahsi-Turbe, Bhiwandi, and Bhandup to reduce the prevalence of HIV/AIDS among prostitutes. In addition to these, several other organizations provide children of prostitutes with education, safe shelter, and wellbeing. This project was conducted with stakeholders from these organizations, which consisted of local public schools and nonprofit organizations. The services provided by the local public school were free education, books, notebooks, two pairs of school uniforms, and a midday meal during the school's lunch break. The nonprofit organizations provided night care shelter for children of prostitutes from age one and a half to 14 years old for males and from one and a half to 18 years of age for female children. The organizations also provided educational support programs for children aged 6 to 18 years. The educational support programs consist of an after-school tutoring program, a child guidance clinic consisting of counselors, and based on the availability with a psychiatrist. In addition, the organizations provide food, shelter, clothing, school supplies, health care, entertainment, and various trainings. The organizations also sometimes sponsored children's high school and/or undergraduate education. Furthermore, the organizations provided institutional placement for children of prostitutes in government-run boarding homes across the country. The stakeholders who participated in the study provided educational support for the children who were going to school or college.

Each participant had been working with children of prostitutes from anywhere between 6 months to 10 years. Stakeholders who were interviewed worked for

organizations located in the heart of the red light areas in Kamathipura and Falkland Road, which are two of the red light districts in Mumbai, India. The participants consisted of 2 school teachers, 3 out-reach workers, 1 social worker, 1 assistant director, and 1 after-school tutoring program teacher. Each of these stakeholders played an immense role in bringing education to these children's lives.

The three themes that emerged from stakeholder interviews the following:

- Challenges faced by stakeholders in providing services,
- Challenges they think the children of prostitutes and their mothers face in their day to day lives, and
- Support the stakeholders need to better provide services to their clients or what support they think their clients need for a better future.

## Challenges Faced by Stakeholders in Providing Services

The stakeholders expressed that they face numerous challenges and concerns when working with the children of prostitutes. For this study, I will discuss some of the main challenges these participants faced. High drop-out rates, setbacks resulting from not having school exit certificates, mother's partners and brothel keepers preventing children from accepting services, and a shortage of staff were the main challenges faced by the stakeholders in providing needed services.

### High Drop-Out Rates

The stakeholders expressed great concern over the school drop-out rates of children in the red light area. Due to high drop-out rates, it becomes difficult to provide efficient services to the children of prostitutes. Stakeholder I, an outreach worker,

indicated that "there is a high dropout rate among our children [red light area children] and then we go to [the community to] bring them back... or send them back to school." Some of the reasons stated by stakeholders for the drop-out rates were expressed by Stakeholder II (an outreach worker) that

Sometimes the mother would just leave the place and go to her native place because of some fight with her partner or some incident in the community... Most of the times we learned that they have left over night. They came back after 6 months or maybe even a year or 2 and then they come back. This is a frequent occurring pattern in our community. Also, at times of festivals, they go to their village and never return or take months to return back...

Furthermore, Stakeholder I expressed her concern over mothers moving. She said that "They move from one brothel to another, so when we go in search of them and they are not there, it takes 2 to 4 days to finally find her. Sometimes without informing us, she goes off to the village or other red light area. As a result of this constant moving, the child's education really suffers." Stakeholder III, a public school teacher, stated,

They [children of prostitute] come for some days to school and then go back to their villages...many times, some children get enrolled in the middle of the school year and due to that, they miss a whole term or come after the 1<sup>st</sup> term exams, and so they miss so much studies. So you know who will teach them all that they missed and this makes them weak in their studies? ...[A]gain, when they go back to villages, there is nobody to provide attention; whatever they have learnt here, they do forget so again it comes to zero.

Stakeholder VI, an outreach worker, summarized the effect of drop-out on the children:

The child fails and has to sit in the same class again and again. Sometimes they don't return for more than a year. When they come back, whatever was taught to them is all forgotten. So, whatever efforts were taken to help him teach Marathi are all gone in vain. Sometime, the children come back for 3 to 4 years; when we become aware of this we find the child has lost interest in their studies or started working.

The stakeholders try their level best to maintain contact with children who have dropped out but sometimes, it becomes hard because they do not have the correct address of the mother's hometown. Mothers who have been trafficked are sold to brothel keepers and have to pay back the amount for which the brothel keeper buys her. Sometimes, mothers keep moving to be safe and escape from brothel keepers to whom they owe money or to protect themselves and their children from abusive partners. The stakeholders have also tried counseling women and their children on the effects of dropping out and to put their children in boarding school, which has worked in many cases. Hence, there is an urgent need to address the high drop-out rate among children of prostitutes.

### School Exit Certificates

In addition to high drop-out rates, stakeholders face the issue of school exit certificates. School exit certificates are given from a school to a student when they leave the school to move to another school. Without an exit certificate, it is hard to get admission in schools or sit for any licensing examination. Stakeholder IV, another public school teacher, testified that "We do not get their exit certificate from the village for Bengali children. We make then get enrolled in 1<sup>st</sup> grade, that's why." Sometimes, schools in Mumbai do not want to give exit certificates for children who move to boarding schools. Stakeholder V, a social worker, expressed that "... The school does not give us an exit certificate...the school authorities do not want to understand the reason behind us sending these children to boarding schools; they think that we enroll the children in local schools to just get an exit certificate of a school. We enroll them in school so they can get an education and be away from the community and be in a safe environment." Stakeholder V conveys the broader challenges regarding getting a school exit certificate and summarized the issue: "Exit certificates from native schools is a big challenge for us. The school board and department are different from state-to-state;

moreover, the child does not remember the exact name of their school, or the exact year of leaving school. So all these things make it hard for them to get an exit certificate."

Prevention of Children of Prostitutes from Receiving Services

Apart from the school exit certificate issue, these stakeholder face a great deal of resistance to provide services from the mother's partner [her pimp, customer, or trafficker] or brothel keeper. Stakeholder VI, an outreach worker, testified that

Most of the time, mothers agree to send their children to school. But the child's "so called" father, the mother's partner, they most of the time refuse to send the child to school...The man has more power to decide and due to this, we face major problems. Because of this, we have to build rapport with the partner. The main objective of our organization is to keep a relationship with the mother, but we face problems to fulfill this objective because we have to maintain a rapport with the male partner. The men's behavior are not very nice, they are very rude, they do not talk properly with us. They keep saying it no use of sending these children to school. And what they do is make the child sit in some shop or make them do some menial jobs. Or they ask children to run errands for them like bring tobacco, or cigarettes, etc.

Organizations in the red light area often do not work with mother's partners as they usually are her pimp, customer, or traffickers. The partners have considerable control over the women. The question then arises what do stakeholders do to provide services to the children? Do the organization's need to change their policies or change their working strategies with mothers? This dilemma is faced constantly by the stakeholders in their work. In addition to the mother's partner, stakeholders face opposition from brothel keeps as well. Stakeholder I expressed her concern that "The gharwali [brothel keeper] doesn't let the child go to school. If we go to her doorstep she says 'why send the girl to school?' The mother has constant fear of losing her child into prostitution. So the mother always fears and that is why they always tell us to put their daughters into boarding schools far away."

# Shortage of Staff

Organizations in red light areas constantly face staff shortage due to the organization's location, high stress work, or low pay. Stakeholder VII, an after-school teacher for a organization, said "Sometimes there is a shortage of [after-school] teachers. We were only two teachers for so many children. The children's education suffered because the pay is very less; not many are interested in the job. Even the children had complained that they were having a lot of difficulties in their studies because we were only two teachers for so many children. So it was hard to pay attention to everyone."

These are some of the challenges stakeholders of organizations in red light areas face while providing services. These stakeholders, despite all of the obstacles they face, try their best to provide a safe shelter, education, food, and other basic necessities for these vulnerable children.

### Challenges Faced by Children of Prostitutes

Stakeholders have enormous involvement and experience working with children of prostitutes, and they shared some of the challenges they think these children encounter in their daily lives. Some of these challenges are language barriers, discrimination, financial problems, and the need for safe spaces and shelter.

# Language Barriers

The stakeholders expressed that language barriers were a primary challenge faced by children of prostitutes. Prostitutes who are trafficked to the Mumbai red light area hail from different parts of India as well as from neighboring countries. These women and their children do not speak the local language "Marathi." Most schools in the vicinity of

the red light areas are Marathi language medium schools. In these schools, the mode of instruction is in the Marathi language instead of the native languages of the children.

Children from the red light area either speak Bengali, Hindi, Kannada, Nepali, or Telugu.

Due to this language disparity, children of prostitutes found it hard to perform well in school.

The number of Bengali speaking prostitutes, from Paschim Banga (West Bengal) or Bangladesh, has increased over the past decade. Due to a lack of Bengali medium schools in the red light area, all of the children either go to Hindi or Marathi language medium schools. Also, if children go to Marathi medium schools, it can be easier for them to get admission in boarding schools in the future, since most boarding schools are Marathi medium. Stakeholder V expressed her concern about the lack of Bengali medium schools when she said, "The challenge related to language is that there are no Bengali medium schools for children who come from a Bengali speaking place. We do enroll these children in local school, which are either Hindi or Marathi medium, but children find it difficult to adjust." Stakeholder V emphasized the problems that children who do not speak Marathi face. She expressed that

We have to admit him/her to 1st grade even if they have already studied 5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup> grade. Because of this, they lose a lot of years of education, as they do not even know how to read or write in Hindi. They do have exams after a few months and if they have picked up the language and clear the exams they can be promoted to a higher grade, but otherwise, they have to study in 1<sup>st</sup> or 2<sup>nd</sup> grade.

Due to language differences, these children do not perform well in school. Stakeholder VI summarized the language problem in his testimony:

The children don't follow the language [Marathi] and are not able to grasp quickly. They cannot understand what is being taught due to the language of instruction, so reading, writing, and understanding is a problem until their 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> standard. We try to teach these children in our educational support program,

but we have a lot of difficulties as the mothers speak Bengali at home, in school they hear Marathi, and in the center they want to speak in Hindi. Due to this constant switching of language, they are only able to pick up the basics of Marathi and do not get the fluency of language until 6<sup>th</sup> or 8<sup>th</sup> grade. And by then they do not perform well in school and start to fail in their classes.

#### Discrimination

Stakeholders stated that children of prostitutes fear discrimination from mainstream society. The researcher noticed that some stakeholders showed underlying discrimination towards the children by thinking that they do not value the program, do not study well, or because they have untidy cloths, etc. Stakeholders shared some of the fear children have when they attended high schools or college outside of the red light area. Stakeholder VII, a project director, said "Children over here [red light area], they make sure, especially the older ones, that they don't convey to people that they are from Kamatipura …there is stigma attached to the name of the place."

Due to the policies of the organization, stakeholders go to the children's educational institutions to inquire about their educational progress from teachers. The children request that stakeholders conceal their identity because they fear discrimination. Stakeholder V expressed that "When we visit their [children's] high school or college we too have to conceal our organization identity; sometimes, we tell the school authorities that we are their siblings who have come for their follow-up. Once we give our organization's name people know we work in the red light area and where the child comes from." Due to their fear of being excluded, the children hide their real identities. Stakeholder V said that "Because of fear of discrimination, they are more attached to this area. They do not want to develop any new relationships with the outside, world and are skeptical about the outside world. They want to make friends outside, but they have

already been so hurt in relationships that they cannot trust anyone."

Due to their experiences in elementary and junior high school, children of prostitutes have developed a fear of being excluded. Stakeholder VI thinks that school teachers indirectly discriminate in their complaints:

I cannot say discrimination but when we do school visits, the teachers complain about the children saying these children do not come on time, their mothers do not come, the children are very dirty; they are not tidy. Like they say these children have no manners, they use abusive words, this is what their mothers teach. They do not show that they are discriminating directly.

Stakeholder VI's concern can be seen in what Stakeholder IV, a public school teacher, told the researcher. The researcher found traces of discrimination in Stakeholder IV's statement when she said, "They are very smart but they do not want to try enough. They think that whatever they get they get for free so they do not have to work hard. So we should not give so much to these children. Their parents do not value it. Many a times, we call their parents but they don't come and even if come, just listen and go." These children are constantly blamed for who they are or where they come from. Some of the stakeholders, while expressing their concerns, showed some hints of blame and apprehension towards the children. Stakeholder VII expressed that

[T]here are times when the children do not capitalize on the fact that a wide range of services is provided to them...I feel that they don't realize the importance. Even the mothers do not realize the importance... I wish the children would take more advantage of the services we provide them. There are very few, only a handful of them which are doing that and those children are very successful here.

This concern reflects an underlying doubt about the children's loyalty and/or value systems, and shows that some stakeholders think that children of prostitutes and their mothers do not care about the services provided. (For a detailed description of what children of prostitutes and their mothers had to say about their needs and the services

they want, see John-Fisk, 2013). There is a constant requirement for these children to prove themselves by doing well to receive service from service providers or funders.

#### Financial Problems

Due to the mistrust among mainstream society about the capability of these children, there is a lack of financial resources available. Mainstream society often does not view the children of prostitutes as being able to succeed in higher education; thus, there is a lack of financial support for this population. These children constantly struggle to fulfill their dreams of higher education due to limited resources. Stakeholder VI, expressed that

Some of these children have big dreams of becoming a doctor or engineer. But they keep their dreams to themselves because they know that their mother does not have the money to help them. Some children after their 10<sup>th</sup> grade don't want to [or cannot] join colleges because they cannot afford it. Also, they have problems due to a lack of shelter, food, nice clothing, and space for study. Due to these reasons, many cannot go to college.

Even though they have a desire to do better in life, there are great deals of obstacles that hinder their success. Here, attitudinal changes are necessary from teachers, stakeholders, and mainstream society about the abilities of children of prostitutes.

## Lack of Safe Shelter and Space

Many organizations in the red light area that provide night care shelter do not cater to male children older then 14. Due to this policy, many male children do not have a safe shelter during the night. Stakeholder VI, a prior client and now outreach worker who was in the same situation a few years back, shared his concerns: "These children who are 13 years or older and are still in school have a lot of challenges. These male children above the age of 12 live in the brothels with their mothers. They witness police raids and

In addition to the lack of safe shelter, these children who are in high school or college do not have space to study. Stakeholder VI stated that "Specifically, those children who are in 10<sup>th</sup> or 12<sup>th</sup> grade or who are doing their undergraduate do not have a place to study. They are working very hard but because they do not have a place to study, they sometimes leave their studies in the middle or start doing badly in school."

In addition, these children get stressed when organizations have to close their centers due to vacation or elections. Stakeholder II argued that,

If the center is closed more than a day or two, the children get very nervous about it. They get tensed when the centers are closed on holidays because it affects the children's education. Most of the time, children have midterm exams after the big school breaks and at the same time, the center is also closed due to the festivals or election...The children were stressed about it. The children do not want to stay at home after they become mature.

In the past, organizations were open during weekends and only closed for a few days during holidays. Many organizations have starting closing their centers during weekends and for extended periods of time during holidays, which has led to anxiety among children of prostitutes. This situation calls for a review of this policy change. If centers remain closed, then new programs or shelters need to be created. These were some of the key challenges the stakeholder think children of prostitutes face.

### Support and Programs

Stakeholders stated what they thought were the key services and support for prostitutes and their children to help improve their lives. Some of the key support this group requires includes the following: children need assistance for education; these women and children need government issued identification documents; sensitization

programs are needed for the general public and stakeholders such as doctors or police; and prostitutes need support programs like vocational training to exit of the flesh trade.

#### **Educational Assistance**

Like any other child, children of prostitutes need an education for a better future. Lack of finances for their education is a major obstacle to achieving their dreams.

Stakeholder VII expressed, "They need money to pursue their education. It's a combination of monetary, motivation, exposing them to different career options. We provide information on different careers through the career sessions. Our children are very clear on what they want to be or on what they want to do." Adding to this, Stakeholder VI said, "If these children got a place to study and a good teacher to help them. There are many private tutoring classes for higher education, which are very expensive which their mothers cannot afford to provide. Even our organization too cannot afford to give such help to one child, as we have to provide for everyone." Getting good grades in high school or college is essential for further education or attaining a job.

The education in the high schools and colleges in which these children go are not high quality. Problems include no regular classes being held, teachers do not come, and some coursework is often not taught before the exams take place, which forces these children to learn this material on their own. To improve their grades, many students want to enroll in private tutoring classes but cannot afford them. In addition, these children do not have any safe place to study. There is an absence of libraries in the vicinity of the red light area. Neither do they get a quiet atmosphere in NGOs or at home. In the NGOs, due to a large number of younger children, there is a high noise level, which disturbs children during their studies. Stakeholder VI expressed,

They have lots to study and need to have concentration for which they need a quiet environment, but they do not have the space to study. There should be space available for these children, along with good teachers, and someone who can give them good guidance...start programs for children between the age group of 13 to 20 mainly who are pursuing their education so they can continue with their education.

In addition to safe spaces for education, these children need a recreation place. There are no playgrounds in the red light area or public schools where children can play, which leaves them with no option but to play in the lanes of the red light area, or wander around the community. Some children visit video parlors in the red light area to play games or go to theaters to watch movies. None of the aforementioned places are safe for these children, which is why there is a need for safe spaces for their recreation. Showing her concern about this problem, Stakeholder V expressed, "There are no playgrounds in this area. Children have no place to do physical activity in the schools due to no playgrounds. They do not play any games. So all these facilities are needed to improve the situation here." This quote emphasizes a need for a safe place for these children were they can pursue their education and recreational needs. Stakeholder V argued that recreation is vital for these children.

#### Government Issued Identification Documents

The stakeholders showed concern for the children of prostitutes and their mothers since they lack any government identification document such as a ration card. A ration card is an important document required to not only get subsidies on food but is also needed to open a bank account, get a passport, or provide proof of address. Stakeholder VI stated,

Basically, these people don't have their identity at all. Government should start issuing ration cards in the name of mother and children...also, these women

should be given a voter identification card. They don't have voting cards just because they do not have ration cards because they do not have any address proof. Ration cards are issued to the brothel keeper or those people who own the brothel. The prostitute does not have a specific place of her own and has to keep moving from one brothel to another, which makes it hard for them to get a specific address.

Stakeholder I shared some reasons why these women do not have ration cards: "...since they live in rental premises, they have neither an electricity bill nor any other proof of residence. She [mother] does not have any rent paying receipt because she only pays rent for the bed. She has no proof of her residence. Also, they do not have a voting identification card...because they have no address proof document they cannot open a bank account..." Due to the lack of these documents, these women and their children do not exist in any government database nor do they have any political participation, causing them to be excluded from the mainstream society. This systematic exclusion denies this group any constitutional rights since they have no documentation to prove their citizenship. They are invisible in many respects.

#### Sensitization

The stakeholders voiced the need to sensitize other stakeholders like police, educational authorities, government officials, doctors, and the general public about the reality and needs of prostitutes and their children so that there is an attitudinal change among them. Stakeholder V communicated, it is "important [to] have sensitized police, doctors, and government. We expect that with this sensitizations, there will be at least some change in their attitude towards these women and children. When there is an attitude change, then they get connected with this group and there is a hope building among these women and children for a better future." Similarly, Stakeholder VIII

expressed the need to sensitize authorities from educational institutions when she said,

The [public school] teachers need to be more sensitive and proactive. Ninety percent of the children who are in their school are those children who are brought by our outreach workers by doing brothel/home/community visits...there should be some level of initiative by the government employees, i.e., the teacher...they are supposed to do field visits, but they do not do it. They should be taken to the field and exposed to where these children live and then maybe their expectations will be realistic, rather then wild and beyond all imaginations. So they should be made aware of the specific needs, and exposed to where these children live, how they live, how their mothers are. I think that will do.

Sensitization is needed to break the barrier of stigma, discrimination, and exclusion, which these women and their children face. Only when the general public views prostitutes and their children as victims and not as criminals will this group be accepted and provided with better opportunities in education, jobs, or housing. The elimination of exclusion will help this group to have better standards of living.

## Support for Mothers

Other than sensitization, there is a need to change some of the laws regarding prostitutes so that they could help the children and their mothers. Stakeholder VIII noted that

Some law which might help them come out of the trade and maybe with regards to rehabilitation. They are within the clutches of the brothel keeper and the pimp. If there is a drop-in center for them to come out [of prostitution], or correctional center or shelter for these women to help them coming out of the trade and be in a safe place. Even if they have some kind of debt, which they can just pay it but they need not be living in brothel to pay that. There should be a shelter home where they can go without any restriction. Some method of coming out of the trade.

Stakeholder VII stated that there is a need for legal aid for the mothers of these children: "When there is a police raid, there is no organization in this community which gives them legal aid. No one is there to help them. The women herself pays the money."

In addition, the stakeholders suggested the need for alternative job opportunities and safe shelter for prostitutes so that they can be empowered to live a better life. Stakeholder VII stated her concern regarding safe shelter for women: "Most organizations provide food and clothing; there is no organization working for shelter for these women." Stakeholder VI tries to summarize the needs for prostitutes in his statement saying,

If there is an organization which works for rehabilitation for these women...There should be some sort of income generation training for these women like small-scale industries like papad [type of food] making or cloth stitching. It happens in many places for women from other sectors; it should start for our women too. There should be a center where they can work the whole day and get enough income to take care of their families and their needs. This will help them not only to get training but also earn something. This sort of rehabilitation is needed.

Stakeholder VIII feels that there is a need for mental health services for women in prostitution. She expressed, "In red light areas, most organizations work with HIV/AIDS, condom promotion, self-help groups, health aspects, but not many are doing anything for their psychosocial support. So some NGO should come and work on this." In addition, Stakeholder VI feels the need to start programs in the areas from where these women are trafficked into prostitution. Stakeholder VI stated that "I think that trafficking should be stopped at the source so no women end up in this area. We first start programs that would prevent trafficking and then we can work on rehabilitation of those women who are in the red light area."

#### Discussion

All 8 stakeholders worked in organizations working for prostitutes and their children in the heart of the red light area of Mumbai. The narratives related by the 8 stakeholders in this study touched on a number of topics, but each also discussed three

important areas—challenges the stakeholder faces to provide service, the challenges children of prostitutes and their mothers face, and the need for support to build a better livelihood for these group. These findings were analyzed using Social Exclusion Theory and Human Ecological Systems Theory.

Social Exclusion Theory was helpful for understanding the experiences of prostitutes and their children. The stakeholders revealed that children of prostitutes face discrimination due to their mothers' work, and were excluded from mainstream society because of it. The children faced exclusion and discrimination when service providers from school or nonprofit organizations saw the children as untidy, undisciplined, unresponsive, or not valuing the services provided to them. In addition, there is a shortage of funding for these children's higher education because there is constant doubt and questioning of these children's' capabilities and dedication because of their backgrounds. These children fear exclusion and discrimination in every step of their lives, which prevents them from revealing their true identity to individuals outside of the red light community.

Furthermore, stakeholders expressed concern about these children's struggles in their daily lives, which can be understood through Human Ecological Systems Theory. The study's findings reflected the development of children of prostitutes due to the various interactions with people around them and their environment. Stakeholders shared how children of prostitutes, due to the constant underlying discrimination in school or nonprofit organizations, develop a wall around themselves to protect themselves from the exclusion they fear from people outside the red light area. In addition, these children face educational difficulties due to language problems. Since these children have migrated

from different parts of India or other countries they are unable to understand the language of instruction in Mumbai schools. Due to a lack of remedial language classes or school in their native language, these children find it hard to cope and excel in school.

Furthermore, their educational challenges escalate due to a lack of safe shelter and space to study. Unavailability of a quiet space like a library or study hall makes it difficult for children who want to go to high school or college to concentrate on their studies. Besides

this, male children above 14 years of age do not have safe shelter to spend the night, exposing them to the dangers of the red light area. The exosystem for children of prostitutes creates many barriers and negative influences. These challenges hinder these

children from moving ahead in life.

All of the narratives indicated that these stakeholders face several challenges to provide services to children of prostitutes and their mothers. The stakeholders experience numerous hurdles every day like high drop-out rates, lack of school exit certificates for children, resistance in providing services, and shortage of staff. Due to high drop-out rates of children in school, the stakeholders face difficultly in providing education and monitoring the children's progress. Children in the red light along with their mothers are on the move constantly from one brothel to another, from one red light area to another, or are coming back and forth from their native homeland to Mumbai. In addition, stakeholders find it hard to enroll children in school because of a lack of school exit certificates from their prior school. This lack of documentation causes children to lose all those years of prior education, which can lead to high drop-out rates.

Furthermore, stakeholders face resistance in providing service from mothers' partners, who could be her ex-customer, pimp, trafficker, and/or brothel keeper. On top of

this, there is a constant shortage of staff due to the high burnout and low pay in the organizations working in the red light area. With all of these challenges, the stakeholders try to provide optimum services to the children of prostitutes and their mothers.

To overcome all of the challenges mentioned above, these stakeholders suggested certain programs and support which might improve their circumstances. These programs are the following: assistance for children's education such as providing financial support, creating a safe shelter, access to libraries in the red light area, and teachers to guide them in their studies. In addition, they think government identification documents like ration cards or voter identification cards would help this group to get cheaper groceries and help them open bank accounts or take loans for housing. Furthermore, there should be support for prostitutes by creating alternative job opportunities, drop-in centers, safe shelter homes, counseling support, and starting programs to prevent trafficking in the source area. Sensitization of educational authorities, government officials, doctors, and police could decrease discrimination and support this group in their development. These stakeholders play their roles in building a better future for these children but need much more support though volunteers and attitude change among mainstream society. These children and their mothers hope for a better future; however, they need tailor-made support to fulfill their dreams.

## Social Work Policy, Research, and Implications

The findings of this study will help policy makers and social workers to have a better understanding of the lives and circumstances of prostitutes and their children. This study suggests programs and policies to help this group, like safe spaces and shelter for children, Marathi as a second language programs, government identification documents,

alternative occupational opportunities, and sensitization programs, as previously mentioned. Stakeholders believe the prospects of this group will change with the availability of these interventions.

#### Limitations

I could not do member checking, since follow-up interviews could not be conducted because of economic and distance limitations between the research site and my location. Due to holidays, exams, and elections all falling at the same time, it was hard to contact stakeholders since many organizations were closed during this period. This constraint limited the number of stakeholders interviewed. There is a need for future research among stakeholders from high schools or colleges, boarding homes, and night care shelters to obtain more information on the challenges children at these institutions face. Future research is also needed to understand the effect of recent gentrification happening in the red light area of Mumbai. It is unknown what kind of changes would be required in future strategies to provide services to prostitutes and their children.

#### Conclusion

The present study reveals that stakeholders and their clients require numerous supports. The children of prostitutes along with their mothers need a great deal of help for their survival. In this study, the stakeholders expressed the various hurdles that they come across in their day-to-day work in providing effective service. In addition, these stakeholders shared their concerns over the struggles their clients face every day. This study fills a void in the literature on stakeholder research surrounding children of prostitutes, by illuminating the struggles these stakeholders and their clients endure. The

research findings strongly advocate for a comprehensive network of services that include economic, emotional, and psychosocial support as well as educational and occupational opportunities to succeed. This study's findings about what challenges stakeholders, prostitutes, and their children face can be used as a guide in developing policies and programs affecting prostitutes and their children. For example, this study's finding that closing centers on weekends and holidays negatively affects children of prostitutes leads to recommendations for either expanded hours for the centers or the development of new policies and programs.

#### References

- Alexander, M. L. (2005). Social inclusion, social exclusion and social closure: What can we learn from studying the social capital of social elites? Paper presented at International Conference on Engaging Communities, Brisbane, Queensland. Paper retrieved from <a href="http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf">http://www.engagingcommunities2005.org/abstracts/Alexander-Malcolm-final.pdf</a>.
- Barry, B. M. (1998). *Social exclusion, social isolation and the distribution of income*. Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics.
- BMJ (2001). Social exclusion: Old problem and new name. *British Medical Journal*, *323* (7306), 1-2. Retrieved September, 19, 2008 from <a href="http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf">http://www.bmj.com/content/323/7306/0.1.full.pdf</a>. *323 doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.323.7306.0*
- Brofenbrenner, U. (1989). Ecological Systems Theory. In R. Vasta (Ed.) (1991). *Six theories of child development: Revised formulations and current issues* (pp.187-249). London: UK, Philadelphia: US, J. Kingsley.
- Campbell, W. K., Twenge, J., Clementz, B., McDowell. J., Krusemark, E., & Brunnell, A. (2006). Social exclusion changes brain function and can lead to poor decision-making. *Science Daily*. Retrieved April 20, 2008, from <a href="http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm">http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2006/11/061108154256.htm</a>
- Dalla, R. L. (2003). When the bough breaks...: Examination intergenerational parent-child relationship patterns among street-level sex workers and their parents and children. *Applied Developmental Science*, 7(4), 216-228.
- Freeman, R. E. (1984). Strategic management: A stakeholder approach. Boston: Pitman
- Karandikar, S. A. (2008). *Gender-based violence among female sex workers of Kamathipura, Mumbai, India: A contextual analysis.* (Doctoral dissertation, The University of Utah). *ProQuest Dissertations and Theses*, 138. Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com/docview/304430358?accountid=14677. (304430358).
- Jermyn, H. (2001). Arts and social exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England. Retrieved April, 20, 2008 from <a href="http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21&id=13">http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publications/publication\_detail.php?sid=21&id=13</a>
- John-Fisk, H. (In progress). Understanding the voices of children of prostitutes from Mumbai, India.
- Marshall, C., & Rossman, B. G. (1999). *Designing qualitative research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). California: Sage Publication.

- Monto, M. A., (2004). Female prostitution, customers, and violence. *Violence Against Women*, 10(2), 160-188.
- Silver, H., & Miller, S. M. (2003). Social exclusion: The European approach to social disadvantage. *Indicators: New York*, 2(3), 5-21.
- Wahab, S. (2005). Navigating Mixed-Theory Programs: Lessons learned from Prostitute-Diversion Project. *Afflia*, 20, 203-221.
- Waine, B., Tunstill, J., Meadows, P., & Peel. M. (2005). *Developing social care: Values and principles*. London: Great Britain Social Care Institute for Excellence.
- Weiner, A. (1996). Understanding the social needs of streetwalking prostitutes. *Social Work, 41*(1), 97-105.

#### **CHAPTER 5**

#### CONCLUSION

#### **Dissertation Summary**

The purpose of this research project was to create a holistic picture of the lives of prostitutes and their children. The research focus was to understand prostitutes as mothers, the needs and experiences of children of prostitutes, stakeholder challenges, and the support this group needs. This research project was composed of three separate manuscripts. The first manuscript examined the experiences of prostitutes as mothers in the U.S. and India. The project's goal was to understand the relationships prostitutes have with their children, the challenges they face in bringing up their children, and what support they need to become better mothers. The second manuscript focused on the children of prostitutes in Mumbai, India. This article reflected on the various challenges these children face in their day-to-day lives, their relationships with their mothers, and the support they say they need. The final manuscript analyzed the challenges stakeholders have when providing services to children of prostitutes. The stakeholders also shared their views on the difficulties that children of prostitutes and their mothers face. The stakeholders expressed what support they thought would be helpful for this group.

This chapter contains the summaries of the three manuscripts and also describes how these manuscripts are connected to each other. These manuscripts, when taken together, provide a detailed portrait of the lives of prostitutes and their children because

each article highlights a different perspective into their lives, be it from the prostitutes themselves, their children, or stakeholders who provide them services. Furthermore, this chapter includes the implications of this study for future social work research, policy, and practice. In addition, the strengths and limitations of this study as a whole will be discussed.

#### Chapter 2 Summary

The first article looked at prostitutes as mothers in the U.S. and India. This manuscript will be submitted to the *Journal of Sex Research* (JSR), which "is a scholarly journal devoted to the publication of articles relevant to the variety of disciplines involved in the scientific study of sexuality" (JSR, 2012). This journal is a good fit for the first manuscript since it not only focuses on sexuality research, but also has a history of accepting manuscripts related to studies about prostitutes. This manuscript can help further the discussion about the research gaps on prostitutes. In addition, this journal accepts a vast array of topics relating to sex research, including international studies. This focus makes it an excellent match for the first manuscript, since it is a comparative study of prostitutes in the U.S. and India.

The first manuscript examined the needs of prostitutes as mothers. Seventeen women were interviewed for the study. The participants touched on a number of topics, but common themes were the following: prostitutes' experiences and challenges as mothers, the relationships these mothers have with their children, and support programs they say they need to help them reach a better life. This study's findings revealed the various challenges these women face, such as not having family or societal support, and

the ways that these obstacles complicate their roles as mothers. The constant struggle they face to keep themselves and their children safe and away from violence shape their lives and relationships. The lack of resources available to them makes it harder for them to be successful mothers.

To overcome all of the challenges mentioned previously, these women suggested certain programs and support which have the potential to improve their circumstances. According to the study participants, current programs do not meet their needs, so they suggested some alternatives. These include early education for girl children and selfesteem programs for young girls and women. Participants also insisted that foster care should not be the only option. They argued instead that joint programs, including both mother and child, be created to overcome situational, occupational, and familial conflicts. Additionally, these women expressed a need for hotline services where prostitutes could call for support to avoid going back into prostitution, receive counseling and outreach, and find new information on prostitution anonymous groups. Other support systems they said they needed included job readiness programs, housing, and shelter for prostitutes. Apart from these programs, women in India requested financial support for their children's education, help to get a ration card and voter identification card, and better health care as well. These are some of the suggestions these women offered that might be helpful for addressing the needs of prostitutes and their children.

## **Chapter 3 Summary**

The second manuscript is concerned with the realities of the lives of children of prostitutes. This manuscript will be submitted to *Family Relations: Interdisciplinary Journal of Applied Family Studies. Family Relations* is a publication of the National

Council on Family Relations (NCFR) and centers around child and parent relationships, family diversity, and cross-cultural/international issues, among many other family related topics. This journal provides a wealth of information about children, parenting, and families in distress, and provides a valuable guide to readers. These topics match well with the findings of the second manuscript.

This study was conducted with 20 children of prostitutes from red light areas in Mumbai, India. This study focused on the narratives related by these children. While they gave a wide range of answers, their narratives centered around three themes: their experiences and challenges as children of prostitutes, their relationships with their mothers, and the support programs they said they needed. The study findings uncovered the various challenges these children face, and the way these obstacles complicate their lives as students and young adults because they did not have support from their extended family or society.

All of the children expressed a need for more teachers in schools and nonprofit agencies. These children conveyed a need for small class sizes, which can help them to better concentrate. The participants communicated a dislike for the red light area and shared the hindrances they face in their studies. All of the participants wanted a stable and safe shelter for themselves and their mothers for a better future. These children also communicated a constant fear of being discriminated against by the larger society when their identities were revealed. They also feared a loss of support if the NGO they were connected to closed down.

All of the participants stated that they did not want to be separated from their mothers. The children had good relationships with their mothers and wanted to support

them in their old age. Some participants did not mind going to boarding schools if they could be in touch with their mothers. Some participants expressed a need for facilities that could provide night care shelter to male children above the age of 14 years. In addition to these needs, the children expressed a need for financial support for their education. They also said that there is a need for better jobs and housing for the women in red light areas so that they can leave the profession. These children also expressed the need for ration cards and voter identification cards for their mothers and other women in the red light area. These were some of the suggestions these children offered that might be helpful for addressing their and their mothers' needs.

## Chapter 4 Summary

This manuscript was based on a study conducted with stakeholders who provide services to prostitutes and their children in India. This manuscript will be submitted to *International Social Work*. This journal emphasizes international social work interventions, the purpose of the social work profession, and training social workers. The third manuscript will fit well in this journal since it discusses the perceptions of stakeholders for children of prostitutes in India. This manuscript conveys stakeholder challenges in catering to this population and what services this group requires.

This study consisted of 8 stakeholders in organizations working with children of prostitutes and their mothers in the heart of the red light area of Mumbai. The narratives related by the eight stakeholders in this study highlighted three important areas: challenges the stakeholder faced in providing services, the struggles that children of prostitutes and their mothers endured, and support that stakeholders viewed this group as needing.

The stakeholders revealed that children of prostitutes face discrimination due to their mothers' work, and were excluded from the mainstream society because of it. The children faced exclusion and discrimination when service providers from schools or nonprofit organizations saw the children as untidy, undisciplined, unresponsive, or not valuing the services provided to them. In addition, there is a shortage of funding for these children's higher education because there is constant doubt and questioning about these children's capabilities and dedication because of their background. These children fear exclusion and discrimination in every step of their lives, which prevents them from revealing their true identity to individuals outside of the red light community.

In addition, these children face educational difficulties due to language problems. As these children have migrated from different parts of India or other countries, they are unable to understand the language of instruction in Mumbai schools. A lack of remedial language classes or schooling in their native language makes it hard for these children to cope and excel in school. Furthermore, their educational challenges escalate due to a lack of safe shelter and space to study. Unavailability of a quiet space like a library or study hall makes it difficult for children going to high school or college to concentrate on their studies. Besides this, male children above 14 years of age do not have a safe shelter to spend the night, which exposes them to the dangers of the red light area. These challenges hinder these children from succeeding.

In providing services, the stakeholders experience numerous hurdles like high drop-out rates, lack of school leaving certificates for children, resistance in providing services, and shortage of staff. To overcome all of the challenges mentioned above, these stakeholders suggested certain programs and support, which might improve the

circumstances for this population. These programs are the following: assistance for children's education such as providing financial support, creating a safe shelter, access to libraries in the red light area, and teachers to guide them in their studies. In addition, stakeholders think government identification documents like ration cards or voter identification cards would help this group buy cheaper groceries and help them open bank accounts or obtain loans for housing. Furthermore, they argued that some supports prostitutes need are alternative job opportunities, drop-in centers, safe shelter homes, counseling support, and programs to prevent trafficking in the source area, from where women get are trafficked. Sensitization of educational authorities, government officials, doctors, and police could also decrease discrimination and support this group. These stakeholders play their role in building a better future for these children but need much more support through volunteers and attitude changes in mainstream society. Through their daily struggles, these children hope for a better future for themselves and their mothers. These children need tailor-made support programs to fulfill their dreams.

## Interconnectedness of the Manuscripts

The three manuscripts consider different perspectives about the lives of prostitutes and their children. Combined, these manuscripts work to give the most comprehensive understanding of the needs of prostitutes and their children possible. The first manuscript analyzes prostitutes as mothers, and the challenges they face. The first article focused on the mother's views of their relationships with their children. The relationships between prostitutes and their children were an important theme in the first and second manuscripts. In contrast to learning the mother's stories in the first article, the second manuscript used interviews from the children of prostitutes to gain insight on how they

see their relationships with their mothers. In order to understand what services are provided for prostitutes and their children or what challenges service providers face, interviews with stakeholders serving prostitutes and their children were conducted in the third manuscript. While all three manuscripts looked at unique aspects in the lives of prostitutes and their children, together they give an extensive picture of the reality of their situations.

#### Conclusion of Overall Research

This research branched out of my work experiences with prostitutes and their children in India. I witnessed their everyday challenges and struggles. As a researcher, I realized that there was a lack of empirical studies on prostitutes and their children, or that viewed prostitutes as mothers. The purpose of conducting this study was to raise awareness on the challenges, needs, and dreams of this population. The study was expanded to incorporate participants in the U.S. and India to get an international as well as more cross-cultural understanding of their situations. The research project was conducted in two phases. The first phase was done with ex-prostitutes in Denver, Colorado, U.S. The second phase of the study was conducted in the red light area of Mumbai, India with prostitutes, ex-prostitutes, children of prostitutes, and stakeholders.

Overall, this study's findings showed a clear distinction between prostitutes in India and the U.S. In the U.S., 5 out of the 6 women had lost custody of their children, whereas the Indian prostitutes retained custody of their children. Another difference between Indian and U.S. prostitutes was in the relationships between them and their children. Indian women reported having cordial relationships with their children.

However, U.S. women expressed having either no relationship or negative relationships with their children. Additionally, the women in India reported that all of their children were in school. These children did not face abandonment issues and their mothers tried to protect them from entering into the flesh trade. In the U.S., women had no control over their children's lives and therefore could not do anything to prevent them from entering into prostitution. All 6 ex-prostitutes interviewed in the U.S. study reported being in foster care as children and being abandoned by their parents. They ended up doing the same with their own children. This legacy of intergenerational abandonment (Dalla, 2003), which may have led these women into prostitution, could also cause the same fate for their children. Conversely, this issue of abandonment did not come up among Indian prostitutes due to interventions in India which are focused on the prevention of second-generation trafficking and prostitution such as providing education for the children, keeping children safe with mothers' consent, and allowing the mothers to retain custody of their children.

To understand the children's perspectives about their relationships with their mothers, the second article was conducted with children of prostitutes in India. The child participants shared that they did not want to be separated from their mothers. They wanted their mothers to have the right to visit them even when they are in boarding schools. These children expressed that they wanted to take care of their mothers after they finished their studies and get a job. Looking at the three different manuscripts, prostitutes, their children, and stakeholders all emphasized the large number of challenges prostitutes and their children face. Looking at these challenges from three different angles gives us a more complete understanding of the problems this group faces.

This study has helped to fill this void in literature, but can also help policy makers and social workers to form better policies and interventions for this group.

## **Implications for Social Work**

### **Social Work Practice Implications**

The findings of this study can serve as a guide, a tool for advocacy, and as a needs assessment for organizations to develop programs for prostitutes and their children. The study can be a guide for practitioners to understand the needs and challenges of this group. The advice given by the stakeholders interviewed in this study can be useful to social workers. The suggestions from the study participants can serve as a needs assessment for practitioners in developing efficient programs for this group. This study has the potential to help build and create policies and programs for organizations. With the knowledge gained from this study, practitioners can work more efficiently with this group.

## Social Work Policy Implications

This research study's findings can be used by social workers to advocate for policy changes. Current laws in the U.S. criminalize prostitutes. This study's findings reveal the impact of this criminalization on the lives of prostitutes and their children. The affect of this punitive form of action causes prostitutes to lose custody of their children. This loss can add to intergenerational abandonment, which has long-term implications (Dalla, 2003). This study advocates for policy changes that look at these women as victims and calls for rehabilitation. The study calls for alternative programs other than prison sentences. Programs such as alternative job training can help these women and

their children become a part of mainstream society. The study calls for policies that focus on preventing women from entering into prostitution. Policies should be based on a framework that views prostitutes and their children as a family unit. Only with policy changes such as these can group find a place for themselves in mainstream society.

#### Social Work Research Implications

This study fills gaps in the literature about children of prostitutes. This study tries to give a new perspective to the literature on prostitutes by addressing the needs of their children. In addition, this study adds to the literature of prostitutes as mothers. Because prostitutes in the U.S. often lose custody of their children, it is extremely difficult to do research with children of prostitutes and there is almost no research on the children of U.S. prostitutes. This research gives a new dimension to the discourses on prostitutes by considering the views of stakeholders who provide services to both prostitutes and their children.

## Strengths and Limitations of the Dissertation Study

A limitation of this study was that contacting active and former prostitutes presents researchers with a number of challenges. Because of the illegal nature of prostitution, there is a fear of arrest, which makes prostitutes difficult to contact or be willing to participate in a study. Limited support programs for these women in many places make it hard to get in touch with participants.

Since holidays and elections in India fell at the same time, it was difficult to contact prostitutes, their children, and stakeholders since many organizations and schools were closed during this period. This lack of access limited the number of participants

interviewed in this phase of the study. Furthermore, many older children had dropped out of school, making it hard to contact them. Additionally, girl children above the age of 14 years were hard to locate because either they were sent to boarding homes or to their native villages. Also, male participants below the age of 11 were more often less verbal than their female peers.

In addition, interviewing children from the U.S. phase of the study was impossible because they were not in the custody of their mothers and most were in foster care. Some participants in the U.S. study choose not to use pseudonyms, so that they could feel a sense of contribution, but this could lead to their identification. The researcher could not do member checking, since follow-up interviews could not be conducted because of the economic and distance limitation between the research site and my location.

Despite the above limitations, this study has many strengths and makes significant contributions to practice, policy, and research. This study fills gaps in the literature about children of prostitutes, and stakeholders' views of children of prostitutes. It also adds to the existing literature on the mothering aspects of prostitutes. This study could be an advocacy tool for policy changes. The study can guide service providers to offer efficient programs to prostitutes and their children, and help them have a better future.

## Future Research

There is a need for more research with children of prostitutes above the age of 17 to find out their experiences and recommendations for services. Also, research needs to be conducted with stakeholders from high schools, colleges, boarding homes, and night care shelters to obtain more information on the challenges children at these institutions

face. In addition, stakeholders have expressed their struggles in trying to work with prostitutes' partners because providing these services was against their organizations' policies. Organizations in the red light area often do not work with prostitute's partners since they are often pimps, customers, or traffickers; however, these partners have considerable control over the women. The question then arises about what stakeholders in the red light area need to do to provide services to children without involving the prostitutes' partner. Do the organizations need to change their policies or change their working strategies with the mothers? This puzzle needs to be considered in future research. Future research is also needed to understand the effects of recent gentrification happening in the red light area of Mumbai. It is unknown what kind of changes would be required in future strategies for this context in order to provide services to prostitutes and their children.

# References

- Dalla, R. L. (2003). When the bough breaks...: Examination intergenerational parent-child relationship patterns among street-level sex workers and their parents and children. *Applied Developmental Science*, 7(4), 216-228.
- The Journal of Sex Research. Retrieved on 20<sup>th</sup> March 2012 from http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/journal.asp?issn=0022-4499&linktype=44

#### APPENDIX A

#### INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR PROSTITUTES

## **Background Questions**

- What is your age?
- How long have you been in Denver/Mumbai?
- Where did you grow up? What was growing up like?
- Can you tell me something about your family?
- Did you go to school? What was school like for you?
- What grade did you reach in school?
- What were your dreams when you were a child?
- What did you want in life when you were young?

## Work Related Questions

- Can you tell me what you did after school/after you dropped out of school? What kind of work did you do?
- Can you describe your work place experience? How was work like? Did you like working? What kind of jobs did you have?
- Was your earning enough for living?
- Can you describe the circumstances that lead you to choose this profession?
- Is your earning enough for survival? How much do you earn in a day?
- How long have you being in this profession?

- How did you join it?
- What are the problems you face in day-to-day life?
- Can you describe your experience with the legal system here in Denver/Mumbai?
- Have you ever thought of leaving this profession?
- What has stopped you from doing so?

#### Partner-Related Questions

- Are you married? Do you have a partner?
- Can you describe your relationship with you partner or spouse?
- Was/Is there violence in your relationship? How do you deal with the violence?
- Do you receive any support from your partner? What type of support?

#### Children-Related Questions

- Do you have children?
- How many? How old are they?
- Can you tell me about your children?
- Do they go to school?
- Can you tell me something about the school they go to?
- Can you describe their experiences in school?
- How are your children doing in school?
- Do they have friends in school? Can you describe their relationship with their friends, teachers, and school administrators?
- Can you describe your relationship with your children's friends, teachers, and school administrators?
- How do you think this can be changed or improved?

## **Support-Related Questions**

- Can you describe any support or help you get from the government or other organizations regarding your profession?
- Can you describe the kinds of support you need or want from the government or other organizations?
- Can you describe the family support you receive?
- What kind of support do you need or want from your family?
- Do you receive any support from social services? Can you describe them?
- Do you think that there is enough support?
- What else would you recommend?
- What services have been helpful for you?

#### Future of the Children

- Can you describe what you want your child to grow up to be?
- How do you think your child will achieve it?
- What do you think will help/support your child to achieve this goal?
- What are you going to do to help your child finish school?
- What external support do you need to take care of your child?

#### APPENDIX B

#### INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTES

## **Background Questions**

- What is your age?
- How long have you been in Mumbai?
- Where did you grow up? How long did you live there?
- What was growing up like?
- Can you tell me something about your family?
- Can you tell me about your average day?
- What are the challenges you face in your day-to-day life?

#### School-Related Questions

- Where do you go to school?
- Which grade are you in now?
- What is school like for you?
- How are you doing in school academically?
- What are the challenges you face in school?
- Do you have friends in school? Can you describe your relationship with your friends?
- Can you describe your relationship with teachers and school administration?
- How do you think this relationship could be changed or improved?

# **Support-Related Questions**

- Can you describe any help you get from government or other organizations for your studies?
- Can you describe the kinds of support you want from government or other organizations?
- Can you describe the support you receive from your family?
- What kinds of support do you want from your family?
- Do you think that there is enough support for you? What else would you want or need?
- What services have been helpful for you?

## **Future-Related Questions**

- What are your dreams for the future?
- How do you think you will fulfill them?
- What support do you think you will need to fulfill these dreams?
- What do you think the challenges are going to be to fulfill these dreams?

#### APPENDIX C

#### INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR STAKEHOLDERS

## Demographic Details

- What is your age?
- How long have you been working in this organization/school?
- How long have you been working with prostitutes and their children?

# Work-Related Questions

- Can you describe your relationship with this group?
- What are the services you provide for them?
- What are the supports you receive to provide services to this population?
- What support have been helpful for you?
- What are the challenges you face in providing support for this group?
- Can you describe the challenges the women and children face with regards to the legal system/day-to-day life?
- Can you describe the challenges the children face with regards to education?
- What do you think are the supports needed to overcome these challenges?
- Can you describe the kinds of support you want from government or other organizations?
- Do you think that there is enough support/services for this group?

 Do you have any recommendations for improving services for this group? If yes, describe them.

#### APPENDIX D

# CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH (PROSTITUTES IN THE U.S.)

## Background

We are inviting you to participate in a research project conducted by the University of Utah. The purpose of this project is to collect information from prostitutes who work in Denver. The information you provide will allow us to better understand the needs of women like yourself and your children, and help to develop more services that are effective. The researcher, Ms. John, is a doctoral student in the College of Social Work at the University of Utah.

#### Study Procedure

If you choose to participate in this project, you will be asked to take part in a face-to-face interview with a researcher from the College of Social Work in University of Utah. Each interview includes questions about your work experience and needs, and your children's needs. With your permission, your interview will be audio-taped and conducted in place of your choose. Each interview will last approximately one to two hours.

## <u>Risks</u>

The risks in participating in this study are minimal. You were chosen to participate based on your work experience. As part of the requirements for the project,

the data collected in the interviews will be incorporated into a report; however, your answers will not be connected with your name, and your responses will remain anonymous. If you do not feel comfortable answering some of the questions, you may choose not to answer them or to terminate the interview at any time. If in any point you feel discomfort about sharing experiences, feel your privacy is being invaded, feel embarrassment, or feel loss of social status, you can choose to discontinue with the study. If during the interview, you feel upset then the researcher will tell you about resources, which are available for your help. If during the interview, you disclose actual or suspected abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a child, or disabled or elderly adult, the researcher will, report this to Child Protective Services (CPS), Adult Protective Services (APS) or the nearest law enforcement agency.

#### **Benefits**

The benefit of participation is that information provided by you will contribute to improvement of the service provided to prostitutes and their children. Participation in this study will also contribute to a greater understanding of the difficulties prostitutes and their children face in everyday life.

#### Alternative Procedures

If you do not want to participate in this study, then you will not be forced.

Remember, participating in this project is up to you. No one will be upset if you do not want to participate, or even if you change your mind and want to stop. You are free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time.

## Confidentiality

Your data will be kept confidential. Data and records will be stored in a locked filing cabinet or on a password-protected computer located in the researcher's workspace. Only the researcher and members of her study team will have access to this information. Your name will not be connected with your answers. All answers will be kept confidential.

#### Person To Contact

If you have questions, complaints or concerns about this study, you can contact Hena John at (801)-512-3997. If you feel you have been harmed because of participation, please call contact Dr. Caren Frost at (801) 581-5287 who may be reached during Monday to Friday 8 am to 5 pm . You can leave a message at any time on this number. You can also contact Joni Handran from Empowerment Women program if you have any concern about the study at 303.320.1989 ext. 224 from Monday to Friday 9am to 5 pm. You can leave a message anytime on this number.

#### Institutional Review Board

Contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) if you have questions regarding your rights as a research participant. Also, contact the IRB if you have questions, complaints, or concerns, which you do not feel you, can discuss with the investigator. Contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) if you have questions regarding your rights as a research participant. Also, contact the IRB if you have questions, complaints, or concerns, which you do not feel you can discuss with the investigator. The University of Utah of IRB may be reached by phone at (801) 581-3655 or by e-mail at

<u>irb@hsc.utah.edu</u>. You may also contact the Research Participant Advocate (RPA) by phone at (801) 581-3803 or by email at <u>participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu</u>.

## Voluntary Participation

As previously mentioned, if you do not want to participate in this study, you do not have to participate. Participating in this project is voluntary, and you can terminate the interview at any time. You are free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time. There is no penalty if you want to quit, or refuse to participate.

### Costs And Compensation To Participants

You will receive U.S. \$20 for participating in this study. . If you choose to leave the interview though half way then you will only receive \$10 for your participation.

There will be no costs to you for participation.

#### Consent

By agreeing to interviewed, I am giving my consent to participate in this study. I confirm I have read the information in this consent form and have had the opportunity to ask question. I will be given a copy of this consent form. I voluntarily agree to take part in this study.

#### APPENDIX E

# CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH (PROSTITUTES IN INDIA)

## Background

We are inviting you to participate in a research project conducted by the University of Utah. The purpose of this project is to collect information from prostitutes, children of prostitutes and stake holders who work in Mumbai. The information you provide will allow us to better understand the needs of women like yourself and your children, and help to develop services that are more effective. The researcher, Ms. John, is a doctoral student in the College of Social Work at the University of Utah.

#### Study Procedure

If you choose to participate in this project, you will be asked to take part in a face-to-face interview with a researcher from the College of Social Work at the University of Utah. Each interview includes questions about your work experience and needs, and your children's needs. With your permission, your interview will be audio-taped and conducted in a place of your choice. Each interview will last approximately one to two hours.

## <u>Risks</u>

The risks in participating in this study are minimal. You were chosen to participate based on your work experience. As part of the requirements for the project,

the data collected in the interviews will be incorporated into a report; however, your answers will not be connected with your name, and your responses will remain anonymous. If you do not feel comfortable answering some of the questions, you may choose not to answer them or to terminate the interview at any time. If in any point you feel discomfort about sharing experiences, feel your privacy is being invaded, or feel embarrassment, you can choose to discontinue with the study. If during the interview, you feel upset then the researcher will tell you about resources, which are available to help you. If during the interview, you disclose actual or suspected abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a child, or disabled or elderly adult, the researcher will report this to Child Protective Services (CPS), Adult Protective Services (APS) or the nearest law enforcement agency.

#### **Benefits**

There are no direct benefits for taking part in this study. However, we hope the information we get from this study may help us develop a greater understanding of the experiences and needs of children of prostitutes. Participation in this study will also contribute to improvement of the service provided to prostitutes and their children.

## Confidentiality

Your data will be kept confidential. Data and records will be stored in a locked filing cabinet or on a password-protected computer located in the researcher's workspace. Digitally audio taped interviews will be kept for one year following the date of interview and after that date will be erased. Interview data will be stored on a password-protected computer. Only the researcher and members of her study team will have access to this information. Your name will not be connected with your answers. All answers will be

kept confidential.

#### Person To Contact

If you have questions, complaints or concerns about this study, you can contact Hena John at (91)-9932215794. If you feel you have been harmed because of participation, please call contact Dr. Caren Frost at (801) 581-5287 in the United States who may be reached during Monday to Friday 8 am to 5 pm. You may a leave a message at any time on this number.

#### Institutional Review Board

Contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) if you have questions regarding your rights as a research participant. Also, contact the IRB if you have questions, complaints, or concerns, which you do not feel you can discuss with the investigator. The University of Utah of IRB may be reached by phone at (801) 581-3655 or by e-mail at <a href="mailto:irb@hsc.utah.edu">irb@hsc.utah.edu</a>. You may also contact the Research Participant Advocate (RPA) by phone at (801) 581-3803 or by email at <a href="mailto:participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu">participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu</a>.

## **Voluntary Participation**

If you do not want to participate in this study, you do not have to participate.

Participating in this project is voluntary, and you can terminate the interview at any time.

You are free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time. There is no penalty if you want to quit, or refuse to participate.

## Costs And Compensation To Participants

You will receive Rs 100 for participating in this study. There will be no costs to you for participation.

# Consent

By agreeing to interviewed, I am giving my consent to participate in this study. I confirm I have read the information in this consent form and have had the opportunity to ask question. I will be given a copy of this consent form. I voluntarily agree to take part in this study.

#### APPENDIX F

#### PARENTAL PERMISSION DOCUMENT

## Background

We are inviting your child to participate in a research project conducted by the University of Utah. Before you decide, it is important for you to understand why the research is being done and what it will involve. Please take time to read the following information carefully. Ask us if there is anything that is not clear or if you would like more information. Take time to decide whether you will allow your child to take part in this study. The purpose of this project is to collect information from prostitutes, children of prostitutes and stake holders who work in Mumbai. The information you provide will allow us to better understand the needs of women like yourself and your children, and help to develop services that are more effective. The researcher, Ms. John, is a doctoral student in the College of Social Work at the University of Utah.

### Study Procedure

If you allow your child to participate in this project, he/she will be asked to take part in a face-to-face interview with the principal investigator. Each interview includes questions about day-to-day life experiences, educational challenges and needs, and plan for the future. With your permission, I would also like to audio-tape your child's interview and conduct the interview in place of their choice. Each interview will last approximately one to two hours.

#### Risks

The risks in participating in this study are minimal. Your child is being chosen to participate based on his/her experience of being a child of a prostitute. As part of the requirements for the project, the data collected in the interviews will be incorporated into a report; however, your child's answers will not be connected with their name, and their responses will remain anonymous. If they do not feel comfortable answering some of the questions, they may choose not to answer them or to stop the interview at any time. If at any point they feel discomfort about sharing experiences, feel their privacy is being invaded, or feel embarrassment, they can choose to discontinue participating in the study. If during the interview, they feel upset then the researcher will tell them and you about resources, which are available to help you. If during the interview, they disclose actual or suspected abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a child, or disabled or elderly adult, the researcher will report this to Child Protective Services (CPS), Adult Protective Services (APS) or the nearest law enforcement agency.

#### **Benefits**

There are no direct benefits for taking part in this study. However, we hope the information we get from this study may help us develop a greater understanding of the experiences and needs of children of prostitutes. The benefit of participation is that information provided by your child will contribute to improvement of the service provided to prostitutes and their children. Participation in this study will also contribute to a greater understanding of the difficulties prostitutes and their children face in everyday life.

### Confidentiality

Your child's data will be kept confidential. Data and records will be stored in a locked filing cabinet or on a password-protected computer located in the researcher's workspace. Digitally audio taped interviews will be kept for one year following the date of interview and after that date will be erased. Interview data will be stored on a password-protected computer. Only the researcher and members of her study team will have access to this information. Your child's name will not be connected with their answers. All answers will be kept confidential.

#### Person To Contact

If you have questions, complaints or concerns about this study, you can contact Hena John at (91)-9932215794. If you feel your child has been harmed because of participation, please call contact Dr. Caren Frost at (801) 581-5287 in the United States who may be reached during Monday to Friday 8 am to 5 pm. You may leave a message at any time on this number.

## **Institutional Review Board**

Contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) if you have questions regarding your child's rights as a research participant. Also, contact the IRB if you have questions, complaints, or concerns, which you do not feel you, can discuss with the investigator. The University of Utah IRB may be reached by phone at (801) 581-3655 or by e-mail at <a href="mailto:irb@hsc.utah.edu">irb@hsc.utah.edu</a>. Research Participant Advocate: You may also contact the Research Participant Advocate (RPA) by phone at (801) 581-3803 or by email at <a href="mailto:participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu">participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu</a>.

## **Voluntary Participation**

If you do not want your child to participate in this study, he/she do not have to participate. Participating in this project is voluntary, and your child can stop the interview at any time. Your child is free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time. There is no penalty if your child wants to quit or refuse to participate. It is up to you to decide whether to allow your child to take part in this study. Refusal to allow your child to participate or the decision to withdraw your child from this research will involve no penalty or loss of benefits to which your child is otherwise entitled. This will not affect your or your child's relationship with the investigator.

## Costs And Compensation To Participants

Your child will receive school supplies worth Rupees 100 for participating in this study after they complete the interview. There will be no costs to you or your child for participation.

#### Consent

By agreeing allow my child to be interviewed, I am giving my consent to my child to participate in this study. I confirm I have read the information in this consent form and have had the opportunity to ask questions. I will be given a copy of this consent form. I voluntarily agree to allow my child to take part in this study.

#### APPENDIX G

# ASSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN A STUDY (CHILDREN OF PROSTITUTES)

#### Purpose Of The Research

We are asking you to participate in a research project conducted by the University of Utah. The purpose of this project is to collect information from prostitutes, children of prostitutes and stake holders who work in Mumbai. The information you give will allow us to better understand the needs of prostitutes and their children. Your information will help to develop better services for prostitutes and their children. The researcher, Ms.

John, is a doctoral student in the College of Social Work at the University of Utah.

#### Procedure/ Intervention/Method

If you agree to participate in this project you will be asked to take part in a face-to-face interview with the researcher. This interview includes questions about your day-to-day experiences as a child of a prostitute, your experiences in school, and your future goals. With your permission, your interview will be audio-taped and conducted in place of your choice. Each interview will last approximately one to two hours.

## Risks

The risks in participating in this study are minimal. You were chosen to participate based on your experiences. The data collected in the interviews will be incorporated into a report; however, your answers will not be connected with your name,

and your responses will be kept anonymous. If you do not feel comfortable answering some of the questions, you may choose not to answer them or to stop the interview at any time. If in any point you feel discomfort about sharing experiences you can choose to stop your involvement with the study. If during the interview, you feel upset then the researcher will tell you about resources which are available to help you. If during the interview, you disclose actual or suspected abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a child, or disabled or elderly adult, the researcher will report this to Child Protective Services (CPS), Adult Protective Services (APS) or the nearest law enforcement agency.

#### Benefits

There are no direct benefits for taking part in this study. However, we hope the information provided by you will help to improve the service provided to prostitutes and needs of children of prostitutes. Your participation in this study will also contribute to a greater understanding of the difficulties prostitutes and their children face in everyday life.

## **Voluntary Participation**

Your participation in this study is voluntary. Remember, participating in this project is up to you. No one will be upset if you do not want to participate, or even if you change your mind and want to stop. You are free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time. You can change your mind later if you want to stop. Please talk this over with your parents before you decide whether or not to be in the study. We will also ask your parents to give their permission for you to take part in this study. Even if your parents say "yes" you can still decide not to do this.

### Confidentiality

Your data will be kept confidential. Data and records will be stored in a locked filing cabinet or on a password-protected computer located in the researcher's workspace. Digitally audio taped interviews will be kept for one year following the date of interview and after that date will be erased. Interview data will be stored on a password-protected computer. Only the researcher and members of her study team will have access to this information. Your name will not be connected with your answers. All answers will be kept confidential.

#### Person To Contact

You can ask any questions that you have about the study. If you have a question later that you didn't think of now, you can call me, Hena John, at (91)-9932215794. If you feel you have been harmed because of participation, please call contact Dr. Caren Frost at (801) 581-5287 in the United States who may be reached during Monday to Friday 8 am to 5 pm. You may leave a message at any time on this number.

#### Consent

By agreeing to interviewed, I am giving my consent to participate in this study. I confirm I have read the information in this consent form and have had the opportunity to ask questions. My parents and I will be given a copy of this form. I voluntarily agree to take part in this study.

#### APPENDIX H

# CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH (STAKEHOLDERS)

## Background

We are inviting you to participate in a research project conducted by the University of Utah. The purpose of this project is to collect information from prostitutes, children of prostitutes and stakeholders who work in Mumbai. The information you provide will allow us to better understand the needs of prostitutes and their children, the challenges you face in providing service to this group and what support you require to make this service more efficient. Your information will help to develop services for this group that are more effective. The researcher, Ms. John, is a doctoral student in the College of Social Work at the University of Utah.

#### Study Procedure

If you choose to participate in this project, you will be asked to take part in a face-to-face interview with a researcher from the College of Social Work at University of Utah. Each interview includes questions about the needs of the prostitutes and their children, the services you provide, the challenges you face while providing services and what support you need in providing this service. With your permission, your interview will be audio-taped and conducted in place of your choice. Each interview will last approximately one to two hours.

#### Risks

The risks in participating in this study are minimal. You were chosen to participate based on your work experience. As part of the requirements for the project, the data collected in the interviews will be incorporated into a report; however, your answers will not be connected with your name, and your responses will remain anonymous. If you do not feel comfortable answering some of the questions, you may choose not to answer them or to terminate the interview at any time. If in any point you feel discomfort about sharing experiences, feel your privacy is being invaded, or feel embarrassment, you can choose to discontinue with the study. If during the interview, you feel upset then the researcher will tell you about resources, which are available to help you. If during the interview, you disclose actual or suspected abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a child, or disabled or elderly adult, the researcher will report this to Child Protective Services (CPS), Adult Protective Services (APS) or the nearest law enforcement agency.

#### **Benefits**

There are no direct benefits for taking part in this study. However, we hope the information we get from this study may help us develop a greater understanding of the experiences and needs of children of prostitutes. Participation in this study will also contribute to improvement of the service provided to prostitutes and their children.

#### Confidentiality

Your data will be kept confidential. Data and records will be stored in a locked filing cabinet or on a password-protected computer located in the researcher's workspace.

Digitally audio taped interviews will be kept for one year following the date of interview

and after that date will be erased. Interview data will be stored on a password-protected computer. Only the researcher and members of her study team will have access to this information. Your name will not be connected with your answers. All answers will be kept confidential.

#### Person To Contact

If you have questions, complaints or concerns about this study, you can contact Hena John at (91)-9932215794. If you feel you have been harmed because of participation, please call contact Dr. Caren Frost at (801) 581-5287 in the United States who may be reached during Monday to Friday 8 am to 5 pm . You may leave a message at any time on this number.

#### Institutional Review Board

Contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) if you have questions regarding your rights as a research participant. Also, contact the IRB if you have questions, complaints, or concerns, which you do not feel you can discuss with the investigator. The University of Utah IRB may be reached by phone at (801) 581-3655 or by e-mail at irb@hsc.utah.edu.

Research Participant Advocate: You may also contact the Research Participant Advocate (RPA) by phone at (801) 581-3803 or by email at <a href="mailto:participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu">participant.advocate@hsc.utah.edu</a>. Voluntary Participation

If you do not want to participate in this study, you do not have to participate.

Participating in this project is voluntary, and you can terminate the interview at any time.

You are free to refuse to answer any question, or to completely withdraw participation at any time. There is no penalty if you want to quit, or refuse to participate.

# Costs And Compensation To Participants

Signature of Researcher or Staff

You will receive Rupees 100 for participating in this study. There will be no costs to you for participation.

# Consent

By agreeing to interviewed, I am giving my consent to participate in this study. I confirm I have read the information in this consent form and have had the opportunity to ask question. I will be given a copy of this consent form. I voluntarily agree to take part			
		in this study.	
		Printed Name of Participant	
Signature of Participant	Date		
	-		
Printed Name of Researcher or Staff			

Date